

Fee-Alexandra Haase

Conceptions of Criticism

**Cross-Cultural, Interdisciplinary, and Historical Studies
of Structures of a Concept of Values**

Index

Introduction	3
0. „Metacriticism“ - On Definitions of Terms of Criticism	3
1. On the Development of Criticism in Europe	14
1.1. „Krisis“ - On Ancient Criticism.....	14
1.2. „Synthesis“ - On Medieval Criticism.....	29
1.3. „Critica“- On Criticism in the New Time.....	41
1.4. "Ratio"- On Criticism in the 18 th and 19 th Century	59
1.5. “Modern and Postmodern” - On Criticism in the 20 th Century.....	89
2. On the Development of Criticism on Continents	103
2.1. „Naqd“ - On Criticism in the Middle East.....	103
2.2. "Tenqid"- On Criticism in non-Arabic cultures, Middle East and C. Asia	127
2.3. “Viveka” - On Indian Criticism.....	149
2.4. “Criticism and Orature” - On African Criticism.....	169
2.5. “Pi Ping” - On Asian Criticism	188
2.6. “Cricismo and Criticism” -On Criticism in America	201
2.7. On Criticism in Australian and the Pacific Area	225

Introduction

0. „Metacriticism“ - On Definitions of Terms of Criticism

René Wellek wrote in the article *Literary Criticism* in the *Dictionary of the History of Ideas* that [...] a survey of the diverse concepts of criticism in history leads to the inevitable conclusion that “criticism” is an “essentially contested concept,” that in the last two hundred years the possible positions were formulated and reformulated in different contexts, for different purposes, in different countries, but that the issues are reducible to a strictly limited number. The conflict between objective and subjective standards is basic and overlaps somewhat the debate between absolutism and relativism which may be historical.”¹ We will follow Wellek’s conclusion and extend its application to time, genres, and cultures mentioned in the quotation above: This book is an introduction into the methods, applications and history of criticism.² These features serve as clusters summarizing the concept ‘criticism’ our investigation is focussing on. Criticism can be defined as the art of judging with knowledge and propriety of an object or performance. Criticism is the act or process of explaining or making clear the meaning(s) of something. Criticism is the act of criticizing and the practice of analyzing, classifying, interpreting, or evaluating a work or object in an activity performed by a critic. The term ‘criticism’ is derived from the Greek verb ‘krinein’, which means ‘to judge,’ ‘to discern,’ or ‘to discriminate’.

We will consider criticism in this work in a basic definition as an intellectual approach based upon reasoning that differentiates between given information or facts and alternatives according to the methods mentioned above. More theoretically used ‘conceptual’ criticism is based upon theories in order to reflect the distinction between criticism proceeding on the basis of experimental and observational concerns. Even a totally subjective criticism we can call still criticism, when the critic announces her/his subjectivity as standard of judgement. Another method is given, when the critic comparatively seeks to establish normative

¹ Wellek, René. *Literary Criticism*. *Dictionary of the History of Ideas*. University of Virginia. May 29, 2007.

<<http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71>>

² Only a very old history of the specific European culture of criticism exists:

Saintsbury, George. *A History of Criticism and Literary Taste in Europe from the Earliest Texts to the Present Day*. Vol 1: *Classical and Mediaeval Criticism*. Edinburgh (Blackwood) 1900

standards or rules for evaluating the differences between objects. By doing so he/she establishes his/her own individual statement, which might be different from the ones of other critics. Theories of criticism lead to questions such as the deduction of elements of criticism, criteria and rules. Criticism is a methodical term and the related terminology focuses on methods. It is an abstract concept, not related to a concrete object. We find this concept in different cultures. As a linguistic concept criticism varies in terms of its terminology and applications from culture to culture. As a mind concept we find it in different cultures as a source for the intellectual tradition of the culture expressed in the local languages. The analyzed sum of all the terminology and definitions related to criticism we can call 'meta-criticism' forming a specific meta-terminology in different languages. Our analysis examines the following fields of research for relevant sources:

1. topographic/geographic research in sources
2. chronological research in sources
3. research in specific sub-terms for special fields of criticism

The place of origin, the *locus genii*, of criticism is philosophy. In antiquity Aristotle was regarded as the father and founder of criticism. In philosophy criticism has developed to a separate established method since ancient times. Since the days of Aristotle rules and methods of criticism have been established. Criticism has produced different genres of critical literature. When criticism is reduced to writing, the form or genre of the writing itself is called a criticism or *critique*. Criticism has a specialized meaning as a published analysis of the qualities and characteristics of an object in the form of an independent genre of literature. Any systematic result of analysis of any composition we can call a *critique*. A *critique* can have the form of countering an argument with a different one or proving it to be wrong. *Critique* in modern philosophy has its origin with Kant, whose *Critique of Pure Reason* can be said to mark the beginning of modern philosophy. The term 'criticism' is used in scholarship in the basic sense of the original Greek, 'techné kritiké', as a technique of distinguishing. A *critique* is an instance of serious practical criticism. The term is also used of the evaluation of work. The intellectual level of these critiques varied widely between different authors and institutions. Any critique addressing the constitutive role of a social institution belongs to social or cultural criticism. *Critique* is also the term for a critical discussion of some topic. *Critique* is a term used with increasing frequency in postmodernism to challenge a number of the conventional assumptions of art, communication and other things. Meta-criticism

(‘criticism of criticism’) is the critical examination of the premises and processes of criticism itself and its criteria. A critic is as a mediator also the person involved in the educational process of explaining or making clear the meaning of the object discussed. Criticism has also an ethical component. As a genre a *critique* is a written critical review of or commentary on a work. A *critique* as form of criticism is an oral or written discussion strategy one can use to analyze, describe, and interpret works. *Critique*, especially in philosophical contexts, has a more clearly defined meaning than criticism being the concrete form of objective argumentation.

When we look at criticism as a methodical approach towards any subject, we can distinguish criticism from doctrine stating that something is in a certain way and claiming authority for these statements. Critical approaches basically apply intellectual investigations to the subject asking for its conditions of existence from comparative and ethical standpoints, but also with values taken from exterior sources or asking for values existing in the subject. Theoretically, criticism can base upon statistics and empirical material analyzed in a methodical way. But criticism can also be grounded in the subjective experience of a person or a collection of material. Opposed to theory, which is abstract and claims to represent the world in a reduced model, criticism is close to the objective world. It recapitulates the given reality from an interpretative point of view. A neuter criticism can only exist terms of its awareness of objectivity and awareness of methods, values, or principles applied. Our approach is also a meta-criticism of criticism comprising its linguistics, history and forms. Metacriticism in the *Glossary of Literary Theory* has the following definition:

*A criticism of criticism, the goal of which is to scrutinize systematically the terminology, logic, and structure that undergird critical and theoretical discourse in general or any particular mode of such discourse.*³

According to the glossary *Words of Art* metacriticism is:

The critical examination of the premises and processes of criticism itself, independent of the particular objects of its investigations, or the criticism of criticism. For example, an evaluation of a work by Niki de Saint Phalle would constitute an act of criticism. In contrast,

³ Henderson, Greig E., and Brown, Christopher. *Glossary of Literary Theory*. University Toronto. June 7, 2007. <[Http://www.library.utoronto.ca/utel/glossary/Metacriticism.html](http://www.library.utoronto.ca/utel/glossary/Metacriticism.html)>

*an analysis of the premises enabling one to make such judgements in general would be part of a metacritical project. Much postmodern thought involves metacritical activity. See also theoretical criticism, theory.*⁴

Our interest is in applied criticism that in particular contains the interpretation and evaluation of a certain group of objects or a single object, e.g. literature and the arts. 'Criticism' in this case is the scientific investigation regarding documents or objects regarding such matters as origin, characterization, or history. Criticism focuses on the characteristics of the objects themselves. Applied criticism always has an object to be related to. The methods of applied criticism vary with its functions. Critics also interpret an object and development of tools and methods. Linguistic critics analyze e.g. sound patterns and meters, styles, devices such as metaphors, character, and plot and the ideas that emerge from the work. Critics analyze any particular individuality that can be evoked or defined. The interpretation is one form of showing the result of criticism and leads finally to a decision about artistic judgments provide the moral, political, religious, or philosophical implications of a work. A critic is a person who offers a value judgement or an interpretation.

What are the criteria of criticism? Criticism is the total of the rules and principles, which regulate the practice of the critic; the elements of criticism depend on the chosen principles, for example 'beauty' and 'truth'. Beauty is the criterion for the judgement the esthetical aspects; truth is the criterion in history and sciences. Criticism is the art of judging skillfully of the merits or beauties, defects or faults of an artificial or scientific performance, or of a production of art or the art of requesting truth.

Criticism as the art of judging qualities and values of an object involves the formation and expression of a judgment on the qualities of anything. The sense in which criticism is taken as implying censorship in any statement or production is the negative form of criticism or even its turn to unjustifiable neglectance or censorship. In a most abstract way, criticism is a system of rules and principles, which regulate the practice of the critic. The most extreme contrapoint to criticism is censorship. Liberty of criticism and all its forms must be allowed. Fair discussion is necessary to determine the authenticity of history and advancement of science. If he

⁴ Words of Art. Compiled by Robert J. Belton. Faculty of Creative & Critical Studies, UBC Okanagan. June 7, 2007.

<http://people.ok.ubc.ca/creative/glossary/m_list.html>

with an applied formula ('normative criticism'). The rules and forms of criticism have been changed. Critical judgment intends to claim universality. A person appeals merely to his own private taste or taste depending on socially and ethically accepted background, judgement is a universal approach to find intersubjective criteria on common ground. This tendency judgment of taste is not based upon any theoretical concepts. It is an individual 'ad hoc' judgment of a person. Judgment of taste applies to objects of sense and is always concrete. Types of judgements according to the outcome have existed ever since and will exist:

- Culturally transmitted judgements
- Unconscious judgements
- Results of personal opinions

Tendency Judgement of Taste

Communication tools for criticism we can call media that transfer data between entities:

Critical Forms	Critical Genres	Critical Methods	Critical Media
Verbal	Verbal genres	Acoustic	Speech
Literal	Literal genres	Visual	Text / literature
Visual	Visual genres	Visual	Visual media
Medial	Medial genres	Vary	New media

Critical Forms and Their Applications

Criticism finds its philosophical basic fields of applications in ethics, morality and aesthetics. We may ask: How can such abstract ideas like aesthetic values and ethical values be discussed by critical methods? The aesthetic judgment expresses a value like judgements on other issues. It may also imply a subjective element. Other criteria can always be 'objectified'. This value

is apprehended as objective, independent of personal states or conditions. A characteristic of criticism is freedom from desire or intensive quality in the pleasure experienced through the object in order to have objectivity. This judgment expresses as a value a subjective element coming from the object. This value is not apprehended as subjective, but objective, independent of personal states or conditions as appealing reaction from the object. So critical judgments can be established between universality and individuality. Main ideas are the universality and objectivity of the aesthetic judgment, which are to be applied in individual cases. Universality means the elimination of the personal, individual, subjective attitudes or opinions of groups.

Objects of criticism
 Methods of judgement
 Criteria of judgement

Elements of Judgement in Literal Media

Object of criticism	Text
Method of judgement	Comparative studies with other books
Criteria of judgement	Literary use of poetic elements

Elements of Judgement in Oral Media

Object of criticism	Speech
Method of judgement	Comparative study of rhetoric terms
Criteria of judgement	Analysis of rhetorical terms

General Elements of Judgement

Object of criticism	Picture
Method of judgement	Symbolic studies
Criteria of judgement	Analysis of the use of iconographic elements

Elements of Judgement. Examples for Forms of Objects of Applied Criticism

In most cases criticism is bound to linguistic means. Philology is a generally accepted comprehensive term for the study of the oral word or languages. Philology designates a branch of knowledge, which deals with human linguistic expressions. Literary criticism is a good example for how philological criticism stands in opposition to the applied criticism in daily journalism. This side of criticism and theory is less concerned with methods of the analysis of facts. Critics determine here the taste and reputations without a deep analysis by catching the 'taste of the *Zeitgeist*'. Philological criticism also assesses the works of the more remote past constantly reinterpreting the tradition of literature. In this way criticism defines literature both by the 'taste of the *Zeitgeist*' and philological work. '*Zeitgeist*'-criticism serves the present concern preparing a way for new literary trends or writers. Comprehensive criticism is interested in knowing how objects are made and their underlying principles, rules, conventions, and devices of composition. As universal means forms of criticism can be applied to all times and fields. Through remoteness from the scene of action the critic is able to make himself/herself familiar with all the elements of age, place and medium of the object. This historical knowledge gives the background qualification for the judgement of new things. The standards of objectivity can be higher, when going back to the past. In *The Democratization of Cultural Criticism* in 2004 George Cotkin made the statement, whenin we find a permanent topos regarding the state of criticism, the 'death of criticism':

*Wallace Shawn's play The Designated Mourner is in part a lament for the death of serious cultural criticism and intellectual community. Cultural barbarians have vanquished the life of the mind. But the genius of his play is in its refusal to leave unexamined this state of affairs. Not all of what has been lost is to be mourned. The designated mourner gleefully bids adieu to "all that endless posturing, the seriousness, the weightiness" of culture.*⁶

This phrase appears permanently and it is related to the idea that criticism and its influence changes. This is from a general perspective right. The continuity of critical concepts makes criticism a permanent cultural value. To show the key elements of such a global value is the interest of this book.

⁶ Cotkin, George. "The Democratization of Cultural Criticism". In: *The Chronicle* of 7/2/2004. Febr. 18, 2005. <[Http://chronicle.com/free/v50/i43/43b00801.htm](http://chronicle.com/free/v50/i43/43b00801.htm)>

Our work presented here includes documents of a wide span time both in a historical review and facing contemporary developments in criticism. References to contemporary dictionaries and other reference material is done in order to demonstrate the change of definitions for criticism in conversational language and specific fields, but also the continuity of the concept of criticism as different to other concepts. This book is interested in the factors, which show how criticism works. Focussing on the historical perspectives, it gives access to the conditions of criticism that depend upon historical situations. On the other hand this book introduces into the main areas of applied criticism showing their historical development and the main applications. In part about the European history this book is related to the origins of the history of criticism. This history will be exemplified in ancient times, medieval and Renaissance times, modern times and 20th century up to present time by representative persons contributing to it. The part concerned with applications of criticism focuses on philological methods of criticism such as textual criticism, higher and lower criticism, historical criticism, form criticism and new criticism. Communication criticism goes back to the ancient rhetorical criticism and is different from reader-response criticism. We mentioned above that philosophical criticism has its roots in Socratic inquiry and finds its modern versions in critical theory and critical thinking. Next to the applied use of criticism in the tradition of the *artes liberales* we find applied criticism since modern times in fields such as psychological criticism, media criticism, art criticism, cultural criticism and social criticism. The cultural part of this book is related to criticism or para-critical phenomena of non-European societies such as the Arabic, the Jewish, the Indian, the African the Asian and the original American and Australian culture and their critical traditions. To come to a short conclusion: This book is concerned with the major developments of a human skill with a broad spectrum of applications asking for the general roots of criticism. As a survey it is composed as an introduction to make the reader realize the different fields of one cultural original idea, which in many ways finds ways into our life.

Critical reading

Critical review

Critical concept

Critical essays and documents

Critical assessments

Critical reviews

Critical report

Forms of written Critical Practice

Critical discourse

Critical dialogues

Critical inquiry

Forms of oral Critical Practice

Regarding the edition of sources, two types are used for source material: The traditional material on paper was cited as follows in a short version, which intends to uniformity of printed and online edited material I will call the *A-T-P-D-P formula*:

Printed monographic works:

Author(s). Title. Place (i.e. city of print) *Date* (i.e. year). *Page(s)*

Online monographic works:

Author(s). Title. Place (i.e. server). *Date* (i.e. month/day/year/of visit). (Online-)Page.

Printed depending sources are cited as following:

Author(s). Title. Place (i.e. magazine, journal etc. including information on volumes), *Date* (i.e. Year). *Page(s)*

Online edited depending sources are cited as following:

Author(s). Title. Place (name of magazine, journal or server-entity), *Date* (Month/day/year/of visit). (Online-)Page.

This *A-T-P-D-P formula* is in my opinion and experience made with citations the shortest way to standardize citations with a minimum of data used form sufficient of both forms of publications. In cases where translations of languages other than English are not given, the reader who cannot read this language can ‘jump over’ it, since they are additional sources of the main text. Charts are given to illustrate the main fields of contents and to give a supporting structure for the introduction of the material. A high degree of authenticity was archives when citing net recources from the internet also intending to show the process still running when it comes to the development of criticism in the fields discussed.

This book is written from a European perspective, since it traced back all roots of criticism to this continent. Determination as a process is the procedure of recovering these roots. Under this aspect this book is a compilation owing tribute to a lot of texts contributing to the theme criticism. I thought about choosing the title ‘Fragments of Criticism’, and this might have been considered as homage to the Romantic idea of universalism resulting in the establishment of the fragment as a literary genre. I consider this form an appropriate solution for dealing with knowledge at this time, the idea of an introductory form, and openmindedness towards contributions to this project. Certain aspects the Romantic culture was aware of – brevity, knowledge of the comprehensiveness of the issue, claim for universality- might be the same for the author of this book. Choosing this genre of literature I would have given the subjective and highly subjective contents a form and on the other hand the normative interest of criticism and its values I spoke about in this introduction and the relations between the chapters an adequate form would be recognized. It is also a result of 21th –century medial knowledge and the question of its beginnings and ending, after which I found it is worth a try to discuss Quintilian and cite a news report on African politics in the same book. The form fragment here also serves as a counterpoint of the main descriptive way of access to the theme. If the fragment can claim a virtuous usefulness, than it is maybe the one that is a separate and/or separated piece, which contains knowledge for others. I don’t consider the fragment a genre of high esteem, in the academic area is like the formal expression of defeat in method and result, but on the other hand it is a realistic result not claiming any output not existing and a historical document. As of the research for the subject, criticism, we can claim relations among the main characteristics and issues mentioned for criticism in this introduction and in the chapters discussed as characteristically for criticism. As an introduction this work has a positivistic standpoint showing main tendencies and development as short as possible. The chapters here presented serve as the didactic form of an introduction giving a general overview over basic facts on the topic – may the reader feel encouraged to find his/her way into criticism from on of them.

Fee-Alexandra Haase

1. On the Development of Criticism in Europe

1.1. „Krisis“ - On Ancient Criticism

Criticism developed in ancient Greek and Roman culture from the educational and social background.⁷ Or in other words by Cartledge, one of the “indispensable words we owe ultimately to the Greeks is criticism [...]. Another is theory (from the Greek word meaning contemplation, itself based on the root for seeing). An early example of the Greek genius for applied critical theory was their invention of political theory, probably some time during the first half of the 5th century BCE.”⁸ According to Mazzola the Indo-European etymology of the word ‘criticism’ is “revealing. It is derived from the Latin word *criticus*, which means ‘decisive’. This Latin word *criticus* in turn is derived from the Greek word *kritikos*, which means ‘to be able to discern’. *Kritikos* in turn comes from the Greek infinitive *krinein*, which means ‘to separate’, ‘to choose’. And *krinein* in turn is derived from the Indo-European root *keri*, which means ‘to sift’ [...].”⁹ According to Mazzola cognates of the word ‘criticism’ are “‘scribe, riddle, secret, endocrine, and hypocrisy’-all containing some form of the Indo-European root *kery*. These words convey the central meaning of ‘decoding a message or process with skill and discrimination.’ Synonyms of the of the word ‘criticism’ are ‘blame, reprehend, censure, condemn, scorn, denounce’- words listed in descending order of approval. Antonyms of the word ‘criticism’ are ‘acclaim and extol’ both conveying a sense of undeserved praise.”¹⁰ From the stem **gery* derived Latin ‘cernere’ (to separate, sift, sort).¹¹ Proto- Indo-European: **ker(y)-*, **krEey-* has the meaning ‘to separate, to divide’. Old Greek

⁷ See also chapter 1.1.1 “Die Begriffe Urteil (iudicium) und Kritik (critica) in der Antike und Aufklärung”. In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/](http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/)>

⁸ Cartledge, Paul. *Critics and Critiques of Athenian Democracy*. BBC. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/ancient/greeks/greekcritics_01.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/ancient/greeks/greekcritics_01.shtml)>

⁹ Mazzola, Lars Charles. *The Art of Criticism*. World Prout Assembly. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html](http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html)>

¹⁰ Mazzola, Lars Charles. *The Art of Criticism*. World Prout Assembly. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html](http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html)>

¹¹ Latin Dictionary. Akira. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.akira.ruc.dk/~tengberg/latin-grammatik/LatinDictionary.html](http://www.akira.ruc.dk/~tengberg/latin-grammatik/LatinDictionary.html)>

kr-´nai, aor. kr-^nai, (lesb. kri´nnai,), ps. krithE^nai, pf. ke´krika, ps. ke´krimai, va. krito´ means 'to separate'. Deiverates are Slavic *kroj-´t-, *krfjü, Baltic *krei~ (*krej-a), Germanic *xri-dl, and Latin cernere ('to separate').¹² The word *critic* derives from the Greek κριτικός. Greek *krino* means to distinguish, i.e. decide (mentally or judicially); by implication, to try, condemn, punish, avenge, conclude, condemn, damn, decree, determine, esteem, judge, go to sue at the law, ordain, call in question, sentence to, think. *Krisis* means decision by extension, a tribunal; by implication, justice (especially, divine law), accusation, condemnation, damnation, judgment. *Kriterion* means neuter of a presumed derivative of *krites* and means a rule of judging. *Krites* derived from from *krino* and stands for a judge. *Kritikos* derived from *krites*.¹³ According to Liddell and Scott's *A Greek-English Lexicon* *kritikos* means:

A. able to discern, critical, dunamis sumphutos k. Arist. APo.99b35 ; ouk echei rhina kritikên pros toupson Posidipp.1.4 ; aisthêseis k. Phld.Mus.p.8 K.; to k. the power of discerning, Arist.de An.432a16; hê kritikê (sc. technê) Pl.Pl.260c, etc.: c. gen., hê geusis tôn schêmatôn kritikôtatê Arist.Sens.442b17 , cf. Thphr.Sens.43, Ocell.2.7; of persons, [ton holôs pepaideumenon] peri pantôn hôs eipein k. tina nomizomen einai Arist.PA639a9 : esp. in language, grammarian, scholar, literary critic, Pl.Ax.366e, Phld.Po.5.24, Str.9.1.10, etc.; of Crates, Ath. 11.490e, who distd. k. and grammatikos, S.E.M.1.79; ei dunatai tis einai k. kai grammatikos, title of work by Galen (Libr.Propr.17); but tôn husteron grammatikôn klêthentôn proteron de k. D.Chr.53.1, cf. Apollod. ap. Clem.Al.Strom.1.16.79; hoi k. tôn logôn Philostr.VS 2.1.14 ; pros tous k., title of work by Chrysippus, Stoic.2.9; hê k., opp. hê grammatikê, Taurisc. ap. S.E.M.1.248, cf. Sch.DTp.3 H. Adv. -kôs, echein tinos Artem.4 Praef., cf. Erot.Praef.p.7 N., Men.Rh. p.391 S.

2. of or for judging, archê k. the office of judges, opp. archê bouleutikê, Arist.Pol.1275b19.

II. = krisimos, hebdomas Ph.1.45 (Sup.), cf. Plu.2.134f, Gal.9.93, al. Adv. -kôs Id.UP17.2 , al.

Words with similar definitions are *kritêrion* and *krima* and Latin *judicium* and *constitutio*.¹⁴ According to Liddell and Scott's *A Greek-English Lexicon* *krisis* means:

¹² Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

¹³ Strong's Greek Dictionary. King James Bible. HTML-Bible. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.bible.com/sacrednamebiblecom/kjvstrongs/STRGRK29.htm](http://www.bible.com/sacrednamebiblecom/kjvstrongs/STRGRK29.htm)>

¹⁴ Liddell, Henry George; Scott, Robert. *A Greek-English Lexicon*. Revised and Augmented Throughout by Sir Henry Stuart Jones With the Assistance of. Roderick McKenzie. Oxford. Clarendon Press. 1940. May 29, 2007.

A. separating, distinguishing, tou pleô kai tou mê pleô Meliss.7 ; tôn homoioenôn, tôn diapherontôn, dub. l. in Arist.EN1165a34.

2. decision, judgement, peri toutôn Parm.8.15 ; tên Kroisou k. Hdt.3.34 ; en theôn krisei A.Ag.1289 ; kata dunamin kai k. emên Hp.Jusj.1 ; k. ouk alêthês no certain means of judging, S.OT501 (lyr.); politês horizetai tôi metechein kriseôs kai archês Arist. Pol.1275a23 ; kriseôs prosdeomena Epicur.Nat.32 G., cf. Herc.1420.3; hai tôn pollôn k. Phld.Mus.p.75 K.; Krisis, title of a play by Sophocles on the Judgement of Paris; k. tinos judgement on or respecting, tôn mnêstêrôn Hdt.6.131 ; aethlôn Pi.O.3.21 , N.10.23; morphês E.Hel.26 : hê tôn hoplôn k., referring to the story of Ajax, Pl.R.620b, cf. Arist.Po.1459b5; krisin . . tou biou peri hôn legomen Pl.R.360e; k. amph' aethlois Pi.O.7.80 ; k. diêmartêmenê Stoic.1.50 ; k. sunetê Cleanth.ib.128; power of judgement, krisei pragmatôn diapheresthai Plb.18.14.10 ; kata krisin with judgement, advisedly, Id.6.11.8.

3. choice, election, k. poieisthai tôn axiôn Arist.Pol.1321a30 , cf. 1271a10.

4. interpretation of dreams or portents, LXX Da.2.36, D.S. 17.116, J.AJ2.5.7.¹⁵

Krisis has the definitions a separating, sundering, separation, a trial, contest, selection, judgment, opinion or decision.¹⁶ The word *krisis* in the *Bible* is translated as ‘judgment’. English ‘crisis’ means ‘a turning point for better or worse’ in the progress of an affair or a series of events. The *Bible* and its documentation developed during the time of the Roman Empire to edited forms. The Christian texts and the Jewish collections were divided into *Old Testament* and *New Testament*. Ford argue that the study of ancient criticism is “unduly narrow unless it combines an awareness of the materiality of culture—of the forms in which literary texts were produced, circulated, stored up, and accessed—with an appreciation for

<<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0057%3Aentry%3D%2360047>>

¹⁵ Liddell, Henry George; Scott; Robert. A Greek-English Lexicon. Revised and Augmented Throughout by Sir Henry Stuart Jones with the Assistance of Roderick McKenzie. Oxford. Clarendon Press. 1940. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0057%3Aentry%3D%2360035>>

¹⁶ "Krisis". TDNT. Theological Dictionary of the New Testament. June 7, 2007.

<<http://www.studydrive.org/lex/grk/view.cgi?number=2920>>

"Krisis".Greek Lexicon. The New Testament Greek Lexicon. June 7, 2007.

<<http://www.studydrive.org/lex/grk/view.cgi?number=2920>>.

how strongly performance traditions could shape the reception and valuation of such texts.”¹⁷ Criticism was inherently a part of the art of rhetoric, which is often said to have originated in Sicily about 476 BCE with the teaching of Corax and his pupil Tisias. As beginning of its prominence in Greco-Roman culture and its influence on poetic theory we can assume the opening of Gorgias' school of rhetoric in Athens (ca. 431 BCE). Gorgias defended in his encomium *Helen* the power of discourse for emotional appeal and to control the opinions (*doxai*) of an audience. Gorgias taught the strategies of style that effect persuasion. Gorgias also practiced these strategies in his own oratory. Within the first collections of rhetorical figures the applied rhetorical criticism regarding the style of speeches developed. Gorgias denied being, being understood, and being communicable. Teachings of Gorgias were criticized by his student Isocrates (436-338 BCE). Isocrates considered political discourse important (*Antidosis* 269). Isocrates writes in his *Antidosis* (15.278) about *persuasion*:

*Furthermore, mark you, the man who wishes to persuade people will not be negligent as to the matter of character; no, on the contrary, he will apply himself above all to establish a most honorable name among his fellow-citizens; for who does not know that words carry greater conviction when spoken by men of good repute than when spoken by men who live under a cloud, and that the argument which is made by a man's life is of more weight than that which is furnished by words? Therefore, the stronger a man's desire to persuade his hearers, the more zealously will he strive to be honorable and to have the esteem of his fellow-citizens.*¹⁸

Plato shares Isocrates' project of examining rhetoric in the context of moral philosophy. But Plato comes to very different conclusions. The rhetor for Isocrates is a philosopher with a good character and practical wisdom. Plato's rhetorician not even practices an art (*Republic* 595a ff.). This public speaker characterized by Socrates as sophist in the dialogues *Gorgias* and *Phaedrus* is someone with an interest in persuasion, whose subject is the mere semblance (*eidolon*) of politics and whose task is to gratify an audience (*Gorgias* 462c, 463d). The sophists were a special group of travelling rhetoricians travelling around during the time of Socrates. Alcidaman characterizes them in *On the Sophists*:

¹⁷ Ford, Andrew. Performance, Text, and the History of Criticism. Princeton/Stanford Working Papers in Classics. Princeton University. June 7, 2007.

<<http://www.princeton.edu/~pswpc/pdfs/ford/110602.pdf>>

¹⁸ Isocrates. Antidosis. Passages selected by Adam Kissel. Nov. 14, 2005.

<<http://home.uchicago.edu/~ahkissel/rhetoric/isocrates.html>>

*Since certain so-called Sophists are vainglorious and puffed up with pride because they have practised the writing of speeches and through books have revealed their own wisdom, although they have neglected learning and discipline and are as inexpert as laymen in the faculty of speaking, and since they claim to be masters of the whole of the art of rhetoric, although they possess only the smallest share of ability therein-- since this is the case, I shall essay to bring formal accusation against written discourses.*¹⁹

In Plato's dialogue *Sophist* the separation of art with the terms *diakritike techne* (*διακριτικη τεχνη*) and *diakrisis* (*διακρισις*) is made in the discussion of Socrates with his guest, the anonymous sophist differentiating a worse one of the better one *cheiron apo beltionos* (*χειρον απο βελτιονος*) and a same one of same one (*homoion omoion*) by the cleaning process *karthasis* (*καθαρμος*) described and practiced in the formal construction of the text.²⁰ Plato had an academy, where he had conversations with students. Plato was not perceived by the public in the society of Athens as a public figure like his protagonist Socrates had been. For Plato poets are responsible for great imperfections destroying truth. Poets should be banned from the republic he considered the ideal state. Pseudo-Plato mentions in *Axiochus sive de morte* the critics (*critici*) among other professionals building the *multitudo dominorum*:

So. Dicam equidem tibi ea, quorum mihi veniet in mentem. Quae enim pars, inquit, aetatis calamitatibus vacat? Non ne statim a principio plorat, ut primum natus est infans? Vitamque a lacrimis auspicatur? Quae tandem non premit cum molestia? Semper enim vel penuria, vel frigore, vel calore, vel verberibus urgetur. Antea quoque quam loqui possit, quanta patitur? Flens scilicet, hancque solam habens anxietati suae quaerelam. Ubi septimum dehinc expleverit annum multosque labores exhausserit: iam custodes, gymnasticae, magistri ludi, iam adolescenti, critici, geometrae, rei militaris praeceptores: ingens plane dominorum multitudo.

¹⁹ Alcidasman. On the Sophists. Translated by LaRue Van Hook. Classical Weekly, January 20, 1991. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://classicpersuasion.org/pw/alcidamas/alcosph1.htm](http://classicpersuasion.org/pw/alcidamas/alcosph1.htm)>

²⁰ Platon. Der Sophist. Griechisch-deutsch. Translated by Helmut Meinhardt. Stuttgart 1990. P. 50.

*Post ista ubi in Ephebos inscriptus est, prior iam metus Lyceum, Academia, gymnasiarchia, virgae, nullaue prorsus malorum mensura.*²¹

The nature and qualities of art has been the subject of debate since the time of Plato and Aristotle. Following Plato the Neo-Platonists came up with a new philosophy. Plotinus concurred with Plato's conception of the real and the ideal reversing Plato's system with respect to the creation of art. Plotinus argued that the search for the beautiful is essential. A work of art can be beautiful if it exhibits a unity of form (*Enneads*, 1.6, 2-3). This ideal does not exist in an abstract form copied by the artist like Platon suggested before. For Plotin it exists in the conception and practice of the artist. A work of art is beautiful insofar as it conforms to the artist's intention. Neoplatonist criticism took literature serious and centred on the idea of poets such as Virgil. For later medieval scholars this mode of allegorical exposition was an exegetical technique and a hermeneutic method. Neoplatonists like Proclus and Plotinus were occupied with the analysis of the beautiful, and also some of the treatises of Porphyry focus on the beautiful.

Xenophon speaks in this work about the 'judicial being' *diakainon einai* (*δικαιον ειναι*) of sovereignty *archon* (*αρχων*).²² In terms like *krisis* (*κρισις*) and *kritos* (*κριτος*) or later Roman *critica* and *criticus* used by authors of late antiquity and the church fathers new forms of words and terminology derived from these words, which have survived in contemporary vocabulary and demonstrate the continuity of criticism in époques of the common era. In antiquity writings of Hippokrates and the church fathers refer to the adjective and noun *criticus*. In the terminology of the medical profession words from this stem usually appear. Their meaning is for the procedure of the healing the definition of the point where the bad stadium of health turns into a good one or not. In writings of Hippokrates the verb *κρινειν* is in a text in the expression *προς της τεχνης κρινεται* represented.²³ So in medical studies the term 'critical' was used. Aurelius Augustinus wrote in his *Confessiones* (liber VI) that the state of approaching danger for the body as called 'critical':

²¹ Pseudo-Plato. Ex versione Marsilii Ficini Florentini. George Mason University. Faculty of Classics. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.gmu.edu/departments/fld/CLASSICS/axio.htm](http://www.gmu.edu/departments/fld/CLASSICS/axio.htm)>

²² Xenophon. Opera Omnia. Recognovit, Brevique Adnotatione Critica Instruxit E. C. Marchant. Opuscula. Tomus V. Oxfort 1968. P. 1.

²³ Wittern, Renate. Die Hippokratische Schrift De Moribus. Ausgabe, Übersetzung und Erläuterungen. Hildesheim and New York 1974. P. 26.

*Et hoc quidem mihi. Tibi autem, fons misericordiarum, preces et lacrimas densiores, ut accelerares adiutorium tuum et inluminares tenebras meas, et studiosius ad ecclesiam currere et in Ambrosii ora suspendi, ad fontem salientis aquae in vitam aeternam. Diligebat autem illum virum sicut angelum dei, quod per illum cognoverat me interim ad illam ancipitem fluctuationem iam esse perductum, per quam transiturum me ab aegritudine ad sanitatem intercurrente artiore periculo quasi per accessionem, quam criticam medici vocant, certa praesumebat.*²⁴

Claudius Ptolemäus uses in his writing *Περί κριτηρίου και ηγεμονιον* the words ‘to divide’ (*κρινειν*), ‘the criterion of the beings’ (*το κριτηριον των οντων*), *crisis* (*κρισις*), and *law* (*νομος*).²⁵ In antiquity the tasks of strictly determining any critical activity was exercised by the critics as a philological procedure of the text examination. With the exception of the *Poetics* of Aristotle very little Greek literature concerning the subject of dramatic theory and criticism has survived. Extant writings are quotations from Greek writers like Theophrastus in the *Ars Grammatica* of Diomedes and from Greek drama writers in *The Deipnosophists* of Athenaeus. Passages from Aristophanes and works or fragments of a more general character of such writers like Plato and Dionysus of Halicarnassus are extant. The scholia or commentaries on the dramatists give a few impressions of dramatic criticism. After Plato Aristotle approached art on a different level by imitation (*mimesis*), which is not treated as an inferior copy of the ideal considered as a basic natural human faculty. Art expresses itself in arts such as painting, music, drama, and poetry. The reason for delight in such imitation is learning by gathering the meaning of a thing (*Poetics* 4). The objects of these imitations are the ethics of actions of either good or bad men. The moral level of the actions and characters decides about the genre of the work (comedy, tragedy). The characters of the story exist to perform the ethical actions (*Poetics* 6). The poet's work is not to describe something that has happened, but what might have happened and have to fulfill the criterion of probability (*Poetics* 24, 25). The *Poetics* of Aristotle was the fundamental text for literary criticism until the 18th century. In the *Poetics* Aristotle defined the aim of literature as imitation (*mimesis*).

²⁴ Aurelius Augustinus. *Confessiones*. Bibliotheca Augustana. June 17, 2005

<http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost05/Augustinus/aug_co06.html>

²⁵ Ptolemäus, Claudius. *The Criterion of Truth. Essays written in honour of George Kerferd Together with a Text and Translation (with Annotation) of Ptolemy's On the Kriterion and Hegemonikon*. Edited by Pamela Huby and Gordon Neal. Liverpool 1989.1.1., 1.4., 1.6. P. 182.

Aristotle describes the form and plots of certain Greek tragedies and alludes to the effect of tragedy as purgation (*'katharsis'*).

According to *Harpers Dictionary of Classical Antiquities* (1898) textual criticism in Greece originated out of the necessity of a unification and collation of the various versions of the Homeric poems.²⁶ An early form of criticism was done by the commentators (*commentatores*). Alexandria was a center for the methods of criticism regarding literature in ancient times. At this place ancient literature from all known cultures was collected and reviewed in a critical way in order to keep the literature in good standing. Sciences were practiced and sophists spread their knowledge. The commentary was a form of analysing the contents of books. There is continuity from the Alexandrian scholars to modern textual critics regarding the use of critical signs and marks. Critical symbols occur in the *New Testament* as well as classical works and were also later used. Zenodotus lived under Ptolemy I. Zenodotus was the first textual critic of Homer's works working as director of the royal library in Alexandria.²⁷ The Alexandrian text-type of the *Bible* was prepared by trained scribes. The ancient critics had either a philological or a philosophical background. Hecataeus or Hekataios of Abdera was a philosopher in Alexandria. Hecataeus had the nickname 'critical grammarian' for his grammatical training. One of his books is *On the Poetry of Homer and Hesiod*.²⁸ Crates or Krates, Son of Timocrates from Mallus, was a Stoic philosopher. Crates was nicknamed 'Homeric' and 'Critic' because of his engagement in grammatical and poetic discourses. Crates was a contemporary of the Alexandrian grammarian Aristarchus during the time of Ptolemy Philometor, who composed a work on textual criticism of the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* in nine books.²⁹ Philetas of Cos, son of Telephus, lived in the time of Philip and Alexander in Alexandria as a grammarian and critic. Philetas became a tutor of Ptolemy II and wrote epigrams and elegies.³⁰

²⁶ Peck, Harry Thurston. *Harpers Dictionary of Classical Antiquities*. *Perseus Project*. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0062%3Aid%3Dtextual-criticism](http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0062%3Aid%3Dtextual-criticism)>

²⁷ Cf. Suda. Adler number zeta 74. Stoa. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.stoa.org](http://www.stoa.org)>

²⁸ Cf. Suda. Adler number epsilon 359. Stoa. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.stoa.org](http://www.stoa.org)>

²⁹ Cf. Suda. Adler number kappa 2342. Stoa. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.stoa.org](http://www.stoa.org)>

³⁰ Cf. Suda. Adler number phi 332. Stoa. Febr. 18, 2005.

There seems to be no doubt that Alexandria possessed during the 3rd century BCE schools of critical operating grammarians. The names of Zenodotus, of Callimachus, and of Aristarchus were eminent in the Alexandrian scholarly tradition of criticism.³¹ In Alexandria was one of the centers for biblical textual criticism situated. Criticism in Alexandria included collating, glossing, translating, editing, and revising works of earlier writers and linguistic and literary forms of comments like commentaries next to lexica, glossaries and other tools. According to *Suda* Pamphilus of Alexandria wrote the first books with the title *Kritike techne*. Pamphilus was a Greek grammarian from the school of Aristarchus. Pamphilus was also the author of a comprehensive lexicon in 95 books of foreign or obscure words. The idea of this project was credited to the grammarian Zopyrion, the compiler of the first four books. The work itself is lost, but an epitome (miniature edition) made by Diogenianus of the 2nd century formed the basis of the *Lexicon* of Hesychius. A similar compilation called *Meadow* dealing with mythological marvels was probably a supplement to the lexicon.³²

Neo-Platonism is a legacy of late antiquity. Its major exponents were Plotinus (3rd century) and his disciple and literary executor Porphyry. The Neoplatonists offer a spiritual interpretation of the material world. In their doctrine the ascendance of the human soul toward some contact with an immutable universe or a transcendent unity confers meaning on the real world. For editions *glossae* were used, since the syncretistic terminology made explications necessary. The Greek term '*glossa*' originally meant a 'tongue', and later a 'language' or 'dialect'. Gradually *glossa* came to denote any obsolete, foreign, dialectal or technical word. Greek lexicography began with the compilation of glossaries in form of collections and explanations of these terms. The first glossaries in the 5th and 4th century BCE were devoted to explaining difficult words in the works of a single author. Homer always had a central place in Greek education. Explanations of his works were necessary.

In Cassius Longinus' *On the Sublime* we find a writing on the judgement of literature of the Roman culture. His book *On the Sublime* was probably written about 260 CE and first printed

<http://www.stoa.org>

³¹ Cf. Haase, Fee-Alexandra. "Rise of Criticism Between Grammar, Rhetoric and Philosophy in Ancient Alexandria." In: *Historia. The World of History*. 2. 2005. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.historia.ru/2005/02/haase.htm>

³² Cf. *Suda*. Adler number pi, 142. *Stoa*. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.stoa.org>

in 1554. *On the Sublime* speaks about the soul and the greatness of the author as the standard of literature. Longinus was a philosopher and teacher of the philosopher Porphyry and a polymath and critic. Longinus lived in the time of the Caesar Aurelian. Longinus also wrote *On the Natural Life*, *Difficulties in Homer*, *Whether Homer is a Philosopher and Homeric Problems and Solutions* in two books, *Things contrary to history, which the grammarians explain as historical*, *On words in Homer with multiple senses* in four books, two publications on Attic diction and *the Lexicon of Antimachus and Heracleon* next to many other work.³³ Longinus wrote in *On the Sublime* that his work traced back to a treatise of Caecilius on the sublime in the introduction:

*You will remember, my dear Postumius Terentianus, that when we examined together the treatise of Caecilius on the Sublime, we found that it fell below the dignity of the whole subject, while it failed signally to grasp the essential points, and conveyed to its readers but little of that practical help which it should be a writer's principal aim to give. In every systematic treatise two things are required. The first is a statement of the subject; the other, which although second in order ranks higher in importance, is an indication of the methods by which we may attain our end. Now Caecilius seeks to show the nature of the sublime by countless instances as though our ignorance demanded it, but the consideration of the means whereby we may succeed in raising our own capacities to a certain pitch of elevation he has, strangely enough, omitted as unnecessary.*³⁴

Longinus says that the transport of 'elevated' language affects the audience:

*The effect of elevated language upon an audience is not persuasion but transport. At every time and in every way imposing speech, with the spell it throws over us, prevails over that which aims at persuasion and gratification. Our persuasions we can usually control, but the influences of the sublime bring power and irresistible might to bear, and reign supreme over every hearer.*³⁵

³³ Cf. Suda. Adler number lambda 645. Stoa. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.stoa.org>

³⁴ Longinus. *On the Sublime*. Translation by W. Rhys Roberts. Peitho's Web. Feb. 10, 2006.

<http://www.classicpersuasion.org/pw/longinus/desub002.htm>

³⁵ Longinus. *On the Sublime*. Translation by W. Rhys Roberts. Peitho's Web. Feb. 10, 2006.

<http://www.classicpersuasion.org/pw/longinus/desub002.htm>

Also intellectual schools had an exchange that approached other cultural or intellectual assets critically. In the Roman liberal arts (*artes liberales*) the traditional division of studies was based on several disciplines. The *trivium* consisted of grammar, rhetoric, and logic. Grammar and logic became the names of specific sciences. In early days of the Roman Empire the rhetorical works of Cicero and the *Art of Poetry* of Horace are concerned with literary criticism. During the later Augustan period the only literary critic of importance was the elder Seneca. Horace's verse epistle the *Art of Poetry* is a source for the idea that literature should both please and instruct. In Antiquity prize writings praised the justice of the victory in a contest. Thus the winner of a chariot race, Arkesilas of Kyrene, is described in an ode as winner following 'the path of justice' (*dike*). Terms for criticism regarding style of oratory and literature can be found in the methodical books for teaching speech art in Rome. Criticism was also used for interpretation. In *On Christian Doctrine* Augustine established a program of reading and preaching, *lectio* and *praedicatio*, which represents the hermeneutical and rhetorical aspect. In *On the Trinity* Augustine says that an allegory is found not in words but in historical events themselves (15.9.15). Aurelius Augustinus wrote in *De Civitate Dei* (liber VII) on interpretations in *De Interpretationibus, quibus Colendi Saturni Ratio Concinnatur* (7, 20)³⁶ and *Quam Interpretationem de Abscissione Attidis Graecorum Sapientium Doctrina Reppererit* (7, 25).³⁷ Augustine writes in *De Dialectica*:

*V. Verbum est uniuscuiusque rei signum, quod ab audiente possit intellegi, a loquente prolatum. Res est quidquid vel sentitur vel intellegitur vel latet. Signum est quod et se ipsum sensui et praeter se aliquid animo ostendit. Loqui est articulata voce signum dare. Articulatam autem dico quae conpraehendi litteris potest. Haec omnia quae definita sunt, utrum recte definita sint et utrum hactenus verba definitionis aliis definitionibus persequenda fuerint, ille indicabit locus, quo definiendi disciplina tractatur. Nunc quod instat accipe intentus. Omne verbum sonat.*³⁸

In the Roman poets such as Juvenal and Martial we can find representatives of the Silver Age of Roman culture. But in Roman culture literature criticism never took a very prominent

³⁶ Aurelius Augustinus. *De Civitate Dei*. Bibliotheca Augustana. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost05/Augustinus/aug_cd07.html](http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost05/Augustinus/aug_cd07.html)>

³⁷ Aurelius Augustinus. *De Civitate Dei*. Bibliotheca Augustana. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost05/Augustinus/aug_cd07.html](http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost05/Augustinus/aug_cd07.html)>

³⁸ Augustine. *De Dialectica*. Penn State University. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/texts/dialectica.html](http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/texts/dialectica.html)>

position with some prominent exceptions. The rhetorician Marcus Fabius Quintilian was an accomplished Roman critic. His *Institution of Oratory* (*Institutio oratoria*) is as a conglomerate the fullest application of criticism regarding literature, which the Latin world produced. The teacher of rhetoric uses the Greek terms *κριτικη* for the judging part (*pars iudicandi*) and *τοπικη* as part for invention (*pars inveniendi*) of the speech.³⁹ According to Quintilian the orator of the future has to be also a philologist with critical skills, who has to write correctly and use the ability to speak correctly. Quintilian's instructions for philological criticism are components of his teachings. Based upon a practical criticism for contemporary and old literary works by training of the judgement (*iudicium*) and the faculty of judgement of the future speaker, Quintilian uses reference works in the *Institutio oratoria* coming from other ancient sources. As for Quintilian, the term judgement (*iudicium*) is both used for the suitability of a judgement and for the training of general criteria of the suitability to which literature refers.⁴⁰

The writings of this rhetorician originating from Spain illustrate also how to use literary criticism next to rhetorical skills. Quintilian's writing *Institutio Oratoria* is a document making a contribution to applied rhetoric and its history with instructions regarding criticism for the pupil as a part of the liberal arts, the education model developed in Roman antiquity. General knowledge is differentiated in components in the education system consisting of the *trivium* and *quadrivium* as education units of the three disciplines grammar, rhetoric and dialectic and in the four disciplines geometry, arithmetic, music and astronomy, which also Quintilian mentions in the *Institutio oratoria* as components for the training of the speaker since early childhood. For Quintilian the tasks of criticism (*critica*) by an analysis of literature are connected with the goal of the training as philologist. Tasks of the *artes liberales* for the evaluation of writings are disciplines of the philologist. In Quintilian's main writing the term *criticus* is used: "*Criticus grammaticae - tenuis a fonte, assumtis historicorum criticorumque viribus, pleno jam satis alveo fluit*". This is a statement Quintilian notes in the second book concerning the effect of the forces of historians and critics.⁴¹ There are -according to Quintilian- also differences between the arts. Visual art and poetic art are characterised in

³⁹ Quintilian, Marcus Fabius. *Institutio Oratoria*. Ausbildung des Redners. Herausgegeben und übersetzt von Helmut Rahn. Darmstadt 1972 a. 1975. Vol. 1, p. 662.

⁴⁰ Quintilian. *Institutio Oratoria*. 1975. Vol. 2, p. 434.

⁴¹ Quintilian, Marcus Fabius. *Institutio Oratoria*. 1975. Vol. 1. 1972, p. 162.

Cf. also: Bonell, Eduard. *Lexicon Quintilianicum*. Leipzig 1834, p. 190.

relation to the art of speech possessing both a border and aim, for which Quintilian uses the Latin term end (*finis*):

*Et pictor, cum vi artis suae efficit ut quaedam eminere in opere, quaedam recessisse credamus, ipse ea plana esse non nescit. Aiunt etiam omnes artes habere finem aliquem propositum ad quem tendant: hunc modo nullum esse in rhetorice, modo non praestari eum qui promittatur.*⁴²

In Cebes' *Tablet* *doctores* and *critici* are classified as '*homini literati*':

Hospes. Et quinam vocantur hi?

Senex. Alii, inquit, Poetae, alii Oratores, alii Dialectici, alii Musici, alii Arithmetici, alii Geometrae, alii Astrologi, alii Voluptuarii, alii Doctores in xystis, alii Critici, et quicumque ejusmodi aunt.

Hospes. Illae autem mulieres, quae videntur circumcurrere, prioribus illis similes, in quibus Incontinentiam affirmabas, et reliquae una cum illis, quaenam sunt?

*Senex. Illae ipsae sunt, inquit.*⁴³

Servius Grammaticus writes in the commentary *Vergilii Aeneidos librum octavum commentarius* that the critics (*critici*) accused Virgil for the way he used the mythological material:

*Sane critici frustra culpant Vergilium, quod praesentibus Troianis Troiae laudari introduxit excidium, non respicientes quia hoc ratio fecit hymnorum, quibus aliquid subtrahere sacrilegium est. alii magis hoc in solacium Aeneae cantatum posse accipi tradunt: nam quod Herculi datur, Graecis aufertur. et potest oblitteratus dolor videri [praeteritus], quando ad fatalem terram perventum est, sicut alibi ait Aeneas "illic fas regna resurgere Troiae", ut ibi iam dixerat "salve fatis mihi debita tellus", quia expectatus venerat solo Laurenti arvisque Latinis.*⁴⁴

⁴² Quintilian, Marcus Fabius. *Institutio Oratoria*. 1972. Vol. 1, p. 254-256.

⁴³ Cebes. *Tablets*. Saint Louis University. Febr. 18, 2005..

<<http://www.slu.edu/colleges/AS/languages/classical/latin/tchmat/pedagogy/latinitas/cebes/cebes.htm>>

⁴⁴ Servius Grammaticus. *Servii Grammatici in Vergilii Aeneidos. Liber 8* (Thilo). Universite Pierre Mendes Grenoble. May 11, 2006.

<http://web.upmf-grenoble.fr/Haiti/Cours/Ak/Auteurs_anciens/serv8.htm>

Horace writes in the second part of the *Epistulae* (2, 1) about the judgment of the critics (*critici*) on Ennius as the 'second Homer' (*alter Homerus*):

*Scriptor abhinc annos centum qui decidit, interperfectos veteresque referri debet an intervilis atque novos? excludat iurgia finis. 'est vetus atque probus, centum qui perficit annos.' quid? qui deperiit minor uno mense vel anno, inter quos referendus erit? veteresne poetas an quos et praesens et postera respuat aetas?' iste quidem veteres inter ponetur honeste, qui vel mense brevi vel toto est iunior anno. 'utor permissio caudaeque pilos ut equinaepaulatim vello et demo unum, demo etiam unum, dum cadat elusus ratione ruentis acervi qui redit ad fastus et virtutem aestimat annis miraturque nihil nisi quod Libitina sacravit. Ennius, et sapiens et fortis et alter Homerus, ut critici dicunt, leviter curare videtur quo promissa cadant et somnia Pythagorea.'*⁴⁵

Servius Grammaticus writes in his comment *Vergilii Carmina Commentarii in Aeneida* (liber I) on style: It is heroic (*heroicum*), when it contains divine and human persons; the high style manifests itself in a speech and large words. The style of the high level belongs to the heroic (*heroicum*). Three styles exist as the low, the middle and the high. The intention of Vergile consists of imitating Homer and praising Augustus because of his parents:

*Est autem stilus grandiloquus, qui constat alto sermone magnisque sententiis. scimus enim tria esse genera dicendi, humile medium grandiloquum. intentio Vergilii haec est, Homerum imitari et Augustum laudare a parentibus;*⁴⁶

In ancient times branches of criticism were well developed. Criticism existed both as an applied method and a form or genre of using criticism. Major branches were philosophy and studies of literature and rhetoric. But finally - and this demonstrated the example of Alexandria par excellence - the application of criticism could be made to any field of science and art in forms like the commentary as a critical interpretative genre. In Greek and Roman culture the forms and genres of criticism were widely developed and known. In Greek critical

⁴⁵ Horatius (Quintus Horatius Flaccus). *Epistularum Liber Duo*. Bibliotheca Augustana. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lsante01/Horatius/hor_ep21.html](http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lsante01/Horatius/hor_ep21.html)>

⁴⁶ Servius Grammaticus. In *Vergilii Carmina Commentarii*. Liber I. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.udl.es/usuaris/s2430206/ciceroll.htm](http://www.udl.es/usuaris/s2430206/ciceroll.htm)>

speech was an element of democracy and dialectics. Commentaries for all sciences were in use in Alexandria. As an element of critical thinking and critical dialogues developed since the time of Socrates. Criticism was well developed as an instrument of making editions and saving documentations of texts. A high demand of critical scholarship came up with a wide spreading of Christian writings. In Roman time criticism's implication in philosophy got lost, but it remained in the *artes liberales* concept as an auxiliary tool of the philological branch of the work. In general criticism became a useful instrument for any tradition process of documents or knowledge passed over the centuries from one generation to the other with the guaranty that the text was delivered correctly in written word and meaning.

1.2. „Synthesis“ - On Medieval Criticism

During the Middle Ages we find only fragmented elements of criticism. In the Middle Ages scholars and clerical persons had knowledge of literature and produced writings, but here the main aim was completely opposite to the analytical and critical investigation and their instrumentarium that the ancient authors had developed. The emphasis was put on synthetic representation and reproduction of knowledge instead of analysis. So we find here works in the standard research literature and literature histories classified as ‘literary criticism’ of the Middle Ages, but we must be aware that this criticism was a synthetic method in order to deal with texts and the individual scholar was the person who used to chose a more diligent approach to literature. Furthermore, at that time we have less findings for the word *critica* and derived forms in mediaeval literature used in a technical sense.⁴⁷ As stated by José Ángel García Landa: Literary criticism “*does not disappear during the Middle Ages. The classical tradition survives the collapse of the Western Roman Empire, and most of the great Latin authors will remain a part of the cultural tradition of Europe. The fate of the Greek authors is different: generally speaking, they will survive only through Latin versions and imitations of their works. Most of the Greek authors are unknown during the Middle Ages (this is the case of Homer) or will reach the West only through mangled versions and derivations (as happened with Aristotle's Poetics).*”⁴⁸ *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism* includes for the Middle Ages main traditions in Latin, European vernaculars, and Byzantine Greek. Grammar and the arts of poetry, letter-writing and preaching, the Latin commentary tradition on classical and classicizing literature, medieval views on literary imagination and memory. Theoretical and critical traditions of Latin and the vernacular languages are also included.⁴⁹

Interpretation is a broad sense from translation to exegesis and interpretation was dominant. Critical techniques were seldom employed. The *Encyclopaedia Britannica* wrote regarding

⁴⁷ Jaumann made research into the history of literary criticism from Roman times to the 17th century.

Jaumann, Herbert. *Critica. Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der Literaturkritik zwischen Quintilian und Thomasius*. Leiden 1995.

An example of this wide concept of literary criticism during the Middle Ages is

The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism. Volume 2, The Middle Ages. Edited by Alastair Minnis.

⁴⁸ Landa, José Ángel García. *Medieval Criticism*. University Zaragoza. May 20, 2007.

[<Http://www.unizar.es/departamentos/filologia_inglesa/garciala/hypercritica/>](http://www.unizar.es/departamentos/filologia_inglesa/garciala/hypercritica/)

⁴⁹ *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism. Volume 2, The Middle Ages*. Series: *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism* (No. 2). Edited by Alastair Minnis. Yale University, Connecticut.

literary criticism during the medieval period that in the Christian Middle Ages criticism suffered from the „loss of nearly all the ancient critical texts and from an antipagan distrust of the literary imagination. Church Fathers like Tertullian, Augustine, and Jerome renewed, in churchly guise, the Platonic argument against poetry“.⁵⁰ The writings of the Church Fathers had a dogmatic character, since the *Bible* was not subject to commentaries or other critical approaches. Rules of the church fathers have been used by medieval scholars and later exegetes of *Bible*. Another field was the translation. Church father Isidore of Sevilla writes in his *Etymologiarum Sive Originum Liber* regarding the Alexandrian work and the biblical tradition about the translation of the *Septaginta* from Hebrew to Greek about explaining ‘interpreters’ (*interpretes*) of *sacra eloquia* from Hebrew to Greek such as *Aquila, Symmachus et Theodotion*:

De libris et officiis ecclesiasticis.

1 *Fuerunt et alii interpretes, qui ex Hebraea lingua in Graecum sacra eloquia transtulerunt, sicut Aquila, Symmachus et Theodotion, sicut etiam et vulgaris illa interpretatio, cuius auctor non apparet et ob hoc sine nomine interpretis Quinta Editio nuncupatur. Praeterea sextam et septimam editionem Origenes miro labore repperit, et cum ceteris editionibus comparavit. Presbyter quoque Hieronymus trium linguarum peritus ex Hebraeo in Latinum eloquium easdem Scripturas convertit, eloquenterque transfudit. Cuius interpretatio merito ceteris antefertur; nam est et verborum tenacior, et perspicuitate sententiae clarior atque, utpote a Christiano, interpretatio verior.*⁵¹

Isidore writes in his encyclopedia *Etymologiarum Libri XX*:

*Si igitur tantae civitatis certa ratio non apparet, non mirum si in aliarum opinione dubitatur. Unde nec historicos nec commentatores varia dicentes imperite condemnare debemus, quia antiquitas ipsa creavit errorem. Sane quasdam, de quibus aut sanctae Scripturae aut historiae gentium certam originem referunt, paucis admodum verbis retexere oportet.*⁵²

⁵⁰ ‘Literary Criticism. Medieval Period’. Encyclopaedia Britannica 2007. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.britannica.com/eb/article-51226/literary-criticism](http://www.britannica.com/eb/article-51226/literary-criticism)>

⁵¹ Curtius, Lacus (ed.). Isidore's Etymologies. Book 6. University Chicago. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/L/Roman/Texts/Isidore/6*.html](http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/L/Roman/Texts/Isidore/6*.html)>

⁵² Isidorus Hispalensis. Etymologiarum libri XX. Liber X V. De Aedificiis et Agris. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost07/Isidorus/isi_et15.html](http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost07/Isidorus/isi_et15.html)>

Iunillus wrote in *De Auctoritate Scripturarum* of the *Instituta Regularia Divinae Legis*:

Quomodo diuinorum librorum consideratur auctoritas? Quia quaedam perfectae auctoritatis sunt, quaedam mediae, quaedam nullius. Quae sunt perfectae auctoritatis? Quae canonica in singulis speciebus absolute numerauimus. Quae mediae? Quae adiungi a pluribus diximus. Quae nullius auctoritatis sunt? Reliqua omnia.

2. In omnibus speciebus dictionis hae differentiae inueniuntur? In historia et simplici doctrina omnes; nam in prophetia mediae auctoritatis libri praeter apocalypsin non reperiuntur nec in prouerbiali specie omnino cassata.

Liber Secundus.

1. Quid de praesenti saeculo scriptura significat?

*Quoniam satis dictum est quot modis de Deo scriptura loquatur, nunc requiro quae de praesenti saeculo loquens scriptura significat. Quaedam quinque: aut generationem eius, id est creationem, aut gubernationem aut accidentia naturis aut euenientia uoluntatibus aut subsequencia uoluntatis euentu.*⁵³

After the breakdown of the Roman civic institutions and the education in the Roman Empire only individual approaches to critical studies were available. Critical principles and methods were transmitted to the Latin Middle Ages in the works interested in pagan literature written by Macrobius, Proclus, Fulgentius, and Boethius between the 4th and 7th century. These writers show the change from antiquity to the Middle Ages preserving classical learning within early European Christian culture after the fall of Rome in the 5th century. The writings of Proclus apply both a philosophical system and literary criticism. Proclus argued that poetry can have a divine, visionary capacity. Certain ideas from Platon were taken as examples like the cosmology in the *Timaeus*, where the human world is considered a microcosm of a transcendent order of the being. In the Middle Ages a *commentum* was used. For example by an Anonymus in 1176 a *Commentum in Epistulas Pauli: In Rom. 5,3-5: de spe* was written. A *commentum* is an invention or lie.⁵⁴ On the contrary a commentary is for example St. Thomas'

⁵³ Iunillus. Iunilli Instituta Regularia Divinae Legis Praefatio Sancto ac Beatissimo Episcopo Primasio Iunillus. Penn State University. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/texts/junillus.text.html](http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/texts/junillus.text.html)>

⁵⁴ Latin – German Dictionary. Gottwein. May 28, 2007.

Commentarius de Psalmis French Aquinas. Macrobius Ambrosius Theodosius' *Commentarium in Somnium Scipionis* (*Commentary on the Dream of Scipio*) articulates critical assumptions. Macrobius wrote in the *Commentarium in Somnium Scipionis* (XII) about the descension:

*Descensus uero ipsius, quo anima de caelo in huius uitae inferna delabitur, sic ordo digeritur. zodiacum ita lacteus circulus obliquae circumflexionis occursum ambiendo complectitur ut eum qua duo tropica signa Capricornus et Cancer feruntur intersecet.*⁵⁵

Macrobius' *Commentarium* is based on a section of Cicero's *De Re Publica*. It is interesting to mention that the discourses on forms of literature were made in *Commentarium in Somnium Scipionis* in form of a commentary related to a Roman topic. Macrobius's *Commentary on the Dream of Scipio* articulates critical assumptions. The commentary is based on a section of Cicero's *De Re Publica*. Medieval theory of signs produced a technique of biblical exegesis. In Augustine's *De Doctrina Christiana* (*On Christian Doctrine*) is written:

48. *There remain those branches of knowledge which pertain not to the bodily senses, but to the intellect, among which the science of reasoning and that of number are the chief. The science of reasoning is of very great service in searching into and unravelling all sorts of questions that come up in Scripture, only in the use of it we must guard against the love of wrangling, and the childish vanity of entrapping an adversary.*⁵⁶

In opposition to ancient concepts a new approach in the Middle Ages was the focus on linguistic signification and semantic meanings. Reading figuratively was considered a way to approach the symbolic value of things. *Signa* (signs) were subject to reading and interpretation. The problem of how to resolve the difference between an allegory as a verbal phenomenon and an allegory as a symbolic event was treated in a treatise by the English monk Bede (Latin Beda, 672–735) in *Concerning Figures and Tropes*. In this treatise Bede strives to substitute the scriptural text for the pagan authors to exemplify the use of figures of

<[Http://www.gottwein.de/latine/kien1/kc090.php](http://www.gottwein.de/latine/kien1/kc090.php)>

⁵⁵ Macrobius, Ambrosius Theodosius. *Commentariorum in Somnium Scipionis*. University Indiana. Nov. 1, 1846.

<[Http://www.music.indiana.edu/tml/3rd-5th/maccom1_text.html](http://www.music.indiana.edu/tml/3rd-5th/maccom1_text.html)>

⁵⁶ Augustine. *On Christian Doctrine*. University Pennsylvania. Nov. 13, 2005.

<[Http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/augustine/ddc.html](http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/jod/augustine/ddc.html)>

speech imitating the pedagogy of Augustine and Jerome. Bede introduced the terms *allegoria in factis* and *allegoria in verbis* ('allegory in facts' and 'allegory in words'). Bede was a Benedictine monk at the Northumbrian monastery of Saint Peter at Wearmouth and of its companion monastery Saint Paul's. Bede wrote a *Historia Ecclesiastica Gentis Anglorum* (*The Ecclesiastical History of the English People*). Bede practiced the allegorical method of interpretation.

The reception of Aristotle in the West begins with Anicius Manlius Severinus Boethius's Latin translations of Aristotle's *Categories* and *On Interpretation*. Boethius made a translation and exposition of Porphyry's *Isagoge*, which was an introduction to Aristotle's *Logic*. The medieval tradition of allegorical interpretation of myth also derived from Boethius's *Consolation of Philosophy*. In its embodiment of key themes from the Platonic *Timaeus* and in its use of myth to illustrate philosophical doctrine, the *Consolation* exemplified the poetic principle of *fabula* and access to meaning through an allegorical method. All elements of the medieval trivium of grammar, rhetoric, and dialectic were language sciences. Grammar was the science concerned with description of linguistic systems and with analysis of literary texts. Rhetoric was the art of eloquence or production of discourse. Dialectic was the study of rational argumentation, of discovering arguments and evaluating propositions. Boethius was translator and commentator of the Platonic philosophies. During the Middle Ages heritage of other cultures was absorbed in Europe. Translations and interpretations became an immanent part of scholarship in the Middle Age. Translations made it possible to spread the culture of Christianity in the northern part of Europe. The German Rabanus Maurus writes in *De Rerum Naturi* that the culture of idols is interpreted (*cultura idolorum interpretatur*) in Book 15 (6):

De diis gentium

*Apud Grecos autem oliua orta est, et Atheniensium urbs ex Mineruae appellatione nomen sortita est. Hic primus omnium Iouem appellauit, simulacra repperit, aras statuit, uictimas immolauit, nequaquam istius modi rebus in Grecia umquam uisis. Idolatria, idolorum seruitus siue cultura interpretatur. Nam latraria Grece, Latines seruitus dicitur, quae quantum ad ueram religionem attinet, non nisi uni et soli deo debetur. Hanc sicut impia superbia siue hominum siue daemonum, sibi exhiberi uel iubet uel cupit. Ita pia humilitas uel hominum uel angelorum sanctorum, sibi oblatam recusat, et cui debetur ostendit. Idolum autem est simulacrum, quod humana effigie factum et consecratum est iuxta uocabuli interpretationem.*⁵⁷

⁵⁷ Maurus, Rabanus. *De Rerum Naturis*. Memorial University of Newfoundland. Book 15. Febr. 18, 2005.

The term *critica* and derived terms were less used. One of the few examples of the use of the word *critica* is medical text *De Urines* written by Mattheus of Archiepiscopus written during the reign of Charlemagne using it for the expression *dies critica* (critical day):

*Urina alba et grossa si sit cum lenta febre vel diuturno morbo et in inicio morbi, scias morbum diuturnum fore. Sed tamen si in die nuncia vel critica appareat, et maxime iij die, scias morbum per apostema sanari. Si autem post diem criticam apparuerit, morbi recuperatio est. Si vero in die iij appareat, determinabitur morbus cum apostemate: post auriculas et in auriculis orietur vel circa, ut materia inferius deponatur et cum urina expellatur.*⁵⁸

Prominent methods of criticism were methods of textual exegesis like gloss, commentary, and prologus to the authors known as *enarratio poetarum* ('explanation of the poets') derived from the techniques of textual commentary practiced by the ancient grammarians and used in the Middle Ages for expositions of the *Bible* and curricular texts. Neo-Platonism made links between Christian and secular hermeneutics, as we see in the familiar verses of Alain de Lille: '*Omnis mundi creatura quasi liber et pictura nobis est, et speculum.*' (*Every creature in the world is like a book and a picture and a mirror for us*) (*Patrologia Latina*, 210, 579). This sentence of the poem is related to a theory of signs produced a technique of biblical exegesis. In Alain de Lille's allegorical poems *The Complaint of Nature* and *The Anticlaudianus* poetic figures represent a higher harmony.⁵⁹ Alain de Lille was also called Alanus de Insulis, the Latin form of his name according to a semiotic word play of similarity on phonetic level between the French and Latin word. Alain writes in his *Prologus* of the *Anticlaudianus* about the scholarly and liberal arts' fields it is related to:

Quoniam igitur in hoc opere resultat grammaticae syntaseos regula, dialetice lexeos maxima, oratorie reseos communis sententia, arismetice matheseos paradoxa, musice melos, anxioma

<[Http://www.mun.ca/rabanus/drn/15.html](http://www.mun.ca/rabanus/drn/15.html)>

⁵⁸ Mattheus de Archiepiscopo. *De Urinis*, Secundum Mattheum de Archiepiscopo. Archivio della Latinità Italiana del Medioevo. Unione Accademica Nazionale. *Epistolae Karolini Aevi* (IV). May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.uan.it](http://www.uan.it)

/ALIM/ServRicerchePag.nsf/212.175.150.163/CF786CABD4B4831EC12572E3002E9523!OpenDocument>

⁵⁹ See also: Ziolkowski, Jan. *Alan of Lille's Grammar of Sex. The Meaning of Grammar to a 12th-Century Intellectual*. Cambridge, Mass. 1985, pp. 30-41.

*geometrie, gramatis theorema, astronomice ebdomadis excellentia, theophanie celestis emblema, infruniti homines in hoc opus sensus proprios non impingant, qui ultra metas sensuum rationis non excedant curriculum, qui iuxta imaginationis sompnia aut recordantur uisa, aut figmentorum artifices commentantur incognita.*⁶⁰

In the Middle Ages human's interest in literature is of sensuous origin. Accepted among medieval thinkers was the Neo-Platonist theory. Beauty was considered a kind of divine order conforming to mathematical laws and religion.⁶¹ Even in late mediaval theology the Neo-Platonist heritage was preserved. Thomas Aquinas devoted passages of his *Summa Theologiae* (ca. 1266–1273) to the study of beauty. Music, poetry, and architecture were considered to show conformity to a cosmic order and harmony. In the classification of the liberal arts proposed by Thomas Aquinas' poetry is seen as a part of logic, along with dialectic and rhetoric. The purpose of the poetry is representation. Poetical comparison (*similitudo*) is the basic device of poetry. For Aquinas poetical literature was a part of logic can also be identified with moral philosophy. Thomas Aquinas writes in *Summa Theologica* (prima pars, quaestio XVI) in *De Veritate in Octo Articulos Divisa* that natural things (*res naturals*) are considered true (*verum*):

*Et similiter res naturales dicuntur esse verae, secundum quod assequuntur similitudinem specierum quae sunt in mente divina: dicitur enim verus lapis, qui assequitur propriam lapidis naturam, secundum praeconceptionem intellectus diini. Sic ergo veritas principaliter est in intellectu; secundario vero in rebus, secundum quod comparantur ad intellectum ut ad principium.*⁶²

Literature –in a broad sense- in the Middle Ages had neither a theory nor critical elements due to the synthetical worldview of this epoque. It was considered a part of the mediaeval world view. In mediaeval thinking poetic fictions of pagan poets like Virgil, Ovid, Lucan, and Statius represented truth when explained from a exegetical Christian position. Poetical texts existed in order to convey philosophical and religious topics. A commentary on the first six

⁶⁰ Alanus ab Insulis. Anticlaudianus. The Latin Library. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/alanus2.html](http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/alanus2.html)>

⁶¹ Cf. also: Leupin, Alexandre. Fiction and Incarnation. Rhetoric, Theology, and Literature in the Middle Ages. Transl. by David Laatsch. Minneapolis, Minn. 2003, pp. 87ff.

⁶² Aquinas, Thomas. Summa Theologica. Corpus Thomisticum. Nov. 5, 2005.

<[Http://www.corpusthomicum.org/sth1015.html](http://www.corpusthomicum.org/sth1015.html)>

books of the *Aeneid* is attributed to Bernardus Silvestris. The 12th-century allegorists exerted their influence on later vernacular literary culture and established a norm of allegorical writing. Allegorists legitimized metaphors as an intellectual access to truth. Hugh of St. Victor's instructional work the *Didascalicon* is an example. Hugo de St. Victor writes in his *Didascalicon*:

*Duae praecipue res sunt quibus quisque ad scientiam instruitur, videlicet lectio et meditatio, e quibus lectio priorem in doctrina obtinet locum, et de hac tractat liber iste dando praecepta legendi. tria autem sunt praecepta magis lectioni necessaria: primum, ut sciat quisque quid legere debeat, secundum, quo ordine legere debeat, id est, quid prius, quid postea, tertium, quomodo legere debeat. de his tribus per singula agitur in hoc libro. instruit autem tam saecularium quam divinarum scripturarum lectorem. unde et in duas partes dividitur, quarum unaquaeque tres habet distinctiones. in prima parte docet lectorem artium, in secunda parte divinum lectorem. docet autem hoc modo, ostendendo primum quid legendum sit, deinde quo ordine et quomodo legendum sit. ut autem sciri possit quid legendum sit aut quid praecipue legendum sit, in prima parte primum numerat originem omnium artium deinde descriptionem et partitionem earum, id est, quomodo unaquaeque contineat aliam, vel contineatur ab alia, secans philosophiam a summo usque ad ultima membra.*⁶³

In *De Studio Legendi* Victor also divides into the two genres (*genera*) of scripture (*scriptura*).⁶⁴

In *De Ordine et Numero Librorum* Victor writes:

*[778D] Omnis divina scriptura in duobus testamentis continetur, in veteri videlicet et novo. utrumque testamentum tribus ordinibus distinguitur. Vetus Testamentum continet legem, prophetas, hagiographos, Novum autem evangelium, apostolos, patres.*⁶⁵

⁶³ Hugonis de Sancto Victore *Didascalicon*. The Latin Library. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo1.html](http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo1.html)>

⁶⁴ Hugonis de Sancto Victore *Didascalicon*. The Latin Library. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo3.html](http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo3.html)>

⁶⁵ Hugonis de Sancto Victore *Didascalicon*. The Latin Library. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo4.html](http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo4.html)>

Victor uses the term interpreters for the holy scriptures (*interpretes Veteris Testamenti*) (Caput V. *De interpretibus*).

*Modus legendi in dividendo constat. omnis divisio incipit a finitis, et ad infinita usque progreditur. omne autem finitum magis notum est et scientia comprehensibile. doctrina autem ab his quae magis nota sunt incipit, et per eorum notitiam ad scientiam eorum quae latent pertingit. praeterea ratione investigamus, ad quam proprie pertinet dividere, quando ab universalibus ad particularia descendimus dividendo et singulorum naturas investigando. omne namque universale magis est determinatum suis particularibus. quando ergo discimus, ab his incipere debemus quae magis sunt nota et determinata et complectentia, sicque paulatim descendendo, et per divisionem singula distinguendo, eorum quae continentur naturam investigare.*⁶⁶

A list of figures and tropes was given in book 4 of the pseudo-Ciceronian *Rhetorica ad Herennium*. The traditions of rhetoric, poetic, and grammar was preserved in Latin *artes poetriae* written by teachers like Matthew of Vendôme under the title *Ars Versificatoria* and Geoffrey of Vinsauf's *Poetria Nova* and *Documentum De Modo et Arte Dictandi et Versificandi*. Geoffrey's directions for describing a beautiful woman from his *Poetria Nova* stand in the tradition of ideal-typical descriptions:

If you wish to describe womanly beauty:

*Let Nature's compass draw the outline of the head; let the color of gold gleam in the hair; let lilies grow on the lofty forehead. Let the eyebrows equal black whortleberries in appearance; let a milky way intersect the twin eyebrows; let restraint rule the shape of the nose, lest it fall short of, or exceed, the proper bounds. Let the sentinels of the forehead gleam from both sides, twin little eyes with emerald lights, like a constellation. Let the face be like the dawn, neither rosy nor white, but of both and neither color at the same time. Let the diminutive mouth shine forth like a half circle; let the swelling lips be moderately full, and red, fired with a mild flame. Let order join together the snow-white, even teeth.*⁶⁷

⁶⁶ Hugonis de Sancto Victore Didascalicon. The Latin Library. May 28, 2007.

<<http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/hugo/hugo3.html>>

⁶⁷ Geoffrey of Vinsauf: Directions for Describing a Beautiful Woman. University of British Columbia. Aug. 11, 2005.

<<http://faculty.arts.ubc.ca/rrouse/110-vinsauf.htm>>

Julius Caesar Scaliger wrote in *Epidorpidēs* on the method of speech (*orationis ratio*):

Orationis ratio.
Si quando loquentes Eranum damus Latine,
De re dubia, ac difficili quod explicemus:
Nusquam repetita, & brevis, & facetæ simplexque,
Et pura sit oratio: fucata molesta est.
Calamistrata nocentque, premuntque dignitatem,
Crispata, modique indiga, bracteata verba.
Nec tardiloquum, nec celerem, nec incitatum,
Nec qui levis in cursibus, impotens tui sis:
Volo te compositum: te iubeo dicere tractim.
Auditor ut & te audiat: audias te & ipse.
Si scribis: ut est mos facilisque, lexque rerum:
Quo quicque cupit tempora propagare vitæ:
Oratio sit lecta, sed haud maligna, turgens,
Fragosa, sui que invida, contumax sibi ipsi.
Peior tamen hac sordida, plebeia, fathiscens:
In qua nihil est undique, quod movere possit:
Suspendere nil auriculam severam aceto.
Nostrum hac humili vult sibi saeculum placere,
Gustu insipido marcidum, inertique palato.
Nanque ante abiens labitur, atque ingrediatur.
Res eligere hinc docta iubent dicta Sophorum,
Pro viribus: ut conveniat tibi que & illis.
Ne rideat unco fera gens Critica naso:
*Nannilli humero stridere sub sarcina Atlantis.*⁶⁸

Ricardi de Bury (1287-1345) dedicates in his *Philobiblon* several chapters on the treatment of books. The *Philobiblon* is divided into the following chapters (*capitula*):

⁶⁸ Scaliger, Julius Caesar. *Poemata*. Ed. By Paula Koning. II, p. 137. Leiden University. Heinsius-Collectie. University Leiden. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.let.leidenuniv.nl/Dutch/Latijn/ScaligerEpidorpidēs.htm](http://www.let.leidenuniv.nl/Dutch/Latijn/ScaligerEpidorpidēs.htm)>

- I *Quod thesaurus sapientia potissime sit in libris*
- II *Qualis amor libris rationabiliter debeatur*
- III *Qualiter in libris emendis sit pretium aestimandum*
- IV *Querimonia librorum contra clericos jam promotos*
- V *Querimonia librorum contra religiosos possessionatus*
- VI *Querimonia librorum contra religiosos mendicantes*
- VII *Querimonia librorum contra bella*
- VIII *De multiplici opportunitate quam habuimus librorum copiam conquirendi*
- IX *Quod licet opera veterum amplius amaremus, non tamen damnavimus studia modernorum*
- X *De successiva perfectione librorum*
- XI *Quare libros liberalium litterarum praetulimus libris juris*
- XII *Quare libros grammaticales tanta diligentia curavimus renovare*
- XIII *Quare non omnino negleximus fabulas poetarum*
- XIV *Qui deberet esse librorum potissimi dilectores*
- XV *Quot commoda confert amor librorum*
- XVI *Quam meritorium sit libros novos scribere et veteres renovare*
- XVII *De debita honestate circa librorum custodiam adhibenda*
- XVIII *Quod tantam librorum collegimus copiam ad communem profectum scholarium et non solum ad propriam voluptatem*
- XIX *De moduo communicandi studentibus omnes libros nostros*
- XX *Exhortatio scholarium ad rependedum pro nobis suffragia debitae pietatis*⁶⁹

Walter Burley wrote in *De Sensibus* about the relation between *sensatio* and *opinio*:

*Circa sensationem visus maxime sunt varie opiniones. Una est que ponit visionem fieri neque per actionem obiecti neque sensus, nec per passionem, sed per solam representiam obiecti supposita dispositione medii et sensus.*⁷⁰

⁶⁹ Bury, Ricardi de. Philobiblon. Informal Music May 28, 2007.

<<http://www.informalmusic.com/latinsoc/debury.html>>

⁷⁰ Burley, Walter. De Sensibus. University Vienna. May 27, 2007.

<<http://homepage.univie.ac.at/thomas.gloning/tx/wburl-ds.htm>>

In terms of social life the society of the Middle Ages didn't cultivate any systematic forms and methods of criticism with the exception of individual approaches. The technical linguistic forms of criticism were less developed. In the 15th century we find a shift: The critical concept and its vocabulary enter the vernacular languages. Dasypodius dictionary is an example how the Greek and Latin vocabulary was conjunct with meanings in the German language and so Germanic and Roman languages were scholarly put in context with each other. Dasypodius writes in his German-Latin dictionary on *crisis*: 'Latine *iudicium* is 'ein vrteyl'.' *Criticus, a, um* means here 'iudicarius' within the Latin sentence *Critici dicuntur librorum censores & reprehensores* translated as 'Die die bu^echer beschetzen vnd schelten.' Related entries are *critici dies, aliàs decretorij* for 'Die tag dar an man von der kranckheyt vrteylen mag / als der sibend / vierzehend.'⁷¹ Among the collection of writings entitled *Lupi Abbatis Ferrariensis Epistolarum Additamentum* we find the entry "*Verum haec criticus quisque, quomodo volet, accipiat.*"⁷²

⁷¹ Dasypodius. Dictionary. University Newcastle upon Tyne. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.staff.ncl.ac.uk/jon.west/dasypodius/das_dice_data.htm>

⁷² Lupi Abbatis Ferrariensis Epistolarum Additamentum. Monumenta Germaniae Historica. May 20, 2007.

<http://mdzx.bib-bvb.de/dmgh_new/app/web?action=loadExtra&extraAction=loadSearch>

1.3. „Critica“ - On Criticism in the New Time

Until the revolutions since the 18th century in Europe artists did not freely criticize the power structures of their societies. But the *literati* employed techniques and produced a critical culture. The Renaissance brought several alternative ways of thinking in intellectual life to Europe.⁷³ The status of criticism increased due to technical needs of book production and a more liberal intellectual life compared to the Middle Ages. The intellectual life of the Renaissance also includes alternative concepts and discussions. An idea of the humanistic movement in Renaissance was the concept of humanity (*humanitas*) and the educational efforts aiming going back on Cicero's *studia humanitatis* with a strong emphasis on linguistic communication. The cultivation of linguistic skills was considered a necessary background of morals and philosophy. Opposed to the practice of studying during the Middle Ages criticism was formulated in a more sophisticated way regarding the quality of texts. In the first period of the Renaissance in Italy the study of texts revived during the corruption of existing manuscripts and was done by critics such as Laurentius Valla and Politianus. Scientific basis for textual criticism was established by the French School, the Scaligers, Lambinus, Salmasius, Casaubon, Gronovius, Burmann, Hemsterhuys, and especially Richard Bentley.⁷⁴ The first published and print edition of the Greek *New Testament* was produced by a method of copy text editing. Erasmus of Rotterdam was the editor selecting a manuscript from the local Dominican monastery in Basle. Erasmus asked in his *Epistolarum Formula* what the critics (*critici*) say:

D. Erasmus Roterodamus Petro Paludano icisti me tandem humanissime Petre. Habes toties efflagitatam a nobis scribendarum epistolarum rationem. Sed vide interim dum tuae mores

⁷³ See as research literature on Renaissance criticism:

Weinberg, Bernard. *A History of Literary Criticism in the Italian Renaissance*. Ann Arbor, Mich.: Univ. Microfilms Intern, 1995

D'Amico, John F. *Theory and Practice in Renaissance Textual Criticism: Beatus Rhenanus between Conjecture and History*. Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1988

Spingarn, Joel Elias. *A History of Literary Criticism in the Renaissance with Special Reference to the Influence of Italy in the Formation and Development of Modern Classicism*. New York : Macmillan [e.a.] 1899

⁷⁴ Peck, Harry Thurston. *Harpers Dictionary of Classical Antiquities*. *Perseus Project*. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0062%3Aid%3Dtextual-criticism](http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.04.0062%3Aid%3Dtextual-criticism)>

*gero voluntati, quantis me calumniis ipse obiecerim. Quid tandem Critici dicent? Imo quid non dicent, ubi viderint me ausum tractare rem a multis tam diligenter ac scite tractatam? Vis tu, inquier, Penelopes telam retexere post tantos auctores? Aut eadem dicas necesse est, aut deteriora, quorum alterum supervacaneum est, alterum etiam perniciosum. Ego vero quamquam multa alia habeo quae respondere possum, unus hoc tamen dico, nullius qui de hac re aliquid conscripserit, me vestigiis inhaesurum. Accipe itaque brevissimam, maximeque compendiariam conficiendarum epistolarum formulam, tibi que hoc unum persuade, non verbis tantum illas, sed arte etiam indigere. Vale, saluta amicos communes.*⁷⁵

Regarding the *New Testament* criticism began as philosophic speculations and made it necessary to ask for the transmission of texts and their quality. Erasmus writes in the letter *Iodoco Ioniae Erphordiensi S.D.* on the rule of Christi (*Christi regula*):

*Quanquam autem illud vitae institutum, in quod per incitiam aetatis fuerat vel delapsus vel pertractus, nequaquam probabat, subinde dicitans apud me fatuorum esse vitam potius quam religiosorum ad nolae signum dormire, expergisci, redormiscere, loqui, tacere, ire, redire, cibum capere, desinere pastu, denique nihil non facere ad praescriptum humanum potius quam ad Christi regulam: nihil iniquius esse quam inter tam inaequales aequalitatem, maxime quod illic saepenumero coelestia ingenia ac melioribus rebus nata, caerimoniis et constitutiunculis humanis aut etiam livore sepelirentur: tamen nec cuiquam unquam fuit auctor mutandae vitae, nec ipse quicquam huiusmodi molitus est, paratus omnia ferre potius quam ulli mortalium offendiculo esse, Pauli sui exemplum in hoc quoque referens. Nihil autem erat tam iniquum quod ille pacis servandae studio non summa cum alacritate perpeteretur.*⁷⁶

The casual work *The Colloquies* of Erasmus was a published dialogue and in the preface commentary on this book we find an early critical statement in a printed book regarding the quality of the book and the changes the editor made:

⁷⁵ Erasmus of Rotterdam. *Brevissima Conficiendarum Epistolarum Formula*. Bibliotheca Latina. Latinitas in Tela Totius Terrae. Aug. 2, 2005.

<[Http://www.grexlat.com/biblio/brevissima/textus.htm](http://www.grexlat.com/biblio/brevissima/textus.htm)>

⁷⁶ Erasmus Roterodamus. *Epistolae Selectae*. Bibliotheca Augustana. July 14, 2005.

<[Http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost16/Erasmus/era_ep18.html](http://www.fh-augsburg.de/~harsch/Chronologia/Lspost16/Erasmus/era_ep18.html)>

*A Book of Colloquies had appeared, the material of which was collected partly from domestic talks, partly from my papers; but with a mixture of certain trivialities, not only without sense, but also in bad Latin, perfect solecisms. This trash was received with wonderful applause; for in these matters too Fortune has her sport. I was compelled therefore to lay hands on these trumperies. At length, having applied somewhat greater care, I added considerable matter, so that the book might be of fair size, and in fact might appear worthy even of the honour of being dedicated to John Erasmus, son of Froben, a boy then six years old, but of extraordinary natural ability.*⁷⁷

The literati were also aware of critical techniques such as conjunctions, added notes in the original text derived from critical examinations. Among the writers of commentaries in Renaissance Franciscus Philephus mentioned in his Latin translation of the *Rhetorica ad Alexandrum* conjunctions (*coniecturae*) of the speech (*oratio*):

*Coniecturae autem sunt, quaequunque hisce rebus de quibus omnis habetur dictio repugnarint, et quibus ipsa oratio adversatur.*⁷⁸

Pico della Mirandula writes in his *Oratio de Hominis Dignitate* about the interpretation (*interpretatio*) through the philosophy of nature (*philosophiam naturae*):

*Quae quid aliud esse potest quam secretioris per philosophiam naturae interpretatio? [...] Scribunt non modo celebres Hebreorum doctores, sed ex nostris quoque Hesdras, Hilarius et Origenes, Mosen non legem modo, quam quinque exarata libris posteris reliquit, sed secretionem quoque et veram legis enarrationem in monte divinitus accepisse; preceptum autem ei a Deo ut legem quidem populo publicaret, legis interpretationem nec traderet litteris, nec invulgaret, sed ipse Iesu Nave tantum, tum ille aliis deinceps succedentibus sacerdotum primoribus, magna silentii religione, revelaret.*⁷⁹

⁷⁷ Erasmus of Rotterdam. *The Colloquies of Erasmus*. Transl. by N. Bailey. Vol. I. London 1878. Athenaeum Reading Room. Sept. 2, 2005.

<<http://evans-experientialism.freewebspace.com/erasmus05.htm>>

⁷⁸ Aristotle. *Aristoteles Latine Interpretibus Variis Edidit Academia Regia Borussica*. Berlin 1831. Reprint edited by Eckhard Keßler. Munich 1995, pp. 732. (10. 14-16.)

⁷⁹ Pico della Mirandula. *Oratio de Hominis Dignitate*. Brown University. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.brown.edu/Departments/Italian_Studies/pico/oratio.html>

In modern times criticism wasn't any longer dominated by theology as the paradigm for the world order and academic hierarchy of knowledge. During Renaissance both philosophy and theology claimed to be on the top of scholarly sciences. Petrus Crinitus (Pietro Riccio, 1465 – 1505) writes in the *Commentarii de Honesta Disciplina* (1504) (liber XVIII.I) that critics (*critici*) use to censor the *fabulae Attae* according to Horace. Crinitus explains what it means to do an exposition of the meaning (literally: sense) of Horace (*Horatianum sensum exponere*):

*Quin illud magis fuerat explicandum, quisnam hic Atta, aut quid in scena crocus et flores. Quae cum paulo diligentius pensitarem, haud ab re futurum putavi si Horatianum sensum exponerem. Constat igitur Attam ipsum comoediarum auctorem fuisse haud incelebrem, ut in "Poëtis" diximus. Ex quo, inquit Horatius: si velim nunc Attae fabulas, ut critici solent, reprehendere, quod in scenam vix afferri debeant, omnes me inscitiae atque imprudentiae arguent. Videbor enim addubitare an satis in scena suas partes absolveret ; hoc est crocum et flores perambulare. Quoniam consuetudo apud veteres fuit, uti cum fabulae agerentur, flores ibidem aliaque odoramenta inspergerentur. Hinc Lucretianum illud in libro ad Memm. II.*⁸⁰

Shakespeare uses the term critic as a censor, carper.⁸¹ In the reformation criticism as a method became a powerful philological tool in theology. In philosophy the so-called 'two cultures problem' of 'arts' versus 'sciences' emerged in the 17th century questioning if ancient or modern texts were better. The characteristic judgement issued by critics relates to the economy of effort to value.⁸² Criticism began to perform important functions in the production and reproduction of certain characteristic modern modes of thought in Europe since the 17th century. Melchior Adam (1615-1620) writes in the *Vitae Germanorum* about three kinds of interpretation in his entry about Salomon Gesnerus:

⁸⁰ Crinitus, Petrus. Pietro Riccio. *Commentarii de Honesta Disciplina*. Liber XVIII. Homepage Lucien de Luca. June 16, 2005.

<[Http://www.chez.com/asklepios/crinitus/Liber_18.htm](http://www.chez.com/asklepios/crinitus/Liber_18.htm)>

⁸¹ Schmidt, Alexander. *Shakespeare Lexicon and Quotation Dictionary*. Perseus Project. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.03.0079%3Aentry%3D%233975](http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/cgi-bin/ptext?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.03.0079%3Aentry%3D%233975)>

⁸² Cf. Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Die Charakteristik. Ueberlieferung und Nutzung einer Form in den Medien Schrift und Sprache in Quellen der antiken Philologie und Redekunst und Neuzeit Deutschlands*. Zeitschrift fuer Religions- und Geistesgeschichte. Potsdam 2001. Bd. 4. 2001. S.302-318.

*Quae est vera interpretatio horum verbosum: Panis est corpus Christi? Respondeo: Tres sunt interpretationes. Prima est Papistarum, qui fingunt trans substantiationem. Altera scholasticorum: qui fingunt Consubstantiationem. Tertia est Orthodoxorum: qui dicunt, illa veria sacramentaliter exponenda esse: ut neque substantialis aliqua mutatio panis fiat: neque occultatio, aut coexistentis substantialis corporis, sub pane, seu ad locum stasuat: sed ut per fidem panis eucharisticus intelligatur esse sacramentum, seu testimonium, pignus atque sigillum, medium ac instrumentum, divinitus ordinatum: cuius usu legitimo obsignetur, id est, non nude significetur: sed applicetur et confirmetur nobis, vera cemmunio corporis et sanguinis Christi, et omnia beneficia Christi Evangelio promissa.*⁸³

Thomas Hobbes' *The Leviathan* contains in its first chapters discourses on imagination, speech, reason and science, and intellectual virtues. Hobbes uses the opposition of art and nature in the introduction of *The Leviathan*:

*Nature (the art whereby God hath made and governs the world) is by the art of man, as in many other things, so in this also imitated, that it can make an artificial animal. For seeing life is but a motion of limbs, the beginning whereof is in some principal part within, why may we not say that all automata (engines that move themselves by springs and wheels as doth a watch) have an artificial life? For what is the heart, but a spring; and the nerves, but so many strings; and the joints, but so many wheels, giving motion to the whole body, such as was intended by the Artificer?*⁸⁴

Some radical critical intellectual approaches were done by philosophers and educators. Truth as an element of philosophical reasoning was inquired by Francis Bacon. Asking *What is Truth?* Bacon performs a critical discourse on metaphors in his *Essays*:

What is truth? said jesting Pilate, and would not stay for an answer. Certainly there be, that delight in giddiness, and count it a bondage to fix a belief; affecting free-will in thinking, as well as in acting. And though the sects of philosophers of that kind be gone, yet there remain certain discoursing wits, which are of the same veins, though there be not so much blood in

⁸³ Melcior Adam. Vitae Germanorum. University Mannheim. July 17, 2005.

<http://www.uni-mannheim.de/mateo/camenaref/adam.html>

⁸⁴ Hobbes, Thomas. *Leviathan*. Oregon State University. Febr. 17, 2005.

<http://oregonstate.edu/instruct/phl302/texts/hobbes/leviathan-contents.html>

*them, as was in those of the ancients. But it is not only the difficulty and labor, which men take in finding out of truth, nor again, that when it is found, it imposeth upon men's thoughts, that doth bring lies in favor; but a natural though corrupt love, of the lie itself. One of the later school of the Grecians, examineth the matter, and is at a stand, to think what should be in it, that men should love lies; where neither they make for pleasure, as with poets, nor for advantage, as with the merchant; but for the lie's sake. But I cannot tell; this same truth, is a naked, and open day-light, that doth not show the masks, and mummeries, and triumphs, of the world, half so stately and daintily as candle-lights. Truth may perhaps come to the price of a pearl, that showeth best by day; but it will not rise to the price of a diamond, or carbuncle, that showeth best in varied lights. A mixture of a lie doth ever add pleasure. Doth any man doubt, that if there were taken out of men's minds, vain opinions, flattering hopes, false valuations, imaginations as one would, and the like, but it would leave the minds, of a number of men, poor shrunken things, full of melancholy and indisposition, and unpleasing to themselves?*⁸⁵

In the 16th century French Petrus Ramus proposed to reorganize the school curriculum. Ramus proposed a division of universities into multiple schools and departments of study. The five components of rhetoric no longer existed under the common concept of rhetoric. Invention and disposition were determined to fall under the concept of philosophy. Elocution of language, delivery, and memory were parts that remained for rhetoric.

Jean Le Clerc's of Amsterdam *Ars Critica in Qua ad Studia Linguarum Latinae, Graecae et Hebraicae Munitur* was published in 1699. Guiliemus Alabaster in 1598 in the writing *Capita de Quibus Onnes Tenentur Sincere Respondere Priusquam ad Habitum et Convictum Collegii Anglicani Admittuntur* asked in his third question (*tertia quaestio*) regarding the disciplines of studies:

De studiis quibus operam dederit, et de profectu et progressu, et ubi studuerit.

The answer (*responsio*) includes the field *critica*:

⁸⁵ Bacon, Sir Francis. The Essays. Oregon State University. Nov. 14, 2005.

<[#OF%20DISCOURSE](http://oregonstate.edu/instruct/phl302/texts/bacon/bacon_essays.html)>

*Grammaticam, poesin, rhetoricam, logicam, philosophiam, mathematicas, historiam, criticam, philologiam, omnesque pene antiquos authores Grecos et Latinos, qua magis, qua minus, gustavi aut hausi, quatenus quidquam ad theologiam pretium operae facturum sperarem. Multa Graecorum patrum minora opera, et similiter Latinorum et historiam ecclesiasticam, et Sententiarum Magistrum et D. Thomae Summam, et patris Roberti Bellarmini et Zuaris in 3a et Stapletoni Principia, et similia Catholicorum scripta evolvi Cantabrigiae. 12 annos studui, quo tempore theologiae licentiati evadunt.*⁸⁶

Not only in the field of academic studies criticism as *critica* was established. Also the critic as a part of intellectual and art production was now addresses. William Gager's play *Ulysses Redux* contains in its publication of the year 1591 a preface *Ad Criticum*.

Ad Criticum

Uorsum inquis, epistola? An nos concione etiam aliqua enecabis? Parumne tibi praestatur, si versus tui legantur? Cuius patientiae erit, praefationem quoque tolerare? Ecquando ad carmina tandem ipsa licebit pervenire? Quid porro hic dicturus es, quod non in prologo tuo dixisti, aut saltem in epilogo dicere potuisti? Recte tu quidem ista, critice, si scriberem epigrammata; quibus epistolari opera non est opus, quia in quacunque pagina visum est, epistolam facere solent. At tragaedis, quibus pro se loqui non licet, praefari semper permissum fuit, et ego tragediam scribo. Imo, non est, inquis, haec tragaedia. Quid ita, critice? Quia, inquis, et materiae quadam mendicitate peccet, dictioneque plerumque comica est; et risum in Iro movet, quod in tragaedia nefas est, atque adeo piaculum; et vere tragico affectu vacat (quis enim aut procorum, id est hominum improborum interitu suspiret, aut meretricularum suspensio illachrymetur?). Postremo, quia laetum habet exitum. Profecto ipsum te esse criticum oportet, ita es ingeniose maledicus, et quidem haud scio an vera ista sint; fortasse non multum absunt a veris. Sed tamen libet ire contra. Ac primum tibi illa Horatiana respondeo,

*et tragicus plerumque dolet sermone pedestri,
Telephus et Peleus cum pauper et exul uterque*

⁸⁶ Guiliemus Alabaster. *Capita de Quibus Onmes Tenentur Sincere Respondere Priusquam ad Habitum et Convictum Collegii Anglicani admittuntur*. University of Birmingham. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/alab/text.html](http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/alab/text.html)>

proiicit ampullas, et sesquipedalia verba.

Mihi vero, quoad licuit, Homeri vestigiis insistere, nunquamque a boni senis quasi latere discedere, religio fuit. Quis enim a tanto vate vel latum unguem libenter abiret? Aut quis meliora se ac grandiora confidat allaturum? Ut, qui materiae dictionisque humilitatem carpit, non me, sed Homerum ipsum, id est principem, ideam, ac deum poetarum reprehendat; eum vero qui vituperat, Zoilum esse necesse sit. Porro in Cyclope Euripides Silenum, satyros, ipsumque Polyphemum ridicule garrientes, et Seneca Thyesten non nimis sane sobrium inducit. Quid vero illa Sophoclis cignea cantio Oedipus Colonaeus, quam centesimum prope agens annum scripsit, quanquam antiquitas tantopere admirata est? Quid, inquam, ea magnopere luctuosum habet, praeter placidam et maturam Oedipodis, iam senio confecti, mortem? Electrae vero quod aliud est argumentum, quam Clytemnestrae nequissimae foeminae, Aegistisque adulteri, iustissima caedes? Eiusdem denique Philoctetes, et Senecae Hercules Oeteus, in quam aliam catastrophem, nisi laetam desinunt? Quid ego hic tot Euripidis tragaedias commemorem? Quarum fere nulla est, quae non in omnem istam reprehensionem incurrat. Magnis ego me et authoribus et argumentis possem defendere; sed emoriar si amem lites, saltem criticas, id est futiles, id est tuas, critice. Nam ut vivendi, sic etiam scribendi ratio mihi imprimis probatur ea, quae est paulo liberior ac pene dissolutior, quaeque non tam doctissimis, quam imperitis placeat. Quid enim putidius quam quod tu facere soles, <scilicet dicere nos> in eo peccare, quia nihil peccare discriamur? Equidem ego hanc sive tragaediam, sive fabulam, sive narrationem historicam, sive quicquid eam dici ius fasque est, non ad exquisitam Artis Poeticae tanquam aurificis stateram, sed ad popularis iudicii trutinam exigendam proposui, et effudi potius quam scripsi. In qua minus ingenio laborandum fuit, in cuius locum dimidiae pene Odysseae argumentum succedit; quo in digerendo, non tam acumine, quam delectu, nec tam copia, quam modo opus habui. At qui ut ipse arrogans sim, si cuiquam haec mortalium minus quam mihi placeret: ita tu improbe facis, qui in alieno libello nimis es ingeniosus. “At quid tibi,” inquis, “omnino est cum tragaedia? Quid tibi cum Homero, ac non potius cum Bartolo negotii est? Cui bono est, si apud te vel Ulysses diserte, vel caste loquatur Penelope?” Iam parce, quaeso; iam puto mehercule verum dicis. critice. Ne vivam <si> ulterius respondere ausim. Quare benevolus lector debebit tuae, id est malae linguae, quod defensionem meditatus longissimam, epistola eum prolixiore non defatigem. Vale.⁸⁷

⁸⁷ Gager, William. Ulysses Redux. Tragaedia Nova In Aede Christi Oxoniae Publice Academicis Recitata. 1591. University Birmingham. May 20, 2007.

A standard element of Baroque books was the preface with epigrams directed to the reader. Published in *Tessera Caerulea. Commentariolum. Tessera Rubicunda Nota Textualis. Tessera Virida* of the *Epigrammatum Liber Quintus* an epigram on hypocrisy and epigram directed towards the critics was written by Owen:

Autor ad Lectorem

In quaedam hypocritam

“Nescit” ais “*mea laeva manus quid dextera donat.*”

Credo, quod omnino dat tua dextra nihil.

Mors in olla. Ad criticos Palatinos

Ut verbum vetus in quit in olla est mors. An in aula?

Nam veteres, Plauto teste, loquuntur ita.

*Veteribus Latinis olla et aula idem sunt.*⁸⁸

Among the epigrams of John Owen we find the epigram *Ad Criticum Aulicum*

Ad Criticum Aulicum

Nil distant labor atque labos, nihil arbor et arbos,

*Idem honor est et honos: qui rapit ergo sapit.*⁸⁹

The *Dictionnaire Historique et Critique* of Pierre Bayle uses the terms *remarques critiques* for the examination of contemporary dictionaries.⁹⁰ The 17th century was coined by a

<[Http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/gager/plays/ulysses/act1lat.html#adcrit](http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/gager/plays/ulysses/act1lat.html#adcrit)>

⁸⁸ Owen, John (Ioannes Audoenus). *Epigrammatum Liber Quintus. Tessera Caerulea. Commentariolum. Tessera Rubicunda Nota Textualis. Tessera Virida Translation.* University Birmingham. 5. Aug. 2003. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/owen/5lat.html](http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/owen/5lat.html)>

⁸⁹ Ioannis Audoeni *Epigrammatum Liber Nonus.* University Birmingham. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/owen/9lat.html](http://www.philological.bham.ac.uk/owen/9lat.html)>

⁹⁰ Bayle, Pierre. *Dictionnaire Historique et Critique.* PhiloLogic Software. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

movement of the secularization and resulted in limitations of absolutism. The absolute state stood over a society that had an increasingly extending civil population in cities as middle class living in cities opposed to the aristocracy. Europe was in the 17th century politically divided into several territories. The 17th century brought as a fundamental development in Europe the separation of nations with a distinguishable religious and cultural identity after the war of 1648 and continental-European conflicts and the English revolutions in England. Regency determined and protected the local religion and vice versa. In all countries of Europe a call for civil liberties came up and was the basis for the later formation of national states. France and the Netherlands had leading positions in the 17th century. England establishes a new political system of parliamentary power in the 17th century serving as ground for a new intellectual climate. Tensions between the aristocracy and the middle classes and religious and profane institutions came up. The unrestricted rule of a king/queen or a prince/princess was commonly connected with the catholic or Protestant church. Social critical movements made critical inquiries or even formulated alternative concepts.

In England John Wilkins in *An Essay Towards a Real Character and a Philosophical Language* (1668) uses the word *critic* for a *judger of words*.⁹¹ Thomas Blount in *Glossographia or a Dictionary* (1656) writes regarding *critical or judicial days (dies critici)* that

*when the disease comes to the Crisis or judgement of a amending or impairing, and they are the fourth and seventh days; because in them the Physitians use to judge of the danger of a disease: But the seventh is accounted the chief Critical day, and the fourth a token or sign, what the seventh day will be, if the Patient live so long. This account must be made according to the number of weeks thus; in the first week the fourth day is the token or Critical of the seventh day. In the second week the eleventh is the Critical of the fourteenth. In the third, the seventeenth is the Critical of the twentyeth, (for Hippocrates reckons the twentyeth day for the last of the third week) In the fourth, the twentyfourth is the Critical of the twenty seventh; and so forth to an hundred.*⁹²

<[Http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/Bayle.sh?milestone=critique&pageident=](http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/Bayle.sh?milestone=critique&pageident=)>

⁹¹ LEME. Lexicons of Early Modern English. University Toronto. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://leme.library.utoronto.ca](http://leme.library.utoronto.ca)>

⁹² LEME. Lexicons of Early Modern English. University Toronto. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://leme.library.utoronto.ca](http://leme.library.utoronto.ca)>

In 1721 Christian Wolff delivered an oration *On the Practical Philosophy of the Chinese*. *Anfangsgründe aller mathematischen Wissenschaften* (1710) was published in Latin as *Elementa Matheseos Universae* (1713-1715). Wolff also wrote the works *Philosophia Rationalis, sive Logica* (1728), *Philosophia Prima, sive Ontologia* (1729), *Cosmologia Generalis* (1731), *Psychologia Empirica* (1732), *Psychologia Rationalis* (1734), and *Theologia Naturalis* (1736-1737). A distinction can be made between criticism as applied method for the *Old Testament* and as applied to the *New Testament*. *Old Testament*-criticism has been developed along the lines of linguistic and historic research. Philosophical-religious prejudices have been kept in the background. The term ‘anti-criticism’ (*anti critica*) can be found as a title for written answers of a critical work during this time. In the art of dialectics and in the ancient methods criticism was already treated for answering in verbal discussion and written speech. Literary works called ‘anti-criticism’ are representatives for literature in prose genres. Writings with these titles serve for the representation of reactions made in reviews. The controversy in the discussion and in written papers was a form of the contest (*certamen*) at universities in the epoche of Enlightenment. In academic institutes the contest between the faculties was delivered in form of literary controversy (*certamen litterarium*) for example at the university Goettingen in Germany. Newly published writings were treated in writings of the scholars according to their topics in different kinds of the criticism. In philology different terms for the kinds and types of criticism were employed in descriptions and speeches. The public education and the philological institutes at the universities use the designation ‘conversation’ for dialogues containing expressions as names for verbal and written criticism made in a *disputatio critica* and *disputatio philologico critica*. The distribution of prizes (*praemia*) according to judgement (*iudicium*) and awards were known since ancient times. Journals and special magazines for publications on scientific of areas made criticism to an institution on the book market.⁹³

During the 17th century Nicolas Boileau-Despréaux was considered to be the foremost French theoretician of classicism and defender of the ancients. In his *Critical Reflections on Longinus* (1694) Boileau-Despréaux emphasized arguments in favour of ancient writers. Abbé Jean-Baptiste Dubos took a traditional position in his *Critical Reflections on Poetry and Painting*

⁹³ See also chapter 1.3.2 “Critica als Bezeichnung für Sprachlehren zur lateinischen Grammatik der späten Neuzeit”.

In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<<http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/>>

(1719). Dubos wrote in *Réflexions Critiques sur la Poésie et la Peinture* in the preface (*Avant-propos*) anonymously:

*On éprouve tous les jours que les vers et les tableaux causent un plaisir sensible, mais il n' en est pas moins difficile d' expliquer en quoi consiste ce plaisir qui ressemble souvent à l' affliction, et dont les symptômes sont quelquefois les mêmes que ceux de la plus vive douleur. L' art de la poésie et l' art de la peinture ne sont jamais plus applaudis que lorsqu' ils ont réüssi à nous affliger.*⁹⁴

17th century esthetics was marked by a variety of conflicting theories and classification of art styles. By analysis and interpretation of techniques and content of artworks the 17th and 18th century-critics introduced critical discussions of art including historical information as well as art doctrine that emphasized on schools of style.

Rhetoric still was related to ancient traditions. Literary criticism in 17th-century France literature was established as an autonomous field of endeavour. The writer was now a professional. French literary criticism was one restricted aspect of a much broader context of human activity within the *res literaria* inherited from antiquity and the Renaissance and sometimes called the ‘Republic of Letters’. In England Alexander Pope’s *An Essay on Criticism* codifies neoclassic literary theory and criticism in a poem. Pope argues in his didactic poem that the ‘golden age’ of literary theory and criticism was the classical age of Plato, Aristototele, Horace, and Longinus. These authors discovered the rules and laws of harmonious and ordered pieces of art following the guideline that an artist must imitate the beautiful in nature. But it is not enough to copy nature. The artist must show the essential association between nature and art. The enjoyment of a work of art derives from the activity of the active imagination of the receiver. *An Essay on Criticism* was first published anonymously on May 15th 1711. *An Essay on Criticism* is primarily a didactical poem with argumentative structure. The main requirement of a good poet is to possess a natural *genius*, to know the classics, and to follow the rules, traditions, and laws discovered by the ancients. The poet and the critic serve as the custodians and defenders of values of taste and cultural. Pope uses in the poem *An Essay on Criticism* the term proof (*Test*) for the inspection of art

⁹⁴ Dubos, Jean-Baptiste. *Réflexions Critiques sur la Poésie et la Peinture*. May 29, 2007..

<http://fr.wikisource.org/wiki/R%C3%A9flexions_critiques_sur_la_po%C3%A9sie_et_la_peinture:_Avant-propos>

(*art*) and nature (*nature*), which following the properties of bodies like ghost (*spirit*), nerves (*nerves*) and movement (*motion*) is in use for judgement (*Judgement*). In this poem the virtues of knowledge, scholarship, and taste are mentioned:

*First follow nature, and your
Judgement frame*

*By her just Standart, which still the
same:*

*One clear, uncharged, and Universal
Light,*

*Fife, Force, and beauty, must all
impart,*

*At once the source, and End, and
Test of Art.*

*Art from that Fund each just Supply
provides;*

*Works without Show, and without
Pomp presides;*

*In some Fair Body thus th'informing
Soul*

*With Spirits feeds, with vigour fills
the whole,*

*Each Motion guides, and every
Nerve sustains;*

*Itself unseen, but in th'Effects,
remains.*

*Some, to whom Heaven in Wit has
been profuse,*

*Want as much more, to turn it to its
use;*

*For Wit and Judgement often are at
strike,*

*Thoug meant each other's Aid, like
Man and Wife.*

*'Tis more to guide than spur the
Muse's Steed;*

*Restrain his Fury, than provoke his
Speed;*

*The winged Courser, like a gen'rous
Hourse,*

*Shows most true Mettle when you
check his Course.⁹⁵*

In Pope's works a critic is described by rules (*Rules*) and laws (*Laws*). Criticism is personified as the 'muse's handmaid':

*Those Rules of old discovered, not devised,
Are nature still, but Nature methodised:
Nature, like Liberty, is but restrained
By the same Laws which first herself ordained.
The gen'rous Critic fanned the Poet's Fire,*

⁹⁵ Pope, Alexander. *Selected Poems of Alexander Pope*. Edited by Philip Brockbank. London 1964, pp. 198-199.

*And taught the World with Reason to Admire.
Then Criticism the muse's Handmaid proved,
To dress her Charms, and make her more belov'd:
But following Wits from that Intention strayed,
Who could not win the mistress, wooed the Maid;
Against the Poets their own arms they turned;
Sure to hate most the Men from whom they learned.*⁹⁶

In a translation of the writing *De Re Publica* of Aristotle made by Dionysius Lambinus in the 16th century the laws of writers (*scriptoris legum*) are mentioned:

*Est autem scriptoris legum, et eorum qui talem aliquem rei publicae administrandae formam constituere volunt, magnum opus non eam constituisse, neque hoc unum solum eorum opus, sed potius ut conservetur videre nam eos diem unum vel duos vel tres manere, qui quavis rei publicae administratione utantur, non difficile est.*⁹⁷

Samuel Cobb in *Discourse on Criticism and of Poetry in Poems On Several Occasions* (1707) wrote that “Criticism, which was formerly the Art of judging well, is now become the pure Effect of Spleen, Passion and Self-conceit. Nothing is perfect in every Part. He that expects to see any thing so, must have patience till Dooms-day. The Worship we pay to our own Opinion, generally leads to the Contempt of another's. This blind Idolatry of Self is the Mother of Error; and this begets a secret Vanity in our Modern Censurers, who, when they please to think a Meaning for an Author, would thereby insinuate how much his Judgment is inferiour to their enlighten'd Sagacity. When, perhaps, the Failings they expose are a plain Evidence of their own Blindness.”⁹⁸ Just a few years ago John Dryden's (1631-1700) ideal of neoclassicism was expressed, when Dryden revived the classical debate on mimesis tracing back to Plato's times. Dryden argued –just like Aristotle before– for the unity of time, place, and action in drama. According to Dryden the controlling characteristics of literary works should be politeness, clarity, order, decorum, elegance, cleverness, and wit. Dryden – also just like Pope– argued that the ‘golden age’ of literary theory and criticism was the classical age

⁹⁶ Pope, Alexander. *Selected Poems of Alexander Pope*. 1964, pp. 199-200.

⁹⁷ Aristotle. *Aristoteles Latine*. 1831. P. 674.

⁹⁸ Cobb, Samuel. *Poems On Several Occasions*. With an Introduction by Louis I. Bredvold. Project Gutenberg. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.gutenberg.org/files/14528/14528-h/14528-h.htm](http://www.gutenberg.org/files/14528/14528-h/14528-h.htm)>

of Plato, Aristotle, Horace, and Longinus. In *An Essay of Dramatick Poesie* Dryden exemplified the sentence *Delectus verborum origo est eloquentiae* (the source of words is eloquence).

Delectus Verborum Origo est Eloquentiæ.

*It was the saying of Julius Cæsar, one so curious in his, that none of them can be chang'd but for a worse. One would think unlock the door was a thing as vulgar as could be spoken; and yet Seneca could make it sound high and lofty in his Latine. — Reserate clusos Regii postes Laris.*⁹⁹

Poetry sought to reaffirm the truths or absolutes already discovered by classical writers. John Dryden writes in his *Preface to Charles Lord Buckhurst*:

My Lord,

*As I was lately reviewing my loose Papers, amongst the rest I found this Essay, the writing of which in this rude and indigested manner wherein your Lordship now sees it, serv'd as an amusement to me in the Country, when the violence of the last Plague had driven me from the Town.*¹⁰⁰

Dryden writes in the preface *To The Reader* about the *censure*:

*The drift of the ensuing Discourse was chiefly to vindicate the honour of our English Writers, from the censure of those who unjustly prefer the French before them. This I intimate, least any should think me so exceeding vain, as to teach others an Art which they understand much better than my self. But if this incorrect Essay, written in the Country without the help of Books, or advice of Friends, shall find any acceptance in the world, I promise to my self a better success of the second part, wherein the Vertues and Faults of the English Poets, who have written either in this, the Epique, or the Lyrique way, will be more fully treated of, and their several styles impartially imitated.*¹⁰¹

⁹⁹ Dryden, John. *Essay of Dramatick Poesie*. Rutgers University. Jan. 30, 2006.

<[Http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html](http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html)>

¹⁰⁰ Dryden, John. *Essay of Dramatick Poesie*. Rutgers University. Jan. 30, 2006.

<[Http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html](http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html)>

¹⁰¹ Dryden, John. *Essay of Dramatick Poesie*. Rutgers University. Jan. 30, 2006.

<[Http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html](http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html)>

Regarding scholarship, when saying *more errors of the School have been detected*, Dryden writes on the state of sciences in *An Essay of Dramatick Poesie* as follows:

*Is it not evident, in these last hundred years (when the Study of Philosophy has been the business of all the Virtuosi in Christendome) that almost a new Nature has been revealed to us? that more errors of the School have been detected, more useful Experiments in Philosophy have been made, more Noble Secrets in Opticks, Medicine, Anatomy, Astronomy, discover'd, than in all those credulous and doting Ages from Aristotle to us? so true it is that nothing spreads more fast than Science, when rightly and generally cultivated.*¹⁰²

The *Dictionnaire de L'Académie Française* (1st Edition 1694) wrote in the entry *critique*:

Critique. adj. de tout genre. Il se dit du jour où il arrive ordinairement quelque crise. Jour critique. le septiesme, & le quatorziesme sont des jours critiques.

Il se dit aussi, d'Un Discours, d'une Dissertation, où l'on examine avec soin un ouvrage d'esprit pour en porter son jugement. Discours critique. Dissertation critique.

Il signifie encore, Qui trouve à redire à tout. Il est extrêmement critique. il a l'humeur fort critique. ce sont des gens trop critiques, on ne sçauroit vivre avec eux. il faut estre bien critique pour, &c.

Il est aussi subst. & sign. Celui qui examine avec soin un ouvrage d'esprit pour en porter son jugement. Bon critique. meschant critique. c'est un critique fort judicieux.

Il sign. encore, Censeur, Celui qui trouve à redire à tout. C'est un critique fascheux. c'est un vray critique. c'est un critique. il n'y a que des critiques qui y puissent trouver à redire,

Critique. s. f. L'art de juger d'un ouvrage d'esprit. Il est habile dans la critique. il est sçavant dans la critique.

Il sign. aussi, La faculté de bien juger d'un ouvrage d'esprit. C'est un homme qui a la critique bonne. exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. sousmettre quelque chose à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il sign. encore, Une Dissertation faite pour examiner un ouvrage d'esprit. Il a fait une critique sur un tel ouvrage. il a fait la critique d'un tel Poëme. sa critique a esté imprimée.

¹⁰² Dryden, John. *Essay of Dramatick Poesie*. Rutgers University. Jan. 30, 2006.

<[Http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html](http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/drampoet.html)>

*Critiquer. v. act. Censurer, trouver à redire. Critiquer un ouvrage. vous critiquez ce vers-là mal à propos. il critique les actions, la conduite de tout le monde. c'est un homme qui critique sur tout.*¹⁰³

Jacob Masen wrote in the preface of his *Ars Nova Arguitarum Erudita et Honestae Recreationis* published in the year 1711 a preface note to the critics (*ad criticos*) put into verses:

Ad Criticos.
Forsitan aspiciat titulum nonnemo libelli,
Durus et in primo limine censor erit.
Scilicet arguta ridebit in Arte Magistrum:
Qui toties hebeti carmina figat acu.
Ergo aliquis dicet, post tot modo saecula, linguas
Erudit ignotis, praevius arte, viis?
Ille, nec ingenio, neque digno cognitus ausu,
Invideat priscis eripiatque decus?
Non equidem invideo: Priscis sua gloria constet.
Et maneat serae posteritatis honos.
Si tantum stupidos dent posthuma saecula fungos;
Progenies fungi, Tu quoque, Mome fores.
Hos tibi do partus, non sunt tamen absque labore.
Quos tibi propositos, absque labore, vides,
Sit mea culpa labor: nihil hunc detrecto pudorem,
Utilitas veniam quantulacumque dabit.
Et licet intereant speciosi nomina libri.
Lis mihi de titulis nulla futura meis.
Et licet argutae stupeant quandoque Camena;
Non tamen idcirco stigmatè digna gerent.
Saepe ferit positam jaculatrix dextera metam:
Saepe suum transit jacta sagitta scopum:

¹⁰³ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries. ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.
<<http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique>>

*Cespitat in media nonnunquam offensus arena,
Ter licet Elaeo pulvere victor equus.
Dent veniam: quandoque bonus dormitat Homerus.
Quae modo dulce canit, stridula saepe lyra est.
Ludimus, ingenuoque sales miscemus honesto,
Nec cruor in nostro carmine vulnus habet.
His ego displiceam titulis, ingratus alumnis
Cypridis, his titulis jure placebo mihi.
Sed tamen et teneros sociamus versibus ignes:
Noster Amor, Deus est; nostra, Maria, Venus.
Stringimus et metrico vibratum carmine ferrum:
Improbitas hostis, Palladis hasta stylus.¹⁰⁴*

For the representation of criticism in an historical way the term ‘history’ (*historia, historia critica*) was used. Within the organization of arts and of sciences by the developed concept of *artes liberales*, different methods of criticism in a variety of fields were marked as a system of rules and as collective term for works and towards a term. In the book *Bibliographia Critica Scriptores Omnium Artium atque Scientiarum* written by Johann Henrich in the year 1715 the arts (*artes*), sciences (*scientiae*) and disciplines (*disciplinae*) follow the categories general (*vulgaris*), popular (*popularis*), liberal (*liberalis*) and philosophical (*philosophica*). Liberal arts (*artes liberales*) belong to grammar (*grammatica*), rhetoric (*rhetorica*) and poesis (*poesis*). Philology (*philologia*) is subdivided with the critics of the poets (*critici poetarum*) besides the subjects history (*historia*), mathematics (*mathesin*), logic (*logica*) and philosophy (*philosophia*) building the canon of sciences.

¹⁰⁴ Masen. Jacob. *Ars Nova Arguitarum Eruditae et Honestae Recreationis, in Duas Partes Divisa. Prima est Epigrammatum. Altera Inscriptionum Arguitarum.* Authore Jacobo Masenio e Societate Jesu. Editio Nova Auctior et Elegantior. Gap desc. Illustration Coloniae Agrippinae, Sumptibus Henrici Rommerskirchem Bibliopolae, Anno M. DCC. XI. Cum Privilegio Sac. Caes. Majestatis. University Mannheim. Camena. Febr. 18, 2005.

http://www.uni-mannheim.de/mateo/camena/masen4/books/masenars_front.htm

1.4. "Ratio"- On Criticism in the 18th and 19th Century

In the context of the Enlightenment the new human ideal was emancipation by intellectual skills. For the Enlightenment time a change in thinking all political and social ranges is characteristic. The main thoughts of the Enlightenment came from England, Germany, and France. The 18th century-intellectuals demanded sovereignty and attention and the acceptance of expressions of free opinion. The central terms of this time were reasoning and the central position of humans in life. Important conditions for the Enlightenment were the humanism of Renaissance, the discoveries of overseas territories and the resulting new concept of the world, and printing for masses. Book acquisition became affordable for the civil public and publishing trade with newspaper production and book markets developed. Knowledge of other cultures brought criticism to the European society. In the 18th century parts of the educated middle class began to criticize contemporary conditions applying reasonable thinking. Ideas asked for in the Enlightenment were liberty, equality, experience, scientific realization, tolerance, and humanity.¹⁰⁵

In *Polish Literary Criticism Circa 1772: A Genre Perspective* Chrostowska wrote that the mid- to late 1700s saw a diversification of critical expression, marked by a proliferation of new forms, such as the advertisement or notice (*ogłoszenie*) informational report (*doniesienie informacyjne*), the review (*recenzja*), and the polemic (*polemika*).¹⁰⁶ A connection between the art of criticism and *artes liberales* like rhetoric and criticism became popular in disciplines of the sciences in the 18th century. The authors that appointed themselves as critics had different intention of taking part in intellectual life according to the different functions of critics since antiquity established. The representatives of the art of criticism (*ars critica*) in the sciences of the 18th century made references to the terminology and methods of criticism for instructions and training of scholars. A source of this terminology is the rhetoric of antiquity. The classical system was exchanged during the second half of the 18th century by a new

¹⁰⁵ See also chapter 3.1.1 "Critica als historischer Begriff für politische Kritik im 18. Jahrhundert". In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<<http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/>>

The following examples of critical terms have been published also in this work.

¹⁰⁶ Chrostowska, S. D. *Polish Literary Criticism Circa 1772: A Genre Perspective*. University Toronto. June 7, 2007.

<<http://www.utoronto.ca/tsq/14/chrostowska14.shtml>>

historical sense. Representatives of the Enlightenment époque exercised criticism in literary forms of text in their writings. These forms of criticism (*critica*) and art of criticism (*ars critica*) in the century of Enlightenment were divided into small literary contributions like critical comments (*commentatio critica*), the critical note (*adnotatio critica*), and the larger forms of critical letter (*epistola critica*), critical writing (*litera critica*) and critical booklet (*libellus criticus*). Methods of criticism also referred to the didactic discussion (*disputatio*), used the concept of thesis and antithesis (*thesis and antithesis*), resulted in writings with explanations and contributions to criticism named critical investigation (*disquisitio critica*), critical comment (*commentatio critica*), critical remarks (*animadversiones criticae*) and critical exercises (*exercitationes criticae*) for the treatment of literature in all fields of sciences and arts. Among the forms for criticism the comment (*commentarius*), the observation (*observatio*) and questions (*quaestiones*) were used by scholars. The description of texts by methods of criticism in Latin terminology was a way to the investigation that was read in all Latin speaking European academic societies. In Florian Dalham's writing *Ars Critica* this art is used as a philological method for handling literature.¹⁰⁷ The designations critical notes (*animadversiones criticae*), critical letters (*litterae criticae*), critical observations (*observationes critices*), historical-critical comment (*commentatio historico critica*) or critical comment (*commentatio critica*) were also popular for critical works. Representaives of the writings with terms such as criticism or *critica* extend furthermore in this time were also the critical note (*adnotatio critica*) or the critical letter (*epistola critica*), a variant of the scholarly letter. The comment (*commentatio*) was in the Enlightenment a form of the applied criticism. Writings were in the 18th century divided into the historical comment (*commentatio historica*), philological comment (*commentatio philologica*), physical comment (*commentatio physica*) and mathematical comment (*commentatio mathematica*).¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁷ Cf. Haase, Fee-Alexandra. "Ars critica. Der Rhetorlehrer Quintilian als Vorbild für Begriffe und Aufgaben von Kritik in neulateinischen Reden und Schriften Deutschlands im 18. Jahrhundert." In: Recenseo. Texte zur Kunst und Wissenschaft. (2001). May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.phil.uni-sb.de/projekte/kunst/recenseo](http://www.phil.uni-sb.de/projekte/kunst/recenseo)>

See also chapter 2.2.3 "Die epistola critica als publizierte Gelehrtenkorrespondenz". In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/](http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/)>

¹⁰⁸ See also chapter "1.3.4 Die Begriffe der Kritik in philologischen Beiträgen zur Grammatik der deutschen Sprache in der Aufklärung und Romantik" and "1.3.5 Der Begriff Kritik in Beschreibungen der Philologie der Aufklärung". In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

A theory for criticism is also in the year 1762 publicated in a speech with the title *De Oratio Recte Cogitandi, Loquendi et Intelligendi*, in which Dalham notes the separation of different arts by the term *artium divisio*. Criticism is defined as an art (*ars*), the rule to distinct is deciding between true one and wrong one (*regulas ad diiucandum vera a falsis, recta a pravis in res literaria*).¹⁰⁹ In paragraph 22 of his writing *Kurzer Begriff aller Wissenschaften* Johann Georg Sulzer notices in the year 1759 the following about the methods of *Wortcritik and Critik der Künste* in philology:

*Die todten Sprachen koennen nicht anders, als aus den Schriften, welche darin geschrieben sind, erlernt werden. Diese Schriften aber sind durch sehr viele Hände und sehr oft wiederholte Abschriften auf uns gekommen. Es ist deshalb natürlich, daß der Text solcher Schriften an sehr vielen Orten verdorben und verstellt worden. Daher ist noch ein neuer Theil der Philologie entstanden, welcher die Wortcritik kann genennt werden, zum Unterschied der Critik der Künste, wovon wir hernach reden werden. Diese enthaelt die Regeln, nach welchen man von der Richtigkeit der Textes eines in einer todten Sprache geschriebenen Werkes urtheilen soll, und beschreibt die Huelfsmittel, wodurch verdorbene oder verfaelschte Stellen koennen verbessert werden. Der beruehmte le Clerc hat in seinem schoenen Werk, welches unter dem Titel *Ars Critica* bekannt ist, diese Wortcritik mit vieler Gruendlichkeit abgehandelt.*¹¹⁰

Zacharias Pearce used the term *criticus* in *Life and Works of Longinus* describing in a citation of Porphyrius Longinus as the greatest of all critics *omnium Criticorum maximus*):

Sic periit Longinus, vir (ut dicit Porphyrius) omnium Criticorum maximus, et quem sui temporis homines vivam quandam Bibliothecam, et ambulans Musaeum vocaverunt. Multa quidem scripsit tum in Philosophia, tum in arte Critica, quorum nihil (si hunc de Sublimitate

<[Http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/](http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/)>

¹⁰⁹ Dalham, Florian. *De Ratione Recte Cogitandi, Loquendi et Intelligendi Libri III in Quibus Praecipua Logicae, Criticae et Hermeneuticae Capita Illustrantur*. [s. l.] 1762. § 564, p. 264.

¹¹⁰ Sulzer, Johann Georg. *Kurzer Begriff aller Wissenschaften und andern Theile der Gelehrsamkeit, worin jeder nach seinem Inhalt, Nutzen und Vollkommenheit kürzlich beschrieben wird, Zweyte ganz veränderte und sehr vermehrte Auflage*. Leipzig 1759, p. 19.

*Commentarium et paucula excipias Fragmenta) ad nos perventi: Lectori vero nomina et titulos eorum, quos scripsit, librorum libet hic apponere.*¹¹¹

Karl von Linné described rules for the *nomenclatura* of the *genera* in *Critica Botanica* (1737). 'Art of criticism' (*ars critica*) is in the Enlightenment a name for a method of the text in philology and grammar studies. The term is used for the designation of the rhetoric of antiquity represented by Quintilian and to the description of methods and forms of texts. In these writings in the disciplines philology and historiography an ideal criticism is represented by critics using the use of the art of criticism (*ars critica*). This idea is still expressed in the 17th century in Johann Ernst Immanuel Walch's writing *De Arte Critica Veterum Romanorum* in form of a tribute to the *Institutio Oratoria*. Quintilian represents the perfect personnel union of a rhetorician for Walch.¹¹² For an arrangement of this 'art of the criticism' (*ars critica*) in three disciplines Walch uses as a basis for sciences. Thus Walch uses the three-division of criticism into the ranges of application in philosophy, history and grammar. As representative figures of the disciplines using the art of the criticism (*ars critica*) in antiquity Walch mentioned Homer, Aristotle and Kratylos and Gorgias, Ion, and Socrates.¹¹³

The *Dictionnaire de L'Académie Française* (4th Edition 1762) wrote in the entry *critique*:

Critique est aussi substantif masculin, & signifie Celui qui examine des ouvrages d'esprit, pour en porter son jugement, les expliquer, les éclaircir, &c. Bon critique. Méchant critique. C'est un critique fort judicieux.

Il signifie encore Censeur, celui qui trouve à redire à tout. C'est un critique fâcheux. C'est un vrai critique. Il n'y a que des critiques qui puissent y trouver à redire.

[...]

L'art, la faculté de juger d'un ouvrage d'esprit. Il est habile dans la critique. Il est savant dans la critique. C'est un homme qui a la critique bonne, la critique sûre. Exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. Soumettre quelque chose à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il signifie encore Une dissertation faite pour examiner un ouvrage d'esprit. Il a fait une critique sur un tel ouvrage. Il a fait la critique d'un tel Poëme. Sa critique a été imprimée.

¹¹¹ Pearce, Zacharias. Life and Works of Longinus. XXXII/XXXIII. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.slu.edu/colleges/AS/languages/classical/latin/tchmat/pedagogy/latinitas/lgi/lgi-vita.html](http://www.slu.edu/colleges/AS/languages/classical/latin/tchmat/pedagogy/latinitas/lgi/lgi-vita.html)>

¹¹² Walch, Johann Ernst Immanuel. *De Arte Critica Veterum Romanorum Liber*. Jena 1757. P. 32- 33.

¹¹³ Walch. *De Arte Critica*. 1757. P. 23.

Il se prend quelquefois en mauvaise part, & signifie Une censure maligne de la conduite d'autrui, de quelque chose, ou de quelque ouvrage d'esprit. Rien n'échappe à sa critique. Au lieu de louer cet ouvrage, il en fait une critique amère.

Critiquer. Censurer quelque chose, y trouver à redire. Critiquer un ouvrage. Vous critiquez ce vers-là mal-à-propos. Il critique les actions, la conduite de tout le monde. C'est un homme qui critique sur tout. Critiquer un tableau. Critiquer un bâtiment.¹¹⁴

The *Dictionnaire de L'Académie Française* (5th Edition 1798) writes in the entry *critique*:

Critique, adj. des 2 g. Terme de Médecine. Il se dit Du jour où il arrive ordinairement quelque crise dans certaines maladies. Jour critique. Le septième et le neuvième sont des jours critiques.

On appelle, Temps critique pour les femmes, Celui où elles perdent leurs règles.

[...]

Critique, est aussi substantif masculin, et signifie Celui qui examine des ouvrages d'esprit pour en porter son jugement, les expliquer, les éclaircir, etc. Bon critique. Méchant critique C'est un critique fort judicieux.

Il signifie encore Censeur, celui qui trouve à redire à tout. C'est un critique fâcheux.

Critique. s. f. L'art de juger d'un ouvrage d'esprit, d'érudition, de littérature. Il est habile dans la critique. C'est un homme qui a la critique sûre. Exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. Soumettre un écrit à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il se prend aussi pour La discussion des faits obscurs, des dates incertaines, de la pureté des textes, de l'authenticité des manuscrits. Il falloit beaucoup de critique pour écrire cette histoire-là.

Il signifie encore Une dissertation, un écrit dans lequel on examine un ouvrage d'esprit. Il a fait la critique d'un tel Poëme. Sa critique a été imprimée. La critique est aisée, mais l'art est difficile.

¹¹⁴ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries.

ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

<<http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique>>

Il se prend quelquefois en mauvaise part, et signifie Une censure maligne de la conduite d'autrui, de quelque chose, ou de quelque ouvrage d'esprit. Rien n'échappe à sa critique. Au lieu de louer cet ouvrage, il en a fait la critique, il en a fait une critique amère.

[...]

Critique, est aussi substantif masculin, et signifie Celui qui examine des ouvrages d'esprit pour en porter son jugement, les expliquer, les éclaircir, etc. Bon critique. Méchant critique C'est un critique fort judicieux.

Il signifie encore Censeur, celui qui trouve à redire à tout. C'est un critique fâcheux.

[...]

L'art de juger d'un ouvrage d'esprit, d'érudition, de littérature. Il est habile dans la critique. C'est un homme qui a la critique sûre. Exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. Soumettre un écrit à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il se prend aussi pour La discussion des faits obscurs, des dates incertaines, de la pureté des textes, de l'authenticité des manuscrits. Il falloit beaucoup de critique pour écrire cette histoire-là.

Il signifie encore Une dissertation, un écrit dans lequel on examine un ouvrage d'esprit. Il a fait la critique d'un tel Poëme. Sa critique a été imprimée. La critique est aisée, mais l'art est difficile.

Il se prend quelquefois en mauvaise part, et signifie Une censure maligne de la conduite d'autrui, de quelque chose, ou de quelque ouvrage d'esprit. Rien n'échappe à sa critique. Au lieu de louer cet ouvrage, il en a fait la critique, il en a fait une critique amère.

Critiquer. v. a. Censurer quelque chose, y trouver à redire. Critiquer un ouvrage. Vous critiquez ce vers - là mal-à-propos. Il critique les actions, la conduite de tout le monde. C'est un homme qui critique tout. Critiquer un tableau, Critiquer un bâtiment.

*Critiqué, ée. participe.*¹¹⁵

In terms of biblical scholarship Johann Jakob Griesbach's *Fifteen Rules* (1796) for the critical commentary of the text of the *New Testament* provided a list of critical rules. Griesbach's critical edition of the *New Testament* first appeared at Halle in three volumes in 1774-1775.

¹¹⁵ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries. ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique](http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique)>

His work *Symbolae Criticae ad Supplendas et Corrigendas Variarum N. T. Lectionum Collectiones* was published in Halle in 1785 and 1793, and his *Commentarius Criticus in Textum Graecum N. T.* discusses readings of the text (1794). Johann Jacob Griesbach's *Commentarius Criticus In Textum Graecum Novi Testamenti* was published in 1811. In Griesbach's *Fifteen Rules* is stated:

1. Brevior lectio, nisi testium vetustorum et gravium auctoritate penitus destituatur, praeferenda est verbosiori. Librarii enim multo proniores ad addendum fuerunt, quam ad omittendum. Consulto vix unquam praetermiserunt quicquam, addiderunt quam plurima: casu vero nonnulla quidem exciderunt, sed haud pauca etiam oculorum, aurium, memoriae, phantasiae ac iudicii errore a scribis admissa, adjecta sunt textui. In primis vero brevior lectio, etiamsi testium auctoritate inferior sit altera, praeferenda est-- (a) si simul durior, obscurior, ambigua, elliptica, hebraizans aut soloeca est, (b) si eadem res variis phrasibus in diversis codicibus expressa legitur; (c) si vocabulorum ordo inconstans est et instabilis; (d) in pericoparum initiis; (e) si plenior lectio glossam seu interpretamentum sapit, vel parallelis locis ad verbum consonat, vel e lectionariis immigrasse videtur.

Contra vero plenior lectionem breviori (nisi hanc multi et insignes tueantur testes) anteponimus-- (a) si omissioni occasionem praebere potuerit homoeoteleuton; (b) si id quod omissum est, librariis videri potuit obscurum, durum, superfluum, insolens, paradoxum, pias aures offendens, erroneum, aut locis parallelis repugnans; (c) si ea quae absunt, salvo sensu salvaque verborum structura abesse poterant, e quo genere sunt propositiones, quod vocant, incidentes, praesertim breviores, et alia, quorum defectum librarius relegens quae scripserat haud facile animadvertibat; (d) si brevior lectio ingenio, stylo aut scopo auctoris minus conveniens est. (e) si sensu prorsus caret; (f) si e locis parallelis aut e lectionariis eam irrepsisse probabile est.

2. Difficilior et obscurior lectio anteponenda est ei, in qua omnia tam plana sunt et extricata, ut librarius quisque facile intelligere ea potuerit. Obscuritate vero et difficultate sua eae potissimum indoctos librarios vexarunt lectiones-- (a) quarum sensus absque penitior graecismi, hebraismi, historiae, archaeologiae, &c. cognitione perspicere non facile poterant, (b) quibus admissis vel sententia, varii generis difficultatibus obstructa, verbis inesse, vel aptus membrorum orationis nexus dissolvi, vel argumentorum ab auctore ad confirmandam suam thesin prolatorum nervus incidi videbatur.

3. *Durior lectio praeferatur ei, qua posita, oratio suaviter leniterque fluit. Durior autem est lectio elliptica, hebraizans, soloeca, a loquendi usu graecis consueto adhorrens aut verborum sono aures offendens.*

4. *Insolentior lectio potior est ea, qua nil insoliti continetur. Vocabula ergo rariora, aut hac saltem significatione, quae eo de quo quaeritur loco admittenda esset, rarius usurpata, phrasesque ac verborum constructiones usu minus tritae, praeferantur vulgatiorebus. Pro exquisitioribus enim librarii usitiora cupide arripere, et in illorum locum glossemata et interpretamenta (praesertim si margo aut loca parallela talia suppeditarent) substituere soliti sunt.*

5. *Locutiones minus emphaticae, nisi contextus et auctoris scopus emphasis postulent, propius ad genuinam scripturam accedunt, quam discrepantes ab ipsis lectionibus quibus major vis inest aut inesse videtur. Erudituli enim librarii, ut commentatores, emphases amabant ac captabant.*

6. *Lectio, prae aliis sensum pietati (praesertim monasticae) alenda aptum fundens, suspecta est.*

7. *Praeferatur aliis lectio cui sensus subest apparenter quidem falsus, qui vero re penitus examinata verus esse deprehenditur.*

8. *Inter plures unius loci lectiones ea pro suspecta merito habetur, quae orthodoxorum dogmatibus manifeste prae caeteris faciet. Cum enim codices hodie superstites plerique, ne dicam omnes, exarati sint a monachis aliisque hominibus catholicorum partibus addictis, credibile non est, hos lectionem in codice, quem quisque exscriberet, obviam neglexisse ullam, qua catholicorum dogma aliquod luculenter confirmari aut haeresis fortiter jugulari posse videretur. Scimus enim, lectiones quascunque, etiam manifesto falsas, dummodo orthodoxorum placitis patrocinarentur, inde a tertii saeculi initiis mordicus defensas seduloque propagatas, caeteras autem ejusdem loci lectiones, quae dogmati ecclesiastico nil praesidii afferrent haereticorum perfidae attributas temere fuisse.*

9. *Cum scribae proclives sint ad iterandas alieno loco vocabulorum et sententiarum terminationes easdem, quas modo scripsissent aut mox scribendas esse, praecurrentibus calamum oculis, praeviderent, lectiones ex ejusmodi rhythmici fallacia facillime explicandae, nullius sunt pretti.*

10. *Hisce ad peccandum illecebris similes sunt aliae. Librarii, qui sententiam, antequam scribere eam inciperent, totam jam perlegissent, vel dum scriberent fugitivo oculo exemplum sibi propositum inspicerent, saepe ex antecedentibus vel consequentibus literam, syllabam aut vocabulum perperam arripuerunt, novasque sic lectiones procuderunt. Si v.c. duo vocabula vicina ab eadem syllaba vel litera inciperent, accidit haud raro, ut vel prius plane omitteretur, vel posteriori temere tribueretur, quod priori esset peculiare. Ejusmodi hallucinationes vix vitabit, qui libello paullo verbosiori exscribendo operam dat, nisi toto animo in hoc negotium incumbat: id quod pauci librarii fecisse videntur. Lectiones ergo, quae ex hoc errorum fonte promanarunt, quantumvis vetustae ac consequenter in complures libros transfusae sint, recte rejiciuntur, praesertim si codices caeteroqui cognati ab hujus labis contagio puri deprehendantur.*

11. *E pluribus ejusdem loci lectionibus ea praestat, quae velut media inter caeteras interjacet; hoc est ea, quae reliquarum omnium quasi stamina ita continet, ut, hac tanquam primitiva admissa, facile appareat, quanam ratione, seu potius quonam erroris genere, ex ipsa caeterae omnes propullularint.*

12. *Repudiantur lectiones glossam seu interpretamentum redolentes, cujus generis interpolationes nullo negotio emunctioris naris criticus subolfaciet.*

13. *Rejiciendas esse lectiones, e Patrum commentariis aut scholiis vetustis in textum invectas, magno consensu critici docent....*

14. *Respuimus lectiones ortas primum in lectionariis, quae saepissime in anagnosmatum initiis ac interdum in clausulis etiam atque in medio contextu claritatis causa addunt, quod ex orationis serie supplendum esset, resecantque vel immutant, quod, sejunctum ab antecedentibus aut consequentibus, vix satis recte intelligi posse videretur....*

15. *Damnandae sunt lectiones e latina versione in graecos libros invectae...*¹¹⁶

In the 18th century authors in Germany in comparisons describe politicians and rhetoricians of antiquity. The ideal of the critic is in the literature of the outgoing 18th century connected with objectivity, impartiality and ethical and aesthetic qualities. This ideal is attributed to authors of antiquity such as Quintilian, Horaz, Cicero, and Pseudo-Longin. The critic is obligated to follow these ideals. With the term 'art of criticism' (*ars critica*) philological criteria became in the literature of antiquity pragmatic criteria for the establishment of the policies by the assistance of critics. The critical method of philosophy used by Descartes was later modified by Immanuel Kant to admit sensual experience as a factor of rational knowledge followed by Georg Wilhelm Hegel. Kant developed the ideas of to link beauty with the finite and the sublime with the infinite twice in 1766 and in 1790. Kant formulated a compromise. Taste according to the *Critique of Judgment* (1790) is individual, but it claims universality and appeals to common sense. Kant writes in the preface of the *Critique of Judgement* in 1790:

The faculty of knowledge from a priori principles may be called pure reason, and the general investigation into its possibility and bounds the Critique of Pure Reason. This is permissible although "pure reason," as was the case with the same use of terms in our first work, is only intended to denote reason in its theoretical employment, and although there is no desire to bring under review its faculty as practical reason and its special principles as such. That Critique is, then, an investigation addressed simply to our faculty of knowing things a priori. Hence it makes our cognitive faculties its sole concern, to the exclusion of the feeling of pleasure or displeasure and the faculty of desire; and among the cognitive faculties it confines its attention to understanding and its a priori principles, to the exclusion of judgement and reason, (faculties that also belong to theoretical cognition,) because it turns out in the sequel that there is no cognitive faculty other than understanding capable of affording constitutive a priori principles of knowledge. Accordingly the critique which sifts these faculties one and all, so as to try the possible claims of each of the other faculties to a share in the clear possession of knowledge from roots of its own, retains nothing but what understanding prescribes a priori as a law for nature as the complex of phenomena-the form

¹¹⁶ Rules of Textual Criticism. Bible Research. Internet Resources for Students of Scripture. Bible Reseacher. May 28, 2007.

<<http://www.google.com/search?q=cache:vbW2C55iVdcJ:www.bible-researcher.com/rules.html>>+commentatores+sunt+est+ad&hl=de&ct=clnk&cd=36&gl=de>

*of these being similarly furnished a priori. All other pure concepts it relegates to the rank of ideas, which for our faculty of theoretical cognition are transcendent;*¹¹⁷

In Germany Kant showed in his writings *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, *Kritik der Urtheilskraft*, and *Über eine Entdeckung, nach der alle neue Kritik der reinen Vernunft durch eine ältere entbehrlich gemacht werden soll* that the critical method is a field of philosophy. About the idea and organization of a special science under the concept of a ‘criticism of the pure reason’ Kant speaks in *Kritik der reinen Vernunft* in detail analyzing the methods of reasoning.¹¹⁸ Kant uses the term *Kritizismus* for making a distinction between dogmatism and scepticism. Also mathematics belongs to the sciences in the 19th century that uses criticism as a method of discourse. The *Kritik der reinen Vernunft* (*Critique of Pure Reason*) is the major work by Kant that was first published 1781 with a second edition in 1787. The form *critique* is used as an attempt to establish the capabilities and limits of ‘pure reason’. *Pure reason* (‘reine Vernunft’) therefore is to be used to create synthetically a priori-knowledge. *A priori* concept provides the framework that allows making sense of an *a posteriori* experience. Time and space are *a priori*-notions for the senses. Kant tended to use words in an unusual way and understanding his terminology is critical for understanding his work. In Kant's terminology *pure reason* has as its sole subject a a priori-concept. Key terms used in the *Kritik der reinen Vernunft* (*Critique of Pure Reason*) include ‘conception’ as the ‘the power of cognizing by means of the representations’, which are received using the faculty of intuition. Like intuition conception can be pure or empirical. A pure conception contains ‘only the form of the thought of an object’. Empirical conception requires the presence of an actual object. In libraries of scholars criticism as independent discipline is preserved in the classification system of

¹¹⁷ Kant, Immanuel. Critique of Judgement. Transl. with Analyt. Indexes by James Creed Meredith. Reprint from Sheets of the 1. edition of The Critique of Esthetic Judgement and the The Critique of Teleological Judgement (1928). Oxford 1989. Preface.

See also:

Haase, Fee-Alexandra. “Rhetoric and Freedom of Speech. Historical Case Studies from the Oratio Libera to the Contemporary Genre of ‘Free Speech’.” In: Sistemi e culture. Systems and cultures. 2007. May 13, 2007.

<[Http://www.click.vi.it/sistemiculture/pagina9.html](http://www.click.vi.it/sistemiculture/pagina9.html)>

Haase, Fee-Alexandra. “From the Oratio Libera to the Contemporary Genre of Free Speech. Rhetorically Re-read: What Kant's What Is Enlightenment as an Essay for Free Speech can tell Us.” In: Dialegesthai. Università degli Studi di Roma Tor Vergata. May 13, 2006.

<[Http://mondodomani.org/dialegesthai/fah01.htm](http://mondodomani.org/dialegesthai/fah01.htm)>

¹¹⁸ Kant, Immanuel. Kants gesammelte Schriften. Kritik der reinen Vernunft. Herausgegeben von der Königlich Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Vol. 3. Berlin 1787, p. 23.

catalogues. An example of a French universal library with different kinds (*sortes*) of faculties (*facultez*) and languages (*langues*) is the *Bibliotheca Universalis* of an unknown owner, which integrates in the year 1772 among the sciences also the area of the critics (*Critici*):

<i>Libri Theologici</i>	<i>Libri Historia Universalis</i>
<i>Libri Juridici</i>	<i>Libri Historia Graeca</i>
<i>Libri Philosophici, Medici & Historiae</i>	<i>Libri Historia Romana</i>
<i>Naturalis</i>	<i>Rerum Italicarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Mathematici</i>	<i>Rerum Galliarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Architecturae</i>	<i>Rerum Hispanicarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Picturae</i>	<i>Rerum Germanicarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Sculpturae</i>	<i>Rerum Anglicarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Numismatici</i>	<i>Rerum Belgicarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Antiquarii</i>	<i>Rerum Asiaticarum, Africanarum et</i>
<i>Inscriptiones</i>	<i>Americanarum scriptores</i>
<i>Libri Geographici</i>	<i>Genealogici, Heraldici, operum</i>
<i>Libri Chronologici</i>	<i>collectiones, vitae, elogiae, historiae</i>
	<i>fabulosae. & c.</i>
<i>Epistolographi & Oratores</i>	<i>Critici, Lexicographi et bibliothecarii</i> ¹¹⁹
<i>Poetae veteres et recentiores</i>	

Rationalism is the British equivalent movement for the Enlightenment on the continent represented by David Hume, John Locke, and George Berkeley as the so-called ‘British Empiricists’. In *An Essay Towards a New Theory of Vision* Berkeley wrote on *an act of judgment* regarding visual objects:

I find it also acknowledged that the estimate we make of the distance of objects considerably remote is rather an act of judgment grounded on experience than of sense. For example, when I perceive a great number of intermediate objects, such as houses, fields, rivers, and the like,

¹¹⁹ Cf. the parts at. Daalen, Nicolas van. *Bibliotheca Universales Vetus et Nova ou Catagogue d’une Magnifique Collection de Livres, Choisis, Curiex et Rares, en Toutes Sortes de Facultez & Langues, Tant Anciens Que M modernes*. Paris 1772. Inhaltsverzeichnis. n. p.

*which I have experienced to take up a considerable space, I thence form a judgment or conclusion that the object I see beyond them is at a great distance. Again, when an object appears faint and small, which at a near distance I have experienced to make a vigorous and large appearance, I instantly conclude it to be far off: And this, it is evident, is the result of experience; without which, from the faintness and littleness I should not have inferred anything concerning the distance of objects.*¹²⁰

In *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding* Hume discussed the different species of philosophy, the origin of ideas, the association of ideas, skeptical doubts concerning the operations of the understanding, skeptical solution of these doubts, probability, the idea of necessary connexion, liberty and necessity, the reason of animals, miracles, a ‘particular providence’ and a ‘future state’, and the ‘academical or skeptical philosophy’. Hume wrote:

*The mere philosopher is a character, which is commonly but little acceptable in the world, as being supposed to contribute nothing either to the advantage or pleasure of society; while he lives remote from communication with mankind, and is wrapped up in principles and notions equally remote from their comprehension.*¹²¹

Hume's major philosophical works were *A Treatise of Human Nature* (1739-1740), the *Enquiries Concerning Human Understanding* (1748), and *Principles of Morals* (1751). Hume's *Natural History* established his reputation as a religious skeptic and an atheist. *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding* contains chapters on the different species of philosophy, the origin of ideas, the association of ideas, skeptical doubts concerning the operations of the understanding, skeptical solution of these doubts, probability, the idea of necessary connexion, liberty and necessity, reason of animals, miracles, a particular providence and of a future state, and the academical or sceptical philosophy. Hume wrote in *Of The Standard Of Taste* in 1760:

The great variety of Taste, as well as of opinion, which prevails in the world, is too obvious not to have fallen under every one's observation. Men of the most confined knowledge are

¹²⁰ Berkeley, George. An Essay Towards a New Theory of Vision. The Project Gutenberg Etext. May 29, 2007. <[Http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext03/trvsn10.txt](http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext03/trvsn10.txt)>

¹²¹ Hume, David. An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding. Bartleby. May 13, 2006. <[Http://www.bartleby.com/37/3/](http://www.bartleby.com/37/3/)>

*able to remark a difference of taste in the narrow circle of their acquaintance, even where the persons have been educated under the same government, and have early imbibed the same prejudices. But those, who can enlarge their view to contemplate distant nations and remote ages, are still more surprised at the great inconsistency and contrariety. We are apt to call barbarous whatever departs widely from our own taste and apprehension; but soon find the epithet of reproach retorted on us. And the highest arrogance and self-conceit is at last startled, on observing an equal assurance on all sides, and scruples, amidst such a contest of sentiment, to pronounce positively in its own favour.*¹²²

Hume wrote in *Of the Liberty of the Press*:

Nothing is more apt to surprize a foreigner, than the extreme liberty, which we enjoy in this country, of communicating whatever we please to the public, and of openly censuring every measure, entered into by the king or his ministers. If the administration resolve upon war, it is affirmed, that, either wilfully or ignorantly, they mistake the interests of the nation, and that peace, in the present situation of affairs, is infinitely preferable.

*If the passion of the ministers lie towards peace, our political writers breathe nothing but war and devastation, and represent the pacific conduct of the government as mean and pusillanimous. As this liberty is not indulged in any other government, either republican or monarchical; in Holland and Venice, more than in France or Spain; it may very naturally give occasion to a question, How it happens that Great Britain alone enjoys this peculiar privilege?*¹²³

Locke writes in his *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding* (book III, chapter X):

Of the Abuse of Words

1. Woeful abuse of words. Besides the imperfection that is naturally in language, and the obscurity and confusion that is so hard to be avoided in the use of words, there are several wilful faults and neglects which men are guilty of in this way of communication, whereby they

¹²² Hume, David. *Of the Standard of Taste*. Fordham University. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1760hume-taste.html](http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1760hume-taste.html)>

¹²³ Hume, David. *Of the Liberty of the Press*. Constitution Society. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.constitution.org/dh/libpress.txt](http://www.constitution.org/dh/libpress.txt)>

render these signs less clear and distinct in their signification than naturally they need to be.¹²⁴

During the 18th century the principles of criticism became an area of central concern for European cultural and philosophical. According to Ford as an academic subject the study of ancient literary criticism can be traced back to 1846 and the first edition of Émile Egger's *Essai Sur l'Histoire de la Critique Chez les Grecs*¹²⁵ Samuel Johnson's *Lives of the Poets* was the first exercise in biographical criticism. Scholars of Neo-Classicism, for example Christian Gottlob Heyne in Germany, made active use of the vocabulary of criticism in order to let it survive in the time of Enlightenment.¹²⁶ George Eliot made translations of Strauss's *Life of Jesus* (1846) and *Feuerbach's Essence of Christianity* (1854).¹²⁷ Mary Ann Evans, known under the pen name George Eliot (1819-1880), was an English novelist of the Victorian era. Her novels are well known for their realism and psychological perspicacity of *personae dramatis* in provincial England. Eliot translated Strauss' *Life of Jesus* (1846). *The Life of Jesus Critically Examined by D. F. Strauss* contained a *History of the Birth and Childhood of Jesus*, a *History of the Public Life of Jesus*, a *History of the Passion, Death, and Resurrection of Jesus*, and a *Concluding Dissertation on The Dogmatic Import of the Life of Jesus*.¹²⁸ The Hegelian ideas of evolution have influenced German criticism and indirectly Biblical criticism. Eduard Wilhelm Reuss had published in Paris in 1879 *L'Histoire Sainte et la Loi. Pentateuque et Josué*. His work was elaborated by Julius Wellhausen, professor at the University of Göttingen, in works published in 1883 and 1889 like *Prolegomena to the History of Israel* and *Composition of the Hexateuch and the Historical Books of the Old*

¹²⁴ Locke, John. An Essay Concerning Human Understanding. University Columbia. Jan. 8, 2006

<[Http://www.ilt.columbia.edu/publications/Projects/digitexts/locke/understanding/chapter0310.html](http://www.ilt.columbia.edu/publications/Projects/digitexts/locke/understanding/chapter0310.html)>

¹²⁵ Ford, Andrew. Performance, Text, and the History of Criticism. Princeton/Stanford Working Papers in Classics. Princeton University. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.princeton.edu/~pswpc/pdfs/ford/110602.pdf](http://www.princeton.edu/~pswpc/pdfs/ford/110602.pdf)>

¹²⁶ Samuel Taylor Coleridge. Biographia Literaria. University Virginia. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://etext.virginia.edu/stc/Coleridge/literar_theory/BiogLiterar.html#PoetStyle](http://etext.virginia.edu/stc/Coleridge/literar_theory/BiogLiterar.html#PoetStyle)>

¹²⁷ Cf. Haase, Fee-Alexandra. "Christian Gottlob Heyne (1729-1812). Ein begriffsgeschichtlicher Beitrag des 18. Jahrhunderts zur Etablierung wissenschaftlicher Kritik." In: Jahrbuch für internationale Germanistik. Vol. XXXII. 2002. 2. Pp. 105-117

¹²⁸ Strauss, David Friedrich. The Life of Jesus. Translated from the Fourth German Edition by Marian Evans. New York 1860. Early Christian Writings. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/strauss/](http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/strauss/)>

Testament. In Germany the Tübingen school ideas of the 19th century brought orthodox Protestant critical thinking. Ferdinand Christian Baur wrote on *historical criticism*:

*If historical-criticism has at all the task to search out everything as precisely as possible with regard to writings whose origin and character it investigates, it cannot be satisfied with merely their outward appearance, but must attempt also to penetrate their inner nature. It must inquire not merely about the circumstances of the time in general, but in particular about the writer's position with regard to these things, the interests and motives, the leading ideas of his literary activity. The greater the conceptual significance of a literary product, the more it should be assumed that it is based on an idea that determines the whole, and that the deeper consciousness of the time to which it belongs is reflected in it. Even with regard to the New Testament writings, therefore, historical criticism would not completely fulfill its task if it did not endeavor to investigate more precisely the conceptual character which they themselves bear, the concerns of the time under whose influence they originated, the direction they pursue, the basic perspective to which the particular subordinates itself — if it did not make any attempt at all to penetrate as far as possible their inner nature, and likewise to peer into the creative conception of the thoughts in the mind of the writer from which these writings went forth.*¹²⁹

The *Dictionnaire de L'Académie Française* (6th Edition 1832-1835) wrote in the entry *critique*:

Critique signifie, par extension, Qui doit amener un changement en bien ou en mal, qui est dangereux, inquiétant. L'instant critique est venu. Les moments critiques de la vie. Les temps, les circonstances sont critiques. Se trouver dans une position critique.

Critique signifie en outre, Qui concerne la critique, qui a pour objet la critique, l'examen de quelque ouvrage d'esprit, ou d'une production de l'art. Observations, notes critiques. Dissertation critique.

Il se dit aussi De la disposition à censurer trop légèrement. Esprit critique. Humeur critique.

¹²⁹ Baur, Ferdinand Christian. On Historical Criticism. Institute for Higher Critical Studies. Drew University. July 25, 2005.

<<http://www.depts.drew.edu/jhc/baurjhc.html>>

Critique. adj. des deux genres (Page 1:454)

Critique. adj. des deux genres T. de Médec. Qui annonce une crise, qui appartient à la crise. Phénomènes critiques. Signes critiques. Pouls critique.

Jour critique, Jour où il arrive ordinairement quelque crise, dans certaines maladies. Le septième et le neuvième sont des jours critiques. On le dit aussi Des jours où les femmes ont leurs règles.

Temps, âge critique, Celui où une femme cesse d'avoir ses règles.

Critique signifie, par extension, Qui doit amener un changement en bien ou en mal, qui est dangereux, inquiétant. L'instant critique est venu. Les moments critiques de la vie. Les temps, les circonstances sont critiques. Se trouver dans une position critique.

Critique signifie en outre, Qui concerne la critique, qui a pour objet la critique, l'examen de quelque ouvrage d'esprit, ou d'une production de l'art. Observations, notes critiques. Dissertation critique.

Il se dit aussi De la disposition à censurer trop légèrement. Esprit critique. Humeur critique.

L'art, le talent de juger les ouvrages d'esprit, les productions littéraires. Les règles de la critique. Critique littéraire. Critique grammaticale. Il est habile dans la critique. C'est un homme qui a la critique sûre. Soumettre un écrit à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il signifie aussi, La discussion des faits obscurs, des dates incertaines de la pureté des textes, de l'authenticité des manuscrits. Il fallait beaucoup de critique pour écrire cette histoire. La critique historique. Cet auteur, ce philologue manque de critique.

Il signifie encore, Une dissertation, un écrit dans lequel on examine quelque ouvrage d'esprit. Il a fait la critique de ce poème. Sa critique a été imprimée.

Il se dit également de Toute observation par laquelle on signale quelque défaut dans une production de l'esprit ou de l'art. Voilà une critique bien sévère. Je n'adopte pas toutes ses critiques sur ce tableau. On a reproché tel défaut à ce poète, et cette critique est fondée.

Il se dit quelquefois, par extension, de Ce qui fait ressortir indirectement les défauts, les vices de quelque chose. Cette parodie est une critique fort spirituelle de telle pièce. Sa conduite est une critique de la vôtre.

Il signifie encore, Une censure maligne ou sévère de la conduite d'autrui, de quelque ouvrage, de quelque chose. Rien n'est à l'abri de sa critique. Exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. Il en a

fait une critique amère. Faire la critique des actes du gouvernement. On ne leur a pas épargné les critiques.

Il se dit aussi de Ceux qui critiquent, en quelque genre que ce soit. La critique lui a reproché telle chose. Il ne put échapper aux traits de la critique.

Critiquer. Celui qui examine des ouvrages d'esprit pour en porter son jugement, les expliquer, les éclaircir, etc. Bon critique. Critique plein de goût. C'est un critique fort judicieux. Un critique sévère.

Il se dit également de Celui qui examine et juge une production de l'art. Les critiques ont reproché à ce peintre de manquer de correction dans le dessin.

Il signifie encore, Censeur, celui qui trouve à redire à tout. C'est un critique fâcheux.

Critiquer. v. a. Censurer quelque chose, y trouver à redire. Critiquer un ouvrage, un écrivain. Vous critiquez ce vers mal à propos. Il critique les actions, la conduite de tout le monde. C'est un homme qui critique tout. Critiquer un tableau. Critiquer un édifice. Critiquer les actes d'un ministre.

*Critiquer une personne, Trouver à redire dans ses actions, dans ses manières, etc.*¹³⁰

Émile Littré's *Dictionnaire de la Langue Française* (1872-1877) wrote in the entry *critiqué*:

1. Soumis à la critique. Les livres critiqués dans ce journal. Des textes ainsi critiqués et éclaircis.

Lesage, Gil Blas, V, 1: Je demeure d'accord de bonne foi que mes vers n'étaient pas bons, aussi ne furent-ils pas critiqués

2. Blâmé. Sa conduite critiquée même par ses partisans.

Critique.

1. Qui a rapport à la critique en fait d'ouvrages d'esprit ou d'art. Observations critiques. Dissertations critiques.

¹³⁰ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries.

ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique](http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique)>

La Bruy., Disc. à l'Acad. fr. Préface: Je me suis abstenu de toucher à leurs personnes, pour ne parler que de leurs ouvrages dont j'ai fait des éloges critiques plus ou moins étendus

2. *Porté à la censure.*

Boileau, Poésies div. 10: Ce greffier [le père de Boileau] doux et pacifique, De ses enfants au sang critique N'eut point le talent redouté

Fén., Tél. XIV: Toute parole libre leur paraît critique et séditieuse

Un esprit critique, homme qui voit tout par les endroits faibles et qui s'en explique librement.

Boileau, Sat. IX.: Gardez-vous, dira l'un, de cet esprit critique ; On ne sait bien souvent quelle mouche le pique

Terme de philosophie sociale. L'esprit critique, l'esprit qui se développe à certaines époques de transition, qui s'occupe d'examiner les doctrines et les institutions, d'en rechercher les bases, et qui rejette celles qui n'ont pas résisté à cet examen. L'esprit critique est l'avant-coureur de l'esprit de révolution.

Age, époque critique, par opposition à époque organique, celle où l'esprit critique domine.

Une période critique de cinq siècles a précédé la révolution française.

3. *Terme de médecine. Qui indique une crise. Phénomènes critiques. Pouls critique.*

Temps ou âge critique, époque de la vie des femmes à laquelle cesse la menstruation, ainsi nommé à cause des indispositions ou des maladies plus ou moins graves qui y sont fréquentes.

Raynal, Hist. phil. XIX, 14: Les femmes galantes échappent difficilement au péril du temps critique ; le dépit d'un abandon qui les menace achève de vicier le sang et les humeurs dans un moment ou le calme qui naît de la conscience d'une vie honnête serait salutaire

Jour critique, jour dans lequel, suivant les remarques des médecins hippocratiques, une crise survient d'ordinaire.

Jour critique se dit aussi du jour où une femme a ses règles.

4. *Par extension, difficile, dangereux, décisif. L'instant critique est venu. Les moments critiques de la vie. Se trouver dans une position critique.*

J. J. Rouss., Ém. IV: Vous êtes dans l'âge critique où l'esprit s'ouvre à la certitude, où le cœur reçoit sa forme et son caractère et où l'on se détermine pour toute la vie

Marmont., Élém. de litt. t. VI, p. 388, dans POUGENS: On voit par là que c'est dans le moment critique où les républiques se corrompent, qu'on y a besoin de l'éloquence

Ségur, Hist. de Nap. XI, 2: Un entretien digne de remarque qu'on entendit cette même nuit montrera tout ce qu'avait de critique sa position, et comment il la supportait [...]

Critiquer.

1. Faire l'examen critique des ouvrages d'art ou d'esprit. Critiquer un ouvrage, un auteur. On critiquait ce vers.

Malebr., Recherche, II, III, 4: Il faut, autant qu'on peut, apporter des exemples illustres des choses qu'on dit, lorsqu'elles sont de conséquence, et c'est quelquefois faire honneur à un livre que de le critiquer

Montesq., Esp. Défense, 2e partie.: Il a bien critiqué le livre qu'il avait dans la tête, il n'a pas critiqué celui de l'auteur

Absolument. Il vaut mieux admirer à tort que critiquer sans raison.

2. Blâmer. Critiquer les actes d'un ministre. Il critique tout le monde.

Fén., Tél. XIII: Un esprit chagrin qui critiquait toutes mes actions

La Font., Court.: Critiquer gens, m'est, dit-il, fort nouveau ; Ce n'est mon fait, et toutefois, madame, Je vous dirai tout net que ce discours....

3. Se critiquer, v. réfl. Faire la critique de soi-même, être un critique à soi-même.

Se critiquer l'un l'autre. Ils se sont critiqués avec acerbité.¹³¹

The British missionary for the Synode at Utah Samuel Ellis Wishard wrote in *The Testimony of the Bible Concerning Destructive Criticism* in 1909 about the work of the 'destructive critics':

The work of the destructive critics has been widely disseminated in current literature. Magazines, secular newspapers, and some religious papers are giving currency to these critical attacks on the Word of God. The young people of our churches are exposed to the insidious poison of this skepticism. It comes to them under the guise of a broader and more

¹³¹ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries. ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

<<http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique>>

*liberal scholarship. They have neither the time nor the equipment to enter the field of criticism, nor is this work demanded of them.*¹³²

Critics concentrated on the artworks of the past. In early 19th-century Germany in the works of Johann Gottfried von Herder and the two Schlegel brothers the classical tradition was rejected in favour of a view of each work as a product of its time and place. In this view criticism was used to understand a work and surrender to its particular beauty. Criticism can - from a Romanticism standpoint- not be used to judge literature by an eternal standard. During the 18th and 19th centuries European scholars studying languages and history tried to add scientific methodological rigor to the work of their predecessors. These scholars thought their traditional literatures were the logical result of progressive cultural refinement. The academically educated man became the art critic during the 18th century. Public exhibitions of art flourished. Johann Joachim Winckelmann's widely known *History of Art* was the first art historical compilation including analysis of esthetic content directly from ancient works of art and statements of ancient artists. It suggested the cultural freedom, that taste, beauty and perfection were available to the ordinary man and to the elite members of society. Winckelman wrote in *Gedanken über die Nachahmung der griechischen Werke in der Malerei und Bildhauerkunst*:

Der gute Geschmack, welcher sich mehr und mehr durch die Welt ausbreitet, hat sich angefangen zuerst unter dem griechischen Himmel zu bilden. Alle Erfindungen fremder Völker kamen gleichsam nur als der erste Same nach Griechenland, und nahmen eine andere Natur und Gestalt an in dem Lande, welches Minerva, sagt man, vor allen Ländern, wegen der gemäßigten Jahreszeiten, die sie hier angetroffen, den Griechen zur Wohnung angewiesen, als ein Land welches kluge Köpfe hervorbringen würde. Der Geschmack, den diese Nation ihren Werken gegeben hat, ist ihr eigen geblieben; er hat sich selten weit von Griechenland entfernt, ohne etwas zu verlieren, und unter entlegenen Himmelstrichen ist er spät bekannt geworden. Er war ohne Zweifel ganz und gar fremde unter einem nordischen Himmel, zu der Zeit, da die beiden Künste, deren große Lehrer die Griechen sind, wenig Verehrer fanden; zu der Zeit, da die verehrungswürdigsten Stücke des Correggio im königlichen Stalle zu Stockholm vor die Fenster, zu Bedeckung derselben, gehänget waren.

¹³² Wishard, Samuel Ellis. The Testimony of the Bible Concerning Destructive Criticism. The Project Gutenberg EBook. University College Cork. Nov. 16, 2005.

<<http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/E800003-007/>>

*Nach solchen über die gewöhnliche Form der Materie erhabenen Begriffen bildeten die Griechen Götter und Menschen. An Göttern und Göttinnen machte Stirn und Nase beinahe eine gerade Linie. Die Köpfe berühmter Frauen auf griechischen Münzen haben dergleichen Profil, wo es gleichwohl nicht willkürlich war, nach idealischen Begriffen zu arbeiten.*¹³³

Carl Ferdinand Meyer wrote in *Das Buch der Vergangenheit* that the allegorized ‚Critica‘ intends to do social criticism even as part of a theological issue:

Das Buch der Vergangenheit

Lügengeister

Der Zaubrer Faust erschien am Hof zu Mainz,

Er liebt der Kardinäle Purpur, scheint's.

Verhangen ward ein Saal und blaß erhellt

Für die Besuche der Gespensterwelt.

Der Kurfürst setzte sich. Ihm stand ich links.

Der bleiche Magier harrte seines Winks.

[...]

Er rief. Ein Purpurtragender erschien.

Ich frage Majestät, ob ihr gedenkt,

Daß sie dem Papst die ew'ge Stadt geschenkt?

"Ja", nickte das Gespenst. Wie? Wo? Und wann?

Ein Märchen ist's, das Eigennutz ersann!

Es ist Betrug und das beweis' ich stramm

Mit scharfer Kunst, die nennt man Criticam.

Du bist ein Pfaffengeist! Zur Hölle fort!

*Der Lügenkaiser schwand vor meinem Wort.*¹³⁴

¹³³ Winckelmann, Johann Joachim. Gedanken über die Nachahmung der griechischen Werke in der Malerei und Bildhauerkunst. Projekt Gutenberg. Nov. 19, 2005.

<[Http://gutenberg.spiegel.de/winckelm/nachahm/nachah11.htm](http://gutenberg.spiegel.de/winckelm/nachahm/nachah11.htm)>

¹³⁴ Meyer, Carl Ferdinand. Das Buch der Vergangenheit. Projekt Gutenberg. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://gutenberg.spiegel.de/cfmeyer/hutten/hutten02.htm](http://gutenberg.spiegel.de/cfmeyer/hutten/hutten02.htm)>.

In the last years of the 19th century the historical studies of religions school had emerged and developed forms of studies of the biblical text. 1799 is written in the preface for the reader of *De Prudentia et Eloquentia Civili Comparanda Diatribe Isagogicae* by Johann Andreas Bose that an exercise of the critical faculty (*criticam facultatem exercere*) exists:

Lectori.

*Annus vicesimus prope exigitur, quando has dissertationes ad publicam utilitatem edidi. Occasionem tunc quidem offerebat liber, qui altera mox vice prodiit, sub titulo bibliographiae curiosae: ubi sub finem Bosii diatribe adparebat, non sine censore. Verum patuit statim hominis imperitia, nec in praesenti debet coargui. Quilibet enim inter doctos novit, quis noster fuerit, qua cura et arte bonas litteras tractaverit. Numquam in scriptoribus percensendis tam improvidus erat aut incautus, ut facile aberraret in nominibus. Sed neque tribuebat aliis, quae ipsis non debebantur. Laudavit eos, quos laude dignos ex virtute et doctrina varia deprehendit: naevos pariter indicavit eorum, qui non poterant obscurari, aut excusari ab ingenio honesto. Aberat plane beatus Bosius longe ab illis, qui criticam facultatem exercent, ubi non possunt: aut temere etiam exercent in rebus ac studiis, quibus parum operae impenderunt. Nostra, aetate nihil est vulgatius, quam nonnullos pro arbitrato iudicare de melioribus, eosque inter barbaros.*¹³⁵

19th-century philology became the study of ancient texts and languages. In this century literary criticism was part of a new secular world view. The term ‘philology’ originally meant a love (Greek: *philein* ‘to love’) of words (Greek ‘*logoi*’).¹³⁶ Philology was in Europe one of

¹³⁵ Bose, Johann Andreas. *De Prudentia et Eloquentia Civili Comparanda Diatribe Isagogicae* Quarum Haec Prodit Auctior Sub Titulo De Ratione Legendi Tractandique Historicis. Accedit Notitia Scriptorum Historiae Universalis Primum Edita Cura Georgii Schubarto. Ienae MDCCXCIX. University Mannheim. Camena. Febr. 18, 2005.

http://www.uni-mannheim.de/mateo/camenahist/bose1/books/boseprudentia_front.html.

See also chapter 1.3.7 “Begriff der Kritik im Wortschatz europäischer Sprachen des 19. Jahrhunderts” and chapter 1.3.8 “Der Begriff Kritik im deutschen Wortschatz des 19. Jahrhunderts”. In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/>

¹³⁶ Haase, Fee-Alexandra. “Warum sollte es einen Niedergang der Rhetorik im 19. Jahrhundert gegeben haben? Ueber die A-Historizität eines Topos der antiken und neueren Geschichte der Beredsamkeit.” In: *Logo. Revista de Retorica y Teoria de la Comunicacion*. Nr. 4 (2003), pp. 187-201. Nov. 10, 2005.

<http://www.asociacion-logo.org/Numero-04.htm>

the 19th century's first scientific approaches to human language. It gave way to the modern science of linguistics in the early 20th century due to the influence of Ferdinand de Saussure. Estheticism developed towards on own branch of science in the 19th century. In *The Psychology of Beauty* written by Ethel D. Puffer the beauty is defined in several areas:

- I. *Criticism and beauty*
- II *The nature of beauty*
- III *The easthetic repose*
- IV *The beauty of fine art*
 - The beauty of visual form*
 - Space composition among the old masters*
- V. *The beauty of music*
- VI *The beauty of liberature*
- VII. *The nature of emotions of the drama*
- VIII. *The beauty of ideas*

In *Bouvier's Law Dictionary* (1856) criticism is the art of judging skillfully of the merits or beauties, defects or faults of a literary or scientific performance, or of a production of art; when the criticism is reduced to writing, the writing itself is called a criticism. It promotes *liberty of criticism*:

2. Liberty of criticism must be allowed, or there would be neither purity of taste nor of morals. Fair discussion, is essentially necessary to, the truth of history and advancement of science. That publication therefore, is not a libel, which has for its object, not to injure the reputation of an individual, but to correct misrepresentations of facts, to refute sophistical reasoning, to expose a vicious taste for literature, or to censure what is hostile to morality. Campb. R. 351-2. As every man who publishes a book commits himself to the judgment of the public, any one may comment on his performance. If the commentator does not step aside from the work, or introduce fiction for the purpose of condemnation, he exercises a fair and legitimate right. And the critic does a good service to the public who writes down any vapid or useless publication such as ought never to have appeared; and, although the author may suffer a loss from it, the law does not consider such loss an injury; because it is a loss which the party ought to sustain. It is the loss of fame and profit, to which he was never entitled. 1

*Campb. R. 358, n. See 1 Esp. N. P. Cas. 28; 2 Stark. Cas. 73; 4 Bing. N. S. 92; S. C. 3 Scott, 340;. 1 M. & M. 44; 1 M. & M. 187; Cooke on Def. 52.*¹³⁷

Poetry in the early 19th century was also read by common people and dealt with subject matter and in a language of interest to its audience. The poet is no longer considered as a preserver of civilized values and proper taste. The poet is a person with a sharp sensibility and knowledge of human nature, who need no longer follow a set of prescribed rules. The reader was able to consult his own judgement and feelings. Readers became independent from the judgement of other critics, when reading the work. Oscar Wilde (1854-1900) wrote *The Critic as Artist* as a rather abstract essay on art criticism. Here Ernest asks Gilbert:

*You are quite incorrigible. But, seriously speaking, what is the use of art-criticism? Why cannot the artist be left alone, to create a new world if he wishes it, or, if not, to shadow forth the world which we already know, and of which, I fancy, we would each one of us be wearied if Art, with her fine spirit of choice and delicate instinct of selection, did not, as it were, purify it for us, and give to it a momentary perfection. It seems to me that the imagination spreads, or should spread, a solitude around it, and works best in silence and in isolation. Why should the artist be troubled by the shrill clamour of criticism? Why should those who cannot create take upon themselves to estimate the value of creative work? What can they know about it? If a man's work is easy to understand, an explanation is unnecessary.*¹³⁸

The history of Russian literary criticism started in the 18th century with classicistic criticism, sentimentalistic criticism, and romantic criticism until the early 19th century, and was followed by realistic criticism. The criticism of the 20th century was in general centralized Soviet criticism as political propaganda. René Wellek wrote in the article *Literary Criticism* in the *Dictionary of the History of Ideas*:

“Russian criticism has great interest because in Russia radically opposed conceptions were formulated most sharply. As late as 1825 Alexander Pushkin could complain that “we have no criticism... we have not a single commentary, not a single book of criticism.” But this

¹³⁷ Bouvier's Law Dictionary. The DICT Development Group. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict](http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict)>

¹³⁸ Wilde, Oscar. *The Critic as Artist*. Nov. 10, 2005.

<[Http://www.online-literature.com/wilde/1305/](http://www.online-literature.com/wilde/1305/)>.

changed soon with the advent of Vissarion Belinsky (1811-48) who dominated Russian criticism for the rest of the century. Belinsky's concept of criticism is expounded in a 'Speech on Criticism' (1842) in which he rejects arbitrary pronouncements of taste or judgment by rules and defines "criticizing as seeking and discovering the general laws of reason in particulars." Criticism is philosophical knowledge while art is immediate knowledge. In practice, criticism in 19th-century Russia was ideological and social. Apollon Grigoriev seems to be an exception. He advocated an "organic criticism" which is intuitive, immediate.

[...]

The Russian Formalists on the whole dismissed criticism in favor of a technical science of literature, while Soviet criticism constitutes a return to nineteenth-century demands for ideological clarity, for the "social mandate" of both writer and critic."¹³⁹

In Russia Vissarion Grigoryevich Belinsky (1811-1848) functioned as a critic through all his intellectual changes. Belinsky gave publication advices to such writers as Dostoevsky. As critic for four major reviews he became the principal champion of the realistic and socially responsible new Russian literature. Belinsky wrote in his *Letter to N. V. Gogol*:

*You are only partly right in regarding my article as that of an angered man: that epithet is too mild and inadequate to express the state to which I was reduced on reading your book. But you are entirely wrong in ascribing that state to your indeed none too flattering references to the admirers of your talent. No, there was a more important reason for this. One could endure an outraged sense of self-esteem, and I should have had sense enough to let the matter pass in silence were that the whole gist of the matter; but one cannot endure an outraged sense of truth and human dignity; one cannot keep silent when lies and immorality are preached as truth and virtue under the guise of religion and the protection of the knout.*¹⁴⁰

René Wellek wrote in the article *Literary Criticism* in the *Dictionary of the History of Ideas*:

Today in Russia and generally behind the Curtain, the Marxist concept of criticism prevails. In its official version it is simply didacticism: criticism serves the inculcation of Communism

¹³⁹ Wellek, René. *Literary Criticism*. Dictionary of the History of Ideas. University of Virginia. May 29, 2007.
<[Http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71](http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71)>

¹⁴⁰ Belinskii, Vissarion. *Letter to Gogol*. Seton Hall University. Jan 29, 2006.
<[Http://artsci.shu.edu/reesp/documents/Belinskii.htm](http://artsci.shu.edu/reesp/documents/Belinskii.htm)>

*and writers are judged according to whether they do so or not. This didacticism is combined with sociologism: a study of the society which assumes that the writer is completely determined by his class origins and reflects and should reflect the society he describes. In subtler versions of Marxism, mainly in the writings of the Hungarian György Lukács and his follower Lucien Goldmann in France, this simple version is rejected; rather, the critic's task is to analyze the structure of his society and that of former ages and to interpret and judge authors in their historical place, dividing them into reactionary and progressive without regard, however, to their overt intentions and allegiances. Goldmann draws a distinction between comprehension and explication. Explication is the insertion of a work into the context of a social structure.*¹⁴¹

Marxist criticism – popular and further developed in the communist countries- is related to cultural criticism, historical criticism, sociological criticism as

*an approach to literature that focuses on the ideological content of a work, its explicit and implicit assumptions and values about matters such as culture, race, class, and power. Marxist criticism, based largely on the writings of Karl Marx, typically aims at not only revealing and clarifying ideological issues but also correcting social injustices. Some Marxist critics use literature to describe the competing socioeconomic interests that too often advance capitalist interests such as money and power rather than socialist interests such as morality and justice. They argue that literature and literary criticism are essentially political because they either challenge or support economic oppression. Because of this strong emphasis on the political aspects of texts, Marxist criticism focuses more on the content and themes of literature than on its form.*¹⁴²

Marxist criticism is a type of criticism in which literary works are viewed as the product of work and whose practitioners emphasize the role of class and ideology as they reflect, propagate, and challenge the prevailing social order. Marxist critics view texts as material products to be understood in broadly historical terms. Marxism, the political dogmatic thinking derived from Marx' writings, began with Marx in the late 19th-century with *Das*

¹⁴¹ Wellek, René. Literary Criticism. Dictionary of the History of Ideas. University of Virginia. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71](http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71)>

¹⁴² Litgloss. Bedford S. Martin's. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://bcs.bedfordstmartins.com/litgloss/LitGlosscode/litgloss_p.html](http://bcs.bedfordstmartins.com/litgloss/LitGlosscode/litgloss_p.html)>

Kapital (1867). Marx was also a literary critic writing critical essays in the 1830s on such writers as Johann Wolfgang von Goethe and William Shakespeare. In *The Holy Family* Marx and Engels use the term *Critical Criticism*.¹⁴³ Even after Marx met Engels in 1843 and began collaborating on political works such as *The German Ideology* (1846) and *The Communist Manifesto* (1848), he maintained his interest in literature. In *The German Ideology* Marx and Engels discussed the relationship between the arts, politics, and basic economic reality in terms of a general social theory. Economics provides here the base or infrastructure of society (German: *Basis*), from which a superstructure (German: *Überbau*) consisting of law, politics, philosophy, religion, and art emerges. Later in the 19th century Marxism was looking for economic and social causes for human states of mind. In works like *The German Ideology* and *The Communist Manifesto*, written with Friedrich Engels, Marx proposes a model of history in which economic and political conditions (*Überbau*) determine social conditions. Marxist criticism, which prevailed in the Communist countries, found many followers in the West. Marx wrote in his *Critique of Hegel's Philosophy in General* (XI.6) on German criticism:

This is perhaps the place at which, by way of explanation and justification, we might offer some considerations in regard to the Hegelian dialectic generally and especially its exposition in the Phänomenologie and Logik and also, lastly, the relation (to it) of the modern critical movement.

So powerful was modern German criticism's preoccupation with the past – so completely was its development entangled with the subject-matter – that here prevailed a completely uncritical attitude to the method of criticising, together with a complete lack of awareness about the apparently formal, but really vital question: how do we now stand as regards the Hegelian dialectic?

*This lack of awareness about the relationship of modern criticism to the Hegelian philosophy as a whole and especially to the Hegelian dialectic has been so great that critics like Strauss and Bruno Bauer still remain within the confines of the Hegelian logic;*¹⁴⁴

¹⁴³ Marx, Karl; Engels, Friedrich. *The Holy Family*. Marxists Internet Archive. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1845/holy-family/ch07.htm>

¹⁴⁴ Marx, Karl. *Critique of Hegel's Philosophy in General*. Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844.

Marxist Internet Archive. Nov. 9, 2005.

<<http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1844/manuscripts/hegel.htm>>

In *The Holy Family* Marx and Engels use the term *Critical Criticism*.¹⁴⁵ Marx wrote in the *Deutsche-Brüsseler Zeitung* in *Moralising Criticism and Critical Morality. A Contribution to German Cultural History* in 1847:

*Shortly before and during the period of the Reformation there developed amongst the Germans a type of literature whose very name is striking — grobian literature. In our own day we are approaching an era of revolution analogous to that of the sixteenth century. Small wonder that among the Germans grobian literature is emerging once more. Interest in historical development easily overcomes the aesthetic revulsion which this kind of writing provokes even in a person of quite unrefined taste and which it provoked back in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.*¹⁴⁶

In *The Art of Literature* (chapter 7) Arthur Schopenhauer mentioned that “in appreciating a genius, criticism should not deal with the errors in his productions or with the poorer of his works [...]”.¹⁴⁷ In the *History of Philosophy* (English translation 1908) Alfred Weber named as the representative philosophers of the ‘Age of Criticism’ Locke, Berkeley, Condillac, Hume, Kant, Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel.¹⁴⁸ In the introduction to Croce’s *Historical Materialism and the Economics of Karl Marx* Alexander Dunlop Lindsay mentioned:

It is often said that it is the business of philosophy to examine and criticise the assumptions of the sciences and philosophy claims that in this work it is not an unnecessary meddler stepping in where it is not wanted. For time and again for want of philosophical criticism the sciences have overstepped their bounds and produced confusion and contradiction. The distinction between the proper spheres of science and history and moral judgment is not the work of either science or history or moral judgment but can only be accomplished by philosophical reflection, and the philosopher will justify his work, if he can show the various contending

¹⁴⁵ Marx, Karl; Engels, Friedrich. *The Holy Family*. Marxists Internet Archive. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1845/holy-family/ch07.htm](http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1845/holy-family/ch07.htm)>

¹⁴⁶ Marx, Karl. *Moralising Criticism and Critical Morality. A Contribution to German Cultural History*. Contra Karl Heinzen. Marxists Internet Archive. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1847/10/31.htm](http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1847/10/31.htm)>

¹⁴⁷ Schopenhauer, Arthur. *The Art of Literature*. University Adelaide. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.etext.library.adelaide.edu.au/s/schopenhauer/arthur/lit/chapter7.html](http://www.etext.library.adelaide.edu.au/s/schopenhauer/arthur/lit/chapter7.html)>

¹⁴⁸ Weber, Alfred. *History of Philosophy*. University Idaho. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.class.uidaho.edu/mickelsen/ToC/Weber%20ToC.htm](http://www.class.uidaho.edu/mickelsen/ToC/Weber%20ToC.htm)>

*parties that his distinctions will disentangle the puzzles into which they have fallen and help them to understand one another.*¹⁴⁹

In *The Man Versus the State* Herbert Spencer wrote in 1884 in the chapter *The Great Political Superstition*:

Here we will take leave to question it. In default of the justification, once logically valid, that the ruler on Earth being a deputy of the ruler in Heaven, submission to him in all things is a duty, let us ask what reason there is for asserting the duty of submission in all things to a ruling power, constitutional or republican, which has no Heaven-derived supremacy. Evidently this inquiry commits us to a criticism of past and present theories concerning political authority. To revive questions supposed to be long since settled, may be thought to need some apology. but there is a sufficient apology in the implication above made clear, that the theory commonly accepted is ill-based or unbased.

*The notion of sovereignty is that which first presents itself; and a critical examination of this notion, as entertained by those who do not postulate the supernatural origin of sovereignty, carries us back to the arguments of Hobbes.*¹⁵⁰

Despite the different developments in European countries philology was one of the 19th century's first scientific approaches to human language not only related to ancient languages, but also to modern and less known languages. For example similarities between Sanskrit and European languages were first noted in the early 18th century and theories of a proto-Indo-European language developed. Philological interests in ancient languages spread widely. It also opened a way to the modern science of linguistics in the early 20th century initiated by Ferdinand de Saussure. One branch of philology is historical linguistics using methods of comparisons and critical study.

¹⁴⁹ Croce, Benedetto. *Historical Materialism and the Economics of Karl Marx*. Translated by C.M. Meredith and with an introduction by A.D. Lindsay. Mc Master University. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://socserv.mcmaster.ca/econ/ugcm/3l13/marx/croce.htm](http://socserv.mcmaster.ca/econ/ugcm/3l13/marx/croce.htm)

¹⁵⁰ Spencer, Herbert. *The Man versus the State*. McMaster University. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://socserv.mcmaster.ca/econ/ugcm/3l13/spencer/manvssta](http://socserv.mcmaster.ca/econ/ugcm/3l13/spencer/manvssta)>

1.5. “Modern and Postmodern” - On Criticism in the 20th Century

Leitch described the 20th century as the Age of Criticism and Metacriticism:

*If the first half or two-thirds of the twentieth century seems an Age of Criticism, then the latter part appears an Age of Metacriticism. In place of the critical scrutiny of "literary" works, we witness the exploration and production of "critical" texts as "literary" creations. [...] One impulse of deconstruction is toward a practice of metacriticism. [...] Within this emerging domain or contemporary discourse, a third force, "historical metacriticism," seems likely to develop. [...] Apparently, all the old subjects and types of criticism can be carried over to a project of metacriticism.*¹⁵¹

Many European languages have terms derived from Greek ‘kritike’. The words for a critic as a person is in most European languages etymologically derived from Greek. Most of the terms of criticism in European languages derive from ancient Greek.¹⁵² Contemporary Greek *κριτικός* means literally ‘criticizer’. Greek *κριτική* is critique and review, *επίκριση* is animadversion, castigation, censure, railing, and reproof.¹⁵³ But also other linguistic roots exist for the concept of criticism in Europe. Critic is in Icelandic *átölur*. Critic is in Finnish *arvostelija* (reviewer). Finnish *kritiikki* means critique, *arvostelu* is critique, review, *arvosteleminen* is criticizing and judgement.¹⁵⁴

The modern field of meanings slightly varies in the European languages. Critic in Swedish is *kritiker*. Swedish *kritik* means animadversion, comment, criticisms, critics, kritik, judgement,

¹⁵¹ Leitch, Vincent. *Deconstructive Criticism: an Advanced Introduction*. New York: Columbia UP, 1981. Excerpted by Clifford Stetner. Phoenix and Turtle. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://phoenixandturtle.net/excerptmill/leitch.html](http://phoenixandturtle.net/excerptmill/leitch.html)>

¹⁵² See also chapter 2.3.7 “Begriffe der Kritik in romanischen Ländern im 20. Jahrhundert”.

In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/](http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/)>

¹⁵³ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁵⁴ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

judgment, reflection, review, *anmärkning* means animadversion, bad mark, comment, demerit, observation, and remark.¹⁵⁵ The English term 'to criticise' is in Swedish *ått kritisera*.¹⁵⁶ Critic is in Dutch *criticus*, *criticaster* (*criticiser*), *scout* (*criticiser*), *recensent*, *kunstbeoordelaar*, and *beoordelaar* (judge). Dutch *kritiek* is critical, *beoordeling* is appraisal, judging, *aanmerking* is observation, remark, and reproof.¹⁵⁷ Critic is in Albanian *kritizer* (carping, dutch uncle, faultfinder, faultfinding). Albanian *kritikë* comprises attack, castigation, censure, and critique.¹⁵⁸ Critic is in Bulgarian *критичка*, *критикар* (censor, criticaster, faultfinder), and *критик* (reviewer). Bulgarian *критика* (animadversion, appreciation, comment, critique), *преценка* (adjudgment, appraisal, assessment, calculation, estimate, estimation, judgement, and opinion).¹⁵⁹ Critic is in Czech *kritik* (reviewer). Czech *kritika* means critique and review.¹⁶⁰ Romanian *critic* means censorious, climacteric, critical, critically, crucial, decisive, delicate, and judge. Romanian *critică* means attack, bar, critique, reviewal), *judecare* (appreciation, censure, condemnation, estimate, estimation, and judgement).¹⁶¹ Serbo-Croatian *kritičar* means censor. Serbo-Croatian *zamerka* is objection, and reproach, *osuda* is censure, condemnation, conviction, denunciation, disapproval, excoriation, verdict), *kritika* is critique. Also the Latin-derived *kriticizam* exists in Serbo-Croatian.¹⁶² German *Kritiker* has the meanings censors, critics, detractor, and reviewer.¹⁶³ Hungarian *kritikus* has the meanings censorious, climacteric, critical, and crucial. Hungarian

¹⁵⁵ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁵⁶ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

¹⁵⁷ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁵⁸ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁵⁹ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶⁰ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶¹ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶² Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶³ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

kritika is critique.¹⁶⁴ In Hungarian a ‘criterion’ is *ismérv, ismertetőjel, jellegzetesség, kritérium,* and *próbakő*. A critic is *kritikus*. Critical is *bíráló, boncolgató, gáncsoskodó, igényes, kritikus, kritizáló, kritikai, válságos,* and *vizsgálódó*. To criticise is *kritizál* and *bírál*. Criticism is *kritika*.¹⁶⁵ The English term ‘critical’ is in Hungarian *bíráló*. The English term ‘criticism’ is in Hungarian *bírálat*.¹⁶⁶

The English term ‘criticism’ is in Esperanto *kritiko*. Italian *critico* stands for climacteric, critical, crucial, judge, and reviewer. Italian *critica* has the meanings comment, critical essay, critics, critique, review, stricture, and write up.¹⁶⁷ The English term ‘to criticise’ is in French *blâmer* and *critiquer*. The English term ‘to criticise’ is in German *kritisieren,* and *vorwerfen*. The English term ‘to criticise’ is in Italian *criticare*. The English term ‘to criticise’ is in Portuguese *criticar*. The English term ‘criticism’ is in Portuguese *crítica*.¹⁶⁸ Portuguese *criticar* is in English ‘to criticize’. The English term ‘critic’ is in Portuguese *crítico*. The English term ‘critic’ is in Portuguese *crítico*.¹⁶⁹ The English term ‘criticize’ is in Italian *criticare*. The English term ‘criticism’ is in Italian *critica*. The English term ‘criticism’ is in Spanish *crítica*. The English term ‘to criticise’ is in Spanish *atildar* and *criticar*. The English term ‘critic’ is in German *der Kritiker, die Kritikerin*. German *kritisch* is in English ‘critical’. The English term ‘critic’ is in Spanish *criticar*.¹⁷⁰ The English term ‘to criticise’ is in Russian *критиковать* and *раскритиковать*. Russian *критическая, критический,* and *критическое* is in English ‘critical’. The English term ‘criticism’ is in Russian *критика*.¹⁷¹

¹⁶⁴ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶⁵ English Hungarian Dictionary. Angol-magyar szótár. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://mek.oszk.hu/00000/00076/html/eng-hun/c.htm](http://mek.oszk.hu/00000/00076/html/eng-hun/c.htm)>

¹⁶⁶ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

¹⁶⁷ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

¹⁶⁸ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

¹⁶⁹ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

¹⁷⁰ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

¹⁷¹ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

Critic is in Estonian it is *kritiseerija*, in Finnish it is *arvostelija*, in German it is *Kritiker(in)*.¹⁷² In Latvian the critic is *kritiķis*, in Lithuanian *kritikas, priekabus vertintojas*, in Norwegian *kritisk røst*, in Polish *krytyk*, in Swedish *häcklare*. Critic in Finnish is *arvostelija* (reviewer). For the word κρίτικα a near etymology exists: начиная с Третьяковского; см. Христиани. Через франц. critique от лат. critica, греч. κριτική: κρίνω "сужу, выношу приговор". Отсюда новообразование критикан (Лесков).¹⁷³ These examples show that the field of meanings for criticism expanded in Europe and brought a variety of employments of criticism. In Polish *krytyka* derived from Greek *kritike* (techne).

French *critique* has the meanings critic, critical, criticalness, critique, and crucial.¹⁷⁴ The *Dictionnaire de L'Académie française* (8th Edition 1932-1935) wrote in the entry *critique*:

Critique. adj. des deux genres. T. de Médecine. Qui annonce une crise, qui a rapport à la crise. Phénomènes critiques. Signes critiques.

Jour critique, Jour où il arrive ordinairement quelque crise, dans certaines maladies. Le septième et le neuvième sont des jours critiques. On le dit aussi des Jours où les femmes ont leurs règles.

[...]

Temps, âge critique, Celui où une modification importante se produit dans le tempérament. Il se dit spécialement des Femmes.

[...]

Édition critique, Celle dont le texte a été soigneusement établi d'après les manuscrits ou des éditions originales.

[...]

Esprit critique, Tendance à examiner les doctrines, les théories, les assertions historiques pour s'assurer si elles sont fondées sur la vérité. Cet historien manque d'esprit critique.

¹⁷² See also chapter 1.3.9 "Der Begriff Kritik im deutschen Wortschatz von der Moderne bis zum Ende des 20. Jahrhunderts". In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<<http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/>>

¹⁷³ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<<http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0>>

¹⁷⁴ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

[...]

Esprit critique signifie aussi Esprit de libre examen. À certaines époques, l'esprit critique domine.

[...]

Humeur critique, Disposition à faire ressortir les défauts des choses, des personnes.

Il s'emploie aussi comme nom pour désigner Tout écrivain qui juge les productions littéraires ou artistiques. Critique judicieux, sévère. Critique littéraire. Critique dramatique. Critique d'art. Un grand critique.

Critique

Art de juger les ouvrages d'esprit, les productions littéraires ou les oeuvres d'art. Les règles de la critique. Critique littéraire. Critique dramatique. Soumettre un écrit à la critique de quelqu'un.

Il se dit aussi de la Dissertation ou de l'écrit dans lequel on examine quelque ouvrage d'esprit. Sa critique a été imprimée.

Il désigne encore la Science qui discute les faits obscurs, les dates incertaines, la pureté des textes, l'authenticité des manuscrits. La critique historique.

Il se dit aussi de l'Ensemble de ceux qui critiquent, en quelque genre que ce soit. La critique lui a reproché telle chose. Il ne put échapper aux traits de la critique.

Il se dit également de Toute observation par laquelle on signale quelque imperfection dans une production de l'esprit ou de l'art. Voilà une critique bien sévère. Je n'adopte pas toutes ses critiques sur ce tableau. On a reproché tel défaut à ce poète et cette critique est fondée.

Il se dit, par extension, de Ce qui fait ressortir indirectement les défauts, les vices de quelque chose. Cette parodie est une critique fort spirituelle de telle pièce. Sa conduite est une critique de la vôtre.

Il signifie encore Censure maligne ou sévère de la conduite d'autrui, à propos de personnes ou de choses Rien n'est à l'abri de sa critique. Exercer sa critique sur un ouvrage. Il en fait une critique amère. Faire la critique des actes du gouvernement. On ne leur a pas épargné les critiques.

*Critiquer. v. tr. Faire ressortir les défauts des choses, des personnes. Critiquer un ouvrage, un écrivain. Il critique les actions, la conduite de tout le monde. Critiquer un tableau, un édifice. Critiquer les actes d'un ministre.*¹⁷⁵

Parallel to the New Criticism in the U.S. in Russia a new formal study of literature called structuralism flourished as a cross-over work between cultural theory and literary theory. Russian formalism was a movement of literary criticism and interpretation, which emerged in Russia during the second decade of the 20th century. The work of Mikhail Bakhtin has found its way into many theoretical approaches, including feminism, cultural studies, and literary criticism of the 20th century. Sir Arthur Quiller-Couch in *On the Art of Reading* in chapter XII. *On the Use of Masterpieces* (1920) writes about the *critics* of the 17th and 18th century and Pseudo-Longinus:

*Masterpieces, then, will serve us as prophylactics of taste, even from childhood; and will help us, further, to interpret the common mind of civilisation. [...] Be this as it may, somebody wrote the treatise and its first editor, Francis Robertello of Basle, in 1554 called him Dionysius Longinus; and so shall I, and have done with it, careless that other MSS than that used by Robertello, speak of Dionysius or Longinus. Dionysius Longinus, then, in the 3rd century B.C.—some say in the 1st: it is no great matter—wrote a little book commonly cited as Longinus on the Sublime. The title is handy, but quite misleading, unless you remember that by ‘Sublimity’ Longinus meant, as he expressly defines it, ‘a certain distinction and excellence in speech.’ The book, thus recovered, had great authority with critics of the 17th and 18th centuries. For the last hundred years it has quite undeservedly gone out of vogue.*¹⁷⁶

Charles Edwyn Vaughan in *English Literary Criticism* wrote:

Thus the history of English criticism, like that of English literature, divides itself roughly into three periods. The first is the period of the Elizabethans and of Milton; the second is from the Restoration to the French Revolution; the third from the Revolution to the present day. The typical critic of the first period is Sidney; Dryden opens and Johnson closes the second; the

¹⁷⁵ Dictionnaires d'Autrefois. French Dictionaries of the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th Centuries. ARTFL Project. The University of Chicago. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique](http://colet.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/dico1look.pl?strippedhw=critique)>

¹⁷⁶ Arthur Quiller-Couch. *On the Art of Reading*. Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.bartleby.com/191/12.html](http://www.bartleby.com/191/12.html)>

third, a period of far more varied tendencies than either of the others, is perhaps most fitly represented by Lamb, Hazlitt, and Carlyle. It will be the aim of the following pages to sketch the broader outlines of the course that critical inquiry has taken in each.¹⁷⁷

The book *Épistémologie Générale ou Critique de la Connaissance* written by Roger Verneaux was publicized in the year 1987. Verneaux uses the postmodern term 'scepticisme' for the mainstreams of the knowledge teachings (*courants principeaux de l'épistémologie*), *empirisme*, *rationalisme*, *idéalisme* and *realism (réalisme)*.¹⁷⁸ As fundamental indications (notation fondamentales) of the applied criticism (*critique*) Verneaux mentions knowledge (*connaissance*), truth (*vérité*), security (*certitude*), the evidence (*évidence*) and the error (*erreur*). As contrastive opponents to it Verneaux mentions feeling (*sensation*) as essential theses (*thèses essential*) of realism (*réalisme*), reflection (*réflexion*), abstraction (*abstraction*), the affirmation (*affirmation*), introduction (*induction*) and translation (*traduction*) of Latin of texts (*text latins*).¹⁷⁹ Verneaux defines criticism (*critique*) as an analyse (*analyse*) of the functions of knowledge (*fonctions de connaissance*): „*La critique exige certainement une analyse des fonctions de connaissance et du sujet connaissant, et nos ne seulement une analyse logique ou rationnelle.*“¹⁸⁰ Lois Tyson differentiates in the year 1999 into psychoanalytic criticism (*psychoanalytic criticism*), Marxist criticism, toolistic criticism (*tool criticism*), new criticism (*new criticism*), Reader response criticism (*reader response criticism*), structural criticism (*structuralist criticism*), deconstructive criticism (*deconstructive criticism*), new historical and cultural criticism (*new historical and cultural criticism*, lesbians,- gays and ' Queer' criticism (*lesbian, gay and queer criticism*) as well as post-colonial and Afro-American criticism (*Postcolonial and African American criticism*). Tyson writes that critical theories (*critical theories*) are tools (*tools*) in the hands of the user (*in your hands*).¹⁸¹

Critics of this development are the critics of postmodernism considered hollow rhetorical exercises. The term criticism in the 20th century was sometimes used negatively to describe

¹⁷⁷ Vaughan, Charles Edwyn. English Literary Criticism. Project Gutenberg. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext04/nglsh10.txt](http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext04/nglsh10.txt)>

¹⁷⁸ Verneaux, Roger. *Épistémologie Générale ou Critique de la Connaissance*. Paris 1987, pp. 21-58.

¹⁷⁹ Cf. the related passages with the terms in. Verneaux. *Épistémologie Générale*. 1987, pp. 120-174.

¹⁸⁰ Verneaux. *Épistémologie Générale*. 1987. P. 12.

¹⁸¹ Tyson, Lois. *Critical Theorie Today. A User-friendly Guide*. New York 1999. P. 427.

tendencies in the society, which were opposite to traditional systems of morality.¹⁸² In terms of the position of the Catholic Church critical approaches towards the Bible became increasingly accepted as methods of study. In the *Constitutio Apostolica qua Nova Vulgata Bibliorum Sanctorum Editio 'Typica' Declaratur et Promulgatur* is written that the critical method (*critica ratio*) may be used:

*Ecclesia ergo in partibus occidentalibus illam ceteris versionibus anteposuit, quae Vulgata solet appellari quaeque maximam partem a s. Hieronymo, doctore praeclaro, confecta, " tot saeculorum usu in ipsa Ecclesia probata " est (Conc. Trid., sess. IV; Enchir. Bibl., n. 21). Tam egregiae existimationi documento est etiam cura eius textum ad criticam rationem apparandi, ac quidem per editionem, quae secundum altiore doctrinam adhuc concinnatur a monachis Abbatiae S. Hieronymi in Urbe, a Pio XI, Decessore Nostro fel. rec., ad hoc institutae (Const. Apost. Inter praecipuas, 15 Iun. 1933; A.A.S. XXVI, 1934, pp. 85 ss.).*¹⁸³

Pope John Paul II. in *Ioannis Pauli II Summi Pontificis Litterae Encycliae Fides et Ratio Cunctis Catholcae Ecclesiae Episcopis De Necessitudinis Natura Inter Utramque* wrote about the critical judgement (*criticum iudicium*):

22. *Primo in epistulae ad Romanos capite adiuvat nos sanctus Paulus quo melius percipiamus quam sit acuta Librorum Sapientialium deliberatio. Populari sermone argumentationem quandam philosophicam enodans Apostolus altam testificatur veritatem: per creata possunt « oculi mentis » ad Deum cognoscendum advenire. Nam ipse per creaturas facit ut ratio humana « virtutem » suam ac « divinitatem » intueatur (cfr Rom 1,20). Hominis rationi ergo illa adsignatur facultas quae excedere videtur ipsos eius naturae limites: non tantum intra sensuum cognitionem non circumscribitur, quoniam de iis critico iudicio meditari valet, sed de sensuum notitiis ratiocinando causam etiam tangere potest quae omnium rerum*

¹⁸² See also chapter 3.1.4 "Der Begriff Kritik für Literatur zu Gesellschaft und Staat im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert". In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<<http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/>>

¹⁸³ *Constitutio Apostolica qua Nova Vulgata Bibliorum Sanctorum Editio "Typica" Declaratur et Promulgatur*. Encuentra. July 6, 2005.

<<http://www.encuentra.com/includes/documento.php?IdDoc=144&IdSec=82.>>

*sensibilium subiacet origini. Philosophicis vocibus dici licet in pergravi loco illo Paulino potestatem hominis metaphysicam adfirmari.*¹⁸⁴

At the beginning of the 20th century existentialism in Europe became a philosophy promoted by Jean-Paul Sartre and Albert Camus considering each person as an isolated being living in an alienized world. Other representatives of this movement include Kierkegaard, Martin Heidegger, Albert Camus, Simone de Beauvoir, Martin Buber, Karl Jaspers, and Maurice Merleau-Ponty. In *The Nation* of December 18th 2003 John-Paul Sartre's *Americans and Their Myths*, first edited in 1947, was republished in *The Nation*:

*There are the great myths, the myths of happiness, of progress, of liberty, of triumphant maternity; there is realism and optimism--and then there are the Americans, who, nothing at first, grow up among these colossal statues and find their way as best they can among them. There is this myth of happiness: black-magic slogans warn you to be happy at once; films that "end well" show a life of rosy ease to the exhausted crowds; the language is charged with optimistic and unrestrained expressions-"have a good time," "life is fun," and the like. But there are also these people, who, though conventionally happy, suffer from an obscure malaise to which no name can be given, who are tragic through fear of being so, through that total absence of the tragic in them and around them.*¹⁸⁵

In the preface of *Historiae Alexandri Magni Macedonis* the editor Theodor Vogel writes:

Neque tamen, ut dicam quod sentio, tantum quantum forsitan quis opinetur refert, utri sententiae editor suffragetur. Etenim cum foedissimis calami erroribus inquinatus sit Parisinus liber, quamdiu ille in suo genere praeter minutas eiusdem familiae reliquias unicus erit, ii qui critice in Q. Curtio exercent ea opera supersedere non potuerunt, ut singulis locis, quantum fidei tam neglegenter transscripto, quamvis bono libro habendum sit, diligenter cauteque ponderent. Usu rem expertus libenter testor, ad Curtii grammaticam

¹⁸⁴ John Paul II . Ioannis Pauli II Summi Pontificis Litterae Encycliae Fides et Ratio Cunctis Catholocae Ecclesiae Episcopis De Necessitudinis Natura Inter Utramque. Contemporary Latin The Latin Library. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/ency.fides.html](http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/ency.fides.html)>

¹⁸⁵ Sartre, John-Paul. "Americans and Their Myths." In: *The Nation*. Home Issues October 18, 1947. May 1st 2006.

<[Http://www.thenation.com/doc/19471018/sartre](http://www.thenation.com/doc/19471018/sartre)>

*aliquantulum, ad emendandam eius orationem enucleandumque sensum haud ita multum interesse, in utram partem inclinaveris, quippe cum pleraque graviora menda aequae ac lacunae omnium fere quinque codicum sint communia. Tantum tamen Parisino dandum esse cum Eussnero censeo, ut, ubicunque eius lectiones neque a scriptoris usu neque a sensu iustam reprehensionem habeant, illius auctoritate stetur. Quam legem eo confidentius mihi sanxi, cum is, qui illum codicem accuratius quam alii omnes perscrutatus sit, E. Hedickius, simile quiddam ipse videatur docere.*¹⁸⁶

In the 20th century the press, later the radio, film and TV were new and effective mass media and a critic as a spokesperson for contemporary opinions achieved his/her position as a journalist. The 20th century has been an era of enormous expansion and diversity in literary criticism. Europe and the United States have played increasingly significant roles. George Lukács wrote the most-influential non-Soviet communist writing of Marxist criticism in the 1930s and 1940s. René Wellek wrote in the article *Literary Criticism* in the *Dictionary of the History of Ideas*:

*In the dialectical thinking of Lukács no contradiction is felt between asserting that the relative truth of Marxism is absolutely valid (Beiträge zur Geschichte der Ästhetik, Berlin [1954], p. 102) and that the party spirit demanded of the critic is not in contradiction to the other duties of an author: the objective reproduction of reality. In practice, the exact rules for criticism are laid down by solemn deliberations of the party congresses. Marxist criticism has returned to prescriptive criticism, to the imposition of specific themes, views, and even styles imposed by the immense power of the state, the party, and the literary organizations, which enforce the edicts in ways undreamt of even in the days of Richelieu.*¹⁸⁷

Walter Benjamin praised new art forms bringing up the term 'the age of mechanical reproduction'. Non-Soviet Marxists took advantage of insights generated by non-Marxist critical theories being developed in post-World War II Europe. For some schools of formalism the distinction between 'literary' and other sorts of texts is of paramount importance. Modern disciplines using critical methods are deconstruction, some strains of Marxism and feminism

¹⁸⁶ Curtius, Quintus. Q. Curti Historiarum Alexandri Magni Macedonis Praefatio Theodori Vogelii. University of Chicago. Febr. 18, 2005.

http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/L/Roman/Texts/Curtius/Praefatio*.html.

¹⁸⁷ Wellek, René. Literary Criticism. Dictionary of the History of Ideas. University of Virginia. May 29, 2007.

<http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-71>

have sought to break down distinctions between the two and have applied the tools of textual interpretation to a wide range of 'texts' including film, non-fiction, historical writing, and even cultural events as a kind of narrative. Postmodern philosophy beginning as a critique of continental philosophy postmodern thinking was influenced by phenomenology, structuralism, and existentialism, and by Friedrich Nietzsche and Martin Heidegger. Postmodern philosophy originated primarily in France from the 1950s until the 1970s influenced by structuralist Roland Barthes. The most influential early postmodern philosophers were Michel Foucault, Jean-François Lyotard, and Jacques Derrida. In 1979 Lyotard wrote *The Postmodern Condition. A Report on Knowledge*. Lyotard argued here that in our postmodern condition meta-narratives no longer work to legitimize truth-claims. Lyotard suggested that people are developing a new 'language game' that makes a world of changing relationships. Lyotard stated in *The Postmodern Condition. A Report on Knowledge*:

*Transformation in the nature of knowledge, then, could well have repercussions on the existing public powers, forcing them to reconsider their relations (both de jure and de facto) with the large corporations and, more generally, with civil society. The reopening of the world market, a return to vigorous economic competition, the breakdown of the hegemony of American capitalism, the decline of the socialist alternative, a probable opening of the Chinese market these and many other factors are already, at the end of the 1970s, preparing States for a serious reappraisal of the role they have been accustomed to playing since the 1930s: that of, guiding, or even directing investments.*¹⁸⁸

Lyotard wrote also in *The Postmodern Condition* about the field *Knowledge in Computerised Societies*:

Our working hypothesis is that the status of knowledge is altered as societies enter what is known as the postindustrial age and cultures enter what is known as the postmodern age. This transition has been under way since at least the end of the 1950s, which for Europe marks the completion of reconstruction. The pace is faster or slower depending on the country, and within countries it varies according to the sector of activity: the general situation is one of temporal disjunction which makes sketching an overview difficult.

¹⁸⁸ Lyotard, Jean-François. *The Postmodern Condition. A Report on Knowledge*. Marxist Internet Archive. Nov. 13, 2005.

<<http://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/lyotard.htm>>

*One could similarly imagine flows of knowledge travelling along identical channels of identical nature, some of which would be reserved for the “decision makers,” while the others would be used to repay each person’s perpetual debt with respect to the social bond.*¹⁸⁹

Jean Baudrillard wrote cultural critical works on America. In America Jean Baudrillard wrote on the academic work done with a computer:

*Hence, the academic grappling with his computer, ceaselessly correcting, reworking, and complexifying, turning the exercise into a kind of interminable psychoanalysis, memorizing everything in an effort to escape the final outcome, to delay the day of reckoning of death, and that other - fatal - moment of reckoning that is writing, by forming an endless feed-back loop with the machine. This is a marvellous instrument of exoteric magic.*¹⁹⁰

According to Hugh Dalziel Duncan cultural criticism can occur only in certain kind of societies. When the structure of the society is relatively simple and the elite is largely able to control the process of legitimation of its power, there is hardly any need for critics of different fields. Neologisms for forms of criticism became public in 20th century derivatives of the term critique in English language. *The Encyclopaedia Universalis* subdivided in 1968 critique into philosophical criticism (*critique philosophique*), film criticism (*critique cinématographique*), art criticism (*critique d'art*), theatre criticism (*critique dramatique*), historical criticism (*critique historique*), literature criticism (*critique littéraire*), and social criticism (*critique sociale*). Karl Popper liked to emphasize the need for ‘the open society’ (‘die offene Gesellschaft’) as a society where people can speak out and criticize. If science progresses through refutations, criticizing becomes essential. Inference is essential to and part of being human. Popper also mentioned: “But of all political ideals, that of making the people happy is perhaps the most dangerous one”.¹⁹¹ Popper wrote that making people lucky is an aim, which leads to the loss of freedom:

¹⁸⁹ Lyotard, Jean-Francois. *The Postmodern Condition. A Report on Knowledge*. Marxist Internet Archive. Feb. 7, 2006.

<[Http://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/lyotard.htm](http://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/lyotard.htm)>

¹⁹⁰ Baudrillard, Jean. *America*. Baudrillard on the Web. University of Texas Arlington. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.uta.edu/english/apt/collab/naudweb.html](http://www.uta.edu/english/apt/collab/naudweb.html)>

¹⁹¹ Popper, Karl. *The Open Society and Its Enemies*. Vol. II. *The High Tide of Prophecy. Hegel, Marx and the Aftermath. "The Revolt Against Reason"*. London 2003, pp. 345

*Aber von allen politischen Idealen ist der Wunsch, die Menschen glücklich zu machen, vielleicht der gefährlichste. Ein solcher Wunsch führt unvermeidlich zu dem Versuch, anderen Menschen unsere Ordnung Werte aufzuzwingen, um ihnen so die Einsicht in Dinge zu verschaffen, die uns für ihr Glück am wichtigsten zu sein scheinen; also gleichsam zu dem Versuch ihre Seelen zu retten. Dieser Wunsch führt zu Utopismus und Romantizismus. Wir alle haben das sichere Gefühl, daß jedermann in der schönen, der vollkommenen Gemeinschaft unserer Träume glücklich sein würde. Und zweifellos wäre eine Welt, in der wir uns alle lieben, der Himmel auf Erden. ... der Versuch, den Himmel auf Erden einzurichten, produziert stets die Hölle.*¹⁹²

The 'criterion of falsifiability' for Popper is a solution to this problem of demarcation, for it says that statements or systems of statements, in order to be ranked as scientific, must be capable of conflicting with possible, or conceivable, observations.¹⁹³

A communication from the *Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions* on a European agenda for culture in a globalizing world (SEC(2007) 570} /* COM/2007/0242 final */) released in Brussels (10.5.2007) defines its purpose of *cultural richness and diversity* as follows:

*Awareness is growing that the EU has a unique role to play in promoting its cultural richness and diversity, both within Europe and world-wide. There is also acknowledgement that culture is an indispensable feature to achieve the EU's strategic objectives of prosperity, solidarity and security, while ensuring a stronger presence on the international scene.*¹⁹⁴

¹⁹² Popper, Karl. *Die offene Gesellschaft und ihre Feinde II. Falsche Propheten. Hegel, Marx und die Folgen.* München 1980. 6.ed., pp.291-292. Febr. 18, 2005.

http://www.stephenjaygould.org/ctrl/popper_falsification.html

¹⁹³ Popper, Karl. *Conjectures and Refutations.* London 2000, pp. 9-13.

¹⁹⁴ Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on a European Agenda for Culture in a Globalizing World. (SEC(2007) 570} /* COM/2007/0242 final */). European Union. June 7, 2007.

<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=COM:2007:0242:FIN:EN:HTML>

In the broad way of theory and applications in many fields of life and science criticism is the interpretation and evaluation of literature and the arts. It exists in the 20th century in a variety of literary forms like dialogues, verse, letters, essays, and treatises. Let us look back and compare: Criticism was used in the state organisations in the antiquity as a discourse medium in philosophical discourses. The critics of the *artes liberales* used criticism in their *res publica litteraria* for the organization as method for commending material. Representatives understand themselves in this epoch as users of a method or art of public argument in writing or talking about other recordings. Disciplines like the sciences and arts of antiquity and modern times in particular since 18th century up to 20th century used criticism as auxiliary method. Despite their historical changes typical elements of teachings in criticism subjected language. Excessive quantity is in form of the publicised idea of mimesis the imitation of arts. It is in form of the scientific methods of the preservation of literature. Scholars and artists used the visual media besides the writing. Criticism is represented in different ranges of the culture as medium of knowledge and its language in the 20th century. Its terms and fields historically changed. By the changes terminology used general aspects of the methods of criticism. The representatives of criticism took part in the public evaluation and in tended to describe terms and procedures with their terminology in historical writings.¹⁹⁵ If we look at the current state of criticism, we must call it a time of decease according to recent voices. The ‘crisis of criticism’ was a term recently used for the state of criticism at the end of the 20th century based upon the assumption that the arena of criticism is not separate from the discussion on cultural meaning and the critic is on the frontlines of a cultural wars. However, these standpoints refer to the reality of contemporary life seen from a Zeitgeist-perspective of the early 21st century.

Allen, Matthew. *Smart Thinking. Skills for Critical Understanding and Writing*. Melbourne 1998, pp. 45.

¹⁹⁵ Cf. for the terminology of criticism:

Murfin, Ross and Supryia M. Ray. *The Bedford Glossary of Critical and Literary Terms*. Boston 1997, pp. 67-89.

2. On the Development of Criticism on Continents

2.1. “Naqd” -On Criticism in the Middle East

Forms of criticism in the Near East must be regarded as a product of a specific cultural background with predominant religious elements.¹⁹⁶ Jabbar Al-Obaidi in *Communication and the Culture of Democracy: Global Media and Promotion of Democracy in the Middle East* stated that the Middle East refers to the lands around the southern and eastern shores of the Mediterranean Sea extending from Morocco to the Arabian Peninsula and Iran. In this paper the Middle East term refers to the Arab countries in specific. The central part of this general area was formerly called the Near East, a name given to it by some of the first modern Western geographers and historians.¹⁹⁷ Ali Ibn Ibrahim Al-Namlah wrote in *Orientalism and the Making of Hatred*:

The Critical Approach of Orientalism

*These are attitudes towards the theme of the World and the Culture of Hatred fanaticism, dominance and clash of cultures, organized by the National Guard, the National Festival for heritage and culture. I have chosen to participate with a determiner of the relations between cultures in contemporary world, especially between Islamic culture and western culture which have religious background. I consider the old orientalism and the contemporary one, depicted by Ridwan and Abdelnabi Astif as the new orientalism, one of the most prominent determiners. Orientalism has made positive contributions and negative ones in eradicating the roots of hatred between Islamic culture and western cultures. According to Abdelnabi Astif, the term New Orientalism means a new intent confined to the intention of internal orientals and their complete responsibility of producing whatever related to their history, community, and culture.*¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁶ See as general introduction:

Hamarneh, Walid. “Arabic Theory and Criticism”. In: *The Johns Hopkins Guide to Literary Theory and Criticism* edited by Michael Groden and Martin Kreiswirth. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. Pp. 30-36.

¹⁹⁷ Al-Obaidi, Jabbar. “Communication and the Culture of Democracy: Global Media and Promotion of Democracy in the Middle East.” In: *International Journal of Instructional Media*. January, 2003. June 5, 2007. <[Http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_hb3096/is_200301/ai_n7757167](http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_hb3096/is_200301/ai_n7757167)>

¹⁹⁸ Al-Namlah, Ali ibn Ibrahim. *Orientalism and the Making of Hatred*. Naseej. June 5, 2007. <[Http://www.kkmaq.gov.sa/Detail.asp?InNewsItemID=219713](http://www.kkmaq.gov.sa/Detail.asp?InNewsItemID=219713)>

21st century-Arabic with over 200 million speakers spread over 20 countries stretching from Morocco to Iraq. Arabic replaced the Persian language in Iraq, the Greek and Syriac languages in Syria, the Coptic language in Egypt and the Berber language in North Africa. Berber are the descendants of the pre-Arab inhabitants of North Africa living in tribes across Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia, Libya, and Egypt in the mountain and desert regions. They are an example for the mixture of Arabic and African traditions.¹⁹⁹ In the *Editor's Notebook* Elie Chalala wrote in *Lamenting Standards of Arab Literary Criticism, Rushing Poetry into Translation* in 2001:

*The Arab intellectual community often complains about the state of professional criticism in the Arab world, whether of books, journals, music, film, theater, or visual art. This complaint, which for some intellectuals has hardened into resentment, may in some cases be excused by Arab literary critics' over-zealous enthusiasm about cultural production in the region, but the deplorable state of Arab literary criticism is indisputable. One indicator of its failings is the trend toward prolific translation of marginal Arab poetry into European languages, for without the filter of competent criticism, many individuals seeking political asylum pass themselves off as great poets in their native land.*²⁰⁰

The Arabic stem *n-q-d* means 'call to account'.²⁰¹ According to Rajki's *Arabic Etymological Dictionary* the verb *naqada* has the meanings 'scrutinize' and (as doubtfully indicated) 'pay cash'.²⁰² Critic is in Arabic *بأي عا، دقانل، داقتنال ريثكل*. Arabic *قن عظحالم، قن قن عظحالم، قن قن عظحالم* is critique, *قن* comprises the meanings cash, commentary, criticize, critique, money, paper,

¹⁹⁹ African Language Resources. Syracuse University. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://web.syr.edu/~mdlattim/e_dox/africa/lang_African.html>

²⁰⁰ Chalala, Elie. *Editor's Notebook. Lamenting Standards of Arab Literary Criticism, Rushing Poetry into Translation*. Al Jadid, Vol. 7. No.34 (Winter 2001). Leb.net. May 28, 2007.

<<http://leb.net/~aljadid/editors/0734chalala.html>>

²⁰¹ See also: Lane's Lexicon. Volume 8. Pp. 96, 97, 98. Project Root List. Study Quran. May 29, 2007.

See for *naqada* also:

Ghali, M. M. "Pharyngeal Articulation". In: *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*. Vol. 46. No. 3 (1983). Pp. 432-444

<<http://www.studyquran.co.uk/PRLonline.htm>>

²⁰² Andras Rajki's *Arabic Etymological Dictionary*. Freeweb. May 29, 2007.

<<http://etymological.freeweb.hu/AEDweb.htm>>

<<http://www.studyquran.org/LaneLexicon/Volume8/00000096.pdf>>

rave, recourse, and review, داقرتنْا، دىءطختْا means to cut and to quibble.²⁰³ In Arabic داقرتنْا and ردصم دقنْ have the meanings faultfinding, criticism, censure, and quibble. Arabic داقرتنْا has the specific field of meanings of criticism, censure, censured, censures, censuring, faultfinding, quibble, quibbled, quibbles, and quibbling.²⁰⁴ According to the *Arabespanol Dictionary* criticism is داقرتنْا and the critic is داقرتنْا..²⁰⁵ A critic in Arabic is called دقانلْا، دقانلْا and داقرتنْالْا ريثكلْا. The secular components of the Arab-Islamic world view evolved for the first time in pre-Islamic time, when Arabs had developed primitive social systems with unwritten codes of tribal law and morality that centred on the concept of dignity (*karama*), honour (*sharaf*), genealogy (*nasab*), paternalism (*abawiyya*), and eloquence (*fasaha*).²⁰⁶ This orally-centred communication used a direct transmission of knowledge from one person to the other.²⁰⁷ The *khatib* (orator) is usually the Imam (prayer leader). According to Paul L. Hover oral transmission of mysteries leads to procedures in establishing research in the authenticity done in scholarly works, which resulted in ‘high standards’ of manuscript production.²⁰⁸ In Arabic we see the development of the use of one single language across centuries and countries. The terms used to describe the steps of the development of the language are:

Classical Arabic
Standard Arabic

²⁰³ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

²⁰⁴ Webster’s Online Dictionary Arabic-English. Webster’s Online. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.websters-online-](http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/translation/Arabic/%25D8%25A7%25D9%2590%25D9%2586%25D9%2592%25D8%25AA%25D9%2590%25D9%2582%25D8%25A7%25D8%25AF)

[dictionary.org/translation/Arabic/%25D8%25A7%25D9%2590%25D9%2586%25D9%2592%25D8%25AA%25D9%2590%25D9%2582%25D8%25A7%25D8%25AF](http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/translation/Arabic/%25D8%25A7%25D9%2590%25D9%2586%25D9%2592%25D8%25AA%25D9%2590%25D9%2582%25D8%25A7%25D8%25AF)>

²⁰⁵ Arabespanol Dictionary. Arabespanol Organisation. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.arabespanol.org/translate/wordsearchlist.php?start=1341](http://www.arabespanol.org/translate/wordsearchlist.php?start=1341)

²⁰⁶ Ayish, Muhammad I. Communication Research in the Arab World. A New Perspective. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.javnost-thepublic.org/media/datoteke/1998-1-ayish.pdf](http://www.javnost-thepublic.org/media/datoteke/1998-1-ayish.pdf)>

²⁰⁷ Ayish, Muhammad I. Communication Research in the Arab World. A New Perspective. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.javnost-thepublic.org/media/datoteke/1998-1-ayish.pdf](http://www.javnost-thepublic.org/media/datoteke/1998-1-ayish.pdf)>

See for *muhaddithun* and *rawis* (story-tellers):

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 367, 380

²⁰⁸ Zaharna, R.S. Bridging Cultural Differences. American Public Relations Practices and Arab Communication Patterns. American University. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://nw08.american.edu/~zaharna/arab-comm.htm](http://nw08.american.edu/~zaharna/arab-comm.htm)>

Modern Arabic

The spreading of Islam itself is connected to oral traditions. In recitation the *Quran*'s emphasized formality is a value. A tradition of music existed in the Arabic area in the pre-Islamic period. Classical Arab music itself was a fusion of pre-Islamic Arab music with Persian and Turkish elements. The call to prayer (*adhan*) is recited by a Muezzin five times a day from the minaret of a mosque. Although not being considered as music by the Muslims, the prayer provides a basic structure and style for Arabian music. The scholarly tradition in the Near East developed concepts of education, from where secular and theological criticism could derive.²⁰⁹ But a specific independent and critical cultural perspective did not exist. Arabic grammarians had developed a systematic method for analyzing the style and the structure of classical Arabic. Arabic eloquence (*balaghah*) is a kind of rhetoric serving the Arabic sciences.²¹⁰ According to the *Encyclopaedia of Islam* the noun *balaghah* is a derivative from *ba'ighh*, 'effective', 'eloquent' and from *balaghah* ('to attain something', 'eloquence').²¹¹ One aim among Arabs was to prevent the changes that were considered as corruption of the Arabic language, which began to creep into the language. The orator (*khatib*) originated from the Arabian culture. Arabic *balaghah* was the result of the conditions and circumstances that were prevalent in the Arabic context after Islamisation. The Arabic language reflects the variations discussed in the cultural divide. The rhythm in Arabic produces the effect called 'lawful magic' (*sihr halal*). The system of Islam is distinct from any other system and unique in both its source and transmission of contents. All texts of the *Quran* of the prophet and the *Sunnah* were considered free from weaknesses and limitations of any human ideas. The *Quran* is considered a *mujizaa* (miracle) based on eloquence (*balagha*). Related to Arabic are specific linguistic disciplines. *Ilm al-maani* is the knowledge of semantics. *Ilm al-bayan* is the knowledge of figures of speech. Style is also expressed in the writing system of Arabic. Arabic calligraphy has several styles-*Kufic*, *Thuluth*, and *Naksh*

²⁰⁹ See for critics' interest in classical and colloquial Arabic language: The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 117, 230, 262, 394, 417

²¹⁰ Cf. Hamod, H. "Arab and Moslem Rhetorical Theory and Practice." In: Central States Speech Journal. 14 (1963), pp. 97-104.

²¹¹ Cf. for Arabic rhetoric:

Connor, Ulla. Contrastive Rhetoric. Cross-Cultural Aspects of Second-Language Writing. Cambridge: University Press 1996, pp. 34-26.

style. Islam's monotheism does not allow the representation of human or animal forms. The calligrapher found artistic expression in stylized flowing patterns.²¹²

Al-Jahiz (d. 868) wrote the two books *Al-Bayan wa Al-Tabyin* and *Al-Hayawanin* that he outlined in his formal theory of Arabic *balaghah*.²¹³ According to Herbjørn Jenssen modern studies of classical art/science of Arabic rhetoric (*ilm al-balaghah*) has mainly focused on only one of the three disciplines that make up this field, namely the science of metaphors (*ilm al-bayan*). For the Arab theoreticians it was the science of meanings, the *ilm al-maani*, that was the most important part of *balaghah*.²¹⁴ *Ilm al-bayan*, i.e. knowledge of figures of speech, like similies and metaphors for expressions or shades of meaning or similies and metaphors, is considered a feature of the standard educated. *Ilm al-badi*, knowledge of rhetoric, is considered the knowledge that reveals the beauty of language. The difference between *ilm al-badi* and *ilm al-bayan* are explained as follows:

*The concern of 'ilm al-badee' however, are the manners in which speech is made more beautiful and ornamented (tahseen), and the 'fine points of expression' (mahaasin al-kalaam). Such ornamentation can take a number of forms, some examples of which are: rhymed prose (saj') which enables prose to be divided into sections, or paranomasia (jinaas), which establishes similarities among the words used, or antithesis (tibaqaq), or allusion to the intended meaning (tawriyah), or the use of opposites (muqaabalah) to highlight the intended meaning, and so on.*²¹⁵

²¹² Calligraphy. Islamic Arts and Architecture Organization. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.islamicart.com/main/calligraphy/index.html](http://www.islamicart.com/main/calligraphy/index.html)>

²¹³ Al-Jahiz criticism and essays. eNotes. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.enotes.com/classical-medieval-criticism/al-jahiz](http://www.enotes.com/classical-medieval-criticism/al-jahiz)>

²¹⁴ Cf. Jenssen, Herbjørn. *The Subtleties and Secrets of the Arabic Language. Preliminary Investigations into Al-Qazwini's Talkhis al-Miftah*. Bergen: Centre for Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies (Bergen Studies on the Middle East and Africa 2). Bergen: Center for Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies 1998, pp. 46ff.

²¹⁵ Anonymus. Difference between 'Ilm al-Badee' and 'Ilm al-Bayan. At-Talib. Resources for the Seeker of Knowledge. 6th of February 2007. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://attalib.blogspot.com/search/label/Arabic](http://attalib.blogspot.com/search/label/Arabic)>

See for *ilm al-badi* ('new style'):

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 14, 53, 80, 103, 404

One branch of knowledge is the *ilm al-balagha* (knowledge of oratory), which is considered a very important subject a commentator should master.²¹⁶ Theological rhetoric, the science of words, (*ilm al-kalaam*) is related to word plays and semantic changes. *Iltifat* is a feature of Arabic literary and Quranic style. Lexically *iltifat* means 'to turn/turn one's face to'.²¹⁷ *Iltifat* has been called by rhetoricians *shajaat al-carabiyya* showing in their opinion the daring nature of the Arabic language.²¹⁸ The word *iltifat* is used for turning aside in speech to talk about something before continuing with the original subject. The word *iltifat* was given a technical meaning as early as the time of Asmaii. In the time of Ibn Al-Mutazz (909) the term *iltifat* refers more to narration or from narration to address. Types of *iltifat* and related features exist.²¹⁹ Arabic rhetoric refers to a phenomenon called *iltifat* ('conversion' or 'turning one's face to'). The change of speech from one mode to another, for the sake of freshness and variety for the listener and in order to renew his interest and to keep his mind from boredom was a part of the rhetorical culture. The main idea in terms of the history of Islam is that Muhammad was a speaker and prophet.²²⁰ The origins of Arabic philosophy (*falsafa*) are Greek and Arab philosophy begins with the Arabic translations of Greek philosophical texts. One of the earliest and most important of theoretical treatises is the *Catalogue of the Sciences* written by Al-Farabi (ca. 870-950). In this work Al-Farabi categorized Aristotle's logical texts according to a scheme Arab scholars had taken from late Greek commentators. To these logical texts known as the *Organon* Al-Farabi added Aristotle's *Rhetoric* and *Poetics* as the

²¹⁶ See for *ilm al-balagha*:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 387, 388, 389, 390, 401–5

²¹⁷ Cf. Haleem, Abdel. "Grammatical Shift for the Rhetorical Purposes: Iltifat and Related Features in the Quran". In: Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies. Volume LV. Part 3 (1992). Islamic Awareness. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.islamic-awareness.org/Quran/Text/Grammar/iltifaat.html>>

²¹⁸ Neusner, Jacob. Oral Tradition in Judaism: The Case of the Mishnah. New York: Scholars Press 1987, pp. 65-72.

Zwettler, Michael. The Oral Tradition of Classical Arabic Poetry. Its Character and Implications. Columbus: Ohio State University Press 1978, pp. 46-51.

²¹⁹ Haleem, Abdel. "Grammatical Shift for the Rhetorical Purposes: Iltifat and Related Features in the Quran. Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies. Vol. LV. Part 3.1992. Islamic Awareness. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.islamic-awareness.org/Quran/Text/Grammar/iltifaat.html>>

²²⁰ Cf. Kennedy, George Alexander. "Literacy and Rhetoric in the Ancient Near East." In: Kennedy, George Alexander. Comparative Rhetoric. A Historical and Cross-cultural Introduction. Oxford: University Press 1998, pp. 115-140.

core sciences.²²¹ The theory of poetry as a form of praise and blame was borrowed from rhetoric, where epideictic speeches of praise or blame is one of the three genres of oratory. The formal pursuit of knowledge had existed in several forms since the time of the Greeks. Muslim scholars also preserved the heritage of Greek science and philosophy adding commentaries and glosses.²²²

The Arab scholars also undertook efforts to collect oral history and recorded compositions that had survived in the memories of recitators. Abu Ali Sina (Avicenna) developed the medicine and philosophy of ancient Greece. Avicenna wrote numerous works. In Europe they were translated into Latin. After Latin versions of Averroes' commentaries on Aristotle started to circulate among scholars, the works of the Greek philosopher were rediscovered. The first Christian crusade began in 1095 after the Byzantines asked Pope Urban II for military assistance. A commentary written by Averroes was translated into Latin in 1256 by Hermannus Alemannus and had a wide circulation. Hermannus Alemannus wrote the *Didascalica in Rhetoricam Aristotelis ex Glossa Alfarabii*. Books were translated from Arabic into Latin. The idea that poetry is a branch of logic was developed in scholastic philosophy in the wake of Aristotelian studies at the universities of Paris and Oxford. In the classification of the sciences proposed by Thomas Aquinas (see also chapt. Middle Ages), poetry was considered an 'inventive logic'. In translating the *Ars Rhetorica* of Aristotle into Arabic the terminology of rhetoric was introduced into Arab. *Maqamat lil-Hariri* is in Latin *Haririi Eloquentiae Arabicae Principis Tres* written by Hariri (1054-1122). The work of Averroes together with earlier Arab scholarship on Aristotelian science had influence on theories of poetry in the Latin West. Ibn Rushd (Abu'l-Walid Ibn Rushd, Averroes) was the authority of the Maliki School of Law in Cordoba regarding laws.²²³

Averroes' *Three Short Commentaries on Aristotle's Topics, Rhetoric and Poetics* were written in Arabic exemplifying how Averroes integrated Islamic traditions and Greek thought. Like

²²¹ Eastwood, Bruce. "Al-Farabi on Extramission, Intromission, and the Use of Platonic Visual Theory". In: *Isis*. Vol. 70. No. 3 (Sep., 1979), pp. 423-425

<[http://links.jstor.org/sici=0021-1753\(197909\)70%3A3%3C423%3AAOEIAT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-U](http://links.jstor.org/sici=0021-1753(197909)70%3A3%3C423%3AAOEIAT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-U)>

²²² See for Arabic language and imagery:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 10-11, 31n11, 32, 37

²²³ A Return to Enlightenment. Muqtedar Khan's Column on Islamic Affairs. *Ijtihad*. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.ijtihad.org/ibnrushd.htm>>

Aristotle in his *Poetics* Averroes makes the classification between *khataba* (oratory), *safsata* (sophistry), and *ibara* (rhetoric). *Talkhis* means commentary, a genre Averroes used for his own studies of Aristotle. Accordingly the *Talkis Kitab al-Jadal* is a commentary on Aristotle's *Topics*. Averroes produced commentaries on Aristotle's major works that were translated into Latin during the 13th century. His commentary on the *Poetics* was an attempt to unite the principles of Aristotle's literary criticism with the literary practice of Arab culture. The medieval tradition of prescriptive poetics was a product of a historical synthesis of classical poetics, rhetoric, and teaching on style.²²⁴

Under the Abbasid caliphs Islamic civilization integrated Arabic, Byzantine, Persian, and Indian cultural traditions. In the *Quran* one can find a strong emphasis on the value of knowledge in the Islamic faith. In the Arabian language we find typical rhetorical elements. Rhetoric was designed to teach a practical skill in Islamic countries speaking Arabic. Mosque schools included *hadith*, jurisprudence (*fiqh*), philology, poetry, and rhetoric. Those who study the *Quran* and the traditions (*hadith*) are known in Arab countries and Turkey as the *ulama* or 'learned', and in India as *maulawis*. In the *madrassa* law (*fiqh*), the *Quran* and its pronunciation (*tajwid*) and style of reciting (*qiraa*), Arabic grammar and rhetoric (*sarf, nahw, balagha*), law (*fiqh*) and its principles *tafsir, kalam*, and *hadith*, as well as *logic, arithmetics, astronomy, adab* (literature), and *hikma* (philosophy and metaphysics) were taught.²²⁵ Prior to the appearance of the idea of the *licentia docendi* in the medieval Christian university, it had already developed in Islam with the same designation expressed in Arabic as *ijazat at-tadris*.²²⁶ When Arab influence spread to Spain and Sicily, Europeans became aware of Arab culture and academies spread across the Near East and the Mediterranean. Cordoba and

²²⁴ Haddad, G.F. Ibn Rushud (Averroes). Sunnah Organisation. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.sunnah.org/history/Scholars/Ibn_Rushd.htm](http://www.sunnah.org/history/Scholars/Ibn_Rushd.htm)>

²²⁵ Bruinessen, Martin van. "Pesantren and Kitab Kuning. Maintenance and Continuation of a Tradition of Religious Learning". In: Wolfgang Marschall (ed.). *Texts From the Islands. Oral and Written Traditions of Indonesia and the Malay World*. Ethnologica Bernica, 4. Berne: University of Berne, 1994. University Utrecht. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.let.uu.nl/~Martin.vanBruinessen/personal/publications/pesantren_and_kitab_kuning.htm](http://www.let.uu.nl/~Martin.vanBruinessen/personal/publications/pesantren_and_kitab_kuning.htm)>

See for *adab*:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. *Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period*. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 18, 389, 390, 394–401

²²⁶ Makdisi, George. "Scholasticism and Humanism in Classical Islam and the Christian West". In: *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. Vol. 109. No. 2 (Apr. - Jun., 1989), pp. 175-182

Toledo in Spain were centres of Arab learning.²²⁷ Similar to textual criticism Arab schools invented methods to proof the quality of the tradition of the *Quran*. Fabricated *hadith* can be recognized by external evidence related to a discrepancy found in the dates or times of a particular incident. *Sunan Abu-Dawud* is a collection of sayings and deeds of Muhammad also known as the *sunnah*. The reports of the prophet's sayings and deeds are called a *hadith*. Components of *hadith* are used for text criticism. A *hadith* is composed of three parts: *Matn* (text), *isnad* (chain of reporters), and *taraf*, which is the part or the beginning sentence of the text, which refers to the sayings, actions or characteristics of the prophet or his concurrence with others action. The authenticity of the *hadith* depends on the reporters and the linkage among them. A number of classifications of *hadith* have been made.²²⁸ Four main categories of *hadith* can be identified:

<i>Qudsi</i>	'Divine'.	This is a revelation from Allah, relayed with the words of the Prophet
<i>Marfu</i>	'Elevated'.	This is a narration from the Prophet, e.g. I heard the Prophet saying.
<i>Mauquf</i>	'Stopped'.	This is a narration from a companion only, e.g., we were commanded to ...
<i>Maqtu</i>	'Severed'.	This is a narration from a successor.

Six other categories can be identified.

<i>Musnad</i>	'Supported'.	This is a <i>hadith</i> which is reported by a traditionalist, based on what he Learned from his teacher at a time of life suitable for learning, similarly - in turn – for each teacher until the <i>isnad</i> reaches a well known companion who in turn, reports from the Prophet.
<i>Mutassil</i>	'Continuous'.	This is a <i>hadith</i> with an uninterrupted <i>isnad</i> which goes back only to a companion or successor.
<i>Mursal</i>	'Hurried'.	This is if the link between the successor and the Prophet is missing, e.g. when a successor says "The Prophet said...".
<i>Munqati</i>	'Broken'.	This is a <i>hadith</i> whose link anywhere before the successor.
<i>Mu'adal</i>	'Perplexing'.	This is a <i>hadith</i> whose reporter omits two or more consecutive reporters in the <i>isnad</i> .
<i>Mu'allaq</i>	'Hanging'.	This is a <i>hadith</i> whose reporter omits the whole <i>isnad</i> and quotes the Prophet directly.

²²⁷ Prince, C. "The Historical Context of Arabic Translation, Learning, and the Libraries of Medieval Andalusia." In: *Library History*. Vol. 18. July 2002, pp. 73-87. May 20, 2007.

<http://www.everything2.com/index.pl?node_id=1043514>

²²⁸ Cf. The Science of Hadith. Mission Islam. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.missionislam.com/knowledge/Hadith.htm>>

According to the reliability and memory of the reporters this provides the final verdict on a *hadith* four categories can be identified:

Sahih	‘Sound’.
Hasan	‘Good’. This is a <i>hadith</i> , where its source is known and its reporters are unambiguous.
Daif	‘Weak’. This is a <i>hadith</i> , which fails to reach the status of <i>hasan</i> . Usually, the weakness is one of discontinuity in the <i>isnadin</i> which case the <i>hadith</i> could be according to the nature of the discontinuity like <i>munqati</i> (broken), <i>muallaq</i> (hanging), <i>mudal</i> (perplexing), or <i>mursal</i> (hurried), or one of the reporters having a disparaged character, such as due to his telling lies, excessive mistakes, opposition to the narration of more reliable sources, involvement in innovation, or ambiguity surrounding his person.
Maudu	This is a <i>hadith</i> whose text goes against the established norms of the Prophet's sayings, or its reporters include a liar. ²²⁹

The Islamic teacher (*mudarris*) lectures based on a commentary. The difference between two types of prophets, *nabi* and *rasul*, is that a *nabi* merely receives messages from god, but a *rasul* in addition to receiving messages has the mission to propagate them and deliver them to the people. These are the types of prophets:

Basir	Seer
Sami	Hearer
Hayy	Living
Mutakallim	Speaker ²³⁰

The metres of Arabian poems were first codified in the 8th century by Al-Khalil Bin Ahmad. Metre (*wazn*) is based on the length of syllables. Rhyme (*qafiya*) is basically determined by the last consonant of a word. Arabic knows the terms literary *fasahah* (elegance), *balaghah* (eloquence), *mawizah* (exhortation), and *khitabah* (oratory). *Mawizah* and *khitabah* (oratory) can be differentiated. Oratory deals with emotions and is considered effective when emotions are inert and stagnant. *Mawizah* is required when lusts and passions become uncontrollable.²³¹

²²⁹ Cf. The Science of Hadith. MSA. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.usc.edu/dept/MSA/fundamentals/hadithsunnah/scienceofhadith/brief1/>>

²³⁰ Nahj al Balaghah. Al-Islam Organisation. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.al-islam.org/nahjul/contents.htm>>

²³¹ Arab Poetry. Al-Bab. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.al-bab.com/arab/literature/poetry.htm>>

The metres of Arabian poems were first codified in the 8th century by Al-Khalil Bin Ahmad. Metre (*wazn*) is based on the length of syllables. Rhyme (*qafiya*) is basically determined by the last consonant of a word. Arabic knows the terms literary *fasahah* (elegance), *balaghah* (eloquence), *mawizah* (exhortation), and *khitabah* (oratory). *Mawizah* and *khitabah* (oratory) can be differentiated. Oratory deals with emotions and is considered effective when emotions are inert and stagnant. *Mawizah* is required when lusts and passions become uncontrollable.²³²

In terms of oral culture the prayer is one of the elements of Islam made either collectively or individually as expression of a constant link with the divine, in other words an ability to break with one's material preoccupations. Amongst religious students called *talabatu* (sing. *talib*) the usual course of study is *as-sarf* (grammatical inflection), *an-nahm* (syntax), *al-mantiq* (logic), *al-hisab* (arithmetic), *al-jabr wa 'l-muqabalah* (algebra), *al-mana wa'l-bayan* (rhetoric and versification), *al-fiqh* (jurisprudence), *al-'aqaid* (scholastic theology), *at-tafsir* (commentaries on the *Quran*), *ilmu'l-usul* (treatises on exegesis and the principles and rules of interpretation of the laws of Islam) and *al-ahadis* (the traditions and commentaries).²³³ The Arabic word *al-bayan* is defined in the *Ghiyasu'l-Lughah* as 'fluent and eloquent speech'. The term occurs in the *Quran* (*Surah LV 3*). The word also occurs in the traditions of *hadith*.²³⁴ From the *Quran* and the received *hadith* one can deduce that government is a public affair. In the chapter 'consultation' (*shura*) in the *Quran* we read:

²³² Arab Poetry. Al-Bab. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.al-bab.com/arab/literature/poetry.htm](http://www.al-bab.com/arab/literature/poetry.htm)>

See for Arabic literary criticism:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 387–416

²³³ Cf. Hughes' Dictionary of Islam. Answering Islam. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm](http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm)>

See for critical commentary:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 150, 389, 390, 412–13

See for critical Quranic commentary:

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period. Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 163, 272, 337–8, 398–9

²³⁴ Cf. Hughes' Dictionary of Islam. Answering Islam. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm](http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm)>

Among those who submitted to God's invitation and upheld the prayer (salat), the affair (amr) is conducted on the basis of consultation. By the term 'affair' in this verse and in the hadith related from the Household of the Prophet, is meant rule and governance. And in the word of Imam `Ali we read: "When I rose to run the affair (government), a group broke their allegiance." And in Imam Hasan's letter to Muawiya, we read: "After Ali (May Peace be upon Him), Muslims trusted the affair of government to me.

In the *Quran* the *suras* contain many details on speech, which is here the holy speech. In *Al-Qadr* (*The Night of Decree*) (*Sura 97, Ayat 1*) is said:

97:1 We have indeed revealed this (Message) in the Night of Power.

In *Yusuf* (*Joseph*) (*sura 12, ayat 1*) is said:

12:1 A.L.R. These are the symbols (or verses) of the perspicuous Book.

In *Al-Baiyinah* (*The Clear Evidence*) (*sura 98:1*) is said:

98:1 Those who reject (truth), among the people of the book and among the polytheists, were not going to depart (from their ways) until there should come to them clear evidence,-

In *Al-Jinn* (*The Jinn*) (*sura 72, ayad 1*) is described that the *jinn* (ghosts) are calling the *Quran* a wonderful recital:

72:1 Say: It has been revealed to me that a company of jinns listened (to the Quran). They said, 'We have really heard a wonderful recital!

In *Al-Nour* (*The Light*) (*sura 24, ayat 1*) is said:

24:1 A sura which we have sent down and which we have ordained in it have we sent down clear signs, in order that ye may receive admonition.

In *Al-Qalam* (*The Pen*) (*sura 68, ayat 1*) is said:

68:1 Nun. *By the pen and the (record) which (men) write,*²³⁵

In the 26th chapter of *Al-Ahuara (The Poets)* is written that the mystic books are in perspicuous Arabic speech. In chapter 20 (*Ta-ha*) is written: ‘If thou pronounce the word aloud, (it is no matter) for verily he knoweth what is secret and what is yet more hidden.’ (026.016).

Ibn Rushd identified three methods in order to receive knowledge. The *burhan* as method of logical demonstration was the most superior method. The second was *jadal* (*dialectical*). *Jadal* according to Ibn Rushd was the method used by theologians.²³⁶ The art of *khatabah* consists of rhetoric, sophistry and persuasion. This method according to Ibn Rushd is to be used while dealing with the mass audience. Ibn Rushd’s *Tahafur al-Tahafut* consists of discussions and proofs. Ibn Rushd writes about the allegorical writing:

*61 If Scripture speaks about it; the apparent meaning of the words inevitably either accords or conflicts with the conclusions of demonstration about it. If this [apparent meaning] accords there is no argument. If it conflicts there is a call for allegorical interpretation of it. The meaning of ‘allegorical interpretation’ is: extension of the significance of an expression from real to meta-phorical significance, without forsaking therein the standard metaphorical practices of Arabic, such as calling a thing by the name of something resembling it or a cause or consequence or accom-paniment of it, or other things such as are enumerated in accounts of the kinds of metaphorical speech.*²³⁷

Ibn Rushd writes about the psychological background of the *diversity of people’s natural capacities* as a reason of different meanings of scripture:

72 The reason why we have received a scripture with both an apparent and an inner meaning lies in the diversity of people’s natural capacities and the difference of their innate

²³⁵ The Quran. Arab with Transliteration. IslamiCity.com. Febr. 18, 2007..

<[Http://www.islamicity.com/Mosque/ArabicScript/Ayat/24/24_35.htm](http://www.islamicity.com/Mosque/ArabicScript/Ayat/24/24_35.htm)>

²³⁶ Hughes, Thomas Patrick. A Dictionary of Islam. Answering Islam. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm](http://answering-islam.org/Books/Hughes/e.htm)>

²³⁷ Ibn Sina. On the Harmony of Philosophy and Religion. Kitab Fasl Al-Maqal with its Appendix (damima)

from Kitab Al-Kashf ‘An Manahij Al-Adilla. Transl. by George F. Hourani. London: Luzac 1976. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ir/fasl.htm](http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ir/fasl.htm)>

*dispositions with regard to assent. The reason why we have received in Scripture texts whose apparent meanings contradict each other is in order to draw the attention of those who are well grounded in science to the interpretation which reconciles them. 73 This is the idea referred to in the words received from the Exalted, 'He it is who has sent down to you the Book, containing certain verses clear and definite' [...] down to the words 'those who are well grounded in science'.*²³⁸

The *Muqaddimah* (Introduction or Prolegomenon) is a source for Arabic rhetoric and speech of the High Middle Ages. The *Muqaddimah* is the most important Islamic history of the pre-modern world written by the 14th-century Arab scholar Ibn Khaldun. The *Muqaddimah* was a universal work of several fields of knowledge.²³⁹ Islamic religious scholars must know the sciences connected with the Arabic language. These parts of the Arabic linguistics are lexicography, grammar, *bayan* (syntax and style), and literature. Knowledge of these parts is necessary for religious scholars, since the source of religious laws is the *Quran* and the *Sunnah*. Their first transmitters were Arab men around Muhammad and the men following him in a second generation. According to the *Muqaddimah* these sciences differ in emphasis according to the different degrees of usefulness. According to the *Muqaddimah* educated people feared that the Arab linguistic values would become entirely corrupted. They derived certain norms for the Arab linguistic works from their way of speaking. Ali noticed that the linguistic habit was changing. The science of syntax and style and literary criticism in the description of the *Muqaddimah* developed as a 'science which originated in Islam' after Arabic philology and lexicography. In the *Muqaddimah bayan* has been divided into three subdivisions. The first subdivision has as its subject the investigation of forms and conditions of speech in order to achieve conformity with all the requirements of a given situation called 'the science of rhetoric' (*balaghah*). Scholars have added as a third subdivision the study of the artistic embellishment of speech achieved through the ornamental use of rhymed prose (*saj*), which divides speech into sections. A figure used is paronomasia (*tajnis*), which establishes a similarity among the words used or the use of internal rhyme (*tarsi*) that cuts down the units of rhythmic speech into smaller units or through. Another figure is the allusion (*tawriyah*) to the intended meaning by suggesting an even more cryptic idea, which is

²³⁸ Ibn Sina. On the Harmony of Philosophy and Religion. Kitab Fasl Al-Maqal with its Appendix (damima) from Kitab Al-Kashf 'an Manahij Al-Adilla. Transl. by George F. Hourani. London: Luzac 1976. Febr. 18, 2007. <<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ir/fasl.htm>>.

²³⁹ Arabic Poetry. Adab. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.adab.com/en/modules.php?name=Content&pa=showpage&pid=18>>

expressed by the same words or through. Another figure mentioned in the book *Muqaddimah* is the antithesis (*tibaq*) and similar figures. In the *Muqaddimah* this is called 'the science of rhetorical figures' (*ilm al-badi*). Recent scholars have according to the *Muqaddimah* used the name of the second subdivision, *bayan* (syntax and style), for all three subdivisions because the ancient scholars had discussed it first.²⁴⁰ According to the *Muqaddimah* eloquence is conformity of speech, which is performed by literary critics:

1557. An explanation of the meaning of natural and contrived speech. How contrived speech may be either good or deficient.

1567 It should be known that the secret and spirit of speech - that is, expression and address - lie in conveying ideas. If no effort is made to (convey ideas), (speech) is like "dead land" (mawat)

1568 which does not count. The perfect way of conveying (ideas) is eloquence. This is shown by the literary critics,

1569 definition of eloquence. They say that (eloquence) is conformity of speech to the requirements of the situation.

1570 Knowledge of the conditions and laws governing the conformity of word combinations to the requirements of the situation is the discipline of eloquence (rhetoric). The conditions and laws were deduced from the Arabic language and have become a sort of rules. The manner in which word combinations are used indicates the relationship that exists between two interdependent (parts of an utterance). (It does so) with the help of conditions and laws constituting the main part of the rules of Arabic. The situations that apply to the word combinations - which may be earlier or later position, determination or indetermination, implicit or explicit (reference), statements used restricted or absolute, and so on - indicate the situations that envelop from outside the (existing) relationship and the persons discoursing with each other.²⁴¹

A science described in the *Muqaddimah* is *bayan*, the science of rhetorical style:

²⁴⁰ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_44>

²⁴¹ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_57>

In its conventional meaning, a word combination indicates one particular idea, but then the mind moves on to what might be the consequence of, or have as its consequence, that idea, or (what might) be similar to it and, thus, express (some idea) indirectly as metaphor or metonymy, 1571 as has been established in the proper places.

1572 This moving around causes pleasure to the mind, perhaps even more than (the pleasure) that results from indicating (the requirements of the situation) All these things mean attainment of a conclusion from the argument used to prove it, and attainment, as one knows, is one of the things that cause pleasure. The different ways the (mind) moves around in this way also have (their) conditions and laws, which are like rules. They were made into a (special) craft and called "the (science of) style" (bayan).

1573 (This science) is sister to the science of idea expression, which indicates the requirements of a given situation. The (science of style) has reference to the ideas and meanings of the word combinations. The rules of the science of idea expression have reference to the very situations that apply to the word combinations, as far as they affect the meaning. Word and idea depend on each other and stand side by side,

1574 as one knows.²⁴²

Both sciences of idea and style according to the *Muqaddimah* establish the science of rhetoric:

Thus, the science of idea expression and the science of style are both part of rhetoric, and both together produce perfect indication and conformity to the requirements of the situation. Consequently, word combinations that fall short of conformity and perfect indication are inferior in eloquence. (Such word combinations) are linked by rhetoricians to the sounds dumb animals make. The preferred assumption is that they are not Arabic, because Arabic is (the kind of speech) in which indications are in conformity with the requirements of the situation.²⁴³

The *Muqaddimah* gives this definition of eloquence:

²⁴² Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_57>

²⁴³ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_57>

*Thus, eloquence is the basis, genius, spirit, and nature of Arabic speech.*²⁴⁴

The *Muqaddimah* uses for literary criticism the term *bayan*.²⁴⁵ In the *Foreword* of the *Muqaddimah* is written:

*It is well known to competent persons and reliable experts that the works of al-Masudi and al-Waqidi are suspect and objectionable in certain respects.¹⁶ However, their works have been distinguished by universal acceptance of the information they contain and by adoption of their methods and their presentation of material. The discerning critic is his own judge as to which part of their material he finds spurious, and which he gives credence to. Civilization, in its (different) conditions, contains (different) elements to which historical information may be related and with which reports and historical materials may be checked.*²⁴⁶

Islamic philosophy differentiates between several modes of reasoning. According to the *Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy* the term *naqid al-muqaddam* has the meaning “denial of antecedent, an invalid (*aqim*) mode of reasoning which does not warrant any logical conclusion”.²⁴⁷ The term *aks* has the meaning “conversion, i.e. deriving a proposition by way of an immediate inference from a given proposition by transposing its subject and predicate but without changing its quality and without distributing a term in the inferred proposition (*makus*) which is not already distributed in the given proposition (*makus minhu*); sometimes called *al-aks al-mustawi* to distinguish it from *al-aks al-naqid* see also *munakis*.”²⁴⁸ The term *al-aks al-naqid* has the meaning “contraposition, i.e. an immediate inference in which from a given proposition we infer another proposition, having for its subject the contradictory of the

²⁴⁴ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_57>

²⁴⁵ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_50.htm>

²⁴⁶ Abd Ar-Rahman Bin Mohammed Ibn Khaldun. *Muqaddimah*. Transl. by Franz Rosenthal. Muslim Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ik/Muqaddimah/Chapter6/Ch_6_44>

²⁴⁷ Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy. Islamic Philosophy Online Project. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm>>

²⁴⁸ Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy. Islamic Philosophy Online Project. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm>>

given predicat, e.g. from the proposition of the form "All S is P" we have through al-aks al-naqid "No not-P is S"; it thus involves first obversion (*adl*) of the given proposition then conversion (*aks*) of the obverse (*madul*).²⁴⁹ The term *ain al-tali* has the meaning "affirmation of the consequent, an involved mode of reasoning which does not warrant any logical conclusion; opposed to *naqid al-tali*."²⁵⁰ The term *ain al-muqaddam* has the meaning "affirmation of the antecedent in the minor premise of a mixed hypothetical syllogism (*al-qiyas al-sharti al-muttasil*) leading to the affirmation of the consequent (*tali*) in the conclusion, a valid mode of reasoning called the positive mode (modus ponens) of hypothetical syllogism; opposed to *naqid al-muqaddam* (denial of the antecedent) which is a form of logical fallacy".²⁵¹ The acceptance of printing by Muslim clergy marks the beginning of religious publishing. The process of *kharraja* (publishing) was accepted as a dominant feature of the mission of Islam. Printing was forbidden in the Middle East soon after its invention due to its power. Two major types of religious publishing are *turath* (heritage) works, and *dawah* (piety or propaganda) works. Zaharna stated that for the Arab culture emphasis is put on form over function, affect over accuracy and image over meaning.²⁵² In *The Science Of Makki and Madini (Historical Criticism)* published by the *American Muslim Society* an access to Quran study by historical criticism was done. We can read here:

The third science to develop from study of the Quran was Ilm al Makki wal Madini (knowledge of the locus of revelation – Makkah or Madinah). Like the contexts of revelation, the study of the locus of revelation may be subsumed under exegesis. Most of the pertinent materials were included in the exegetical works. However, the study is independent and autonomous, because it deals with historical materials different from those of the science of asbab al nuzul. The latter takes into consideration the particular historical materials in the individuals and their interrelationships, and the events, deeds, and circumstances that constitute the real matrix of the specific verse or verses in question. These, however, are not

²⁴⁹ Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy. Islamic Philosophy Online Project. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm](http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm)>

²⁵⁰ Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy. Islamic Philosophy Online Project. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm](http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm)>

²⁵¹ Dictionary of Islamic Philosophy. Islamic Philosophy Online Project. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm](http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/pd/d-17.htm)>

²⁵² Zaharna, R.S. Bridging Cultural Differences. American Public Relations Practices & Arab Communication Patterns. American University. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://nw08.american.edu/~zaharna/arab-comm.htm](http://nw08.american.edu/~zaharna/arab-comm.htm)>

*the only historical materials relevant for a correct understanding of revelation. The Makki and Madini science was developed in order to answer three different inquiries.*²⁵³

In modern times the colonisation and influence of the European countries resulted in secular movements. It also resulted into opposite conservative religious movements. As described by Ayish a tradition of research known as 'Islamic communication' gained vogue in the mid-1980s. In its basic configuration, this tradition was no more than an exposition of how mass media could be used to propagate Islamic ideas and concepts around the world.²⁵⁴ Arab countries develop local publishing industries, but they also have access to television, computer, and Internet technology in different degrees depending on the economic situation of each country.²⁵⁵ *Arabsat (Arab Satellite Communication Organization)* is positioned as the leading provider of satellite communication for the Arab World. It was established to serve the needs of telecommunication, information, culture, and education sectors. The introduction of mass media studies into Arab countries was marked by strong Western influences in terms of media formats, media usages, and perceptions of communication effects. Also Academic communication schemes in the Arab world were modelled after Western, especially American programs. For globalisation Arab leaders are pursuing with greater vigour liberal investment policies. Radio and television are, until recently, everywhere in the Middle East centralized services under state control, sponsorship and supervision. Besides the growing popularity of television and satellite TV, the radio remains the most important medium for communication, since it can reach distant rural areas. In the *Beirut Declaration* in 2002 was said:

The Council welcomes the resumption of the dialogue between Iraq and the United Nations.

The Council calls for lifting the sanctions on Iraq and ending the tribulation of the fraternal Iraqi people.

The Council rejects threats of aggression against some Arab states, particularly Iraq, and reiterates categorical rejection of attacking Iraq.

²⁵³ The Science Of Makki and Madini (Historical Criticism). American Muslim Society. June 5, 2007.

<http://www.masnet.org/history.asp?id=498>

²⁵⁴ Ayish, Muhammad I. Communication Research in the Arab World. A New Perspective. [2.2.2007]

<http://www.javnost-thepublic.org/media/datoteke/1998-1-ayish.pdf>

²⁵⁵ Hover, Paul L. Islamic Book and Information Culture. An Overview. Webology. Vol. 4, Number 1, March, 2007. Webology. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.webology.ir/2007/v4n1/a39.html>

*The Council denounces international terrorism, including the terrorist attack on the United States on 11 September 2001, as well as the Israeli Government's exploitation of this attack. The Council emphasizes the distinction between international terrorism and the peoples' legitimate right to resist foreign occupation, and stresses the need to reach an international agreement within the framework of the United Nations.*²⁵⁶

In the *Pact of the League of Arab States* (March 22, 1945) was stated regarding communication:

Article 1.

The League of Arab States shall be composed of the: independent Arab States that have signed this Pact.

Article 2.

The purpose of the League is to draw closer the relations between member States and co-ordinate their political activities with the aim of realizing a close collaboration between them, to safeguard their independence and sovereignty, and to consider in a general way the affairs and interests of the Arab countries.

It also has among its purposes a close co-operation of the member States with due regard to the structure of each of these States and the conditions prevailing therein, in the following matters:

(a) Economic and financial matters, including trade, customs, currency, agriculture and industry;

(b) (communications, including railways, roads, aviation, navigation, and posts and telegraphs;

*(c) Cultural matters;*²⁵⁷

²⁵⁶ Extracts From the Text of the 'Beirut Declaration' (final Communiqué) Issued by the Arab Summit in Beirut, 28 March, 2002. Al-Bab. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.al-bab.com/arab/docs/league/communique02.htm](http://www.al-bab.com/arab/docs/league/communique02.htm)>

Arab ministers of communication ratified new strategy of communication from 2007 to 2012. This new Arab strategy based on a plan including pivots related to enhance communication's services among the Arab countries and the E-government in addition to developing Arab joint market in the field of communication, as well as encouraging the Arab investment in human development.²⁵⁸ The *Kuwait Constitution* (1962) stated in article 36 (Freedom of Opinion and Expression):

Freedom of opinion and of scientific research is guaranteed. Every person has the right to express and propagate his opinion verbally, in writing, or otherwise, in accordance with the conditions and procedures specified by law.

Article 37 (Freedom of the Press) states:

Freedom of the press, printing, and publishing is guaranteed in accordance with the conditions and manner specified by law.

Article 39 (Freedom and Secrecy of Communication) states regarding *freedom of communication*:

*Freedom of communication by post, telegraph, and telephone and the secrecy thereof is guaranteed; accordingly, censorship of communications and disclosure of their contents are not permitted except in the circumstances and manner specified by law.*²⁵⁹

Yemen has a specific law (Law No. 25 (1990)) on press and publications. Article 3 states:

²⁵⁷ Pact of the League of Arab States, March 22, 1945. Mideast Page 20th Century Page. The Avalon Project. Yale University. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/mideast/arableag.htm#art2](http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/mideast/arableag.htm#art2)>

²⁵⁸ Thawra, Mazen. SANA. Syrian Arab News Agency, 10.01.2007. University Potsdam. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.uni-](http://www.uni-potsdam.de/db/elog/ifgcc/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=22356&Itemid=93&lang=de_DE)

[potsdam.de/db/elog/ifgcc/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=22356&Itemid=93&lang=de_DE](http://www.uni-potsdam.de/db/elog/ifgcc/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=22356&Itemid=93&lang=de_DE)>

²⁵⁹ The Kuwait Constitution. University Bern. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.servat.unibe.ch/law/icl/ku00000_.html](http://www.servat.unibe.ch/law/icl/ku00000_.html)>

*Freedom of knowledge, thought, the press, expression, communication and access to information are rights of the citizen which enable him/her to express his/her thoughts orally, in writing or in pictorial or in drawing form or by any other means of expression. These rights are guaranteed to every citizen by the Constitution and by the provisions of this law.*²⁶⁰

Muhammad Yahya wrote in *Al-Tawhid. A Criticism of the Idea of Arab Nationalism*:

*The Arab nationalist propaganda has been increasingly voiced in recent months from many organs in several Arab countries, particularly Egypt. It was quite evident to observers of the Islamic movement that a re-vitalization of that idea was in order in view of the current hysterical building of defensive strategies in the Arab region against the famous danger of Islamic 'fundamentalism'. It is only appropriate that an idea which originated at the hands of Christian Levantine writers to serve as a weapon of disintegration against the 'Uthmani State, should now be unearthed to be of service once more in the face of rising Islam.*²⁶¹

In *A History of Muslim Philosophy* is written regarding modern criticism of Muslim natural historians:

*[...] to learn moral and spiritual lessons from the phenomena of nature is, therefore, legitimate from the point of view of Islam because it is spiritually meaningful and fulfils a need, whereas finding the weight of a certain leaf of a tree to be so many grams is from this point of view a secondary and unimportant inquiry unless it leads to higher knowledge. The modern criticism of Muslim natural historians on this point is, therefore, unjust and based on a misapprehension of their point of view.*²⁶²

²⁶⁰ Law No. 25 (1990) of Yemen. Al-Bab. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.al-bab.com/yemen/gov/off4.htm](http://www.al-bab.com/yemen/gov/off4.htm)>

²⁶¹ Yahya, Muhammad. "Al-Tawhid. A Criticism of the Idea of Arab Nationalism". Article presented at the World Seminar on "The Impact of Nationalism on the Ummah," London, Dhu al-Qi'dah 13 -- 16, 1405 (July 31 - August 3, 1985), held by the Muslim Institute. Al-Islam Organisation. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.al-islam.org/al-tawhid/arabnationalism.htm](http://www.al-islam.org/al-tawhid/arabnationalism.htm)>

²⁶² A History of Muslim Philosophy. Edited and Introduced by M. M. Sharif. Published by Pakistan Philosophical Congress. Muslim Philosophy Online. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/hmp/](http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/hmp/)>

Muhammadullah Muhammad Khalili Qasmi stated in *Does Islam Permit Critical Thinking?* an ultra-conservative position identifying the legal process of decision making in Islamic culture, *ijtihad*, biased as ‘critical thinking’:

The clear and apparent meanings of the Glorious Quran and the Hadith, which are called ‘mansusaat’ or ‘nusoos-e-qatiyah’ in Islamic terms, have no place for criticism. Here, rational thinking to find out the depth is not only permissible but also encouraged in Islam. The principle beliefs, obligatory practices are from this category where the human mind is allowed to explore the reasons and the facts of the matters, but it is not allowed to criticize since the mind has its own limitation as other human faculties have.

[...]

Besides, Islam allows critical thinking in other matters. The four major schools of thought in Islamic Fiqh i.e. Hanafi, Shaf’ee, Maliki, Hanbali are the clear proof of the claim. The scholars, having deep knowledge of the Glorious Quraan, Hadith and Islamic sciences, discussed the matters, which were not explicitly mentioned in the Qur’aan and Hadith, and they perform ijtihad.²⁶³

Naqd is the Arabic noun for criticism, especially literary criticism, and several forms of criticism in the Arab culture exist.²⁶⁴ Recent developments in Muslim culture show tendencies of integrating criticism into an Islamic cultural concept. Here we find different concepts behind the term depending on the background. Sherin Khankan in *A Muslim Manifesto* wrote in *Forum For Critical Muslims* wrote on criticism of Muslims:

Critique

Critique is known as naqd in Arabic and is a positive word to us, as it fuels development and dynamism. It is important, that we dare to criticise each other, as critique often develops our understanding of how we ought to act as well as refining our points of view. There is a need for more critical voices among Danish Muslims. The highest form of critique is self-criticism to turn ones sight and critique inwards before we look outwards. We believe in the Quran as the revealed word of God. We consider this word to be eternally true, universal and infallible.

²⁶³ Khalili Qasmi, Muhammadullah Muhammad. “Does Islam Permit Critical Thinking?”

IRFI. Islamic Research Foundation International, Inc. May 29, 2007.

<http://www.irfi.org/articles/articles_351_400/does_islam_permit_critical_think.htm

²⁶⁴ See for *naqd*: The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Arabic Literature in the Post-Classical Period.

Edited by Roger Allen and D. S. Richards. Oxford: Cambridge University Press 2006. Pp. 388–9, 390, 391, 392

*Our interpretations on the other hand are relative, impermanent and fallible. Our criticisms are aimed at our interpretations, which often become ideologies of truth. We are working for a critical approach to the dogmatic and reactionary interpretations of the Quran, as well as a critique of tradition and culture.[...]*²⁶⁵

In the 21st century the term *naqd* is employed in a wide field of cultural assets. The newspaper *An-Naqid* is published since 1988 in London and now online available. Ibn Rashik was called *an-naqid ash-shaer* (critic and poet) in the writing of Abdarrauf Mahluf with the same name published in 1965. Ibn Haldun was called *naqid at-ta-rih wal-adab* by Utman Muwafi in the writing published in 1976. The Congress *Falsafat an-Naqd wa-Naqd al-Falsafa fi 'l-Fikr al-Arabi wa-'l-Garbi* (*Critical Philosophy and Criticism of Philosophy in Arab and Western Thinking*) was in Cairo in 2003. In terms of the expression of critical thought the countries in the Middle East have contents in their constitutions that guarantee the freedom of expression. On the other hand this freedom is limited by cultural values considered to be in higher esteem and traditions.

²⁶⁵ Sherin Khankan. A Muslim Manifesto. Forum For Critical Muslims. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.kritiskemuslimer.dk/muslim_manifesto.htm](http://www.kritiskemuslimer.dk/muslim_manifesto.htm)>

2.2. "Tenqid"- On Criticism in Non-Arabic Cultures, the Middle East and C. Asia

In Jewish *l'havdil, lehavdil* (lit. 'the difference') is used to contrast as a form of modesty something great from something far less significant.²⁶⁶ In the *Research Project of the Working Group Modernity and Islam* at the *Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin* was emphasized that in recent years critical thinking within the "Islamic and Jewish academic world has engaged in new ways of thinking about its own respective religious traditions." It was stated also that the "critique of the political appropriation of the religious sources evolves from the critical engagement with the tradition itself. This is true for contemporary Jewish as well as Muslim thought, at least within a religious avant garde."²⁶⁷ The *Bible* is written in Hebrew and became subject to textual criticism.²⁶⁸ The texts of the first five books of the *Bible* (*Pentateuch*) were written down in 500 B.C.E. Some of these texts date back to the 9th century B.C.E. The five books of Moses (*Torah*) are a part of the Jewish oral tradition. Thirteen basic rules of logic and style exist that govern the interpretation of the written Jewish law.²⁶⁹ These rules of *Rabbi Yishmael* are listed in the *Introduction to Sifra* and provide the basic tools for understanding the *Talmud*.²⁷⁰ Hebrew literature is represented by Solomon's *The Song of Songs* in the *Bible*. Modern Hebrew, Aramaic, and Arabic share many linguistic features. The title *naqid* -'shepherd'- was given to the ruler. In the Hebrew *Bible* *naqid* is a prominent, conspicuous person as chief of the royal palace.²⁷¹ Glueck demonstrated that Hebrew *naqid* and *noqed* are similar in terms of their etymology to other semitic languages starting from early

²⁶⁶ Dictionary of Judaica. Dictionary of Key Words and Phrases. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.jewishgen.org/infofiles/dict.txt](http://www.jewishgen.org/infofiles/dict.txt)>

²⁶⁷ Islamic and Jewish Hermeneutics as Cultural Criticism. Research Project of the Working Group Modernity and Islam. Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.wissenschaftskolleg.de/index.php?id=99&L=1&type=98](http://www.wissenschaftskolleg.de/index.php?id=99&L=1&type=98)>

²⁶⁸ Cf. Snyman, Andries H. "On Studying the Figures (Schemata) in the New Testament." In: *Biblica*. 69. 1. (1988), pp. 93-107.

Yaakov, Mashiah. *The Terminology of Hebrew Prosody and Rhetoric with Special Reference to Arabic Origins*. Ann Arbor, Mi: University Microfiches 1975, pp. 93-101.

²⁶⁹ 'Judaism. Compiled by Rabbi Mordechai Becher and Rabbi Moshe Newman. Ohr Somayach International. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://ohr.edu/judaism/survey/survey4.htm](http://ohr.edu/judaism/survey/survey4.htm)>

²⁷⁰ 'Judaism2. Compiled by Rabbi Mordechai Becher and Rabbi Moshe Newman. Ohr Somayach International. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://ohr.edu/judaism/survey/survey4.htm](http://ohr.edu/judaism/survey/survey4.htm)>

²⁷¹ 'Governor'. In: *WebBible and Christian Answers.Net*. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.christiananswers.net/dictionary/governor.html](http://www.christiananswers.net/dictionary/governor.html)>

Mesopotamian languages. In Arabic the root *n-q-t* means ‘to pierce’, ‘to mark with dots’, and *n-q-s* means ‘to blemish’. In Syriac the root *nqd* has similar meanings.²⁷² Hebrew is currently spoken by a community in the State of Israel.²⁷³ The noun ‘critic’ is in Hebrew מְבַקֵּר.²⁷⁴ According to *Webster's Online Dictionary* the English translation of מְבַקֵּר includes the terms comptroller, controller, critic, critique, reviewer, visitant, and visitor.²⁷⁵ The English term ‘to criticise’ is in Hebrew בְּקִרְיָהּ.²⁷⁶ The verb תְּרוֹקֵב has the meanings censure, check, commentary, control, inquiry, inspection, review, and stricture.²⁷⁷ Hebrew לְרִוּגָא is in English ‘critical’.²⁷⁸ The Jewish law was exposed by the *soferim* (scribes). In Palestina and Babylonia schools produced *Talmuds*, known as the *Talmud Yerushalmi* and *Talmud Babli*.²⁷⁹ Study and mastery of the *Talmud* marked one as a *rabbi*, a master. The oral law was used by the Jews. In fragments of the *Dead Sea Scrolls* (1Q29, 4Q376 1Q29 F.1) considered to be part of the *Bible* ‘tongues of fire’ are described in a text mentioning also the speech of a prophet and the interpretation of the priest:

[...] [...] the stone, just as the LORD commanded [...] and your Urim. And it [the cloud?] shall come forth with him, with the tongues of fire. The left-hand stone which is on its left side shall be uncovered before the whole congregation until the priest finishes speaking and after

²⁷² Glueck, J. J. “Nagid-Shepherd”. In: *Vetus Testamentum*. Vol. 13, Fasc. 2 (Apr., 1963). Pp. 144-150.

²⁷³ *Writings and Speech in Israelite and Ancient Near Eastern prophecy*. Ed. by Ehud Ben Zvi. Atlanta, Ga.: Society of Biblical Literature 2000, pp. 23-29

²⁷⁴ Milon: English Hebrew Dictionary. Milon. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://milon.morfix.co.il/Default.aspx](http://milon.morfix.co.il/Default.aspx)>

²⁷⁵ Webster's Online Dictionary Hebrew-English. Webster's Online. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.websters-online-](http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/translation/Hebrew/%25D7%259E%25D6%25B0%25D7%2591%25D6%25B7%25D7%25A7%25D6%25BC%25D6%25B5%25D7%25A8)

[dictionary.org/translation/Hebrew/%25D7%259E%25D6%25B0%25D7%2591%25D6%25B7%25D7%25A7%25D6%25BC%25D6%25B5%25D7%25A8](http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/translation/Hebrew/%25D7%259E%25D6%25B0%25D7%2591%25D6%25B7%25D7%25A7%25D6%25BC%25D6%25B5%25D7%25A8)>

²⁷⁶ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

²⁷⁷ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

²⁷⁸ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

²⁷⁹ *A Dictionary of the Targumim, the Talmud Babli and Yerushalmi, and the Midrashic Literature*. Compiled by Marcus Jastrow. Case Western Reserve University. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://library.case.edu/ksl/ecoll/books/jasdic00/jasdic00a.pdf](http://library.case.edu/ksl/ecoll/books/jasdic00/jasdic00a.pdf)>

Safran, William. “The Jewish Diaspora in a Comparative and Theoretical Perspective”. In: *Israel Studies*. Volume 10. Number 1. Spring 2005, pp. 36-60

the cloud has been lifted ... And you shall keep [...] the prophet has spoken to you [...] [...] who counsels rebellion [...] [...] the LORD your God [...]

[...] [... the] right-hand stone when the priest comes out [...] three tongues of fire from the right-hand stone [...] [from ...] [...] and after he goes up he shall draw near to the people[...]

[...] [...the LORD] your God [...] [...Blessed is the God of Israel] [...] [...] among them all. Your name [...] [...and an] abundance of strenght, honored [and awesome...] [...]

[...] these words, according to all [...] [... and then] the priests shall interpret²⁸⁰

When Israel was created as a homeland for Jewish people, Hebrew became the national language of Israel. The word *torah* means ‘a teaching’. In *The Aims of Yiddish Philology* (1913) David Katz wrote about the philosophy and history of the Jewish history:

Of all the sciences, philology plays the greatest role in the national revival of oppressed peoples. Philology is not a hollow theory for scholars and sedentary academics but a practical guide for the people. It does encompass certain theoretical and historical components such as the history of the language and culture with which it is concerned and the general principles of language development. Yet its purpose and its educational importance lie with the practical life of the people. The first objective of every awakening people is the mastery of its own language in order that it be used all the more productively in its national creativity. As long as a people remain illiterate in its own language there can be no national culture. National culture comprises not only the poetic works of literary masters but primarily and foremostly the skill to correctly speak and write the mother tongue.²⁸¹

Midrash is a commentary or interpretation of religious texts. *Shailo* is a judgment or ruling.²⁸² Ancient translations are often used as witnesses of the biblical texts. Retranslated translations

²⁸⁰ Tongues of Fire. 1Q29, 4Q376. Dead Sea Scroll Texts. The Gnostic Society Library. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.gnosis.org/library/tongfi.htm](http://www.gnosis.org/library/tongfi.htm)>

²⁸¹ Katz, David. *The Aims of Yiddish Philology*. Edited, Translated and Abridged by David Katz for Publication in *Jewish Frontier* (June-July 1980). Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.angelfire.com/il2/borochov/yiddish.html](http://www.angelfire.com/il2/borochov/yiddish.html)>

²⁸² Dictionary of Judaica. Dictionary of Key Words and Phrases. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.jewishgen.org/infofiles/dict.txt](http://www.jewishgen.org/infofiles/dict.txt)>

back into Hebrew demonstrate if another text underlies the translation used by the *textus receptus*. Clement of Alexandria's Greek word *ιαουε* favors the transliteration 'Yahweh' or 'YHVH'. Hebrew and the Jewish culture developed their own forms of critical studies in literature. Hebrew belongs to the North-central branch of the Semitic family of languages.²⁸³ The formal language of the Babylonian Empire was Aramaic becoming the vernacular language of Judaea for 700 years. Hebrew was not used as a spoken language for about 2300 years. Hebrew and Aramaic are the languages of the early *Bible* writings and are central to Judaism and Jewish culture. Terms of speech are in Hebrew ללמ (talk, verbosity, words), לולמ (utterance), עלמ (term, word), למנמ and לושל for expression, language, lingo, and tongue, לעבע (oral expression), לובע for saying, talk, talking, utterance, and word, לורע (address, lecture, sermon), לממש בין (expression), and למנמ (address, oration, ovation). Hebrew words or elements of words have become embedded in European languages. In European languages the influence of Hebraisms can be found as early as when travelling Sefardim (Arabic 'safer' 'travel') in the High Middle Ages have taken with them their lingua franca, a language which originated in Spain and was changed by the fact that it was written in the Hebrew alphabet separated from mainstream Spanish by its association with the dominant languages in the areas of settlement and especially in the Ottoman territories.²⁸⁴ The Hebrew alphabet and writing became popular around 600 B.C.E. Communication terminology in Hebrew contains the term לריסמ with the meanings conveyance, delivery, handing, pass, and transmission, לרודשת for broadcast, despatch, dispatch, and message, לרושקת and לרובחת for traffic and transport, לרשק for connection, converse, knot, liaison, and relationship, and לרבעה for conveyance, passing, and removal.²⁸⁵ The first written evidence of Hebrew is the *Gezer Calendar*, which dates back to the 10th century B.C.E.²⁸⁶ The *Rabbi Donald A. Tam Institute for Jewish Studies* mentioned the following disciplines in Jewish Studies:

²⁸³ Bar-Lev, Zev. "Hebrew key-letters." In: *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies*. Vol. 21. 4. (2003), pp. 85-114

Rabin, Chaim. *A Short History of the Hebrew Language*. Adath-Shalom. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.adath-shalom.ca/rabin_he.htm](http://www.adath-shalom.ca/rabin_he.htm)>

²⁸⁴ Zucker, George K. *Ladino, Judezmo, Spanyolit, El Kasteyano Muestro*. *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies*. Vol. 19. 4 (2001), pp. 4-14

²⁸⁵ Milon. *English Hebrew-English Dictionary*. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.milon.co.il/](http://www.milon.co.il/)>

Cheyette, Bryan. "On Being a Jewish Critic". In: *Jewish Social Studies*. Vol. 11. Number 1. Fall 2004 (New Series). Pp. 32-51

²⁸⁶ *Jewish Terminology*. University Hamburg. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.rz.uni-hamburg.de/rz3a035/jew_term.html](http://www.rz.uni-hamburg.de/rz3a035/jew_term.html)>

Jewish literature includes the classic texts of the Hebrew Bible and the Talmud, as well as non-canonical texts, such as discoveries from the Dead Sea Scrolls, the Cairo Genizah and modern Hebrew poetry from Rahel Blaustein and Haim Nahman Bialik.

[...]

Literary critics analyze Jewish texts with the following guiding questions:

Which genre is used and why?

Who are the characters?

What is the tone?

How does the plot develop?

Who is the author? What is the writer's intent?

What are recurring themes and motifs?

How do various schools of literary criticism understand the meaning of the text? Is there meaning?

Who is the author writing for? Who are the readers, intended or actual?

If the author is multilingual, how is meaning affected by language choice?

*The purpose of literary criticism is to offer interpretive analysis, to make a value judgment, or to enrich the reader's understanding of the historical background of a work. One critic's interpretation provokes a scholarly debate among other critics, who respond with fresh interpretations.*²⁸⁷

Eric Zakim in *To Build and Be Built. Landscape, Literature, and the Construction of Zionist Identity* criticized the “normative forms of Hebrew criticism and Zionist historiography”:

This present study begins in a consideration of the consequences of this incapacity of history and criticism—despite their many achievements—to present things in a way that does justice to what the original slogan "to build and be built" actually tried to express. "To build and be built" presents the mutual relation between Jew and land as something other than an identity thesis, where the terms of this reflective formula would present themselves as self-evidently true. Conversely, the two normative forms of Hebrew criticism and Zionist historiography —

²⁸⁷ Disciplines in Jewish Studies: Literature. The Rabbi Donald A. Tam Institute for Jewish Studies. June 7, 2007.

<http://www.js.emory.edu/disciplines/literature.html>

*literary and political—advance precisely an identity thesis that the original formula always found suspect.*²⁸⁸

Due to its geographic origin the Arabic language had contacts with Greek, Persian, Copt, Roman, Indian, and Chinese culture. The Arabs translated and preserved literature of the Greeks, Indians, and Persians. During the 9th and 10th centuries a translation movement centred in Baghdad. Islamisation reached the Eastern part of Europe and Central Asia. Islam spread all over Central Asia. The *maktabs* and *madrasas* of Central Asia were signs of the Arabic influence in Central Asia. The transmission of knowledge (*talim*) was one concern of the *maktab*. Pupils were also taught proper modes of behaviour and conduct (*tarbiya*).²⁸⁹ The instruction in Islamic schools was entirely oral and written texts served as visual mnemonic aids. Central Asia has traditions of oral poetry, but oral transmission also extended to textual forms. *Maddahs* and *qissakhwans* were itinerant reciters and storytellers, a common phenomenon in Arab countries and Central Asia. Events devoted to reading aloud from manuscript texts are called *mashrab*. The transmission of knowledge beyond the *maktab* was diffused throughout society.²⁹⁰

We can see several cultural assets in Middle East culture as opposed to the Islamic culture. In the 6th century B.C.E. early Persian cuneiform was influenced by neo-Babylonian script. Good transport and communication systems were essential in ancient Persia.²⁹¹ Iranian people were defeated by Alexander the Great in 331 B.C.E. Middle Persian was used in the south-western part of Iran and the official language of the Sassanide Dynasty. Middle Persian is less known. The modern Persian language is influenced by the Arabic language, and many words are compound words taken from an Arabic stems. Transmission of knowledge in oral tradition was the job of the bard and the minstrel. Prophet Zoroaster received his prophetic calling, in which

²⁸⁸ Zakim, Eric. To Build and Be Built. Landscape, Literature, and the Construction of Zionist Identity. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.js.emory.edu/index_new/literature.html](http://www.js.emory.edu/index_new/literature.html)>

²⁸⁹ Khalid, Adeeb. The Politics of Muslim Cultural Reform. Jadidism in Central Asia. University of California Press. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://content.cdlib.org/xtf/view?docId=ft8g5008rv&chunk.id=d0e1535&toc.id=d0e1510&brand=eschol](http://content.cdlib.org/xtf/view?docId=ft8g5008rv&chunk.id=d0e1535&toc.id=d0e1510&brand=eschol)>

²⁹⁰ Khalid, Adeeb. Knowledge and Society in the Nineteenth Century. In: The Politics of Muslim Cultural Reform. Jadidism in Central Asia. University of California Press. Online Publication. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://content.cdlib.org/xtf/view?docId=ft8g5008rv&doc.view=content&chunk.id=d0e1510&toc.depth=1.>](http://content.cdlib.org/xtf/view?docId=ft8g5008rv&doc.view=content&chunk.id=d0e1510&toc.depth=1.>)

²⁹¹ Ancient Persia. The British Museum. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.thebritishmuseum.ac.uk/forbiddenempire/control/transport.html](http://www.thebritishmuseum.ac.uk/forbiddenempire/control/transport.html)>

he envisioned god through Vohu Manah ('good mind'). Seventeen hymns composed by Zoroaster were preserved over the centuries by the Zoroastrian community. Zoroaster's teachings were handed down orally from generation to generation. The *dastan* ('history', also *jir*, *ir*, *chorchok*) is an oral history used in the area of today's Iran and common among the peoples of Central Asia. Later versions of the *dastan* were written. The *dastan* is part of the permanent recordings of people.²⁹² The *dastan* has also been used to propagate religious ideas or doctrines, although the genre in its original form is not religious.²⁹³ Firdausi's *Shahname* (*Book of the Kings*) was finished about 1010. It is an epic history of the pre-Islamic Iranian kings focusing on the conflict of Iranians with the Turan (Turks). In Persia Firdousi's *Shahname* transmitted the tradition of Iranian monarchs and it was used to legitimize their right of western Iranian lands. Saadi wrote *The Tree Garden* (*Bustan*, 1257) and *The Rose Garden* (*Golestan*, 1258). The book *Golestan* is composed of eight chapters with introduction and conclusion. Speech and communication issues are themes in the first chapter about the *Manners of Kings*, chapter 2 on the *Morals of Dervishes*, chapter 4 on the *Advantages of Silence*, and chapter 8 on *Rules for Conduct in Life*. The ability to read a book like the *Golistan* or *Bustan* is considered in Central Asia as a sign of a liberal education. The *Rubaiyyat* of Omar Khayyam (ca. 1048-1122) are mystical and do not follow Islam's principles. The *Rubaiyyat* of Omar Khayyam use the metaphors 'wine', 'rose', and 'nightingale':

*And David's Lips are lock't; but in divine
High piping Pelevi, with "Wine! Wine! Wine!
Red Wine!"--the Nightingale cries to the Rose
That yellow Cheek of hers to'incarnadine.²⁹⁴*

Hafiz (Khwaja Shams ad-Din Mohammad of Shiraz) due to his mystical poetry is known as *Lisan al-Ghahib* ('The Tongue of The Hidden') and *Tarjoman al-Asrar* ('The Interpreter of Secrets'). Main genres of Persian poetry are the *qasida* (ode), a long poetic rhyme form for panegyrics, the *ghazal*, a short poetic form for lyrics, the *mathnavi* for narrative themes, and

²⁹² Paksoy, H.B. Literature in Central Asia. Hartford Web Publishing. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.hartford-hwp.com/archives/53/141.html](http://www.hartford-hwp.com/archives/53/141.html)>

²⁹³ Shaked, Shaul. From Zoroastrian Iran to Islam. Studies in Religious History and Intercultural Contacts. Aldershot: Ashgate 1995, pp. 90-99.

²⁹⁴ Khayyam, Omar. Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam Rendered into English Verse by Edward Fitzgerald. Project Gutenberg. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext95/rubai10.txt](http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext95/rubai10.txt)>

the *robaiat* for epigrammatic poems. In the 10th century a significant tradition of Islamic Persian poetry began. The Sufi tradition, which originated in Persia, involved singing, dancing, and storytelling as techniques for exploring inner spirituality. Born in 1207 in the town of Balkh in Khurasan in contemporary Afghanistan, Jalal Al-Din Rumi became a Sufi teacher in 1240 in Konya in Turkey with a group of disciples gathered around him due to his great eloquence, theological knowledge, and engaging personality. The *Discourses* of Rumi (*Fihi ma Fihi*) consist of questions of a disciple and answers by a master.

Under the Umayyad Dynasty the use of Middle Persian, written in Pahlavi script was abandoned by the administration and Arabic was used instead. In the 10th century Persian was written in the Arabic alphabet. The Iranian poet Bahauddin, son of Jalal Al-Din Rumi, composed a poem entitled *Rubab-Nameh* in Farsi in which he included 156 Turkish verses. In the *Sufistic Lexicon (Islihat al-Sufiyya)* of Abd al-Razzaq al-Qashani (d. 1330 C.E.) the 'secret of the reality' (*sirr al-haqiqa*) means that one, which touches the symbolic expression (*ishara*).²⁹⁵ The author of *Asas Al-Balagha (The Fundamentals of Rhetoric)* was Al-Zamakhshari (1057-1144), who gave a definition of each word and examples of its use. Structured in the way most Arabic dictionaries are indexed, it contains for every word its three constituent root letters.²⁹⁶ Persian is also spoken in Afghanistan. Afghanistan's languages are Pashto, Dari Persian, and other Turkic and minor languages. Farsi *فارسى* is in English 'critical'. Pashto *کانرطخ* is in English 'critical'.²⁹⁷ The English term 'criticism' is in Pashto *داقتن*.²⁹⁸ The English term 'to criticise' is in Pashto *داقتن اوک*. The English term 'criticism' is in Dari *دېقن*. Derived from Arabic in Dari *داقتن* means in English 'critic'. The English term 'to criticise' is in Dari *دېقن اوک*.

²⁹⁵ Bahauddin. "The Essence of Mysteries. Chapter Three. Beyond Islam: Hermeneutical Terminology in the Book of Certitude." In: Studies in the Babi and Bahai Religions. Volume 7. Symbols and Secrets: Quran Commentary and Bahauddin's Kitab-i Iqan. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.bahai-library.com/books/symbol.secret/3.html>>

²⁹⁶ Studies in the Babi and the Bahai Religions. Vol. 7. Symbols and Secrets. Quran Commentary in Bahauddin's Kitab-e Iqan. Chapter Three. Beyond Islam. Hermeneutical Terminology in the Book of Certitude. Bahai Library. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://bahai-library.org/books/symbol.secret/3.html>>

²⁹⁷ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

²⁹⁸ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

إن دَرَك دُيِقُنَتَا، دُيِقُنَتَا.²⁹⁹ Races consist of Pashtun, Tajik, Hazara, Uzbek, and minor ethnic groups. In Pashto *nuktah* means point, a dot, a spot, a stain, and a vowel. The verb means to criticise and to impute a fault to. A *nakl* is a history, narrative, tale, story, anecdote, and fable. *Nuktah* is criticism, sagacity, captiousness, and cavil. *Attkal* is guess, conjecture, and judgment. *Att-kalunah att-kalawul* means to guess, to conjecture, to judge, to think, and to estimate. *Pohah* is intellect, understanding, comprehension, reason, sense, capacity, intelligence, conception, and judgment. A *tajwiz* is an approbation, permission, inquiring into, examining, investigation, considering, contrivance, scheme, plan, sentence, judgment, determination, and trial. *Tamiz* is discernment, judgment, discretion, distinction, and sense. *Sud* means memory, remembrance, understanding, sense, consciousness, notice, care, intelligence, and judgment. A *fatwa* is a decree, award, sentence, decision, and judgment. *Kaza* is a long poem and ode or judgment, decree, and administration of justice. A *kahr* is indignation, vengeance, calamity, and judgment. A *kiyas* is a measuring or comparing in the mind, judgment, opinion, supposition, thought, guess, theory, and syllogism. *Hosh* is understanding, sense, judgment, capacity, instinct, intelligence, and recollection. *Hoshiyar* is intelligent, clever, sensible, wise, endowed with judgment or capacity, careful, prudent, discreet, cautious, attentive, alert, awake, watchful, accurate, and sober.³⁰⁰

Ancient Persian has evolved into Farsi, Kurdish and Pashto. Douglas Craven published in 1910 a *Higher Persian Grammar* for use of the Calcutta University showing differences between Afghan and modern Persian with notes on rhetoric. Iran's *University of Teheran* has a *Department of Communication*. Regarding the recent politics developments in Iraq and the U.S. and UN activities there Goodall, Trethewey, and McDonald stated that the existing communication strategy for public diplomacy in the Middle East failed. They name as two major reasons for failures of communication in public diplomacy the reliance on an outdated one-way model of influence, and an inability to prepare for, or respond to the jihadi media and message strategy that has thus far dominated local 'cultural interpretations' of U.S.

²⁹⁹ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

³⁰⁰ Raverty, Henry George. A Dictionary of the Pukhto, Pushto, or Language of the Afghans with Remarks on the Originality of the Language, and its Affinity to other Oriental Tongues. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/raverty/](http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/raverty/)>

diplomatic objectives.³⁰¹ *Jihad* is one of the elements of Islam, meaning ‘holy war’ and expressing the intention to spread this religion. The oldest known work of Persian literary criticism after the Islamic conquest written in the Samanid period is the *Muqaddame-ye Shahname-ye Abu Mansuri*.³⁰² Critic is in Farsi رگش‌ه‌وکن, داقن, رگدقن, سان‌ش‌راک (expert, judge), جنس‌ن‌خس, مرخ (connoisseur, expert), مدن‌ک‌داقتنا. Farsi داق‌ت‌نا means ‘to censure’ and ‘to gaff’.³⁰³ Derived from Arabic the English term ‘criticism’ is in Farsi اِذْقِ نِ.³⁰⁴ Derived from Arabic the English term ‘to criticise’ is in Farsi اِذْقِ نِ اِنْ دَرَكِ.³⁰⁵ A فرح‌ریگ (*harfgir*) is a censorer, caviller, and critic. هدرخ‌ین‌یب (*churdabini*) is subtilty of genius or close criticism. هدرخ‌ناد (*churdadan*) is a critic. هدرخ‌ریگ (*churdahir*) is a criticiser or critic. ی‌فاکش‌وم (*mushikafi*) is criticism.³⁰⁶ An ا‌د‌یب (*adeeb*) is a man of letters, a literary man, a literary critic, and a writer. داق‌ت‌نا (*enteghad*) is a criticism and a critique. داق‌ت‌نا دومن means to criticise. ف‌ن‌د‌اق‌ت‌نا is criticism as an art. ف‌ن‌د‌اق‌ت‌نا (*fan enteghad*) is a critic as an art. خ‌س‌ف‌ار‌ص is a critic of language, a critic of words, and a weigher of words. Two other forms are derived from the Arabic root *n-q-d*: A دق‌ت‌ن‌م is a criticiser or a critic. A دقان (*naghad*) is an assayer or a critic. داقن (*nagh-ghad*) is a critic, داقن (*naghadee*) is a critique, criticism. داقن‌ک‌ردن (*naghadi kardan*) means to be a critic, to criticize, and to assay money. ا‌ط‌خ (*khata*) means to sin, to miss, to censure, and to criticize. داق‌ت‌نا (*enteghad*) means critical or characterized by criticism. د‌د (*deed*) is examination, inspection, appraisal, or a competence to act as an appraiser or critical judge. ه‌ب‌ق‌ع (*aghabe*) is a pursuit, consequence, issue, continuation, remainder, and crisis. ن‌ار‌ق (*gheran*) is the

³⁰¹ Cf. Goodall, Bud; Trethewey, Angela; McDonald; Kelly. Strategic Ambiguity, Communication, and Public Diplomacy in an Uncertain World: Principles and Practices. June 21, 2006 Report #0604 Consortium for Strategic Communication. Arizona State University. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.asu.edu/clas/communication/about/csc/documents/StrategicAmbiguity-Communication.pdf>>

³⁰² Persian literature, literary writings in the Persian language, nearly all of it written in the area traditionally known as Persia, now Iran. Pre-Islamic and Early Islamic Literature. Columbia Encyclopedia. June 7, 2007.

<http://reference.info.com/reference?qkw=Persian&source_id=2222&source_key=Persian+literature>

³⁰³ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

³⁰⁴ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

³⁰⁵ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

³⁰⁶ Steingass, Francis Joseph. A Comprehensive Persian-English Dictionary Including the Arabic Words and Phrases to be Met with in Persian Literature. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/steingass/>>

conjunction of Venus and Jupiter and stands figuratively for a critical period or state or crisis. حساب (*hesab*) is both arithmetic and judgment. تفاسح (*hasafat*) is a sound judgment or perspicacity. حکم (*hokm*) is an order and a commandment.³⁰⁷ In Persian *balaghat* stands for delivery of a message, transmitting message, summons, and eloquence. *Khetabeh* is an oration, a speech, an address, a lecture, a prelection, a sermon, preaching, oratory, and rhetoric. *Ma-ahce* has the meanings senses, or significations, poet, charms, and graces. Following Parsinejad the history of criticism starts in the second a half of the 19th century in Iran.³⁰⁸ Mirza Fath Ali Akhundzade (1812-1878) is regarded. as the founder of modern literary criticism in Iran. Akhundzade's wrote on criticism (*Qeritika*), a *Faultfinding Treatise (Resale-ye Irad)*, *On Verse and Prose (Darbare-ye Nazm va Nasr)*, *Note to the Scribe (Khetab be Kateb)*, *Note to the Narrator (Khetab be Naqel)*, *The Art of Criticism (Fann-e Kritik)*, and *Principles of Writing (Osul-e Negaresh)* among other works.³⁰⁹

For centuries the Turkic speaking peoples have migrated to the West and intermingled continuously. In the time Mahmud al-Kashghari was writing his *Diwan Lughat at-Turk* in the 11th century Arab scholars had lost interest in oral and folk cultural forms. The *Diwan Lughat at-Turk (Turkic Language Lexicon)* is an encyclopedic lexicon of the Turkic dialects including citation of proverbs and poetry with glosses and explanations in Arabic. Al-Kashgari's *Diwan Lughat at-Turk* was composed in the 11th century as an old lexicographical source. Being the earliest known Turkic book written in Arabic, *Diwan Lughat al-Turk* was composed as a *Turkic-Arabic Lexicon*, where Turkic words were presented in Arabic transliteration and provided with translation and comments on etymology, contexts, and various possibilities of their use. Kashghari based the structure of his work *Diwan Lughat al-Turk* on the structure devised by a fellow Central Asian Turk, Abu Ibrahim Ishaq Ibn Ibrahim al-Farabi (d. 961) for his dictionary of Arabic. Kashghari's dictionary was dedicated to the Abbasid caliph Al-Muqtadi. The language, which Kashgari described, is the language of the

³⁰⁷ Hayyim, Sulayman. *New Persian-English Dictionary, Complete and Modern, Designed to Give the English Meanings of over 50,000 Words, Terms, Idioms, and Proverbs in the Persian Language, as well as the Transliteration of the Words in English Characters.* University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/hayyim/>>

³⁰⁸ Parsinejad, Iraj. *A History of Literary Criticism in Iran (1866-1951). Literary Criticism in the Works of Enlightened Thinkers of Iran: Akhundzade, Kermani, Malkom, Talebov, Maraghe'i, Kasravi and Hedayat.* Bethesda, Maryland, IBEX Publishers, 2003.

³⁰⁹ Translation available at:

Parsinejad, Iraj. *A History of Literary Criticism in Iran.* Ibex Publishers: Bethesda 2003

Turkic runic inscriptions dating from the 8th century, the beginning of the foundations of a Turco-Islamic literary culture.³¹⁰ Among Mahmud al- Kashgari's *Diwan Lughat al-Turk* we find such terms like 'otruk' (scheming, two-faced, dishonest, not open, not decisive). In verse 70 (p. 141) about 'adgu' (good) is said:

*Honor and respect your clansmen; when you receive a gift prepare a good recompense for it.*³¹¹

In verse 189 (p. 289) about 'kanig' (joy) is written:

*Describing the bounty of the queen: ' The cloud of her (bounty) rains down pure gold; should her flood flow (upon me my hapiness would be perfect and) I would overflow with joy '.*³¹²

Mahmud al Kashgari's *Diwan Lughat al-Turk* states guidelines in communication as follows:

Meclisde arif ol, kelami dinle.

El iki soylerse sen birin soyle.

Elinden geldikce sen iyiklik eyle.

Hatira dokunma, yikici olma.

Keep your wits about you in group discussions and listen attentively to all views.

If there is a division of opinion, state your own preferences decisively.

Do good to others as far as it is in your power to do so.

*Don't wound people's feeling gratuitously or be deliberately destructive.*³¹³

³¹⁰ Dankoff, Robert. Qarakhanid Literature and the Beginnings of Turco-Islamic Culture. University of Kansas. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.ku.edu/~ibetext/texts/paksoy-2/cam4.html>

³¹¹ Murphey, Rhoads. Selections from Mahmud al Kashgari's Compendium of the Turkish Dialects (Part I). University of Birmingham. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.historical.bham.ac.uk/rhoadsmurphey/Civ%20and%20Barb/divani%20lugat%20corpus.doc>

³¹² Murphey, Rhoads. Selections from Mahmud al Kashgari's Compendium of the Turkish Dialects (Part I). University of Birmingham. Febr. 18, 2007.

<http://www.historical.bham.ac.uk/rhoadsmurphey/Civ%20and%20Barb/divani%20lugat%20corpus.doc>

The *Qutadghu Bilig* by Yusuf of Balasaghun was written in 1069 as a long didactic poem in the genre mirror-for-princes. In 1037 Seljuk Turks invaded Iran and founded a dynasty, which continued to reign in Iran till 1197 C.E. Oratory in modern Turkish is *konuşma sanatı* (declamation, elocution). Turks had an oral tradition that is called *sagu* or *sav* including the epics of heroes. Modern Turkish uses for communication the term *iletişim*. The Turkic languages constitute a language family of some thirty languages, spoken across a vast area from Eastern Europe to Siberia and Western China. The Turkic languages are traditionally considered to be part of the Altaic language family. The Turkic language with the greatest number of speakers is Anatolian Turkish. Tatar Turkic languages are a group of closely related languages spoken by people spread across a vast area from Eastern Europe to Siberia and Western China. All Turkic languages show similarities to each other in terms of phonology, morphology, and syntax.³¹⁴ From Proto-Turkic *k̄č- as Altaic etymological root with the meaning ‘to criticize, malice’ several words in Turkic languages derived: Karakhanid q̄čur-, Tatar q̄ž̄r-, Turkmen Ḡž̄t 'reproach', Khakassian x̄s̄sar- 'to reproach, blame', x̄ž̄r- 'to tease smb.', Yakut k̄h̄r-, Tuva q̄ž̄r̄r- 'to tease, ridicule', and Kirghiz q̄ž̄n-.³¹⁵

The appreciation of Arabic oral tradition decreased as an emphasis was put on developing a literary language and as Quranic language became more remote from contemporary speech. Proverbs are useful poetry, cultural tools for thought and persuasion, and instances of authoritative language. The Turkic languages belong to the large Altaic language family. Paksoy in the edition *Central Asian Monuments* wrote that in a time “when Central Asia's importance to the world affairs is again resurgent”, it is “necessary to understand the intellectual nucleus of Central Asians' mode of thinking. This is especially important, because an overwhelming majority of Central Asian writings do not appear in any other language than their own dialects”. The appreciation of these monuments, “their messages and their influence over time contribute to the understanding of current issues precisely because they are directly

³¹³ Murphey, Rhoads. Selections from Mahmud al Kashgari's Compendium of the Turkish Dialects (Part I). Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.historical.bham.ac.uk/rhoadsmurphey/Civ%20and%20Barb/divani%20lugat%20corpus.doc>>

³¹⁴ Turkic Branch of the Altaic Language Family. National Virtual Translation Center. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.nvtc.gov/lotw/months/march/TurkicBranch.html>>

³¹⁵ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<<http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0>>

linked in the minds of the Central Asians themselves”.³¹⁶ Turks imitated the concept of *adab* the Arabs and Iranians had.³¹⁷ The *Nasihatlār* (*Admonitions*) written by Abbas Kulu Agha Bakikhanli is a short work comprising laconic and simply stated moral ‘lessons’ written for young people. It was composed in 1836. In the *Nasihatlār* we find advices for communication and thinking:

19. [5] *Do not do any deed or speak any word from which no good will come in [this] world or in the next world, in order that you will not suffer damage (loss).*

22. [7] *Associate with those people that adults consider to be decent, stay far from the base and those who chatter, so that you will not become like them.*

28. [13] *When a person becomes angry, he departs from reason. Do not do any work in that condition. Only begin after your anger has cooled!*

77. [62] *That person is considered intelligent who sees his own faults more than those of others and attaches less importance to his own skills than to those of others.*³¹⁸

Turks live in tribal confederations. The *Codex Cumanicus*, which is presently housed in the Library of St. Mark, in Venice, Cod. Mar. Lat. DXLIX, consists of several unrelated works. In a wordlist of the *Codex Cumanicus naqt* (Arab. *naqd*) means ‘money’.³¹⁹

The Turkish word *köpük* contains the meanings bubbles caused in fluids or liquors by fermentation or agitation, empty, senseless show of wit or eloquence, and rhetoric without

³¹⁶ Central Asian Monuments. Edited by Hasan B. Paksoy. European University Institute, Florence, Italy. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam0.html](http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam0.html)>

³¹⁷ Cf. Dankoff, Robert. Qarakhanid Literature and the Beginnings of Turco-Islamic Culture. European University Institute, Florence, Italy. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam4.html](http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam4.html)>

³¹⁸ Altstadt, Audrey L. *Nasihatlār* of Abbas Kulu Agha Bakikhanli. Dedicated to the 200th Anniversary of the Birth of Agha Abbas Kulu Bakikhanli. European University Institute, Florence, Italy. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam7.html](http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam7.html)>

³¹⁹ Golden, Peter B. The *Codex Cumanicus*. European University Institute, Florence, Italy. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam2.html](http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam2.html)>

thought, light, unsubstantial matter.³²⁰ 21st century-terms of communication are in Turkish *temas* (contact, contiguity, feel, touch), *tebliğ* (communique, edict, manifesto, notification), *nakletme* (recitation, transferring), the loanwords *mesaj* (dispatch, message, purpose) and *kominikasyon*, and *irtibat* (concern, connection, liaison), *iletişim* (channel, touch, and communication), *haberleşme* (correspondence, intercommunication), *haber* (message, news, report), *bildiri*, and *bağlantı* (channel, concern, connexion). We see that in this thesaurus one term represents lexems from different mind concepts such as esthetics, emotions, genres of literature, and message progressing.³²¹ Turkish *tenkit* comprises animadversion, censure, strictures, *kınama* animadversion, blame, castigation, censure, condemnation, denouncement, denunciation, disapprobation, disapproval, reprehension, reprimand, reproach, reproof, reproof, reproof, strafing, strictures, *eleştiri* animadversion, censure, comment, commentary, critique, denouncement, expostulation, knocking, review, slating, stricture, strictures.³²² Critical terminology in Turkish includes *muhalif* (adversary, antagonist, antagonistic, anti, contrary, dead against, dead-set against, defiant, disaffected, dissenter, dissentient, dissident, hostile, objector, opponent, opposing, opposite, oppositional, repugnant, warring), *kusur bulup duran kimse*, *karşı olan kimse* (antagonist, anti, opposing person), *eleştirmen* (commentator, corrector, reader, reviewer), and *eleştirci* (argumentative, assailant, assailer, censorious, critical, faultfinder, faultfinding, judicial, reviewer, uncomplimentary).³²³ Criticism has according to *Seslisozluk. English-Turkish-German Dictionary* the following meanings in Turkish:

1. *eleştiri, kınama, adverse criticism yerme kusur, yerme, tenkit, eleştirme.*
2. *eleştiri, kritik kusur bulma, olumsuz eleştiri.*
3. *eleştiri, tenkit, yerme, kınama, kritik.*
4. *eleştiri.*

³²⁰ English-Turkish-German Dictionary. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.seslisozluk.com/search/froth>>

³²¹ Murphey, Rhoads. Selections from Mahmud Al-Kashgari's Compendium of the Turkish Dialects. Part I. University of Birmingham. Febr. 18, 2007.

<<http://www.historical.bham.ac.uk/rhoadsmurphey/Civ%20and%20Barb/divani%20lugat%20corpus.doc>>

³²² Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

³²³ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

Seslisozluk. English-Turkish-German Dictionary gives the following definitions for *criticism*:

1. *The rules and principles which regulate the practice of the critic; the art of judging with knowledge and propriety of the beauties and faults of a literary performance, or of a production in the fine arts; as, dramatic criticism.*
2. *The act of criticising; a critical judgment passed or expressed; a critical observation or detailed examination and review; a critique; animadversion; censure. a serious examination and judgment of something; "constructive criticism is always appreciated" a written evaluation of a work of literature disapproval expressed by pointing out faults or shortcomings; "the senator received severe criticism from his opponent".*³²⁴

In Turkish criticism is *eleştiri*, *tenkit*, and *kınama*. In Turkish critic means *eleştirmen*, *eleştirici*, *karşı olan kimse*, *kusur bulup duran kimse*, and *muhالیf*.³²⁵ The English term 'to criticise'³²⁶ is in Turkish *eleştirmek*.³²⁶ The Central Asian area is linguistically covered by Turkish languages and Indo-Germanic languages. The Arab language served as a tool for the Islamisation of the Central Eastern area including also a part of China. Since the Arab conquest people of Central Asia converted to Islam. Islamisation meant a complete change of sacred scriptures, languages, literature, and life style. But in spite of the immense linguistic diversity, as it was mentioned earlier on, all the language had space and often overlapped and shared common thesauri. Turkey represents the Western area of the Islamic cultural terminology of rhetorical and communication concepts. Turkish is influenced by Farsi, but also shares Arabic vocabulary, and Western loanwords. The Turkish language knows the terms *hitabet* and *güzel söz söyleme sanatı* for rhetoric. Derived from the Arabic term is the word *balaghah* is *belagat*. The thesaurus of the Turkish language represents different mind concepts and levels of communication put together as meanings of one word. Terminology related to talk consists in Turkish of word derived from Arabic such as *sohbet* (causerie, chat, conversation). Other verbs are *söz* (engagement, expression, faith, saying, sentence, statement, term, word), *söylenti* (report, rumor, story), *laf* (empty words, say, word), *konuşmak* (confabulate, discourse, have a talk, have speech with, speak), *konuşma* (address, allocution,

³²⁴ Seslisozluk. English-Turkish-German Dictionary. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.seslisozluk.com/?word=criticism&go_search=Search](http://www.seslisozluk.com/?word=criticism&go_search=Search)>

³²⁵ English-Turkish Online Dictionary. A Bilingual Dictionary ECTACO. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.lingvosoft.com/English-Turkish-Dictionary](http://www.lingvosoft.com/English-Turkish-Dictionary)>

³²⁶ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

causerie, conversation, delivery, discourse, interlocution, oration, speaking, speech, utterance), *hoşbeş* (chat, confabulation, gossip), *görüşmek* (approach, argue, interview), *görüşme* (conversation, debate, discussion, disputation, hearing, interview, meeting, negotiation), and *dedikodu* (report, rumor). In Turkish to criticize is *kınamak*, *tenkit etmek*, *eleştirmek*; *eleştir/kusur bul*, *değerini ölçmek*, *kusur bulmak*, *eleştirmek*, and *eleştir*.³²⁷ The Proto-Turkic root *K̄č has the meaning ‘to criticize’ and ‘to malice’ and in Russian ‘критиковать’, ‘злоствовать’. In Karakhanid q̄čur-, in Tatar q̄ž̄r-, in Turkmen Ḡč̄r- mean ‘reproach’, in Khakassian x̄s̄xar- (‘to reproach, blame’) and x̄ž̄r- (‘to tease smb’), in Yakut k̄h̄r-, in Tuva q̄ž̄r- (‘to tease, ridicule’), and in Kirghiz q̄ž̄n- are similar stems.³²⁸ Paksoy mentioned that the Soviet state has exerted much effort to introduce the ‘idea’ of this ‘scientific finding’, the existence of separate ‘Turkic languages’ among Central Asians. It must be noted that in no Turk dialect or ‘language’, is there any such distinction as ‘Turkic’ and ‘Turkish’. This distinction exists in some Western languages, as well as Russian, with the latter referring to the Ottoman or Turkish republican domains and the former, to other Turks. It is noteworthy that, before the arrival of the Russians, the Central Asians were able to communicate among themselves, apparently totally oblivious to the fact that they were speaking in “totally separate and distinct languages.”³²⁹

Collins argued that clans, informal organizations based on kin and fictive kin ties, are political actors that have a profound impact on the nature of posttransitional regimes and the potential for regime durability in the post-Soviet Central Asian area.³³⁰ Di Cosmo proposed a four-phase periodization including ages of tribute empires (209 C.E.-551), trade-tribute empires (551-907), dual-administration empires (907-1259), and direct-taxation empires (1260-1796) for Inner Asia.³³¹ The languages of the majority of the inhabitants of the former Soviet

³²⁷ Seslisozluk. Turkish-German-English Dictionary. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.seslisozluk.com](http://www.seslisozluk.com)>

³²⁸ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

³²⁹ Paksoy, Hasan B. Sun is also Fire. European University Institute, Florence, Italy. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam1.html](http://vlib.iue.it/carrie/texts/carrie_books/paksoy-2/cam1.html)>

³³⁰ Collins, Kathleen. “The Logic of Clan Politics. Evidence from the Central Asian Trajectories.” In: *World Politics*. Volume 56. Number 2. January 2004, pp. 224

³³¹ Di Cosmo, Nicola. “State Formation and Periodization in Inner Asian History”. In: *Journal of World History*. Volume 10. Number 1. Spring 1999, pp. 1.

Central Asian Republics come from the Turkic language group. Turkish is the most widely spoken language in Central Asia. Turkmen is mainly spoken in Turkmenistan and among the populations of Afghanistan, Pakistan, Iran, and Turkey. Kazakh, Kyrgyz and Tatar are related languages of the Kypchak group of Turkic languages spoken throughout Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan, but also in regions of Central Asia in Afghanistan, Xinjiang, and Qinghai. Uzbek and Uighur are spoken in Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, and Xinjiang. Terminology of talk consists in Turkmen of the nouns *юиwe* (accent, dialect), onomatopoeic *туюю-туюю* (rumour), *гыррыс* (conversation, discussion), *gepleюmek* (converse), *gep-гыррыс* (conversation), and *gep* (parlance). The Arabic root *n-q-d* served for terms in criticism in many Turk languages. In Turkmen *tankyt* stands for critique and review.³³² A critic in Azeri is *tənqidçi* and criticism is *tənqid*.³³³ Derived from Arabic root *n-q-d* is an intensive vocabulary in Turk languages related to criticism. In Uzbek *dopilla* means to denounce, to criticize, to light into. *Dopposla* means to blacken, to criticize, to denounce, to follow the outline of, and not to let out of one's sight. *Tanqidchi* is a critic. *Munaqqid* is derived from Arabic and means critic and detractor. *Yomonlovchi* is a critic. A *tanqidchi* is a critical and censorious person. *Tanachi* means critical. *Tanqidiy* derived from the same Arabic root means criticism. *Tanqid* is derived from Arabic and means dangerous, tricky, critical, and crucial. *Tanqid ket* means to make a critical mistake. Empirio-criticism is *empiriokrititsizm*, a loanword derived from Russian. Empirio-criticist is *empiriokritik*, a term also derived from Russian. A faultfinder or critic is *tanqidboz*, a term derived both from Arab and Persian. *Tanqid qil* is to criticize someone well and good. In Uzbek a *tuban* is someone who studies the arts or an art critic. In Uzbek *sanatshunos* is derived from Persian and means proper reading of the *Quran*, but also blind memorization and uncritical learning. In Uzbek a specific terminology for criticism exists: A *qaltislik* is a textual critic. Derived from Russian *tekstolog* is derived from Russian and means textual criticism. *Qorala* means to find fault with and to criticize.³³⁴ The Uzbek proverb *Avral oyla, keyin soyla* means *First think, after speak*. *Oz tiling oz dushmaning* means *Your tongue is your enemy*. Since independence from the former Soviet Union in 1991, the vernacular language of the Ukraine has experienced a revival and

³³² Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

³³³ French-Azeri Dictionary. Ployglot. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.polyglot.az](http://www.polyglot.az)>

³³⁴ Uzbek - English Dictionary. Firespeaker. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://uzbek.firespeaker.org/](http://uzbek.firespeaker.org/)>

became the official language of the Ukrainian Republic.³³⁵ The *Ukrainian Oral History Association* was created on October 28, 2006, at the International conference 'Oral History in Contemporary Social Sciences and Humanities: Research Theory and Practice', held in Kharkiv, Ukraine.³³⁶ In Ukrainian critic is *критик*.³³⁷

Urdu انرک is in English 'criticism'. The English term 'to criticise' is in Urdu ای جنس مقی قد. In Urdu 'crisis' meaning a critical moment is کزان. A critic is ای جنس مقی قد. Criticism in the sense of critical examination is مقی قد. Urdu has the terms ہتکن, فرج-یری گ, یری گ-درخ-یری گ for criticism as animadversion.³³⁹ In Uyghur language of East Turkestan the term *edebiy tenqid*, әдәбий тәнқид means literary criticism. The term *eyiblimek*, әйиблимәк means to criticize, to blame, to fault with something, to initiate proceedings against, and to prosecute. The term *chékit qoymaq*, чекит қоймақ comprises in English to dot, to write a period, to put a period, and to point the finger at and to criticize. *éwen qoymaq*, евән қоймақ means to criticise, to find fault. The term *gepke qoymaq*, гәпкә қоймақ means to blame and to criticize. The term *kayimaq*, кайимақ means to blame, to criticize, to become unhappy with, to become angry with, to complain, to become unhappy, and to go through a lot of trouble. *maxizm*, махизм is machism, empirical criticism. *malamet*, маламәт derived from Arabic *mal* means unjustified criticism. *obzorçhiliq*, обзорчилик is commenting and reviewing literary criticism. *öz-özini tenqid*, өз-өзини тәнқид is self-criticism. *péshanigha tegmek*, пешаниға тәгмәк is to be affronted, to face sarcasm or criticism. *péshanigha qoymaq*, пешаниға қоймақ is to affront, to voice sarcasm or criticism to someone's face. *éwen qoymaq*, евән қоймақ means to

³³⁵ "Ukrainian." Worldlanguage. [2.2.2007]

< [Htp://www.worldlanguage.com/Languages/Ukrainian.htm](http://www.worldlanguage.com/Languages/Ukrainian.htm) >

³³⁶ See also website of: The Ukrainian Oral History Association. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://keui.univer.kharkov.ua/oral_history/index.html](http://keui.univer.kharkov.ua/oral_history/index.html)>

³³⁷ Online English-Ukrainian Dictionary. Cybermova. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://cybermova.com/cgi-bin/onlinedic.pl](http://cybermova.com/cgi-bin/onlinedic.pl)>

³³⁸ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic](http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic)>

³³⁹ Urdu-English Dictionary. Urduseek. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.urduseek.com/](http://www.urduseek.com/)>

³⁴⁰ English-Urdu-Dictionary. Majstro Pakistan Data Management Services. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.majstro.com](http://www.majstro.com)>

criticize or to find fault. Derived from Chinese نەپىپى، *pipen*, пипән is (political) criticism. نەپىپى قىلماق، *pipen qilmaq*, пипән қилмақ is to submit to criticism.³⁴¹

The Russian proverb *Слово – не воробей: вылетит – не поймаешь* (*Ne vorobey: vyletit — ne поймáesh*) means *Spoken word is not a sparrow: Flying out, you can't catch it*. *Слово — серебро, молчание — золото* (*Slovo — serebro, molchaniye — zoloto*) means *Word is silver, silence is gold*. *Слу́хом земля́ по́лнится* (*Slukhom zemlya polnitsya*) means *The rumour fills the earth*. Media and communications in Russia includes news, newspapers, magazines, radio, television, and news services. Most Russian subject directories and general portals have sections devoted to сми (Средство массовой информации) or mass media.³⁴² Critic is in Russian *выговор*. Russian *критика* is animadversion, critique, and critiques.³⁴³ Ukrainian *критицизм*, *критичний розгляд*, and *критика* stand for animadversion, critique, judgement, and judgment. Ukrainian *критикан* has the meaning of censor and *критик* means reviewer.³⁴⁴ Glasnost (Russian: гласность) is a Russian word for ‘transparency’ or ‘openness’. Mikhail Gorbachev used to describe a program of reform introduced to the Soviet Union in 1985. The reduction of censorship resulted in a lost of power of the Communist Party. The name Eastern Bloc was used for the Soviet-led military alliance *Warsaw Pact* or the *COMECON*, the international economic organization of communist states. Soviet allies outside of Eastern Europe such as Mongolia were included in the so-called East Bloc. The former communist states were influenced by Soviet ideology in terms of communication issues. In 1989 Kyrgyz, Uzbek, Tajik and other languages were declared official/state languages of Central Asia. Uzbekistan adopted Latin script. In Kyrgyzstan along with the official language Kyrgyz from the Turkic family of languages, many other languages such as Uzbek, Tajik, Kazakh, Dungan, Uigur, Turkmen, Korean, and Tatar are spoken in the country. An example for the change of a former country of the Soviet Union to a separate country with an own education system is Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan’s languages are Kazak and Russian, the

³⁴¹ Uyghur Dictionary. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.uyghurdictionary.org](http://www.uyghurdictionary.org)

³⁴² Ministry for Communication and Informatization of the Russian Federation. Concept and Development. Virtual Technologies Agency. Febr. 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.loc.gov/rr/international/european/russia/resources/ru-media.html](http://www.loc.gov/rr/international/european/russia/resources/ru-media.html)>

³⁴³ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

³⁴⁴ Webster’s Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

official language in the time of the Soviet Union. A *Journalism and Mass Communication Department* exists at the *American University of Central Asia* in the Kyrgyz Republic.³⁴⁵ *Critical Thinking Laboratory* (CTL), which was founded in the fall of 1999 in *American University of Kyrgyzstan*, is developing and inculcating philosophy of “Reading and Writing for Critical Thinking” (RWCT) program. The goal of laboratory is “to help to bring up and educate new and contemporary generation of people who are able to think flexibly, independently, creatively, initiatively, able to be responsible for their own education and future, after for the future of their country and able to be not only implementer of somebody’s orders but the man on whom depends the future and success of work which he conducts. In the fall of 2001 the laboratory was recognized in nation wide”.³⁴⁶ In early 21st-century Kazakhstan at *Kazakh National University* ‘*communicology*’ is taught as fundamental theoretical discipline and in its frameworks communicative as a ‘pragmatical discipline investigating functions and means of mass information processes in the society’. Besides PR as one complex other sciences called para-linguistics, kinetics, proxemika, conflictologia, imageologia and rhetoric exist indicating how the terminology used is part of the Western (Spanish, English, Latin, Greek) linguistic and intellectual tradition. Rights of media criticism are not fully developed.³⁴⁷ *Human Rights Watch* in 2007 welcomed the initiative of the *EU* and the German presidency to embark upon a Central Asia strategy, following years of neglect of this important region by the *EU*.³⁴⁸ The director of the *International Press Institute* (IPI) Johann P. Fritz issued a further statement about the silencing of the KTK and Karavan media organizations in 2007:

³⁴⁵ Journalism and Mass Communication Department. American University of Central Asia. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.auca.kg/admin/mod/html_edit/ktml2/files/uploads/Timetable/fall_2007/JOR_fall_2007.doc](http://www.auca.kg/admin/mod/html_edit/ktml2/files/uploads/Timetable/fall_2007/JOR_fall_2007.doc)>

³⁴⁶ Critical Thinking Lab. American University of Central Asia. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.auca.kg/search/word/cms_page/68.html](http://www.auca.kg/search/word/cms_page/68.html)>

³⁴⁷ See also: Kimmage, Daniel. The Fog of Information War in Kyrgyzistan and Tajiksitan. Tactical Media for Central Asian Ruling Elites. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.debalie.nl/dossierartikel.jsp?dossierid=22375&articleid=31596](http://www.debalie.nl/dossierartikel.jsp?dossierid=22375&articleid=31596)>

³⁴⁸ Human Rights and the Central Asia Strategy. The need for human rights criteria and high-level commitment. Human Rights Watch. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://hrw.org/backgrounder/eca/eu0407/](http://hrw.org/backgrounder/eca/eu0407/)>

*An independent media and the willingness of a government to allow media freedom is a true test of a democracy. At present, the Kazakh government is failing this test. It should reverse its course immediately by allowing KTK and Karavan to renew their operations [...].*³⁴⁹

Eastern Iranian languages served as the *lingua franca* of the Silk Route around Samarkand. The exchange of good and also of languages is a factor for the spreading of languages and the implementation of words from one language to another in Central Asia. Central Asia is multilingual and multiethnic. In recent times an experience of a foreign influence was the process of ‘Russification’ in the Soviet Union, when Russian was imposed as a linguistic force ruling a conglomerate of states and nationalities. After the collapse of the Soviet Union a process of democratization and a global market economy with English as the *lingua franca* for global communication began. After the fall of the Soviet Union the new independent states Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kirgызstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan were founded in the area next to Afghanistan, the Northern provinces of Pakistan, Eastern Iran, Western China, and Western Mongolia. After the fall of the Soviet Union the local languages could take functions the time before given to the Russian language. The Central Asian countries are ruled traditionally in clan structures. Hunter stated that Islam's deep roots in Central Asia made the religion an obvious contender to replace communism.³⁵⁰

³⁴⁹ Johann P. Fritz. Press Release on Kazakhstan. International Press Institute (IPI). Freemedia. May 29, 2007. <http://www.freemedia.at/cms/ipi/statements_detail.html?ctxid=CH0055&docid=CMS1180093076608&year=2007>

³⁵⁰ Hunter, Shireen. “Religion, Politics, and Security in Central Asia”. In: SAIS Review. Volume 21. Number 2. Summer-Fall 2001, pp. 65.

2.3. “Viveka” - On Indian Criticism

Indian criticism is an example for a separate cultural tradition of criticism and the comparison with Western concepts. Lahiri stated in *The Spirit of Indian Philosophy* on criticism in India:

*The western view is based on incorrect information and untruth. It betrays colossal ignorance of ancient Indian thoughts. Its achievements are very imperfectly known to them even today. It may be that the philosophical thoughts in the western evolution may have resulted in a somewhat coherent type as of today but the Indian thought of old definitely represented a superb universal thought of that day. Most of the Indian thoughts in earlier stages existed in a much undifferentiated stage. We witness many schools of thought and criticism of various schools and find each system more differentiated and coherent. Unfortunately most of the systems of thoughts in many cases are lost. India never considered chronology as primary to philosophical interests, which was its main concern.*³⁵¹

On the contrary Thumpamon wrote on Malayalam criticism figuring out the influence of Western criticism to Indian criticism:

*Modern criticism is concerned with projecting the hidden and the esthetic aspects of a literary world. As in other languages, in Malayalam also, methods have been used for gauging the levels of beauty in a literary piece. The aim of all criticism is one and the same but the stress of criticism is on certain functions. A new method of criticism sprouted as a reaction to the previous methods. “ Art for Arts Sake” was swayed art, “ Art for Life’s Sake” and “Art itself is life” came to occupy the centre stage. The criticism in Malayalam is indeed based on the western principles. Till that time, the treasury of Malayalam literary criticism was the fundamental theories of the Estheticians of the east. In the place of the authorities of Sanskrit in Malayalam criticism, now the second half of the eighteenth century western modes got established. Kerala open-mindedly accepted the western literary and intellectual ways from that time. P. K. Narayana Pillai, who had same name.*³⁵²

Lariviere divided into three types of criticism in Asia from a Western perspective on the area:

³⁵¹ Lahiri, R.K. *The Spirit of Indian Philosophy*. Boloji.com. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.boloji.com/hinduism/113.htm](http://www.boloji.com/hinduism/113.htm)>

³⁵² Thumpamon, Thomas. *Malayalam Criticism*. Government of Kerala. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.kerala.gov.in/keralcaljan05/p40-41.pdf](http://www.kerala.gov.in/keralcaljan05/p40-41.pdf)>

The first criticism I will call the Orientalist criticism. It has its origin in the landmark work of Edward Said in his book Orientalism, but that book has spawned an entire mini-industry all its own. I want to talk about the charge that Europeans (and I include Americans under this rubric) have in some sense "created" the India that they study. That this "created India" has no basis in reality, and has been created to serve a constellation of interests all of which benefit Europeans and are inimical to the Indians, themselves. The second criticism I will call the Essentialist criticism. It is articulated, for example, by Ronald Inden in his book Imagining India. It is the one that says that what we have done with our knowledge of ancient India is create "essences" of India and Indian society. In doing so, we have again denied the reality of what India was and is, and created a manageable but grossly distorted view of India. In creating these essences we have also denied Indians agency in their own history. We have denied them the ability to shape their own destiny. The third criticism that I want to address is what I call the Distortionist criticism. This is the charge that ideas found in Indian culture are taken out of their context and used for nefarious purposes elsewhere. This criticism has been brought by Sheldon Pollock in an article entitled "Deep Orientalism? Notes on Sanskrit and Power Beyond the Raj."³⁵³

In *The Rise of Historical Criticism* Oscar Wilde wrote about the minds of Hindus and their affinity to criticism:

While as regards the Hindus, their acute, analytical and logical mind is directed rather to grammar, criticism and philosophy than to history or chronology. Indeed, in history their imagination seems to have run wild, legend and fact are so indissolubly mingled together that any attempt to separate them seems vain. If we except the identification of the Greek Sandracottus with the Indian Chandragupta, we have really no clue by which we can test the truth of their writings or examine their method of investigation.³⁵⁴

³⁵³ Lariviere, Richard W. Protestants, Orientalists, and Brāhmanas. Reconstructing Indian Social History. First Published as a Part of the 1994 Gonda Lecture, Gonda Foundation, Netherlands. Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences. University of Texas. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://asnic.utexas.edu/asnic/subject/gondalecture.html](http://asnic.utexas.edu/asnic/subject/gondalecture.html)>

³⁵⁴ Wilde, Oscar. The Rise of Historical Criticism. University College Cork. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/E800003-001/text001.html](http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/E800003-001/text001.html)>

A Proto-Indo-European root and its derived forms show us the linguistic root for the Indian concept of criticism. A Proto-Indo-European root is *w- with the meaning 'separate, alone' Old Indian *vi-* is 'apart, asunder'; *vitara* is 'farther off, more distant', Avestan: *v-ϕ-* is 'separated', Old Greek *i'dio-*, *wi'dio-* is 'own', Germanic Gothic is *wira*, and Latin is *vitricus*.³⁵⁵ Indian languages have several mind concepts employed with criticism. Derived from Proto-Indo European root *kens with the meaning to speak in a florid, solemn style is Old Indian *samsayati* with the meanings 'to cause to recite, predict, foretell', *samsati* for 'to recite, repeat', and *sasti-* for 'praise and invocation'. Avestan *sah* is equivalent to 'pronuntiare'. Derived is also Latin *censere* and *ensor*.³⁵⁶ In Sanskrit *sankata* means difficult and critical. *Sankata ka thana* means conversation. *Sankata kathâ* is conversation or talk. *Sankata kara* is commingling, mixture, intermixture of castes by unequal marriages and mixture of figures of speech. Sanskrit *vivekita* is discrimination, discernment, and judgment. *Mithyakopa* is wrong or false talk. *Mithyakopa adhyavasiti* is a false supposition serving as a figure of speech in which the impossibility of a thing is expressed by making it depend on an impossible contingency. *Durvaca* is an ill-spoken abusive word and means also hard to answer. *Durvaca vakana* are hard words or abuse. *Durvaca vakas* are stupid words. *Codana ayi-tavya* means to be censured or criticised. *Suprakasa pratarka* is a sound judgment. *Viveka* is discrimination, distinction, investigation, discussion, criticism, discernment, and judgment. *Viveka khyâti* is a correct judgment. A *vivaka* is one who pronounces a judgment. *Vijnana* is a discernment, knowledge and the faculty of knowing.³⁵⁷ In Sanskrit *prajna* comprises the meanings information, discrimination, judgment, intelligence, understanding, wisdom, knowledge, and purpose. *Purvanipata* is an irregularity of the previous word. *Nyaya* is a rule, standard, axiom, principle, method, manner, propriety, correct way, logical proof or conclusion, and syllogism. *Aviveka* is a want of discrimination and lack of judgment.³⁵⁸ Indian languages brought different kinds of criticism. In Lushai specific forms for criticism and judgement exist.

³⁵⁵ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

³⁵⁶ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

³⁵⁷ Macdonell, Arthur Anthony. A Practical Sanskrit Dictionary with Transliteration, Accentuation, and Etymological Analysis Throughout. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/](http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/)>

³⁵⁸ Macdonell, Arthur Anthony. A Practical Sanskrit Dictionary with Transliteration, Accentuation, and Etymological Analysis Throughout. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/](http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/)>

process of judgment. *Vinicchaya katha* is an analytical discussion, exegesis, interpretation. *Vinicchaya vithi* is the process of judgment in logic. *Viniccninana* means giving judgment. *Vinicchinati* means to investigate, try; to judge, determine, decide. *Vithi* in psychology is course, process of judgment, senseperception or cognition.³⁶² In Tamil *anupoka vaittiyam* is practical doctoring. *Apayanilai* is a critical stage. *Irantungkettavan* is an indifferent man neither good nor bad, someone who cannot distinguish good from evil, and someone with ill-balanced judgment. *Kantanam* is criticism, refutation, reproof, chastisement, and correction. *Kallappeccu* is insincere talk. *Canti* is meeting, junction, and combination. *Natuve peca* means to interrupt someone who speaks or to speak as a mediator. *Natuve muyikka* is to object or contradict in speaking. *Nutpaputti* is an acute understanding. *Nutpavurai* is a critical commentary. *Panikkuccolla* means to direct someone how to make a thing and to criticise. *Vazakkoran colla* means to pass partial judgment. *Kuruttuniyayam* is erroneous reasoning or perverted judgment. A *tirppu* comprises the meanings settlement, conclusion, decision, award, judgment, sentence, resolution, and clearance. *Tirppukkatta* means to make a decision and to form an opinion. *Tunintucolla* means to speak with confidence and to venture to say. A *telinan* is a learned wise man. *Telintaputti* is a well-informed judgment, mature understanding, clear knowledge or discernment, and profound wisdom. *Natuttirkka* or *tirvaiyita* means to decide a case and to pass judgment. *Puntiyar* are the wise, the learned, and poets called. A *vveki* is a sharp and clever man.³⁶³

In Urdu □□□□□ *parkhi* is a judge, critic, and connoisseur. *Sukhhan-cin* is a critic, hypercritic, informer, tale-bearer, spy, and calumniator. *Sukhhan-dan* means skilled in language or eloquent. A scholar or an orator is called *sukhhan-dani*.³⁶⁴ □□□□□ *pakarna* means to catch, to lay hold of, to hold, take to criticise, find fault (with), pick holes, to carp, cavil, to acquire, get, gain, and receive. *Harf-par ungli rakhna*, *harf pakarna* is to find fault, to pick holes, to cavil, to censure, and to criticise. *Harf-giri* is censoriousness, cavil, and

³⁶² Pali Text Society, London. The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary. Chipstead, 1921-1925.

University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/pali/>>

³⁶³ Fabricius, Johann Philipp. J. P. Fabricius's Tamil and English Dictionary. 4th ed., rev. and enl. Tranquebar: Evangelical Lutheran Mission Pub. House, 1972. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/fabricius/>>

³⁶⁴ Platts, John T. (John Thompson). A Dictionary of Urdu, Classical Hindi, and English. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<<http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/platts/>>

criticism. *Churda-bin* is acute or hypercritical. A critic is *churda-bini*. *Zaban-par lana* means to utter, say, speak of, and mention. *Zaban pakarna* means literary 'To lay hold of the tongue' and has the meaning to prevent someone from speaking. □□□□ (*atkal*) means guess, conjecture, supposition, rough computation or estimate, skill in judging, discernment, judgment, opinion, quantity, and size. *Admiyat* is human nature, humanity, benevolence, compassion, sympathy; civility, urbanity, and politeness. *Imtiyaz* means separation, distinction, discrimination, discernment, judgment, discretion, holding oneself aloof, and refusal. □□□□□ *anu-bhav* is comprehension in the mind, perception, judgment, opinion, conjecture, hypothesis, experience, practical knowledge, consequence, and result. □□□ (*ankh*) is eye, sight, look, glance, regard, observation, discernment, judgment, and sense. □□□□□□ (*buddhi*) is derived from Sanskrit and has the meanings perception, observation, intelligence, understanding, sense, intellect, mind, wisdom, judgment, and discernment. □□□□□□ (*a-vicar*) is want of consideration or judgment and injustice. □□□□□□ (*a-vivek*) means without judgment or discrimination. □□□□□ (*bibek*) means discrimination, discernment, judgment, discretion; sense, intelligence, and true knowledge. □□□□□ (*bicar*) means consideration, reflection, meditation, deliberation, investigation, examination, trial, disputation, discussion, and dispute. □□□□□□□ (*bicarna*) means to think, deem, opine, conceive, apprehend, consider, reflect, ponder, deliberate, comprehend, examine, discriminate, judge, investigate, estimate, calculate, determine, decide, pronounce judgment on, and feel. □□□□□□□ (*baiwastha*) is a legal opinion, judgment or decree according to Hindu law equivalent to *fatwa*. □□□□□□□□□□□ (*prajna*) is a clever or sensible woman and intelligence, understanding, intellect, wisdom, knowledg, discernment, discrimination, and judgment. □□□ (*parakh*) is inspection, examination, test, trial, proof, experiment, scrutiny, discrimination, and judgment.³⁶⁵

Common to all Hindus is belief in *dharma*, reincarnation, *karma*, and *moksha* (liberation) of every soul through a variety of moral, action-based, and meditative yogas. Fundamental principles include *ahimsa* (non-violence), the primacy of the guru, the divine word *aum* and the power of mantras. Indian literature is either religious or a reworking of familiar stories from Sanskrit epics. In Indian literature oral and written forms prevail. Hindu scriptures are classified as *shruti*, *smriti*, and *itihaas*. The most famous works in Sanskrit are the Hindu holy

³⁶⁵ Platts, John T. (John Thompson). A Dictionary of Urdu, Classical Hindi, and English. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/platts/](http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/platts/)>

texts like the *Vedas*, *Upanishads*, and *Manusmriti*. Hindu religious literature is of the two types of primary scriptures (*shruti*) and secondary scriptures (*smriti*). The *Sruti* scriptures are of divine origin. Truth was directly revealed to ancient *rishis* (sages) in their deep meditations. *Shruti* scriptures include the four *Vedas* named *Rig*, *Yajur*, *Sama* and *Atharva* and the *Bhagavad Gita*. There are 18 principal *Upanishads* and several minor *Upanishads*. *South Asian History* wrote that “the authors of the *Upanishads* had opened the door for various heterodox currents to emerge in society, and amongst the most significant of these were the *Lokayatas* who polemicized against religious charlatans, and the *Nyayavadis* whose rational epistemology created the foundation for intense philosophical debate and encouraged the investigation of the real world based on reason and logic, freed from the burden of superstition and irrational adherence to burdensome rituals.”³⁶⁶ The *Upanishads* are divided into *Khanda*, *Adhyaya* and *Prapathaka*. Oral literature in the vernacular languages of India is of great antiquity, but it was not until about the 16th century that an extensive written literature appeared. Main factors in this development were the intellectual and literary predominance of Sanskrit.

The *Vedas* first employed a terminology of criticism in Indian literature. A *brahma-srotri* is someone who has knowledge of the *Vedas* and the *Upanishads*.³⁶⁷ In the *Vedas* the term *viveka* means discrimination.³⁶⁸ *Viveka* is the ability of discrimination between the real and the unreal. According to Mazzola an ancient Vedic classification of literature provides an even more sophisticated moral perspective than contextual ethics. It divides literature into four types: *kavya* (lucid, poetic art), *purana* (moral tale), *itikatha* (factual history), and *itihasa* (educative history). *Itihasa* is that portion of history from which human beings learn the lessons of *caturvarga* (catur, four; varga, class).³⁶⁹ The *Vedas* are the ancient scriptures or revelation (*shruti*) of the Hindu teachings. They manifest the divine word in human speech. They reflect into human language the language of the gods. There are four *Vedas*, each

³⁶⁶ South Asian History. Philosophical Paradigms from Ancient India: Ethics, Doctrines of Impermanence and Change; Buddhist Ideology. India Resources. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm](http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm)>

³⁶⁷ Glossary. DLSHQ. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.dlshq.org/glossary.htm](http://www.dlshq.org/glossary.htm)>

³⁶⁸ Glossary. DLSHQ. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.dlshq.org/glossary.htm](http://www.dlshq.org/glossary.htm)>

³⁶⁹ Mazzola, Lars Charles. The Art of Criticism. World Prout Assembly. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html](http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html)>

consisting of four parts. The primary portion is the *mantra* or hymn section (*samhita*). To this are appended ritualistic teachings (*brahmana*) and theological sections (*aranyaka*). Finally philosophical sections (*upanishads*) are included. The hymn sections are the oldest. In the first book *Rig-Veda* the first hymn is a monologue of a priest representing the sacred speech literature:

Agni.

I Laud Agni, the chosen Priest, God, minister of sacrifice,

The hotar, lavishest of wealth.

Worthy is Agni to be praised by living as by ancient seers.

He shall bring. hitherward the Gods.

Through Agni man obtaineth wealth, yea, plenty waxing day by day,

Most rich in heroes, glorious.

Agni, the perfect sacrifice which thou encompassest about

Verily goeth to the Gods.³⁷⁰

The *Bhagavad Gita* is an extended piece which forms part of the larger epic *Mahabharata*. The *Bhagavad Gita* as part of the *Itihaas* scripture *Mahabharata* is in the form of a dialogue between Lord Sri Krishna and the mighty Pandava warrior Arjuna. In the *Bhagavad-Gita* in the chapter *Virtue in Work* the value of meditation and action is discussed:

Of Virtue in Work

Arjuna. Thou whom all mortals praise, Janardana! If meditation be a nobler thing than action, wherefore, then, great Kesava! Dost thou impel me to this dreadful fight? Now am I by thy doubtful speech disturbed! Tell me one thing, and tell me certainly; By what road shall I find the better end?

Krishna. I told thee, blameless Lord! there be paths shown to this world; two schools of wisdom. First the Sankhya's, which doth save in way of works prescribed by reason; next, the yog, which bids attain by meditation, spiritually.³⁷¹

³⁷⁰ The Rig Veda Index. The Rig Veda. Translated by Ralph T.H. Griffith. Sacred Texts Online. Jan. 27, 2006.

<[Http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/rigveda/](http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/rigveda/)>

³⁷¹ Bhagavad-Gita. Sacred Texts Online. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/gita/bg02.htm](http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/gita/bg02.htm)>

Religious commentaries were also published on Indian literature. *Dnyaneshwari* is a commentary on the *Gita* divided into 18 chapters:

<i>Chapter 1</i>	<i>Arjuna's Desponency</i>
<i>Chapter 2</i>	<i>The path of knowledge</i>
<i>Chapter 3</i>	<i>Path of actions</i>
<i>Chapter 4</i>	<i>Yoga of knowledge</i>
<i>Chapter 5</i>	<i>Renunciatin</i>
<i>Chapter 6</i>	<i>Meditation</i>
<i>Chapter 7</i>	<i>Wisdom and knowledge</i>
<i>Chapter 8</i>	<i>The imperishable absolute</i>
<i>Chapter 9</i>	<i>Sovereign knowledge and sovereign mystery</i>
<i>Chapter 10</i>	<i>Divine manifestations</i>
<i>Chapter 11</i>	<i>Division of universal form</i>
<i>Chapter 12</i>	<i>Yoga of devotion</i>
<i>Chapter 13</i>	<i>The field and the knower of the field</i>
<i>Chapter 14</i>	<i>The three attributes</i>
<i>Chapter 15</i>	<i>The supreme person</i>
<i>Chapter 16</i>	<i>Divine and demoniacal endowment</i>
<i>Chapter 17</i>	<i>Three kinds of faith</i>
<i>Chapter 18</i>	<i>Release through renunciation</i>

In Indian literature we see how the interpretation of a text by a commentary was since ancient times considered as a congenial work compared to the original source. In other words: Distance to the object is missing here and imitation favored. The philosophies of transcendence and immanence (*bhedabheda*) assert both identity and difference between the world and finite individuals and Brahman. This world and finite individuals are real and different from the Brahman. Commentators of sutras could also have the status of a religious leader. Vallabha's commentary on the *Vedanta-sutras* is known as *Anubhasya* (*The Brief Commentary*), which is commented upon by Purusottama in his *Bhasya-prakasha* (*Lights on the Commentary*). His philosophy is called pure nondualism 'pure' meaning 'undefiled by maya'.³⁷² In the old Sanskrit poem *Bhartrhari*, dedicated to the 5th century grammarian and

³⁷² Indian Philosophy. Historical Development of Indian Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.philosophy.ru/library/asiatica/indica/edu/02/7.html](http://www.philosophy.ru/library/asiatica/indica/edu/02/7.html)>

poet, literary criticism is practiced in a very stringent way resulting in an allegorical honor of love and poetic words:

Bhartrhari

*Of what use is the poet's poem,
Of what use is the bowman's dart,
Unless another's senses reel
When it sticks quivering in the heart?*

*"Do not go", I could say; but this is inauspicious
"All right go" is a loveless thing to say.
"Stay with me" is imperious. "Do as you wish" suggests
Cold indifference. And if I say I will die
When you are gone", you might or might not believe me.
Teach me my husband, what I ought to say
When you go away.*

[...]

*Philosophers are surely wrong to say
That attributes in substance must inhere.
Her beauty burns my heart; yet I am here,
And she is far away.*

*A poet who has not tasted grief
Can mourn in fiction, and command belief.
A man who mourns in truth has no such art
To find words for a broken heart.
When he saw her,
He was struck by the arrows of love.
Nor could he save himself by shutting his eyes:
For he was a young man of an enquiring mind.
And so he was forced to examine the problem
In greater detail*

*Of how the Creator
Had come to make
A figure like hers.*³⁷³

A *rasa* is the ultimate criterion of artificial works in India, and depending of emotional states several *rasas* can be differentiated.³⁷⁴ The goddess of beauty in Hindu mythology is Lakshmi.³⁷⁵ *Buddhi* comprises the terms intelligence, understanding, reason, intellect, mind, discernment, judgment, presence of mind, ready wit, perception, comprehension, opinion, view, belief, conviction, supposition, thought, correct or reasonable view, reflection, and meditation.³⁷⁶ Upcoming early Buddhism was also a form of social criticism. *South Asian History* wrote that “in a parable in the *Kaalaama Sutta*, followers of Buddhism are advised not to accept any moral codes on the grounds of Vedic authority (*anussava*), tradition (*paramparaa*), hearsay or report (*itikiraa*), textual authority (*pittakasampadaa*), apparent agreeability of the view (*sama o no garu*), authority of the holder of the view (*takkahetu*), apparent logicity of the view (*nayahetu*), the fact that the view is an accepted standpoint (*aakaaraparivitakka*), inadequate reflection on reasons (*bhabbaruupataa*), or the fact that the view agrees with one’s own (*ditthinijjhaanakkhanti*).”³⁷⁷ Buddhism coming from India is now popular in East Asia and is spitted into many sects. One aim of the Buddhist is to have a ‘truthful speech’. Five paths exist that a *bodhisattva* develops and among the Eightfold Path there is the quality of ‘perfect speech’. The five successive paths for a *bodhisattva* are:

Sambharamarga The path of equipment

³⁷³ Old Sanskrit Poems. Sonny. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://members.tripod.com/~SundeepDougal/sanskrit.html](http://members.tripod.com/~SundeepDougal/sanskrit.html)>

³⁷⁴ Beebee, Thomas. *Rasa. The Key Concept of Classical Indian Aesthetics*. Pennsylvania State University. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.courses.psu.edu/cmlit/cmlit100_tob/rasa.htm](http://www.courses.psu.edu/cmlit/cmlit100_tob/rasa.htm)>

³⁷⁵ A standard introduction work is:

Daumal, Rene. *Rasa. Knowledge of the Self: Essays on Indian Aesthetics and Selected Sanskrit Studies*. New York 1982.

³⁷⁶ Macdonell, Arthur Anthony. *A Practical Sanskrit Dictionary with Transliteration, Accentuation, and Etymological Analysis Throughout*. University Chicago. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/](http://dsal.uchicago.edu/dictionaries/macdonell/)>

³⁷⁷ *South Asian History. Philosophical Paradigms from Ancient India: Ethics, Doctrines of Impermanence and Change; Buddhist Ideology*. India Resources. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm](http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm)>

<i>Prayogamarga</i>	The path of training
<i>Darshanamarga</i>	The path of seeing
<i>Bhavanamarga</i>	The path of intense contemplation
<i>Vimuktimarga</i>	The path of freedom

The term 'path' later came in use in Chinese, Korean and Japanese as *dao*. The eight-fold path consists of:

- Perfect view
- Perfect resolve
- Perfect speech
- Perfect conduct
- Perfect livelihood
- Perfect effort
- Perfect mindfulness
- Perfect concentration³⁷⁸

The basic Buddhist concept relies on the *Four Noble Truths*. Buddha gives in *The Eightfold Path right speech* as 'absence of lying and useless speech' this definition:

What, now, is right speech? It is abstaining from lying; abstaining from tale-bearing; abstaining from harsh language; abstaining from vain talk. There, someone avoids lying, and abstains from it. He speaks the truth, is devoted to the truth, reliable, worthy of confidence, is not a deceiver of men.

Therefore examples follow:

Being at a meeting, or amongst people, or in the midst of his relatives, or in a society, or in the king's court, and called upon and asked as witness, to tell what he knows, he answers, if he knows nothing: "I know nothing"; and if he knows, he answers: "I know"; if he has seen nothing, he answers: "I have seen nothing," and if he has seen, he answers: "I have seen.", he never knowingly speaks a lie, neither for the sake of his own advantage, nor for the sake of

³⁷⁸ See for the Eightfold Path: Encyclopedia. Orientalia. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.orientalia.org/gate.html?name=Encyclopedia&op=content&tid=2295](http://www.orientalia.org/gate.html?name=Encyclopedia&op=content&tid=2295)>

*another person's advantage, nor for the sake of any advantage whatsoever. He avoids tale-bearing, and abstains from it.*³⁷⁹

Buddha describes with words such as *gentle, soothing to the ear, loving, going to the heart, courteous and dear right speech* in *The Eightfold Path*:

*What he has heard here, he does not repeat there, so as to cause dissension there; and what he heard there, he does not repeat here, so as to cause dissension here. He unites those that are divided; and those that are united, he encourages. Concord gladdens him, he delights and rejoices in concord, and it is concord that he spreads by his words. He avoids harsh language, and abstains from it. He speaks such words as are gentle, soothing to the ear, loving, going to the heart, courteous and dear, and agreeable to many.*³⁸⁰

In the words of Buddha's 'right speech' is called *sammaa-vaaca*. In *Majjhima-Nikaya* Buddha explains the term 'right speech' as 'mundane speech' in opposition to the 'ultramundane speech':

*Now, right speech, let me tell you, is of two kinds: Abstaining from lying, from tale-bearing, from harsh language, and from vain talk; this is called the "Mundane Right Speech, which yields worldly fruits and brings good results. But the abhorrence of the practice of this four-fold wrong speech, the abstaining, withholding, refraining therefrom - the mind being holy, being turned away from the world, and conjoined with the path, the holy path being pursued:- this is called the "Ultramundane Right Speech, which is not of the world, but is ultramundane, and conjoined with the paths. Now, in understanding wrong speech as wrong, and right speech as right, one practices Right Understanding; and in making efforts to overcome evil speech and to arouse right speech, one practices Right Effort; and in overcoming wrong speech with attentive mind, and dwelling with attentive mind in possession of right speech, one practices Right Attentiveness. Hence, there are three things that accompany and follow upon right attentiveness.*³⁸¹

³⁷⁹ Buddha. *The Word Index*. 500 B.C. Edited by Nyanatiloka. The Pagan Library. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.paganlibrary.com/etext/buddha-word/third_step.php](http://www.paganlibrary.com/etext/buddha-word/third_step.php)>

³⁸⁰ Buddha. *The Eightfold Path*. The Pagan Library. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.paganlibrary.com/etext/buddha-word/third_step.php](http://www.paganlibrary.com/etext/buddha-word/third_step.php)>

³⁸¹ Buddha. *Majjhima-Nikaya*. Enabling Support Foundation. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.enabling.org/ia/vipassana/Archive/N/Nyanatiloka/WOB/wob4nt08.htm](http://www.enabling.org/ia/vipassana/Archive/N/Nyanatiloka/WOB/wob4nt08.htm)>

According to the *Encyclopedia of Orientalia* the *Nyaya-Sutras* “probably were composed by Gautama or Aksapada about the 2nd century B.C.E, though there is ample evidence that many sutras were subsequently interpolated.” Gautama gives here several terms for forms of discourse. The *Nyaya-Sutras* “are divided into five chapters, each with two sections. The work begins with a statement of the subject matter, purpose, and relation of the subject matter to the attainment of that purpose. The ultimate purpose is salvation and salvation is attained by knowledge of the 16 categories: hence the concern with these categories, which are means of valid knowledge (*pramana*), objects of valid knowledge (*prameya*), doubt (*samshaya*), purpose (*prayojana*), example (*drstanta*), conclusion (*siddhanta*), the constituents of a syllogism (*avayava*), argumentation (*tarka*), ascertainment (*nirnaya*), debate (*vada*); disputations (*jalpa*), destructive criticism (*vitanda*), fallacy (*hetvabhasa*), quibble (*chala*), refutations (*jati*), and points of the opponent's defeat (*nigrahasthana*).”³⁸² *Anviksiki* is a logical process based upon metaphysics, logic, critical thinking, and rhetoric. According to the *Encyclopedia of Orientalia* “the *nyaya* system of philosophy was established by the sage Gautama. As he was also known as Aksapada, this system is also sometimes referred to as the *aksapada* system. [...] *Nyaya* is predominantly based on reasoning and logic and therefore is also known as *Nyaya Vidya* or *Tarka Sastra* ‘the science of logic and reasoning’. Because this system analyzes the nature and source of knowledge and its validity and nonvalidity, it is also referred to as *anviksiki*, which means ‘the science of critical study’.”³⁸³

The Buddhist belief system prescribed reasoning based on investigation as the means of determining ones *dhamma* (or *dharma*). The denial of criticism in Buddhist thinking is a part of the concept, not a denial *per se*. In a parable in the *Kaalaama Sutra* followers of Buddhism are advised not to accept any moral codes on the following ten grounds of ‘Vedic authority’ (*anussava*), ‘tradition’ (*paramparaa*), ‘hearsay’ or ‘report’ (*itikiraa*), ‘textual authority’ (*pittakasampadaa*), ‘apparent agreeability of the view’ (*sama o no garu*), ‘authority of the holder of the view’ (*takkahetu*), ‘apparent logicity of the view’ (*nyayahetu*), the fact that the view is an accepted standpoint (*aakaaraparivitakka*), ‘inadequate reflection on reasons’ (*bhabbaruupataa*), or the fact that the view agrees with one’s own (*ditthinijjhaanakkhanti*).

³⁸² *Orientalia. Encyclopedia. May 29, 2007.*

<<http://www.orientalia.org/gate.html?name=Encyclopedia&op=content&tid=22320>>

³⁸³ *Orientalia. Indian Philosophy. Encyclopedia. May 29, 2007.*

<<http://www.orientalia.org/gate.html?name=Encyclopedia&op=content&tid=22325>>

So we have an Indian tradition of logical thinking and Buddhist terminology.³⁸⁴ Elizabeth J. Harris wrote in *Detachment and Compassion in Early Buddhism*:

Viveka and viraaga are the two Paali words which have been translated as 'detachment'. The two, however, are not synonymous. The primary meaning of viveka is separation, aloofness, seclusion. Often physical withdrawal is implied. The later commentarial tradition, however, identifies three forms of viveka: kaaya-viveka (physical withdrawal), citta-viveka (mental withdrawal), and upadhi-viveka (withdrawal from the roots of suffering).

*Kaaya-viveka as a chosen way of life was not uncommon during the time of the Buddha. To withdraw from the household life, renounce possessions, and adopt a solitary mendicancy was a recognized path. [...] Kaaya-viveka was valuable only if seen as a means to the inner purging and mental transformation connected with the destruction of craving.*³⁸⁵

Buddhism continued to have an impact outside India and developed its influence westwards to Syria and Alexandria and to Central Asia including the modern regions of Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzia, Kazakhstan, and Tibet. In the East its influence was felt on virtually every nation including Burma, Thailand, Malaya and Indonesia, Laos, Cambodia, Vietnam, China, Korea, and Japan. Buddhist scholars in China, Korea, and Japan offered their own commentaries and individual interpretations of Buddhist concepts. *South Asian History* wrote that “Buddhism survived only in those countries that escaped invasions by Islamic conquerors.”³⁸⁶ Due to the influence of Islam “it might also be observed that the destruction of Buddhist centers of learning coincided with the destruction of extremely valuable textual materials - which could have been potentially rediscovered, and revived or reinterpreted by future generations of Indians so as to achieve a society that was more thoughtful and learned.

³⁸⁴ Cf. Thich Nhat-Tu, Bhikkhu. *Rational Foundations of the Buddha's Teachings*. Buddhism Today. June 12, 2006.

<<http://www.buddhismtoday.com/english/buddha/Teachings/003-rational.htm>>

<<http://www.enabling.org/ia/vipassana/Archive/N/Nyanatiloka/WOB/wob4nt08.htm>>

³⁸⁵ Harris, Elizabeth J. “Detachment and Compassion in Early Buddhism”. In: *Bodhi Leaves* No. 141. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1997. Access to Insight Edition. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/harris/bl141.html>>

³⁸⁶ *South Asian History*. Philosophical Paradigms from Ancient India: Ethics, Doctrines of Impermanence and Change; Buddhist Ideology. India Resources. May 29, 2007.

<http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm>

Islamic texts did not offer anything comparable in terms of causality or epistemology. Nor did they offer the psychological, sociological, or moral insights that had been developed under the ambit of Buddhism.”³⁸⁷ In *Dhammapada* is written how the mind shall be disciplined:

*Mind precedes its objects. They are mind-governed and mind-made. To speak or act with a defiled mind is to draw pain after oneself, like a wheel behind the feet of the animal drawing it. 1 Mind precedes its objects. They are mind-governed and mind-made. To speak or act with a peaceful mind, is to draw happiness after oneself, like an inseparable shadow. 2 I have been insulted! I have been hurt! I have been beaten! I have been robbed! Anger does not cease in those who harbour this sort of thought.*³⁸⁸

Criticism in India has unique forms. But influence of a Western literary model is also visible in the field of criticism in literature in the first half of the 20th century. In the Online edition of India's *National Newspaper* from Tuesday, Dec 24, 2002 a recension of the work under the rubric *Literary criticism* of Kaavya Darpan (*The Mirror of Poetry*), a commentary on the *Kavya-Prakasa*, by Raja Chudamani Dikshita was published:

Literary criticism KAAVYA DARPAN of Raja Chudamani Dikshita: Latha-Editor; New Bharatiya Book Corporation, Shop No. 18, II Floor, 5574-A, Choudhary Kashiram Market, Durga Complex, New Chandraval, Delhi-110007. Rs. 400.

The history of Sanskrit literary speculations, called Alankara Sastra, forms a glorious chapter of outreaching Indian thought in the area of literary criticism. There are at least eight schools of view propounded by a long line of rhetoricians from Sage Bharatha to Jagannatha Pandita but the most important of them are the two schools of Rasa and Dhvani (Anandavardhana in his Dhvanya Loka revolutionised literary theory with the concept of Dhvani or suggestion as the "soul of poetry" and coalesced Rasa with it as the result of suggestion.) Anandhavardhana's lead has been followed by several subsequent rhetoricians, more particularly Mammata, whose work Kavya-Prakasa became very popular and attracted no less than 30 commentaries on it, all over India.

³⁸⁷ South Asian History. Philosophical Paradigms from Ancient India: Ethics, Doctrines of Impermanence and Change; Buddhist Ideology. India Resources. May 29, 2007.

http://india_resource.tripod.com/buddhism.htm

³⁸⁸ The Dhammapada. Online Translation by John Richards. Abacus. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.abacus4.com/~frank/dhammapada-english-transl.html>.

*The present publication is a critical edition of Kavya-Darpana, (the mirror of poetry) a commentary on the Kavya-Prakasa and it has six chapters called Ullasas, by Raja Chudamani Dikshita who lived in the later part of the 16th and the early part of the 17th century A.D. This edition, available only in a century-old edition in Telugu script with many mistakes, has now been compared with four manuscripts and brought out with short notes on Sanskrit rhetoricians, schools (Sampradayas) of Sanskrit Alankara, introduction to the author's life and work, and a good summary of the contents of the six chapters for the benefit of readers. This work lucidly expounds the formulations of the original Kavya-Prakasa and goes beyond it in certain contexts displaying the insights of the commentator. After explaining the nature of the significations of words (Vachaka, Lakshaha, and Vyanjaka) and the idea Dhvani as Vyanjaka, the author devotes the chapters to the characteristics of Uttama, Madhyama and Adhama Kavyas and thus systematises the statements of Mammata. This critical edition earns our appreciation. As a lucid commentary on the much-studied work of Mammata, Kavya-Darpana can be prescribed for higher studies in Sanskrit.*³⁸⁹

Kapoor cites the 5th century philosopher of language Bhartrhari in the penultimate *karika* of the second *kanda* of his *Vakyapadiya* saying: “*The intellect acquires critical acumen by familiarity with different traditions. How much does one really understand by merely following one’s own reasoning only?*” (Ka-484)³⁹⁰ The collection *Indian Literary Criticism in English. Critics, Texts, Issues* was edited by P.K. Rajan in 2004 and contains chapters on Tagore's criticism, Sri Aurobindo as a critic, *rasa*, and *dhvani*, Mardhekar's contribution to aesthetics and criticism, C.D. Narasimhaiah essay towards a common poetic for modern India, on Meenakshi Mukherjee and the Indian English critical tradition, culture criticism in India and the Marxist problematic by Malini Bhattacharya, on poststructuralism as a radical alternative and the historiography of Indian literature in pre-colonial India up to literary criticism in the new millennium. Attempting to make a comprehensive evaluation of some of the major Indian critics/theorists in English and also focusing on some of the issues vital to contemporary Indian literary criticism. Movie criticism is a wide field in India due to the high number of productions in Bollywood. For example Taran Adarsh is a film critic and box office analyst reviewing Bollywood films. His film write-ups can be found at

³⁸⁹ The Hindu. Literary Criticism. Hinduonnet. Febr. 18, 2005.

<<http://www.hinduonnet.com/thehindu/br/2002/12/24/stories/2002122400070303.htm>>

³⁹⁰ Kapoor, Kapil. Eleven ObjectionstTo Sanskrit Literary Theory. A Rejoinder. International Forum for India’s Heritage. Febr. 18, 2005.

<<http://us.geocities.com/ifihome/articles/kkp002.html>>

www.indiafm.com. Adarsh is the editor of *Trade Guide*, which tracks the box-office collections of Hindi films. In India religion is considered a way of life and is influential in daily life up to successful business relationships. In the Online edition of India's national newspaper *The Hindu* on Saturday, Jun 11, 2005 was written that media criticism must be objective:

*'Media's criticism must be objective' Special Correspondent Thiruvananthapuram: Chief Minister Oommen Chandy has urged the media to be objective when criticising the Government and those holding public offices. Presenting this year's Swadeshabhimani Puraskaram and various Vakkom Moulavi awards, instituted by the Swadeshabhimani Smaraka Samiti, here on Friday morning, the Chief Minister said democracy could be strengthened only through objective criticism and a tolerant and constructive response to such criticism from those in power. Mr. Chandy pointed out that Kerala had a glorious tradition of fearless journalism and that eminent persons such as Swadeshabhimani Ramakrishna Pillai and Vakkom Moulavi had laid the foundations for fearless and objective journalism paying a heavy price. He hoped that the new generation would imbibe the examples set by such towering personalities of the past.'*³⁹¹

Contemporary gurus still employ a terminology for mental states they associate with reasoning. In *The Terrible Kaali, The Benign Mother* the Guru Sri Swami Chidananda wrote:

*A real seeker and a worshipper of the Divine Mother should ever exercise his Vichara (enquiry), Viveka (discrimination) and Vairagya (dispassion) with a resolute and determined mind. It is the exercise of all these higher faculties, so that his lower faculties may be completely elevated or destroyed that forms the real worship of the Divine Mother. The Sadhana (spiritual practise) which the seeker does in order to destroy the impurities of his mind and heart, the Sadhana, which he does to burn up his egoism, attachments and all the aspects of his lower, human personality, this Sadhana constitutes the real worship of Durga or Kaali.'*³⁹²

³⁹¹ 'Media's Criticism Must Be Objective'. In: *The Hindu*. Kerala News. Online edition of India's National Newspaper. Saturday, June 11, 2005.

<http://www.hindu.com/2005/06/11/stories/2005061104160400.htm>

³⁹² Sri Swami Chidananda. *The Terrible Kaali, The Benign Mother*. DLSHQ. May 29, 2007.

<http://www.dlshq.org/religions/kaali.htm>

The spiritual background of criticism is still existing in modern Indian culture. According to the *Glossary of Sathya Sai Baba's Vahinis vichakshana* is the discriminating intellect. *Vichara* (*vichaara*) is inquiry, analysis, and reflection of the nature of the Self or truth. *Vicharana* (*vichaarana*) is enquiry and analysis.³⁹³ Swami Krishnananda wrote in *The Study and Practice of Yoga. An Exposition of the Yoga Sutras of Patanjali* on *Viveka*:

„This is the meaning in substance of these sutras: What is the way to this attainment? Discriminative knowledge is the way, which has to be attained by the practice of the limbs of yoga—and there is no other alternative. *Nanya pantha vidyate ayanaya* (R.V. X.90.16), says the *Rig Veda*. We cannot have any other, simpler method here. There is only one method. This is a single-track approach, and everyone has to proceed along the same road which others have trodden from ancient times. This is the *viveka khyati* that is referred to here. The enlightenment that follows understanding of the true nature of things—this is *viveka khyati*. This understanding should be perpetual; it should be second nature to us.

[...]

This *viveka khyati*, or understanding, arises by stages; it does not suddenly burst like a bomb. In the beginning it very gradually reveals itself by effort, and later on it becomes a spontaneous feature. In one of the sutras we are told that there are at least seven stages of the manifestation of this understanding. The number seven is very holy, and it has been held holy in all religions and in all mystical fields, whether of the East or the West. Something very strange it is. In all the scriptures we see this number seven mentioned as a holy number. These are supposed to be the stages of the ascent of the soul to its perfection.³⁹⁴

According to the glossary of Swami Virajeshwara *viveka khyati* is dawn of *viveka*. *Viveka* is the discriminative faculty of the mind.³⁹⁵ Tamil Sri Vedanta Mahadesikan had the title *Master of the Twin Harmonies of Tamil and Sanskrit* and was born as Vedanta Desika in 1268 CE in

³⁹³ Glossary of Sathya Sai Baba's Vahinis. Translated into English by N. Kasturi. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.sathyasai.org/refs/vahiniglossary/entries.htm](http://www.sathyasai.org/refs/vahiniglossary/entries.htm)>

³⁹⁴ Swami Krishnananda. *The Study and Practice of Yoga. An Exposition of the Yoga Sutras of Patanjali*. The Divine Life Society. Sivananda Ashram, Rishikesh, India. Website Swami Krishnananda. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.swami-krishnananda.org/patanjali/raja_70.html](http://www.swami-krishnananda.org/patanjali/raja_70.html)>

³⁹⁵ Glossary. Swami Krishnananda. *The Study and Practice of Yoga. An Exposition of the Yoga Sutras of Patanjali*. The Divine Life Society. Sivananda Ashram, Rishikesh, India. Website Swami Krishnananda. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.swami-virajeshwara.com/Glossary.htm](http://www.swami-virajeshwara.com/Glossary.htm)>

the village of Tuppul near Kanchipuram. Desika's dramatic play *Sankalpa Suryodaya* is a story of King Viveka (discrimination) and Queen Sumati (wisdom) that seek to free Purusha (soul) from Karma (human bondage) struggling against the evil forces led by Mahamoha (dense ignorance) and succeed when Purusha learns to surrender to Vishnu through Bhakti. Other characters are Darpa (pride) and Dambha (vanity). India's national newspaper *The Hindu* calls it a 'criticism of the community'.³⁹⁶ Recent projects focus on the efforts to improve the knowledge of Indian history of criticism and Indian critics. The project *Indian Critics Survey* is a self-funded, non-profit project, organized by an autonomous group of critics, to conduct a survey of all the practicing Indian critics in English and the regional languages and to collect data on their current work, approaches, and views on the state of criticism in India today.³⁹⁷

³⁹⁶ Teacher, Composer and Philosopher. The Thirunakshatram of Sri Vedanta Desikar falls on September 24.

The Hindu. Online Edition of India's National Newspaper. Friday, Sep 24, 2004. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.hindu.com/thehindu/fr/2004/09/24/stories/2004092402760600.htm](http://www.hindu.com/thehindu/fr/2004/09/24/stories/2004092402760600.htm)>

³⁹⁷ Indian Critics Survey. Samvad India Foundation. June 11, 2005.

<[Http://www.samvadindia.com/critic/index.php?pg=project](http://www.samvadindia.com/critic/index.php?pg=project)>

Literature Criticism . Western Influence. Department of Public Relations. Government of Kerala. May 21, 2006.

<[Http://www.prd.kerala.gov.in/prd2/mala/lit39.htm](http://www.prd.kerala.gov.in/prd2/mala/lit39.htm)>

2.4. “Criticism and Orature” - On African Criticism

On the African continent the concept of criticism was 'imported' by colonial powers. This we can say for the ancient high culture in Alexandria and for the colonization process in African countries in modern times. Local forms of criticism only derived in non-literal forms as reactions of personal behaviors in order to criticize someone's personal behavior according to social or moral guidelines. The modern forms of criticism we find in Africa are results from colonization: the literal form, the topics dealing with social issues of African countries, and protest against contemporary or past colonization are here predominant mostly in further developed areas and cultural institutions such as universities. African languages have terms for critical statements. In Hausa critic is *mawuyaci*, to criticise is *aibata* and *hora*.³⁹⁸ In South Khoisan etymology we find Proto-Taa *xuv* for to berate, criticize, and find fault with. In Bushman etymology of !Xoong *xu^η -sà //xuV L* is used.³⁹⁹ In Proto-Khoekhoe *xoa* stands for to criticize obliquely. Nama uses *khoa* for to criticize.⁴⁰⁰ An example for an African language that has a local vernacular expression for criticizing in the sense of a personal negative statement about another person is Hausa. In Hausa *aibàtaa* is 'criticize'; to give a critical advice is '*hooraa or kaa dà mutum*'. These terms are used in oral speech situations with the meaning 'to blame someone'.⁴⁰¹ Derived from Dutch a critic is in Afrikaans *beoordelaar* and in Dutch *beoordelaar*, *criticus*, and *recensent*. Criticism is in Afrikaans *beoordeling* and *berisping*.⁴⁰² Since these languages are mainly orally transmitted, they do not represent a specific critical culture with the exception of applied practical use of critical speaking. In Africa large parts of the continent had no literacy prior to colonisation. That is why this continent represents oral cultures. In societies of oral cultures the persons live in close connection with their environment and with each other. While in these cultures authorities depend on other factors than literacy, in many high developed cultures the ability to write and

³⁹⁸ English-to-Hausa Query by Franz Stoiber 2001. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.univie.ac.at/Hausa/oracle/sqlc.cgi](http://www.univie.ac.at/Hausa/oracle/sqlc.cgi)>

³⁹⁹ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

⁴⁰⁰ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

⁴⁰¹ English-to-Hausa Dictionary. University Vienna. May 27, 2007.

<[Http://www.univie.ac.at/Hausa/oracle/sqlc.cgi](http://www.univie.ac.at/Hausa/oracle/sqlc.cgi)>

⁴⁰² Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

read was only possible to learn for elite classes. The size and diversity of Africa makes it also a place of different oral cultures.⁴⁰³ The influence of foreign languages into a language by e.g. trade or colonization is a phenomenon that can be seen everywhere as result of intercultural communication. In Africa the native languages were influenced by Arab and European languages and the Swahili language is an example for the use of an international language. Literary critics are called in Swahili *karii*. A critic is called *mhakiki* or *mnenea*. Critical in Swahili is *chaguzi*. A critical person in Swahili is *mteuzi*. To be critical in Swahili is *tafiti*. A critical situation is called *wasiwasi*. Criticism is *kamio*, *lawama*, and *masuto*. For to criticize in Swahili several verbs exist such as *aili*, *ailisha*, *atibu*, *aziri*, *chambua*, *checha*, *guna*, *hakika*, *kosoa*, *laumu* from Arabic, *nyambua*, *nyonyo*, *onya*, and *pima*.⁴⁰⁴ Swahili serving as a *lingua franca* is an African language used on the African continent mainly in Tanzania, Kenya, Congo (Kinshasa), Burundi, and Uganda. The Swahili language terminology is basically of Bantu origin, but it has borrowed words from other languages such as Arabic and Persian, and Portuguese, English, and German.⁴⁰⁵ Swahili had Arabic characters as written form before the European conquest of Africa.⁴⁰⁶ The language is written in a form of the Arabic alphabet.⁴⁰⁷ Christian missionaries introduced the Roman alphabet for recording Swahili. Christian missionaries taught Swahili as the language of communication to spread the religion. At one such wedding in the 1960s, the wandering poet used the occasion to censure male school teachers who were infamous for their affairs with school girls:

Vadzidzisi vanochema
Vanochema navakadzi
Vanogoda vamwe vei

⁴⁰³ Cf.: Kennedy, George A. "Formal Speech in Some Nonliterate Cultures". In: Comparative Rhetoric. An Historical and Cross-Cultural Introduction. New York, Oxford 1998, pp. 62-82.

⁴⁰⁴ Kamusi Project. Yale University. June 5, 2007.

<<http://www.yale.edu/swahili/> Kamusi Project >

⁴⁰⁵ Hooker, Richard. Civilisations in Africa. The Swahili Kingdoms. World Cultures Home Page. Washington State University. June 5, 2007.

<<http://www.wsu.edu/~dee/civafrica/swahili.htm>>

⁴⁰⁶ Hooker, Richard. Civilisations in Africa. The Swahili Kingdoms. World Cultures Home Page. Washington State University. June 5, 2007.

<<http://www.wsu.edu/~dee/civafrica/swahili.htm>>

⁴⁰⁷ Cf.: Ethnologue Language Family Index. In: Gordon, Raymond G., Jr. (ed.), 2005. Ethnologue: Languages of the World, Fifteenth Edition. Dallas, Texas: SIL International. Online Version. June 5, 2007.

<<http://www.ethnologue.com/>>

*Ivo vanavo vechikoro.
Teachers are grieving
They yearn for wives;
But which wives again
When they have school girls
Right in their midst?*⁴⁰⁸

Several English terms have been employed for criticism derived from a non-Western perspective. Critical thinking or elements like these are not part of African tradition but only developed in European traditions. Methods of African nationalist ideology are often derived from colonial-imperial discourse. Evan Mwangi wrote in 2005 about *eco-criticism* as an applied form of criticism:

*The award of this year's Nobel Peace prize to African environmentalist Wangari Maathai is a big boost to eco-criticism in the study of the continent's literature. Eco-criticism, a relatively new approach to literature, is the study of the inter-relationship between art and the natural world. An elated Wangari Maathai receives news of the Nobel Peace Prize: "She was recognised for her environmentalist efforts." Although African critics have over the years examined the relationship between literature and other forms of social consciousness such as morality, politics, psychology, pedagogy and philosophy, a more conscious insertion of the study of environment in criticism would help us understand literature better and appreciate the art's interaction with other forms of human practice. Prof. Maathai is the first African woman to win the award, and although she is not a literary personality, there are a few poems dedicated to her and her "green" campaign.*⁴⁰⁹

Wamba dia Wamba, a leader of the *Rassemblement Congolais la Democratie* (RCD-Kisangani) based in Kinshasa, the capital town of the Democratic Republic of Congo, made the statement that the basic issues of the Congolese crisis “have not been dealt with, since

⁴⁰⁸ [Http://www.wacc.org.uk/publications/md/md1997-3/hove.html](http://www.wacc.org.uk/publications/md/md1997-3/hove.html). June 5, 2007.

⁴⁰⁹ Mwangi, Evan. “African Eco-Criticism Nobel Prize. A Shot in the Arm for African Eco-Criticism”. In: *The Nation* (Nairobi). University Minnesota. Febr. 18, 2005.

[Http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/mwangi.htm](http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/mwangi.htm)

See also for the term eco-criticism.

Huggan, Graham. ““Greening” Postcolonialism: Ecocritical Perspectives”. In: *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*. Vol. 50. Number 3. Fall 2004. Pp. 701-733

people have no confidence in the existing institutions and their officers. When the overall system is based on mediocrity and irresponsibility, each leader has no self-confidence. There is complete absence of a sense of statecraft and workmanship".⁴¹⁰ *The Namibian* wrote in its article *World Bank Made Mistakes in Africa* in February 2000:

*Conakry - If the World Bank made mistakes in Africa in the last twenty years it is because 'the Bank is only as smart as the people thinking about development', says Jean-Louis Sarbib, the outgoing World Bank vice-president for sub-Saharan Africa. Sarbib, now moving to the North Africa and Middle East section of the World Bank, candidly admits his organisation has made mistakes. But at least, he says, it has always acknowledged them and tried to correct them and move on.*⁴¹¹

Literacy is less developed in Africa than in other continents. Illiteracy is a barrier to information in contemporary Africa. The *Cultural Charter for Africa* (1976) drawn up by the General Secretariat of the *Organisation of African Unity* articulates the conviction that cultural domination led to the depersonalization of part of the African peoples. African literature professor at Nouakchott University El Hassen Ould Ahmed stated about the conditions of *African literature criticism*:

*African critics are yet to settle down the question of an African literature criticism accepted by all. This is partly because of their different backgrounds, partly because of complexity of the different sources of African literature but mainly because of the absence of clear cut standards and features according to which people must evaluate the quality of an African Artistic work. [...] More complex and delicate situation of national languages is the fact that many local languages are usually spoken over a whole region covering different sovereign countries.*⁴¹²

⁴¹⁰ The Failure of an African Political Leadership. An Interview with Professor Wamba dia Wamba by Mandisi Majavu. Z Communications. July 18, 2003.

<[Http://www.zmag.org/content/showarticle.cfm?SectionID=2&ItemID=3927](http://www.zmag.org/content/showarticle.cfm?SectionID=2&ItemID=3927)>

⁴¹¹ Anonymus. The World Bank Made Mistakes in Africa. *The Namibian* of Febr. 15, 2002. *The Namibian*. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.namibian.com.na/Netstories/2000/May/Marketplace/007EFD986A.html](http://www.namibian.com.na/Netstories/2000/May/Marketplace/007EFD986A.html)>

⁴¹² Ahmed, El Hassen Ould. *African Literature Criticism*. Peacenewspaper. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.peacenewspaper.com/content/view/112/](http://www.peacenewspaper.com/content/view/112/)>

As Benton wrote: “Sympathetic critics of the world-systems perspective have emphasized the power of local conflict and culture to shape global structures. The critique has nevertheless left the main features of the global structural model intact. Two alternative approaches— institutional analysis and postcolonial cultural theory—offer important insights into how we might push the critique further.”⁴¹³ Jean-Marc Moura mentioned *postcolonial criticism* as an impact on African literature:

*Postcolonial criticism's first contribution to Africa was precisely to develop simultaneous comparative study - I am a lecturer in comparative literature, which is perhaps why this interests me between Francophone, Anglophone and Lusophone texts. That is, to develop a specifically African point of view, independent of the language in which such and such a work was written, studying Senghor, Sony Labou Tansi, in the Francophone zone, Soyinka or Achebe, in the Anglophone region, José Juan Dino Vieira in the Lusophone zone.*⁴¹⁴

Imre Szeman wrote in *Who's Afraid of the "Nation-State"?* on the influence of postcolonial criticism regarding nationalism: If recent postcolonial criticism is more and more preoccupied with transnational and global cultural movements as the privileged sites of contemporary colonial and neo-colonial struggles and contestations, then who's afraid of the imaginary, modernist, seemingly now irrelevant question of the “nation”?⁴¹⁵ Orature is a term coined by Pius Zirimu from Uganda to denote oral texts. Orature constitutes the primary source of literary productivity in Africa. For Zirimu the privileging of written literature over orature is increasingly ‘discredited in view of the continual flux between orality and literacy’. In most of Africa orature already provides exemplary texts of resistance and discursive contest. Ngugi and Kwame Appiah concur in characterising as Afro-European literature written by Africans in European languages.⁴¹⁶ A multiplicity of African languages and questions of the orality of their society characterize the continuity of literatures in African languages. Colonial

⁴¹³ Benton, Lauren A. “From the World-Systems Perspective to Institutional World History: Culture and Economy in Global Theory.” In: *Journal of World History*. Vol. 7, Number 2, Fall 1996, pp. 261-295

⁴¹⁴ Postcolonial Criticism. A Study of Specificities. Interview with Jean-Marc Moura. May 29, 2007. <[Http://www.africultures.com/anglais/articles_anglais/int_moura.htm](http://www.africultures.com/anglais/articles_anglais/int_moura.htm)>

⁴¹⁵ Imre Szeman: *Who's Afraid of the "Nation-State"?* *Zones of Instability: Literature, Postcolonialism, and the Nation*. *Postcolonial Text*, Vol 2, No 1 (2006). June 7, 2007. <[Http://postcolonial.org/index.php/pct/article/view/466/166](http://postcolonial.org/index.php/pct/article/view/466/166)>

⁴¹⁶ See also: Niekerk, Marlene van. *Understanding Trends in 'African Thinking'. A Critical Discussion*. *The African Philosophy Reader*. 1998, pp. 52-85

bilingualism contained indigenous tongues and official dominating languages, mainly from the colonial power, and produced also *linguae francae* and pidgins for communicative purposes. In Feminist and womanist criticism of African literature. A bibliography was noticed by Sharon Verba that “rereading, willful misreading, and de- and re-coding are tools used in African literature and womanist or feminist discourse to challenge 'canonized literature' that tends to black out black and blanch out woman.”⁴¹⁷ African Storytelling is an introduction done by Cora Agatucci about the oral tradition in Africa:

It is only the story that can continue beyond the war and the warrior. It is the story that outlives the sound of war-drums and the exploits of brave fighters.

Traditionally, Africans have revered good stories and storytellers, as have most past and present peoples around the world who are rooted in oral cultures and traditions. Ancient writing traditions do exist on the African continent, but most Africans today, as in the past, are primarily oral peoples, and their art forms are oral rather than literary. In contrast to written "literature," African "orature" (to use Kenyan novelist and critic Ngugi wa Thiong'o's phrase) is orally composed and transmitted, and often created to be verbally and communally performed as an integral part of dance and music. The Oral Arts of Africa are rich and varied, developing with the beginnings of African cultures, and they remain living traditions that continue to evolve and flourish today.

Tortoise and the Birds and "Nnabe and Chineke" are examples of Igbo folktales that explain how animals got their physical characteristics—a genre common in many cultures around the world.

*In many of these cultures, storytelling arts are professionalized: the most accomplished storytellers are initiates (griots, or bards), who have mastered many complex verbal, musical, and memory skills after years of specialized training. This training often includes a strong spiritual and ethical dimension required to control the special forces believed to be released by the spoken/sung word in oral performances*⁴¹⁸

⁴¹⁷ Feminist and Womanist Criticism of African Literature. A Bibliography by Sharon Verba. Indiana University. May. 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.indiana.edu/~librcsd/bib/verba/index.html](http://www.indiana.edu/~librcsd/bib/verba/index.html)>

⁴¹⁸ Agatucci, Cora. African Storytelling. Central Oregon Community College. May. 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm](http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm)>

Evan Mwangi in *Nobel Prize: A Shot in the Arm for African Eco-Criticism* made the statement:

*The award of this year's Nobel Peace prize to African environmentalist Wangari Maathai is a big boost to eco-criticism in the study of the continent's literature. Eco-criticism, a relatively new approach to literature, is the study of the inter-relationship between art and the natural world.*⁴¹⁹

We will look now how in different African countries the relation between colonism and national identity influenced forms of criticism. In South Africa the *African National Congress (ANC)* is a centre-left political party and has been South Africa's governing party supported by a tripartite alliance between itself, the *Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU)* and the *South African Communist Party (SACP)* since the establishment of majority rule in May 1994. The *ANC's* willingness to support terrorism was subject of both foreign and domestic criticism. In *Criticism and Censorship in the South African 'alternative' Press with Particular Reference to the Cartoons of Bauer and Zapiro* Mario Pissarra made the following statement on *criticism*:

*Cartooning is an extremely heterogeneous practice whose genealogy can be traced back to caricature 1. This paper does not concern itself with the diversity that can be found in the cartoons Derek Bauer and Jonathan Shapiro (Zapiro), but rather chooses to focus on the potential of cartooning as a critical a practice. This paper proceeds from the premise that criticism and censorship are oppositional and antagonistic concepts which seldom appear alone. Criticism, particularly when expressed publicly and directed at specific interest groups (eg. a ruling elite) frequently evokes censorship, whilst censorship and repression and resistance.*⁴²⁰

According to Bernhard Magnier Africa's growing role in western European culture is reflected in the increasing interest in its literature. Magnier stated that confined during the 1970s and

⁴¹⁹ Evan Mwangi. Nobel Prize. A Shot in the Arm for African Eco-Criticism. The Nation (Nairobi). 24 October 2004. May 1st, 2006.

<<http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/mwangi.html>>

⁴²⁰ Pissarra, Mario. Criticism and Censorship in the South African 'Alternative' Press with Particular Reference to the Cartoons of Bauer and Zapiro. South African History Online. May 1st, 2006.

<<http://www.sahistory.org.za/pages/sources/mario-dissertation/chapter-one.htm>>

1980s to politically radical circles, African authors now appear in the culture pages of journals. New anthologies from leading French publishers have raised the profile of African writing, while increased funding has enabled the professionalization of translation. Though channels of distribution are still at present weighted towards the West, African literature is on its way to becoming a vital manifestation of a universal literature.⁴²¹ For Magnier literary criticism has to a large extent been professionalized. Literary journalists cover the current state of African books in the same way they would any other literature regardless of geographic origin. African books are today featured in the book section of the daily paper. This development, which has taken place as part of a wider movement recognizing the African continent, has established a place for African writing in the realm of a more universal literature, as well as placing upon it the same constraints as other literatures.⁴²² In *Approaches to African Cinema Study* Martin Mhando wrote about an *South African academic/critic*:

For example, the South African academic/critic Keyan Tomaselli argues for orality as one of those specific influences characterising narrative patterns in Southern African cinema. Western critics have for a long time now, approached African cinema from thematic perspectives at the expense of more formal approaches. There are many reasons for this, not least, the effect of the initial encounter of cinema and the African based on the proverbial didactic function of film encouraged by colonial authorities. Immediate post-independence African cinema is often seen to mimic the style of didactic filmmaking set up under colonialism.

This type of filmmaking often emphasises content over artistic and cultural influences and styles.

*A conscious application of the didactic functions of cinema was what was directly linked to African narrative.*⁴²³

Lumumba-Kasongo stated that Ghana was a former British colony and the first sub-Saharan African country to offload colonial domination in 1957. There had been about 20 years of military interlude in civilian administration. The negative consequence of this military

⁴²¹ Magnier, Bernhard. Eurozine – Articles. Eurozine. Jan. 11, 2006.

<[Http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2005-10-03-magnier-en.html](http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2005-10-03-magnier-en.html)>

⁴²² Magnier, Bernhard. Eurozine – Articles. Eurozine. Jan. 11, 2006.

<[Http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2005-10-03-magnier-en.html](http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2005-10-03-magnier-en.html)>

⁴²³ Mhando, Martin. *Approaches to African Cinema Study*. Sense of Cinema. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/00/8/african.html](http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/00/8/african.html)>

adventurism in the democratization process was disastrous.⁴²⁴ *CS Monitor* in 2003 wrote this headline about Zimbabwe:

*In his three-year effort to reengineer the racial and economic landscape of Zimbabwe by forcibly taking farms away from whites and giving them to blacks, President Robert Mugabe has long counted on - and gotten - support from almost all of Africa's leaders.*⁴²⁵

The contributors to the *Asmara Declaration on African Languages and Literatures* stated:

*We writers and scholars from all regions of Africa gathered in Asmara, Eritrea, from January 11 to 17, 2000, at the conference titled Against All Odds: African Languages and Literatures into the 21st Century. This is the first conference on African languages and literatures ever to be held on African soil, with participants from east, west, north, Southern Africa and from the diaspora and by writers and scholars from around the world. We examined the state of African languages in literature, scholarship, publishing, education, and administration in Africa and throughout the world. We celebrated the vitality of African languages and literatures and affirmed their potential. We noted with pride that despite all the odds against them, African languages as vehicles of communication and knowledge survive and have a written continuity of thousands of years. Colonialism created some of the most serious obstacles against African languages and literatures. We noted with concern the fact that these colonial obstacles still haunt independent Africa and continue to block the mind of the continent. We identified a profound incongruity in colonial languages speaking for the continent. At the start of a new century and millennium, Africa must firmly reject this incongruity and affirm a new beginning by returning to its languages and heritage.*⁴²⁶

⁴²⁴ Lumumba-Kasongo, Tukumbi. Liberal Democracy and Its Critics in Africa” Keynote Speech in the Series of Debates Shaping. Afrikabeleid. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.afrikabeleid.nl/docs/Keynote_speech_professor_Tukumbi_Lumumba.pdf](http://www.afrikabeleid.nl/docs/Keynote_speech_professor_Tukumbi_Lumumba.pdf)>

⁴²⁵ Anonymus. African Criticism of Mugabe Rises. *CS Monitor*. 2003. May. 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/1223/p06s01-woaf.html](http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/1223/p06s01-woaf.html)>

⁴²⁶ Asmara Declaration. Queens University. Jan. 11, 2006.

[Http://www.queensu.ca/snid/asmara.htm](http://www.queensu.ca/snid/asmara.htm)

Philosophical wisdom in Africa has been handed down from generation to generation in a way which can be described as mainly oral.⁴²⁷ That is also the case with what is called oral literature. This concept, which is in use in the science of intercultural literature, makes clear that it is wrong to speak of an opposition between oral and literate. There are elements of writing in a mainly oral tradition and elements of orality in a mainly literate tradition. The broad range of orality and literacy is not given in order to belittle the importance of the transition from mainly oral forms of communication and tradition in African philosophy. The term ‘negro writing’ was used.⁴²⁸

M'Baré N'gom made first research on Hispanidad through literature in Africa exemplified by Equatorial Guinea, the only sub-Saharan country with a literature of Spanish expression. This literature has not received much critical or theoretical attention. N'gom mentioned that Guinean literature, like other African literary expressions written in transcontinental languages, is the “expression of two literary traditions”: Spanish, marked by the strict and rigid norms of scripture, and African Bantu like Ndowne, Fang, and Bubi characterized by the more flexible and pragmatic rules of orality a phenomenon called ‘textual friction’, a “process through which the African text ends up incorporating the European text. During this interaction at the textual level by collecting and transcribing, and translating, a new cultural product evolves Pius Zirimu called ‘orature’. Since the act of translating from a source text to a target text is in itself an act of manipulation, therefore this process was not just limited to the thematic and structural levels”.⁴²⁹ In Africa literacy developed very late. Because cultural

⁴²⁷ Mühlig, W. J. G. (ed.). *Die Oralliteratur in Afrika als Quelle zur Erforschung der traditionellen Kulturen*. Berlin 1988, pp. 56-64

Yaba, Alphonse: *Oral Tradition, Literatur und Geschichte in Afrika*. Abidjan Gagnoa. Fuldabruck 1985, pp. 73-78

Opland, Jeff: *Xhosa Oral Poetry. Aspects of a Black South African Tradition*. Cambridge 1983, pp. 78-84

The African Past Speaks. Essays on Oral Tradition and History ed. by Joseph C. Miller. Hamden, Conn. 1980, pp. 41-45

La Tradition Orale. Problematique et Methodologie des Sources de l'Histoire Africaine par Dioulde Laya. Niamey 1972, pp. 59-65

⁴²⁸ Cf.: *The term negro writing used in: Within the Circle. An Anthology of African American Literary Criticism from the Harlem Renaissance to the Present*. Edited by Angelyn Mitchell. Durham; London 1994.

Cf.: Greenberg, Joseph H. “African Languages, African Tongues and Tribes”. In: Greenberg, Joseph H.: *Language, culture and communication*. Stanford 1971, pp. 126-136; pp. 137-142

⁴²⁹ M'Baré N'gom. “The Missing Link. African Hispanism at the Dawn of the Millennium.” In: *Arachne*. Volume 1. Number 1. 2000. Rutgers University. May. 1st, 2007.

forms and expressions are organized as an integral part of the way of life of African peoples, particular forms may change or disappear when the institutions or lifestyles that support them are modified or abandoned. One exception to the African oral culture is ancient Egypt with an early literate society. In ancient Egypt the invention of writing was attributed to the monkey god Thoth (Djeuty in Egyptian). Coming from Egypt papyrus became the writing medium of Egyptians, Greeks, and Romans in Hellenism serving for record keeping. Old Egyptian used the hieroglyphics where we find the first teaching advises to students regarding the rules how to speak. Systematic comments on communication can be traced back to the precepts of Kagemni and Ptah-Hotep (3200-2800 B.C.E.) as the classic examples of a rhetoric practiced in a pre-modern time. The *Maxims of Ptah-hotep* as an ancient text dates to back to the Old Kingdom. The advice offered in the maxims gives insight into the speech practices used in the hierarchical society of ancient Egypt. The fragment of *The Instruction to Kagemni* (6th Dynasty. *Papyrus Prisse I and II*) in the translation of Gardiner gives advices about good speaking and caution in terms of speech that could talk something that is not accepted by the majority of the culture:

*[...] the timid man prospers, praised is the fitting, open (is) the tent to the silent, spacious is the seat of the satisfied. Speak not (too much)! Sharp are the knives against he who transgresses the road, (he is) without speedy advance, except when he faults. When you sit with company, shun the food you like. Restraint of heart is (only) a brief moment! Gluttony is base and one points the finger at it. A cup of water quenches thirst, a mouthful of herbs strengthens the heart. A single good thing stands for goodness as a whole, a little something stands for much.*⁴³⁰

The ancient Egyptians used papyrus for writing hieroglyphics as early as the 4th millennium B.C.E. In Egypt the scribes were the social group having access to writing. Individual scribes signed their name on a document. Egyptian culture had –with the exception of Libya and Ethopia- little influence on the rest of the continent. The step from oral to written recording of

<http://arachne.rutgers.edu/voll_1ngom.htm>

⁴³⁰ Gardiner, Alan. “The Instruction to Kagemni and his Brethren”. In: *Journal of Egyptian Archeology*. 37 (1946), pp. 71-74

Published at:

Two Translations of the Instructions of Kagemni. Ancient Egypt Online. June 3, 2007

<<http://nefertiti.iwebland.com/texts/kagemni.htm>>

advice regarding speech conduct in Egypt was made in ancient times.⁴³¹ The Nilo-Saharan language Nubian is the only modern African language with early written records dating from the 8th century C.E. to the 14th century and has an alphabet derived from the Coptic one. Coptic consisting of Greek characters with some special Coptic characters serving as the connecting language between ancient Egyptian language and modern Northern African languages in the Nile area and preserving the Biblical literature.⁴³² Egyptian culture had except of Libya and Ethiopia little influence on the rest of the continent. The way from oral to written Rhetoric in Egypt was made in ancient times.⁴³³

In the 7th century of the Christian invading first Christianized Egypt believers in the new faith of Islam missionized nearly the whole country. Spreading further westwards, Islam reached Europe, Spain, from the north of Africa and throughout North Africa Christianity was replaced by Islam with some exceptions like Egypt, Upper Nubia, and Ethiopia. Examples for the influences of Islam are converted ethnic groups such as Berber and Tuareg. Arabian influence in Africa can be found in literature, language and the educational system. In Algerian Arabic is the primary language of around 82% of the population. Most of the rest of population speak various Berber dialects with Arabic as a second language. The Tuareg tribes speak two Berber dialects.⁴³⁴ The nomadic Tuaregs were the first inhabitants in the Sahara region. The nomadic Tuaregs share little affinity with the black African majority of Niger. Myths, proverbs and songs are typical forms of African orality. The term griot refers to traditional recitators throughout Western Africa. Griots can be court bards or itinerate musicians and storytellers with a broad regional sphere of activity. Griots today live in Mali, Gambia, Guinea, and Senegal among the Mande peoples, Fulbe (Fula), Hausa, Tukulóor, Wolof, Serer, Mauritanian Arabs, and many other tribes. African griots serve as historians,

⁴³¹ Lesko, B. S. "The Rhetoric of Women in Pharaonic Egypt." In: *Listening to Their Voices. The Rhetorical Activities of Historical Women*. Ed. by Molly Meijer Wertheimer. University of South Carolina: University Press 1997, pp. 89-111.

⁴³² The Christian Coptic Orthodox Church Of Egypt. *Encyclopedia Coptica*. May 1st, 2007.
<[Http://www.coptic.net/](http://www.coptic.net/)>

⁴³³ Lesko, B. S. "The Rhetoric of Women in Pharaonic Egypt." In: *Listening to their Voices. The Rhetorical Activities of Historical Women*. Edited by Molly Meijer Wertheimer. U. of South Carolina Press. 1997, pp. 89-111.

⁴³⁴ Maddy-Weitzman, Bruce. "The Berber Question in Algeria. Nationalism in the Making?" In: *Minorities and the State in the Arab World*. Ed. by Ofra Bengio and Gabriel Ben-Dor. Ciaonet. May. 1st, 2007.
<[Http://www.ciaonet.org/book/bengio/bengio02.html](http://www.ciaonet.org/book/bengio/bengio02.html)>

storytellers, traditional praise singers, and musicians.⁴³⁵ Occult powers and primal energies of creation and destruction are called *nyama* by Mande peoples of Western Africa.⁴³⁶ The *jeli* or griots are a subgroup of the artisan professions that the Mande designate *nyamakalaw*, or *nyama*-handlers.⁴³⁷ According to Boni African orality contains a specific rhetoric.⁴³⁸ African *orature* is a term of Kenyan novelist and critic Ngugi wa Thiongo for stories orally composed and transmitted.⁴³⁹ The oral tradition developed in the oral societies of sub-Saharan Africa and particularly in West Africa, to which this communication primarily refers. Keywords to African and African American rhetorical considerations are harmony and unity, the divine spirit is found in community and *nommo*, the lived power of the spoken word.⁴⁴⁰ Forms of criticism can be presented in vernacular languages in traditional oral forms such as songs. This protest song shows the mistreatment and struggle of blacks in South Africa:

In Brutal

Chainsby Didi Obichere

"In the brutal chains of apartheid

South Africa sheds so many bloody tears

Tears of anger, rage, and sorrow

Tears that have been gushing out

Of blood-shot eyes for many years

⁴³⁵ Sage, Bethany. West African Storytellers. Griots and Griottes. Chatham College. May. 1st, 2007.

<[Http://www.chatham.edu/pti/2004%20units/Introduction%20to%20Folktales/Sage%20unit.pdf](http://www.chatham.edu/pti/2004%20units/Introduction%20to%20Folktales/Sage%20unit.pdf)>

⁴³⁶ Agatucci, Cora. African Storytelling. An Introduction, with Works Cited and Source for Further Study.

Central Oregon Community College. May. 1st, 2007.

<[Http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm](http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm)>

⁴³⁷ Cf. Agatucci, Cora. African Storytelling. An Introduction, with Works Cited & Source for Further Study.

Central Oregon Community College. May. 1st, 2007.

<[Http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm](http://www.cocc.edu/cagatucci/classes/hum211/afrstory.htm)>

⁴³⁸ Aguessi, Honorat: La Tradition Orale, Modèle de Culture. La Tradition Orale, Source de la Littérature Contemporaine en Afrique, Dakar, Nouvelles Editions Africaines, 1984, pp. 44-54.

Blakely, Pamela A. R.: Ancestors, "Witchcraft", and Foregrounding the Poetic. Men's Oratory and Women's Song-Dance in Hêmbá Funerary Performance." In: Religion in Africa. 1997, pp. 398-442

⁴³⁹ Cf.: Petrilli, Susan. "Telling Stories in the Era of Global Communication: Black Writing—Oraliture." In: Research in African Literatures. Vol. 32. Number 1. Spring 2001, pp. 98-109.

⁴⁴⁰ Introduction to African, African American, and Asian Rhetoric. Bradley University. May. 1st, 2007.

<[Http://bradley.edu/~ell/aa&arhet.html](http://bradley.edu/~ell/aa&arhet.html)>

*We have been chained into the Native Land Act
The gruesome act that controls our ev'ry step
The thoughtless act which separates us
Mother, father, children however close
We may be kept*

*We have been left the heart-throbbing chain marks
Of our brothers and children passed
The brutal chains that whipped away our people in Sharpeville
Locked away our leader, Mandela
Hammered away at our innocent school children in Soweto
Murdered away our brother and fighter, Biko
Will never be forgotten
Our struggle will linger on
And soon our strong arms will break these brutal chains
And we, South Africa, will surpass." ⁴⁴¹*

A common folklore with local variations has spread along with the Bantu language across Sub-Saharan Africa.⁴⁴² Some of the first African writings to gain attention in the West were the poignant slave narratives, such as *The Interesting Narrative of the Life and Adventures of Olaudah Equiano or Gustavus Vassa, the African* (1789), which described vividly the horrors of slavery and the slave trade.

Olu Oguibe delivered a keynote speech held at the *International Association of Art Critics Conference* at *Courtauld Institute* in London, November 1996 about art criticism in Africa:

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Five years ago almost to the date, I had the honor to speak on art criticism and Africa not so far away from this spot. At the time, I had taken what many saw as a hardline,

⁴⁴¹ Modern World History. Protest Song Project. *Springbrook High School* June 7, 2007..

<[Http://www.mcps.k12.md.us/schools/springbrookhs/socialstudies/History/Protest%20Song%20Project.htm](http://www.mcps.k12.md.us/schools/springbrookhs/socialstudies/History/Protest%20Song%20Project.htm)>

⁴⁴² Diop, Samba. *The Oral History and Literature of the Wolof People of Waalo, Northern Senegal. The Master of the Word (Griot) in the Wolof Tradition.* Lewiston 1995, pp. 23-29.

*uncompromising position in arguing that the business of the state of art criticism in Africa should be left with the Africans. It was my opinion, too, that this business is one that ideally should be conducted in Africa. The very idea of discussing art criticism and Africa in London or New York did not seem particularly appropriate to me then. Neither does it now. It is, I believe, a reflection of the sad state of that continent and its leaders that five years on it has fallen on us again to speak about art criticism and Africa outside the continent. Perhaps I ought to mention that in those five years I have had only one opportunity to visit Africa, only one opportunity to visit my country, and may not do so freely today thanks to the presence of a dictatorship that has driven and continues to drive the finest minds, including art historians and critics, out of that country.*⁴⁴³

Criticism of modern African literature has developed.⁴⁴⁴ James E. Lassiter wrote in *African Culture and Personality*. about the intercultural approaches to social issues:

African scholars writing on these subjects since the early 1960s have taken a humanistic, liberating or empowering approach. They have been specifically interested in identifying and explaining African psychological processes, personality characteristics, and the processes of African cultural adaptation to indigenous social conditions and exotic influences. For example, the work of University of Nairobi philosophy professor Joseph M. Nyasani (1997), which features prominently in this paper, is a recent attempt to define the "African psyche."
445

In *Contemporary African Philosophy* Zeverin Emagalit wrote about four trends in African philosophy:

Allen, Matthew. *Smart Thinking. Skills for Critical Understanding and Writing*. Melbourne 1998, pp. 98ff.

⁴⁴³ Olu, Oguibe. *Art Criticism and Africa. Thoughts Towards a New Century*. The Olu Oguibe Homepage. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://camwood.org/aica.htm>

Allen, Matthew. *Smart Thinking. Skills for Critical Understanding and Writing*. Melbourne 1998, pp. 78ff.

⁴⁴⁴ Cf. Egudu, R. N. "Criticism of Modern African Literature". In: *The Question of Evaluation World Literature Written in English*. 1982. Spring. Vol. 21 (1), pp. 54-67

⁴⁴⁵ Lassiter, James E. *African Culture and Personality. Bad Social Science, Effective Social Activism, or a Call to Reinvent Ethnology?* University Florida. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.africa.ufl.edu/asq/v3/v3i3a1.htm>

One of them is the popular understanding of Africa as a Dark Continent where there are no roads, no schools, no governments and no civilization. This is the Africa of journalists, merchants and tourist business people who want to promote their products. Another reason why some people usually express wonder and doubt at the mention of the existence of African Philosophy is due to the image of Africa as delineated by some anthropologists, social scientists, political analysis's and historians with a slanted approach to reality.

Basically, there are four trends that can be regarded as the core of African Contemporary Philosophy in our present times. The first of these trends is Ethnophilosophy. While the second is branded as Philosophic Sagacity, the third trend is Nationalist-ideological Philosophy. Finally, there is what we all know, Professional Philosophy.

Ethnophilosophy is a system of thought that deals with collective worldviews of diverse African peoples as a unified form of knowledge. It is based on the myths, folk-wisdom and the proverbs of the people. The term "ethnophilosophy" was coined by Paulin Hountondji to refer to the works of those anthropologists, sociologists, ethnographers and philosophers who present collective philosophies of life of African peoples.

The second current trend of philosophy in Africa today, is the Sagacity Philosophy. Philosophic Sagacity is a reflective system of thought based on the wisdom and the traditions of people. Basically it is a reflection of a person who is acknowledged both as a sage and a thinker.

The third current trend of Philosophy In Africa is the Nationalist-Ideological philosophy. It is a system of thought, based on traditional African socialism and familyhood. It represented by the works of politicians like Kwame Nkrumah, Julius Nyerere and Leopold Senghor. This trend of philosophy aims at seeking a true and a meaningful freedom for African people that can be attained by mental liberation and a return to genuine traditional African humanism wherever it is possible.

The final unit of philosophy in Africa today is the professional philosophy. In the African context, professional philosophy consists in the analysis and interpretation of reality in general. It further consists of criticism and argument, which to them, are the essential characteristics and conditions for any form of knowledge to be judged as philosophy.⁴⁴⁶

*Ecocriticism is an example how Africans adapt concepts of criticism. The word 'ecocriticism' traces back to William Rueckert's 1978 essay *Literature and Ecology: An Experiment in**

⁴⁴⁶ Emagalit, Zeverin. Contemporary African Philosophy. Mount Sait Mary College. May. 1st 2006.

<[Http://faculty.msmc.edu/lindeman/af.html](http://faculty.msmc.edu/lindeman/af.html)>

Ecocriticism and apparently lay dormant in critical vocabulary until the 1989 Western Literature Association meeting (in Coeur d'Alene), when Cheryll Glotfelty revived the term but urged its adoption to refer to the diffuse critical field that heretofore had been known as 'the study of nature writing'.⁴⁴⁷ In *Nobel Prize: A Shot in the Arm for African Eco-Criticism* Evan Mwangi mentioned that "although African critics have over the years examined the relationship between literature and other forms of social consciousness such as morality, politics, psychology, pedagogy and philosophy, a more conscious insertion of the study of environment in criticism would help us understand literature better and appreciate the art's interaction with other forms of human practice." Mwangi sees differences between eco-criticism in the West and Africa:

*In the West, eco-criticism focuses mainly on the 19th century literature which celebrated nature and wildness. In Africa, it would be more energetic because most of the literature has a rural setting or a degenerate urban background that expresses a longing for the lost rural peace.*⁴⁴⁸

The concept of 'ecocriticism' is an example how a term of criticism was created and promoted by the *Association for the Study of Literature and Environment* in the 90s. For Heise in *Science and Ecocriticism* ecocriticism, or green criticism is "one of the most recent interdisciplinary fields to have emerged in literary and cultural studies. Ecocriticism analyzes the role that the natural environment plays in the imagination of a cultural community at a specific historical moment, examining how the concept of 'nature' is defined, what values are assigned to it or denied it and why, and the way in which the relationship between humans and nature is envisioned. More specifically, it investigates how nature is used literally or metaphorically in certain literary or aesthetic genres and tropes, and what assumptions about nature underlie genres that may not address this topic directly."⁴⁴⁹ Dean answered the

⁴⁴⁷ Defining Ecocritical Theory and Practice. 1994. Western Literature Association Meeting

Salt Lake City, Utah-6 October 1994. The Association for the Study of Literature and Environment. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.asle.umn.edu/conf/other_conf/wla/1994/1994.html](http://www.asle.umn.edu/conf/other_conf/wla/1994/1994.html)>

⁴⁴⁸ Mwangi, Evan. Nobel Prize: A Shot in the Arm for African Eco-Criticism. *The Nation* (Nairobi). 24 October 2004. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/mwangi.html](http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/mwangi.html)>

⁴⁴⁹ Heise, Ursula K. *Science and Ecocriticism*. In: *The American Book Review* 18.5 (July-August 1997). The Association for the Study of Literature and Environment. June 7, 2007.

question "What is Eco-Criticism?" as "study of culture and cultural products (art works, writings, scientific theories, etc.) that is in some way connected with the human relationship to the natural world. Eco-criticism is also a response to needs, problems, or crises, depending on one's perception of urgency."⁴⁵⁰ Since Africa is a continent in progress, a definite answer or point of the current state is unpossibbly made and only roots can be traced back and relations can be shown. In *Science Encyclopedia* about *Realism In African Philosophy, Reality in African Aesthetics and Literary Criticism* was stated:

One of the concerns of aesthetics has been the refutation of the colonialist definition of African aesthetics. A particular area of debate has been the negative assessment of African art, such as the claim that the category of realism does not apply to African art.

*As can be seen, the concept of realism is used diversely in African philosophical and cultural practice. It is used in its traditional sense as a concern with art as a mirror of reality, but also in relation to the requirement for epistemological, cultural, and representational authenticity. It is noteworthy that the term realism is applied to a variety of realities and to different methods of representing the real. Even deconstructionists ultimately cannot avoid employing the traditional meaning of the word, of connoting the degree of representativeness or accuracy of artistic as well as philosophical and critical practice. What is also significant is that the philosophical attempt to define the real and realism often overflows the rather rigid categories set up by the African rationalist philosophers, proving that their concepts, rigorously defined as they are, cannot themselves fully represent the diversity of intellectual reflections on realism in Africa in the early twenty-first century. Perhaps even universal philosophy is particular after all.*⁴⁵¹

As far as African criticism is related to topics on Africa we can consider it independend, since critical forms of expressionals are universal forms not determinated by European standards.

<[Http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/heise.html](http://www.asle.umn.edu/archive/intro/heise.html)>

⁴⁵⁰ Thomas K. Dean, "What is Eco-Criticism?" The Association for the Study of Literature and Environment. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.asle.umn.edu/conf/other_conf/wla/1994/dean.html](http://www.asle.umn.edu/conf/other_conf/wla/1994/dean.html)>

⁴⁵¹ Realism In African Philosophy, Reality In African Aesthetics And Literary Criticism. Science Encyclopedia. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://science.jrank.org/pages/10995/Realism-Africa-Reality-in-African-Aesthetics-Literary-Criticism.html](http://science.jrank.org/pages/10995/Realism-Africa-Reality-in-African-Aesthetics-Literary-Criticism.html)>

Where on the other hand criticism is used within European forms, we must consider this being an output of colonialism.

2.5. “Pi Ping” - On Asian Criticism

Chinese is the most influential language for the region of Far East. Its terminology influenced several languages of Far Asia. In Chinese *pi ping* is criticism. According to Mazzola the Chinese word for criticism is “*piping*. *Wenxue piping* [...] means literary criticism. Although *piping* does not have the root meaning of sifting, it does suggest a similar idea, but from a slightly different angle. The first syllable of the Chinese word, *pi*, connotes ‘peeling’.” The process of criticism [...] according to the Chinese language is like peeling away the husk to come closer to the core, which is often both sweet and nourishing. The second part of the word, *ping*, refers to ‘measuring and ranking in accordance with an accepted standard’ (Han). So the Chinese word for criticism, *piping*, suggests the similar process as the Indo-European word *keri* -of moving carefully to the heart of the matter, by peeling, arranging, and ranking, once the center has been opened.”⁴⁵² Within the cultural framework based upon Chinese culture Asian cultures have developed techniques similar to critical techniques. In *The Rise of Historical Criticism* Oscar Wilde wrote:

*The Chinese annals, ascending as they do to the barbarous forest life of the nation, are marked with a soberness of judgment, a freedom from invention, which is almost unparalleled in the writings of any people; but the protective spirit which is the characteristic of that people proved as fatal to their literature as to their commerce. Free criticism is as unknown as free trade.*⁴⁵³

Also a terminology of criticism exists in the Chinese language with expressions for ‘critic’, ‘critique’, and ‘critic’.⁴⁵⁴ Critic in simplified Chinese is 批评家 and in traditional Chinese 批評家. Critic in Japanese is 批評家. A critic as a person is in simplified Chinese 爱挑剔的人, in traditional Chinese 愛挑剔的人. A critical inquiry is 英文系, critique is 英文系, cultural

⁴⁵² Mazzola, Lars Charles. *The Art of Criticism*. World Prout Assembly. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html](http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html)>

⁴⁵³ Wilde, Oscar. *The Rise of Historical Criticism*. University College Cork. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/E800003-001/text001.html](http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/E800003-001/text001.html)>

⁴⁵⁴ Legge, James. *Chinese critics attribute*. *The Chinese Classics in five volumes*. Chapter II of the Confucian Analects. Section I. Formation of Text of the Analects by the Scholars of the Han-Dynastie. Harvestfields Ebooks. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.harvestfields.ca/ebook/01/009/02.htm](http://www.harvestfields.ca/ebook/01/009/02.htm)>

critique is 比研所, and discourse is 英文系 in Chinese characters. In Korean the critic is 흥 잡는 사람 and 비평가. Chinese 責 *tse*, in Korean 책 has next to the basic meaning ‘upbraid’ the meanings to criticize, correct, to demand, to ask from, and to punish. 譏評 is *chi-ping*, in Korean 기평, in Japanese キヒヨウ with the meanings to censure and to criticize. 謫 *che*, Korean 적, Japanese チャク means condemn, blame, censure, charge, accuse, and criticize. 謗難 *pang-nan*, Korean 방난, Japanese ホウナン has the meanings to criticize and to disparage. 評註 *ping-chu*, Korean 평주, Japanese ヒヨウチュウ has the meanings to criticize and to comment on.⁴⁵⁵ For critic 批 the modern Beijing reading is *pi* derived from preclassic Old Chinese is *phij*. The basic English meaning is ‘to hit with the hand’. Later attested meanings are ‘to scrape’, ‘to criticize, make an official decision’. Vietnamese *phe* for party, camp, side may be traced back to the Chinese word with the latter meaning. The character 評 in modern Beijing reading is *ping*. The English meaning is to criticize, discuss since the Han-Dynasty. The Japanese reading is *hyō*; *agetsurau*. The character 箴 stands for *zhen* with the meanings needle and criticism. The character 議 in modern Beijing reading is *yì* and has the English meanings to plan, give thought to, and criticise.⁴⁵⁶ In Japan 点者 (てんじゃ) is a critic of *haiku* poetry. 評論家 (ひょうろんか) is a critic. 言居士 (いちげんこじ; いちごんこじ) is a person who is ready to comment on every subject. 警世家 (けいせいか) is a social critic. 映画評論家 (えいがひょうろんか) is a movie critic. 音楽評論家 (おんがくひょうろんか) is a music critic. 評者 (ひょうしゃ) is a critic or reviewer.⁴⁵⁷ 春秋の筆法 (しゅん

⁴⁵⁵ Digital Dictionary of Buddhism. Charles Muller's Dictionary of Terms and Names found in Buddhist Canonical Sources, Updated on User Contributions. June 5, 2007.

<<http://buddhism-dict.net/ddb/>>

⁴⁵⁶ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<<http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0>>

⁴⁵⁷ Jim Breen's WWWJDIC Server. Monash University. June 5, 2007.

<<http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~jwb/cgi-bin/wwwjdic.cgi?1E>>

じゅうのひっぽう) is a critical argument laden with value judgment, where an indirect cause, often trivial, is made to appear as leading to the effect. 申し分のない; 申し分の無い; 申分のない; 申分の無い (もうしぶんのない) means no objection and nothing to criticize. 眼高手低 (がんこうしゅてい) means able to criticize but not to create. 褒め殺す ほめごろす means to compliment and criticize lavishly. 糞みそに言う くそみそにいう means to verbally attack, to run down, and to criticize severely. 批判材料 ひはんざいりょう means elements deserving criticism. 責める (せめる) means to condemn, to blame, and to criticize.⁴⁵⁸ 私議 (しぎ) means personal opinion and criticism behind one's back. 我我に向けられた非難; 我々に向けられた非難 (われわれにむけられたひなん) is criticism leveled against us. 文学論 (ぶんがくろん) is literary criticism or theory. 物議 (ぶつぎ) is a public discussion or criticism. 痛棒 (つうぼう) is severe attack or a bitter kind of criticism. 公論 (こうろん) is public opinion and unbiased criticism. 非難 (批難) (ひなん) is blame, attack, and criticism. 論評 (ろんぴょう) is both comment and criticism. 妄評 (ぼうひょう; もうひょう) is an unfair criticism. 指弾 (しだん) is attack, criticism, blame, and rejection.⁴⁵⁹ Derived from Chinese *pi* in Korean an art critic is 미술 비평가. To criticize is 비평하다, 비판하다, 평론하다, and 감정하다. Critical is 임계의. Critical philosophy is 비판 철학. An editorial critic is 사설. Criticism is 감정, comparative criticism is 비교 비평, desultory criticism is 만평, interpretative criticism is 해석 비평, textual criticism is 본문 비평.⁴⁶⁰ The main English translator of the Confucian texts was James Legge. Legge's translations

⁴⁵⁸ Jim Breen's WWWJDIC Server. Monash University. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~jwb/cgi-bin/wwwjdic.cgi?1E](http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~jwb/cgi-bin/wwwjdic.cgi?1E)>

⁴⁵⁹ Jim Breen's WWWJDIC Server. Monash University. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~jwb/cgi-bin/wwwjdic.cgi?1E](http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~jwb/cgi-bin/wwwjdic.cgi?1E)>

⁴⁶⁰ Korean Dictionary. Z Korean. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.zkorean.com/dictionary.php?direction=ek&word=criticism](http://www.zkorean.com/dictionary.php?direction=ek&word=criticism)>

accompanied by Chinese text and extensive commentary were issued in a series of volumes called *The Chinese Classics* published between 1893 and 1895 and in contributions to Max Mueller's series *The Sacred Books of the East* (1875-1925). The most influential text for all Northern Asian culture, the Confucian *Analects* (Chinese: *Lun Yu*), can also be translated as 'discourses' and 'dialogues' or 'conversations'. The *Analects* contains twenty books that were compiled by his disciples and by the following disciples of the second generation. The Confucian canon as it exists today was essentially compiled by Zhu Xi. Zhu Xi codified the canon of the *Four Books* (*The Great Learning*, *The Analects of Confucius*, *Mencius*, and *Doctrine of the Mean*) that in the subsequent Yuan and Ming Dynasties were made the core of the official curriculum for the civil service examinations. In Chinese the terms *shi* for 'to inspect' and *shiyoku* for 'sight' and *shikai* for 'field of vision' and *shisatsu* for inspection come from the same root. *Riso* means 'ideal', *riron* and *gakusetsu* are 'theory' and *meian* 'bright idea'. *Teikaen* is a 'definite view'. *Ji* has the meanings 'character', 'symbol', and 'letter'. *Goki* is 'way of speaking', *wahei* is a 'topic of conversation' and *sho* means 'to persuade'. In the *She King*, one of the classical Chinese works, artful speaking is described:

*Alas that (right words) cannot be spoken,
Which come not from the tongue (only)!
The speakers of them are sure to suffer.
Well is it for the words that can be spoken!
The artful speech flows like a stream.*⁴⁶¹

Two of China's logical schools of thought are the Mohists and the Logicians. Logic in China is part of another concept than the European Greek rooted one.⁴⁶² Philosophers used both terms *dao* (way) and *fa* (standard) and show this way their similarity in thinking with sectarian writings from India. S.C. Combs in *The Dao of Communication Criticism: Insects, Individuals, and Mass Society* stated that Daoist rhetoric offers the potential to provide a 'valuable and unique vantage point for communication criticism'. His paper concludes by discussing the implications of Daoist criticism for communication theory and practice. In so

⁴⁶¹ See also:

Haase, Fee-Alexandra. "Intercultural communication and speech style." In: CLC WEB. Comparative Literature and Culture. A WWWWeb Journal. Purdue University. June 5, 2007.

<<http://clcwebjournal.lib.purdue.edu/ccs-purdue.html>>

⁴⁶² From. Chad Hansen. Logic in China. In. Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Edited by Craig Edward. London, New York. Routledge 1998, pp. 694-695.

doing he illustrated important differences in the films, indicates central differences in Eastern and Western cultural values, and demonstrated the viability of Daoist rhetoric as a basis for communication criticism.⁴⁶³ Asian concepts of thinking and world view relay on simple oppositions within a holistic system. Following *dao* is following the way of Daoism as ‘way’ is discussed in the *Dao de Jing* elaborating on *yin* and *yang*, *wu wei*, *governing*, *the Three Jewels*, and other principal terms and issues. The extant text of *Chuang-Tzu*, which is also the name of the author, consists of thirty-three chapters being a mixture of philosophic disquisition and anecdotes or parables of Daoism.⁴⁶⁴ Daoism's central books are the *Dao De Jing*, attributed to Lao Zi (Lao tse) and the *Zhuang Zi (Chuang Tse)*. Genres of texts were developed. Religious Daoism in the *Daoist canon (Dao zang)* knows main texts (*ben wen*), Talismans (*shen fu*), commentaries (*yu jue*), diagrams and illustrations (*ling tu*), histories and genealogies (*pu lu*), precepts (*jie lu*), ceremonies (*wei yi*), rituals (*fang fa*), practices (*zhong shu*), biographies (*ji zhuan*), hymns (*zan song*), memorials (*biao zou*), and supplements (*si fu*). The basics of Daoism produced other writings. The *Great Mystery (tai xuan)* is based on the *Dao de Jing*. The *Great Peace (tai ping)* is based on the *Taiping Jing*. The *Great Purity (tai qing)* is based on the *Taiqing Jing* and other alchemical texts. The *Orthodox One (zhen gyi)* is based on texts from *Way of the Heavenly Masters (tian shi dao)* tradition. The core concepts of Daoism are traced far in Chinese history incorporating elements of mysticism dating back to prehistoric times linked with the *Book of Changes (I Ching)*, a divinatory set of 64 geometrical figures describing states and evolutions of the world. Taoism is also a government doctrine where the ruler's might is ruling through ‘non-action’ (*wu wei*). In Daoism *yin* and *yang* are negative and positive principles of the universe representing opposites in relations to each other. The *yin yang* symbol, a circle with black and white sections, depicts this. Around the circle white or black will increase, until the opposite color is almost gone. The cycle then repeats for the opposite color. *Yin* and *yang* represent the following opposites.

Yin
Negative

⁴⁶³ Combs, S.C. “The Dao of Communication Criticism. Insects, Individuals, and Mass Society”. In: *Social Semiotics*. Volume 12. Number 2, 1. August 2002, pp. 183-199 (17). June 5, 2007.
<<http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/routledg/csos/2002/00000012/00000002/art00003;jsessionid=54uqhc24rqhh.alice>>

⁴⁶⁴ Cf. *Chuang-Tzu. A Translation of Selected Chapters* by Lin Yutang. Febr. 18, 2005.
<http://www.geocities.com/ziconix_the_mystic/chuangtzu.htm>

Female
Dark
Evil
Earth

Yang
Positive
Male
Light
Good
Heaven

According to the *Dao De Jing* constant principles underlie heaven's behavior. The *Dao de Jing* was written by Lao-tzu saying that *the Master observes the world, but trusts his inner vision:*

I
The Tao that can be told
Is not the eternal Tao
The name that can be named
Is not the eternal Name.

The unnamable is the eternally real.
Naming is the origin
Of all particular things.

Free from desire, you realize the mystery.
Caught in desire, you see only the manifestations.

Yet mystery and manifestations
Arise from the same source.
This source is called darkness.

Darkness within darkness.

The gateway to all understanding.

12

Colors blind the eye.

Sounds deafen the ear.

Flavors numb the taste.

Thoughts weaken the mind.

Desires wither the heart.

The Master observes the world

But trusts his inner vision.

He allows things to come and go.

*His heart is open as the sky.*⁴⁶⁵

The editing and preserving of ancient texts needs critical studies of the texts. The Chinese version of the *Dao de Jing* itself has seen dozens of editions containing five to six thousand characters. The early 17th-century treatises on drama turned to the problem of the interrelation between *ya* (elegance) and *su* (vulgarity). In *Qu pin (Ranking of the Dramas)* Lu Tiancheng evaluated rustic dramas as ‘wanting’. With scholarly interest shifting from the musical to the verbal components of drama including spoken dialogues.⁴⁶⁶ In Chinese *shih ping* stands for historical criticism dealing with great events in history, methods of historical approach or entire historical works. Early work in Japan was heavily influenced by Chinese literature, since there was no native writing system. Asian mind concepts and critical thinking are divergent cultural assets.⁴⁶⁷ The Asian cultures are synthetical and emphasize social harmony

⁴⁶⁵ Lao-tzu. Tao Te Ching. Marxists Internat Archive. Nov. 19, 2005.

<[Http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/lao-tzu/works/tao-te-ching/tao.htm](http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/lao-tzu/works/tao-te-ching/tao.htm)>

⁴⁶⁶ Cf. Dolezelová-Velingerová, Milena. Chinese Theory and Criticism. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://61.152.93.149/english/Print.asp?ArticleID=966](http://61.152.93.149/english/Print.asp?ArticleID=966)>

Allen, Matthew. Smart Thinking. Skills for Critical Understanding and Writing. Melbourne 1998, pp. 78ff.

English, David. The Critical Cringe? The Implications for Australian Literary Studies of Contemporary European Critical Theory. Commonwealth Essays and Studies. 1984. Spring. Vol. 6 (2), pp. 56-63

Fizer, John. Psychologism and Psychoesthetics. A Historical and Critical View of their Relations. Benjamins 1981, pp. 90ff.

⁴⁶⁷ Essays in Modern Chinese Literature and Literary Criticism. Papers of the Berlin Conference 1978. A Selection of Papers, which were Read at the International Conference on Literature, Literary Theory and Literary

or intuitive insights of the individual person under a social hierarchy as a higher value than public criticism or argumentation.⁴⁶⁸ The lack of critical thinking tradition in Asia can linguistically be explained by the fact that educational systems and linguistic background are different. On the other hand China has its own indigenous traditions of logical and argumentative thinking as a meditative exercise, but in practice it is not considered of high value.⁴⁶⁹ The concept of *wu-wei* even is opposite to any approach of thinking at all. An example is given in *The Great Prajna-Paramita Heart Sutra* used in Zen and Mahayana Buddhism emphasizing *no thinking* is written:

Maka Hannya Hararmita shin gyo

The Great Prajna-Paramita Heart Sutra

Kan ji zai bo sa gyo-jin han-nya ha ra mi ta ji

Avalokiteshvara Bodhisattva, practicing deep Prajna Paramita,

Sho-ken go on kai ku-do is-sai ku yaku

clearly saw that all five skandhas are empty, transforming anguish and distress.

Sha ri shi shiki fu I ku-ku fu I shiki

Shariputra, form is no other than emptiness, emptiness no other than form;

Shiki sozu ze ku-ku-soku ze shiki

form is exactly emptiness, emptiness exactly form;

Ju so-gyo-shili yaku bu nyo ze

sensation, perception, mental reaction, consciousness are also like this.

Criticism in the People's Republic of China held at the East Asian Institute of the Free Univ. of Berlin, Sept. 18-24, 1978, pp. 67ff.

⁴⁶⁸ Cf. also: Chinese Aesthetics and Literature. A Reader. Ed. by Corinne H. Dale. Albany 2004, pp. 67ff.

See also in general: John Hopkins Guide to Literature Theory and Criticism. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://litguide.press.jhu.edu/](http://litguide.press.jhu.edu/)>

⁴⁶⁹ An important contribution to the history of criticism and all its aspects with a rich bibliographic backgrounds is:

Wang, Edward Q. Historical Writings in the 20th Century China. Methodological Innovation and Ideological Influence. University Oslo. May 29, 2006.

<[Http://www.oslo2000.uio.no/program/papers/s1/s1-wang.pdf](http://www.oslo2000.uio.no/program/papers/s1/s1-wang.pdf)>

Sha ri shi ze sho ho-ku-so-fu sho-fu metsu
Sha-riputra, all things are essentially empty-- not born, not destroyed;
Fu ka fu jo-fu zo- fu gen
not stained, not pure; without loss, without gain.

Ze ko ku-chu-mu shiki mu ju so-gyo-shiki
Therefore in emptiness there is no form, no sensation, perception, mental
reaction, consciousness;

Mu gen –ni bi zes-shin i
no eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, mind,
Mu shikiI sho-ko- mi soku ho-
no color, sound, smell, taste, touch, object of thought;

Mu gen kai nai shi mu I shiki kai
no seeing and so on to no thinking;

Mm mu myo- yaku mu mu myo-jin
no ignorance and also no ending of ignorance,

Nai shi mu ro-shi yaku mu ro-shi jin
and so on to no old age and death,
and also no ending of old age and death;

Mu ku shu metsu do-y
no anguish, cause of anguish, cessation, path;

Mi chi yaku mu toku i mu sho tokko
no wisdom and no attainment. Since there is nothing to attain,

Bo dai satta e han-mya ha ra mi ta ko
the Bodhisattva lives by Prajna Paramita,

Shim-mu kei ge mu kei ge ko mu u ku fu
with no hindrance in the mind; no hindrance and therefore no fear;

Om ri is-sai ten do- mu so- ku gyo – ne han
*far beyond delusive thinking, right here is Nirvana.*⁴⁷⁰

Verse of the Han

(Incised on the han at Koko An)
Completely freed from yes and no;
great emptiness charged within;
no questions, no answers;
*like a fish, like a fool.*⁴⁷¹

Soraj Hongladarom wrote in *Asian Philosophy and Critical Thinking: Divergence or Convergence?*:

It is widely recognized nowadays that critical thinking has become a necessary ingredient in all levels of education. Educators and educational policy makers agree that one of the desirable goals of education is that students are able to think critically. In Thailand, many have felt the need to inculcate critical thinking more seriously in educational curricula. This has gone so far as to include a clause in the newly promulgated Constitution that a bill on education be passed by Parliament. At the moment the act is being considered by various factors and agencies. The core of the proposed act is the idea that the students be able to think critically and independently.

This acknowledgement of the value of critical thinking has also reached the countries of Asia, whose cultural traditions are very different from that of the West.

[...]

⁴⁷⁰ Buddhist Studies. Daily Zen Sutras. Zen Pages. Nov. 14, 2005.

<<http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/ZenPages/Daily-Zen-Sutras.html>>

⁴⁷¹ Buddhist Studies. Daily Zen Sutras. Zen Pages. Nov. 15, 2005.

<<http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/ZenPages/Daily-Zen-Sutras.html>>

*Consequently, Asian cultures and critical thinking are divergent only if the former opt not to amend their decisions. But since we are talking only about decisions, then it is not difficult at all to conceive that cultures would make new decisions in response to changing times.*⁴⁷²

Critical methods are only done in a rudimental mediating form or as mental training. In recent time Western literature and translation was a form of practicing this concept. Wang in *Translating Journals into Chinese: Toward a Theoretical (Re)Construction of Chinese Critical Discourse* wrote:

Translation has played a very important role in Chinese literature, theory, and criticism. Modern Chinese literature is almost a translated literature, for, through a sort of cultural translation, traditional Chinese literary and critical discourse was deconstructed and has manifested itself in a new form. But translating Western journals into Chinese is only a recent practice, adopted since the turn of the century, because Chinese theorists realize that many insightful theoretical concepts and ideas first appear in journal articles.

[...]

*Chinese literary and cultural studies, due to the translation of these journals, will move closer and closer toward the international community, thereby having equal dialogues with the latter. Since most of the articles published in the above-mentioned journals anticipate their authors' substantial research and profound thinking of cutting-edge theoretical issues, they will certainly provide illumination to Chinese scholars' theoretical reflections.*⁴⁷³

The South Asian culture contains in terms of its literature stories, legends and poem of oral tradition. South Asian culture offers a view to different countries with common linguistic, religious and political roots, but also national developments of these aspects. Malay was influenced by Arabic. In Malay *fasih* is fluent and eloquent. *Kefasih* is fluency. *Fikir* is to

⁴⁷² Hongladarom, Soraj. Asian Philosophy and Critical Thinking: Divergence or Convergence? May 29, 2007. <<http://homepage.mac.com/soraj/web/APPEND.html>>

⁴⁷³ Wang, Ning. "Translating Journals into Chinese: Toward a Theoretical (Re)Construction of Chinese Critical Discourse". In: *New Literary History*. Vol. 36. Number 4. Autumn 2005. Pp. 649-659

See also for criticism in China:

Tong, Q. S.; Zhou, Xiaoyi. "Criticism and Society: The Birth of the Modern Critical Subject in China". In: *Boundary 2*. Vol. 29. Number 1. Spring 2002. Pp. 153-176

Totten, Gary. "Zitkala-Sa and the Problem of Regionalism: Nations, Narratives, and Critical Traditions". In: *The American Indian Quarterly*. Vol. 29. Number 1&2, Winter/Spring 2005. Pp. 84-123

think. *Fikiran* is opinion or thought. *Berfikir* is to think. *Berfikiran* is having the ability to think and to form opinions. *Memikirkan* is to think over and to ponder. *Pemikiran* is thinking. *Sefikiran* is an expression for having the same opinion.⁴⁷⁴ The English term 'criticism' is in Malay *kritikan*.⁴⁷⁵ The English term 'to criticise' is in Malay *mengkritik*.⁴⁷⁶ Vietnamese *che* has the meanings to criticize and to sulk.⁴⁷⁷ In Vietnamese a literary critic is *nhà phê bình văn học*.⁴⁷⁸ The English term 'criticism' is in Vietnamese *sự phê bình*. Vietnamese *chê bai*, *chỉ trích* is in English 'critic'.⁴⁷⁹ The English term 'to criticise' is in Vietnamese *phê bình*.⁴⁸⁰ Vietnamese *sự phê phán*, *sự phê bình* stands for animadversion, censure, and stricture, *sự chỉ trích lời phê bình*, *sự bình phẩm*, *lời phê phán*, and *lời chỉ trích* is comment.⁴⁸¹ In Vietnamese critic is *danh từ* and *nhà phê bình (văn nghệ)*. A literary critic is *nhà phê bình văn học* and *người chỉ trích*.⁴⁸² The English term 'to criticise' is in Indonesian *mengkritik*. A critic is in Indonesian *pengeritik*, *pengecam* (tally), *pencerca* (caviler, fault finder), *pencela* (detractor, fault finder), and *pencacat* (fault finder). Indonesian *timbangan* is an opinion based upon scales rather than weights. *Penggugatan* means accusing and claiming. *Gugatan* is an accusation, claim, and suit. *Bahas* is investigation, research, and study.⁴⁸³ In Thai a critic is *นักวิจารณ์* and *ผู้ที่ชอบติเตียน* with the meanings faultfinder, and carper. Criticism is *บทวิจารณ์* standing for a critical article and a review. Criticism is *การวิจารณ์* with the

⁴⁷⁴ Malay-English Dictionary. Freie Universitaet Berlin. June 5, 2007.

<<http://userpage.fu-berlin.de/~qntal/dictionary/>>

⁴⁷⁵ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

⁴⁷⁶ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

⁴⁷⁷ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<<http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0>>

⁴⁷⁸ Vietnamese - English - French Dictionary. Vdict. June 5, 2007.

<<http://vdict.com/critical,1,0.html>>

⁴⁷⁹ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

⁴⁸⁰ Multilingual Dictionary. The WordChamp. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.wordchamp.com/lingua2/Search.do?str=critic>>

⁴⁸¹ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

⁴⁸² Vietnamese Dictionary. May 29, 2007.

<<http://vietdic.com>>

⁴⁸³ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

meanings caviling, carping, and complaints. Criticism as การประเมิณผลงาน comprises the meanings study and analysis.⁴⁸⁴

⁴⁸⁴ Thai-English Dictionary. Lexitron. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://lexitron.nectec.or.th/lookupword_nm.php](http://lexitron.nectec.or.th/lookupword_nm.php)>

2.6. “Cricisimo and Criticism” - On Criticism in American

Both parts of America developed concepts of criticism rooted in European culture. In terms of linguistics South American criticism has its roots in the vernacular languages from the immigrating Europeans from Spain and Portugal. In North America the English language dominates. Portuguese, spoken in Brazil, employs *crítico*, *exigente*, and *perigoso* for a critic. In Portuguese *crítico*, *crítica*, *censura*, and *desaprovação* is used for criticism. Critic in Spanish is *crítico*. Spanish *crítico* has the meanings alarming, censor, censorious, critical, grave, knocker, reviewer, serious, and vital. Spanish *crítica* means appreciation, censure, chicane, critique, indictment, notice, reflection, review, stricture, *reparo* means cavil, demur, indemnity, objection, observation, remark, repair, reproof, *censura* means animadversion, blackout, blame, censor, censorship, censure, condensation, denunciation, observation, remark, reproach, reproof, stricture, and viewing.⁴⁸⁵ Portuguese *crítico* has the meanings argumentative, assailant, climacteric, critical, crucial, reviewer, and serious.⁴⁸⁶

The native Americans were divided in different ethnic groups from North to South America and have –as Kennedy showed- different features in terms of their oral systems developed.⁴⁸⁷ The diverse ethnic groups in America have a variety of mostly orally transferred cultural heritage. Native Americans found forms for criticism as approach towards the behavior of the immigrating Europeans. Inupiat Eskimo language *naipiqtuq* means to watch critically. A *fatkubnaq* is a medium, which communicates with the spiritual world.⁴⁸⁸ In Proto-Eskimo *nanju* stands for to criticize, to curse. Eastern Canadian Inupik uses *nanja(q)*- and *nanjai*.⁴⁸⁹ Tachnechorus (John Logan), Speckled Snake, Ma-ka-tai-me-she-kia-kiak (Black Hawk), Cobb, Seathl, Para-Wa-Samen (Ten Bears), Cochise, In-mut-too-yah-lat-lat (Chief Joseph)

⁴⁸⁵ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

⁴⁸⁶ Webster's Dictionary Online. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.websters-dictionary-online.net>>

⁴⁸⁷ Cf.: Kennedy, George A. North American Indian Rhetoric. In: Comparative Rhetoric. An Historical and Cross-cultural Introduction. New York, Oxford 1998, pp. 83-112.

⁴⁸⁸ Inupiat Eskimo Dictionary, Donald H. Webster and Wilfried Zibell. Alaskool. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.alaskool.org/Language/dictionaries/inupiaq/dictionary.htm](http://www.alaskool.org/Language/dictionaries/inupiaq/dictionary.htm)>

⁴⁸⁹ Databases. StarLing Database Server. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0](http://starling.rinet.ru/cgi-bin/main.cgi?root=config&morpho=0)>

(1876) and Standing Bear are Idians of the 19th century that wrote speeches. Tachnehdorus (John Logan) (ca. 1723-1780) wrote a speech to the white men:

I appeal to any white man to say, if ever he entered Logan's cabin hungry, and he gave him not meat; if ever he came cold and naked, and he clothed him not.² During the course of the last long and bloody war, Logan remained idle in his cabin, an advocate for peace. Such was my love for the whites that my countrymen pointed as they passed, and said, "Logan is the friend of the white man." I had even thought to have lived with you, but for the injuries of one man, Colonel Cressap, who last spring, in cold blood and unprovoked, murdered all the relations of Logan, not even sparing my women and children. There runs not a drop of my blood in the veins of any living creature. This called on me for revenge. I have sought it; I have killed many; I have full gutted my vengeance. For my countrymen I rejoice at the beams of peace. But do not harbor a thought that mine is the joy of fear. Logan never felt fear! He will not turn on his heel to save his life. Who is there to mourn for Logan?⁴⁹⁰

In the Spanish and Portuguese language the tradition of rhetoric both in theological and civil life was transmitted. The social background in these countries is the Catholic religion.⁴⁹¹ Prior to independence in Latin America higher education institutions were run by the Catholic Church of the Counter-Reform as part of the Spanish colonizing enterprise. European influence of rhetoric came from Spanish rhetoric mainly. Ioan de Guzman's *Primera Parte de Rhetorica de Ioan de Guzman* was published in 1589. Carlos Rollin's *Praeceptiones Rhetoricae* was published in 1744. Cipriano Soarez' *De Arte Rhetorica Libri Tres ex Aristotele* was published in 1621. The Jesuits created in Europe and later in America great universities cultivating the study of grammar, rhetoric, Latin and Greek, as well as elegant writing and speech. Mexican rhetoric is influenced by the Southern European sources of the emperors.⁴⁹² Social classes and estates based on distribution of economic surplus appropriated by the ruling class through tribute collection.⁴⁹³ Monarchy monopolized the legal use of violence, but ruled through provincial units of political organization that were based on

⁴⁹⁰ <[Http://www.parish-without-borders.net/afirstories.htm](http://www.parish-without-borders.net/afirstories.htm)>

⁴⁹¹ Abbott, Don Paul: *Rhetoric in the New World. Rhetorical Theory and Practice in Colonial Spanish America.* Columbia 1996.

⁴⁹² Cf.: Bucher, Irina. "Teoria de la Comunicación Intercultural: La Conquista. La Colonización y la Evangelización del Mexico Indígena." In: Zimmermann, Klaus ; Biermann, Christine (ed.): *Lenguaje y Comunicación Intercultural en el Mundo Hispánico.* Frankfurt am Main et al. 1997, pp. 51-68.

⁴⁹³ Cf.: Serra, Andre. *Antología de la Elocuencia Mexicana, 1900-1950.* Rojas 1950, pp. 67-72.

ethnic, religious, and economic specialization.⁴⁹⁴ The *Sociedad Mexicana de Oratoria y Literatura* is responsible for *oratoria* and *comunicación más* and defines *Retórica* as *arte del bien decir*. In North America the English literature influenced concepts of criticism. South America has employed several terms of specific forms of *criticismo* (criticism) related to this area. *Criticismo* has the following definitions in a Chilean English-Spanish dictionary:

1. *filos Sistema filosófico que considera a la epistemología como una disciplina filosófica independiente y fundamental, previa a cualquier otra.*

2. *filos Doctrina epistemológica de Kant.*⁴⁹⁵

Javier de Monserrat differentiated in *El Concepto de Criticismo en Teoría de la Ciencia* several forms of criticism:

1. *Criticismo realista: pensar critico científicamente consiste en hacerlo sometándose a una pauta ; significa hacerlo con un criterio, con una pauta, dicho criterio no puede ser sino la experiencia, la realidad, mas exactamente la realidad de la experiencia.*

2. *Criticismo fenomenico. El hombre sabe que tiene una experiencia de apariencia, parcial, fenomenica de lo real. La critica real de la ciencia es siempre critica de los fenómenos.*

3. *Criticismo conceptual. Significa pues, que la ciencia vive en la continua critica de sus propios conceptos y sistemas conceptuales para tratar de encontrar expresiones cada vez mas adecuadas de lo que objetivamente presenta la realidad.*

4. *Criticismo lingüístico. Dada la identidad entre pensamiento y lenguaje, el criticismo conceptual es, su vez, criticismo lingüístico. El criticismo conceptual, construcción o constitución critica de los sistemas de lenguaje de la ciencia, a través de la critica empírica de la realidad fenomenologica.*

5. *Criticismo estructural. Pensar critico estructuralmente es, primeramente constatar el conjunto de datos fenomenologicos con que la realidad se manifiesta y, en segundo lugar, trata de reducirlos a una imagen unitaria y suficiente, es decir, real.*

⁴⁹⁴ Kenno, Peggy; Lacy, Sondra. *Business Mexico: A Practical Guide to Understanding Mexican Business*. Lincolnwood, IL 1994, pp. 101-110.

Kras, E. S. *Management in Two Cultures: Bridging the Gap between U.S. and Mexican Managers*. Yarmouth, Maine 1988, pp. 141-144.

⁴⁹⁵ English-Spanish Dictionary. *Diccionarioweb*. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.diccionarioweb.org/d/ES-ES/criticismo](http://www.diccionarioweb.org/d/ES-ES/criticismo)>

6. *Criticismo Intersubjetivo. La crítica de la realidad realizada a niveles de instersubjetividad es el elemento critico valorador esencial para la corrección de las interpretaciones en sistemas conceptuales y lingüísticos.*⁴⁹⁶

Afranio Coutinho in *A Crítica Literária no Brasil* wrote regarding *crítica* of literature:

A década de 1950, na literatura brasileira, pode ser considerada como da crítica literária. É o momento em que se adquire a consciência exata do papel relevante da crítica em meio à criação literária e aos gêneros de literatura imaginativa, função da disciplina do espírito literário. Sem ser um gênero literário, mas uma atividade reflexiva de análise e julgamento da literatura, a crítica se aparenta com a filosofia e a ciência, embora não seja qualquer delas. É uma atividade autônoma, obediente a normas e critérios próprios do funcionamento, e detentora de uma posição específica no quadro da literatura.

O reconhecimento de tudo isso pode-se afirmar que se fixou naquela década, sob forma tão aguda e profunda que justifica para ela a denominação de a década crítica, pela descoberta de sua autonomia e cunho técnico.

*Essa época é uma réplica a outra, de grande importância na história brasileira, a iniciada em 1870 com a geração naturalista, a cujo trabalhos devem os estudos literários no Brasil a maioria dos padrões predominantes a partir de então e só postos em cheque nos últimos quinze anos.*⁴⁹⁷

The main critical social influence of biblical studies of Catholicism came from the idea of ‘liberation theology’ in South America. Miguez stated in *Latin American Reading of the Bible. Experiences, Challenges and its Practice*:

This article is a brief and unpretentious survey of the historical development of biblical interpretation in Latin America in the last part of the XXth. Century, in order to help the reader tounder stand its present context. A liberating interpretation of Scriptures could not be fundamentalist of any one given location, or naïve in its appropriation of the text. A

⁴⁹⁶ Monserrat, Javier de. El Concepto de Criticismo en Teoría de la Ciencia. University Sabana. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://sabanet.unisabana.edu.co/ingenieria/agroindustrial/1semestre/exp_com/5pensamiento/temas/complementarias/06elconcepto.htm](http://sabanet.unisabana.edu.co/ingenieria/agroindustrial/1semestre/exp_com/5pensamiento/temas/complementarias/06elconcepto.htm)>

⁴⁹⁷ Coutinho, Afranio. “A Crítica Literária no Brasil”. In: Revista Interamericana de Bibliografía. Washington.

Vol.XIV, nº 2 (1964). Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://acd.ufrj.br/pacc/literaria/nobrasil.html](http://acd.ufrj.br/pacc/literaria/nobrasil.html)>

*liberationist hermeneutics must also be self-critical, give account of the complexities and contradictions within the text as well as in the reading community. From a "liberationist canon" to a "canonical liberation".*⁴⁹⁸

Literature and media serve here as forms for the expression of criticism. Social and media criticism is related to the relation between the media and the institutions in the country. Mostly it is reflecting the media themselves by means of the media. The Latin American media are both unregulated and highly controlled. Governmental censorship quickly became the norm in Latin American broadcasting.⁴⁹⁹ Resistance is here a term that used to be associated with criticism. Ângela Maria Dias wrote in *A Possibilidade do Criticismo Hoje: Intelectuais, Mídia e Políticas Culturais no Brasil*:

*Ao contrário, a resistência crítica, ao encarar a Literatura como o lugar de exercício da "consciência dramática da linguagem", onde se consoma a incurável dissonância entre consciência e realidade, pode, sem enredar-se em ultrapassados absolutismos essencialistas, recuperar um indispensável horizonte universalista inerente à radicalidade da arte como "experiência de limites" e "momento de intensidade semântica e formal". Nesta direção, por sinal, Lyotard desenvolve, na "resistência imediata ao "totalitarismo presente", uma reflexão sobre a arte moderna a partir da estética kantiana do sublime — quando a considera consagrada à alusão do "impresentificável" através de "presentificações" visíveis — numa espécie de "retração do real", hostil às boas formas do realismo pictórico e narrativo da indústria cultural.*⁵⁰⁰

In Brazilian *REP - Revista de Economia Política* the following was written in 2005 on the reactions of *neoliberal criticism*:

⁴⁹⁸ Miguez, Nestor O. Latin American Reading of the Bible. Experiences, Challenges and its Practice. Instituto Universitario ISEDET. Buenos Aires, Argentina. Febr. 18, 2005.

<http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?pid=S0102-69092000000300002&script=sci_arttext&tlng=pt 22>

⁴⁹⁹ Haase, Fee-Alexandra. "Censura und recensio. Zensur und Rezension. Begriffe in Kuensten und Wissenschaften aus der Antike in Deutschland von der spaeten Neuzeit zum Medienzeitalter des Internets fuer die Beurteilung von Literatur." Fachpublikationen. Febr. 18, 2005.

<<http://www.Fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/24>>

⁵⁰⁰ Dias, Ângela Maria. *A Possibilidade do Criticismo Hoje: Intelectuais, Mídia e Políticas Culturais no Brasil*. PACC. May 29, 2007.

<http://www.pacc.ufrj.br/ciec/publicacoes/papeisavulsos/papeisavulsos54_1.html>

*The present wave of privatization and the relative success of the neoliberal criticism against the economic role of the state are part of the cyclical character of state intervention. We are now in the downturn of the cycle. During the upturn state intervention, measured in terms of nationalization's and increase in regulation, is initially successful, but after some time it runs in increasing distortions. The crisis and the criticism that come with the distortions lead to a reduction and particularly to a change in the pattern of state intervention. But never to a return to l'Etat gendarme dreamed by neoliberals.*⁵⁰¹

Some forms of criticism derived from the local culture. *Dance criticism* is a form of criticism related to local South American culture in Brazil. In an interview with Roberto Pereira Relache Casa Hoffmann asked:

C.H.: When did dance criticism start in Brazil?

*R.P.: It's difficult to say when it started, but certainly the twentieth century represented the construction of a dance tradition in the country, through the first official dance institute in the city of Rio de Janeiro, in 1927, and later with the creation of a company. The development of a public and of a specialized dance critic gains strength at this moment.*⁵⁰²

Argentina is an example for South American philosophical criticism keeping distance to European influence. In *The Problem on Criticism* Mirta A. Giacaglia made the statement that criticism evolved between the Western cultural tradition of reasoning and *a fresh perspective to reflect upon the category of criticism* in the country:

The crisis of enlightened reason and its effects opens up a new horizon that calls for a rethink of the idea of criticism. A certain way of looking upon criticism was that which was in correspondence with the ruling of the metaphysics of presence, characterized by the imperialism of Western reason, the turning to ultimate reasons and principles, the primacy of an autonomous and free cognizant subject, the idea of Being as full presence, of truth a sad

⁵⁰¹ Anonymus. Article. REP - Revista de Economia Politica. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.rep.org.br/pesquisar3.asp?id=365](http://www.rep.org.br/pesquisar3.asp?id=365)>

⁵⁰² Hoffmann, Casa. Interview with Roberto Pereira Relache. Revista Electronica da Casa Hoffmann. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.fcddigital.com.br/relache/05_edicoes/ed01_entrevista_roberto/roberto_interview.doc](http://www.fcddigital.com.br/relache/05_edicoes/ed01_entrevista_roberto/roberto_interview.doc)>

equacy and of wholeness, fixity and permanency of structures. Today, historicity, contingency, antiesencialism and the lack of an ultimate grounding, open up a fresh perspective to reflect upon the category of criticism. Some of the most important issues of contemporary philosophy (" the inevitability of the hermeneutic circle, the impossibility of a neutral location for theory, the turning of all theory to its historical horizons of emergence, the constituting presence of pre-judgement in scientific and ethic statements, the critique of the idea of objectivity, etc" 1) guide us in the attempt to constitute a new conception of criticism, on the basis of the critique of the very idea of it. Criticism, understood from an ethimological perspective as the capacity to judge a decide according to rules, is an eminently modern issue that sends us back to the kantian"sapere aude! ", beyond the limits in which this remains caught.⁵⁰³

In *A Note in Reply to Joachim Hirsch* John Holloway made the statement using for the situation of criticism in Argentina the term *negative, corrosive, infernal movement of theory*:

I take my stance in the printing house of hell. Joachim Hirsch does not. That is the difference between us. In the printing house of hell, according to William Blake, the devils print "in the infernal method, using corrosives, which in Hell are salutary and medicinal, melting apparent surfaces away, and displaying the infinite which was hid". (Blake 1793/1988, 39) The Scream with which my book starts is a scream from hell. It introduces a negative grammar, a theoretical movement-against which aims to corrode, to destroy "all relations in which man is a debased, enslaved, forsaken, despicable being" (MECW 3, 182): this, with the aim of displaying the infinite which was hid, the social power of human doing. The movement of theory is negative, corrosive, destructive. Marx is an acid which destroys all fixed concepts, never-endingly. In a society which is based on the negation of the social power of human doing, any theory which aims to affirm that creative social power can only be negative, negating the negation of our social doing. The negative, corrosive, infernal movement of theory is at the same time the theoretical emancipation of human doing. The melting away of the apparent (fetishised) surfaces is immediately and directly the displaying of the infinite which was hid (the creative power of social doing). There is no middle term between corrosion and displaying the infinite.⁵⁰⁴

⁵⁰³ Mirta A. Giacaglia. The Problem on Criticism. Universidad Nacional de Entre Rios. Febr. 18, 2005.

<[Http://www.fc.edu.uner.edu.ar/Theproblemofcriticism.pdf](http://www.fc.edu.uner.edu.ar/Theproblemofcriticism.pdf).>

⁵⁰⁴ Holloway, John. A Note in Reply to Joachim Hirsch. Writing from Hell. Corrosive Criticism. Herramienta. Febr. 18, 2005.

The Brazilian educationalist Paulo Freire has developed a theory on thinking about progressive practice in his *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Freire in *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* differentiated between dialogics and dialogue and antialogics and dialogics as matrices of opposing theories of cultural action: the former as an instrument of oppression and the latter as an instrument of liberation. His theory of antialogical action and its characteristics consists of conquest, divide, and rule, manipulation, and cultural invasion, while the theory of dialogical action and its characteristics contains values such as cooperation, unity, organization, and cultural synthesis. Mazzola stated:

*What Paulo Freire called critical literacy is another helpful tool for political analysis. Friere, a Brazilian educator, found that literacy involves more than signing one's name (signatory literacy). It also involves more than being able to read a message, write a check, count change, decipher a bus schedule, or follow traffic signs (functional literacy). It also involves more than being able to read and understand the key texts of a particular society (cultural literacy).*⁵⁰⁵

Garcia Marquez said in *The Solitude of Latin America* in his Nobel Prize Lecture, 8 December 1982:

*Our independence from Spanish domination did not put us beyond the reach of madness. General Antonio López de Santana, three times dictator of Mexico, held a magnificent funeral for the right leg he had lost in the so-called Pastry War. General Gabriel García Moreno ruled Ecuador for sixteen years as an absolute monarch;*⁵⁰⁶

In *La Crítica de la Crítica y la Movilidad de Sus Funciones* Giraldo stated that when criticism approaches a series of problems related with legitimacy, statue and methodologies, the need of a 'criticism of criticism' should be considered consisting of 'programmatic reflection' and 'theorizing in the bosom of discourses':

<[Http://www.herramienta.com.ar/print.php?sid=103](http://www.herramienta.com.ar/print.php?sid=103)>

⁵⁰⁵ Mazzola, Lars Charles. *The Art of Criticism*. World Prout Assembly. May 28, 2007.

<[Http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html](http://www.worldproutassembly.org/archives/2007/03/the_art_of_crit.html)>

⁵⁰⁶ <[Http://www.themodernword.com/gabo/gabo_nobel.html](http://www.themodernword.com/gabo/gabo_nobel.html)>

*En momentos en que la crítica aborda una serie de problemas relacionados con su legitimidad, estatuto y metodologías, vale la pena considerar la necesidad de una crítica de la crítica (esa especial tendencia de análisis, resultante de la reflexión programática y de la teorización en el seno de los discursos que tratan sobre el arte) caracterizada por una especial vocación autotélica y autorreflexiva. Bien sea como búsqueda teórica o aclaración de sus funciones, este volverse sobre sí mismo se convierte en el sino particular de un ejercicio demandado por nuestra realidad cultural.*⁵⁰⁷

George Yúdice's article *The Funkification of Rio. A Política Cultural do Funk Carioca* exemplifies the influence of culture as a form of criticism:

*Para estes, obras de arte são dispositivos heurísticos através dos quais o crítico ganha um conhecimento da realidade social, que é inacessível de outro modo. Os funkeiros não precisam que a crítica cultural lhes diga como sua realidade social está estruturada: eles sabem muito bem e utilizam este conhecimento para atingir seus objetivos.*⁵⁰⁸

Víctor Mendoza wrote in *Hermenéutica Crítica* on Latin American critical thinking (*pensamiento crítico latinoamericano*):

*El pensamiento crítico latinoamericano, contribuyó seriamente a la reformulación de los resultados que los hermeneutas europeos habían realizado, poniendo al interior la hermenéutica, la generación de una interpretación crítica- transformadora, en ésta el trabajo de interpretación, no sólo contiene un interés, sintáctico, semántico, pragmático o emancipatorio, también se inscribe como significativo, el interés transformador que se gesta desde la realidad de exclusión de las víctimas que producen interpretaciones "negativas" sobre el resultado de los efectos no intencionales del sistema mundo, para articularse dialécticamente a la transformación de la realidad, este presupuesto axiomático contienen modalidades distintas de la hermenéutica, producidas en Estados Unidos y en Europa.*⁵⁰⁹

⁵⁰⁷ Giraldo, Efrén A. La Crítica de la Crítica y la Movilidad de Sus Funciones. Revista Co-Herencia N° 2. Universidad EAFIT. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.eafit.edu.co/EafitCn/Revistas/co-herencia/Ediciones/2/Index.htm](http://www.eafit.edu.co/EafitCn/Revistas/co-herencia/Ediciones/2/Index.htm)>

⁵⁰⁸ Yúdice, George. The Funkification of Rio. A Política Cultural do Funk Carioca. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://eamusica.blogspot.com/2007/01/ydica-funkification-of-rio-poltica.html](http://eamusica.blogspot.com/2007/01/ydica-funkification-of-rio-poltica.html)>

⁵⁰⁹ Mendoza Martínez, Víctor Manuel. Hermenéutica Crítica. Razonypalabra. Número 34. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.razonypalabra.org.mx/anteriores/n34/vmendoza.html](http://www.razonypalabra.org.mx/anteriores/n34/vmendoza.html)>

Mendoza's *Modelos Hermenéutica* are:

Hermenéutica Jurídica

Hermenéutica Crítica

Hermenéutica Teológica

Other models are:

El Modelo Filológico

Modelo Hermenéutico Crítico

Regarding *Hermenéutica Crítica* Mendoza stated:

*Con el contexto de mediación crítica interpretativa expuesto y su inclusión en todas las relaciones humanas, estamos dando un paso significativo hacia la crítica a los actos de habla con pretensiones de univocidad represiva y su resguardo por el sentido de un mundo hegemónico.*⁵¹⁰

Henry Seidel Canby wrote in 1924: "It is impossible to understand the development of American criticism without a true view of American history. Culturally, socially, and to a less extent politically there have been from the eighteenth century onward two Americas." Seidel Canby understood here the East as part influenced by Europe and the West as influenced by a global population.⁵¹¹ According to the survey *American Literary Criticism in the Nineteenth Century* criticism and critical theory in the U.S. did not fully establish itself until early in the 19th century. Colonial critical theory was "initially associated with 18th-century thought, but soon thereafter began to embrace European Romanticism". Dissatisfaction with dependence upon the literature and theories of England would engender the most prominent features of American critical theory: "the insistence on a literature that was uniquely American" and one

⁵¹⁰ Mendoza Martínez, Víctor Manuel. *Hermenéutica Crítica*. Razonypalabra. Número 34. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.razonypalabra.org.mx/anteriores/n34/vmendoza.html](http://www.razonypalabra.org.mx/anteriores/n34/vmendoza.html)>

⁵¹¹ Seidel Canby, Henry. National Council of Teachers of English. *The Status of American Criticism*. In: *The English Journal*, Vol. 13, No. 10 (Dec., 1924), pp. 705-709. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.blesok.com.mk/tekst.asp?lang=eng&tekst=111](http://www.blesok.com.mk/tekst.asp?lang=eng&tekst=111)>

“that reflected the country's democratic principles”.⁵¹² The U.S. and Canada are culturally diverse societies. These diverse sources influenced current literary theory, criticism, and practice.⁵¹³ 21st century U.S.-American dictionaries employ a variety of definitions for criticism and critic. Wander wrote in *The Ideological Turn in Modern Criticism on multicultural criticism*: “If critical theory in the United States had New Criticism for its 50s and 60s, structuralism and post-structuralism in its 70s, and a “return to history” in the New Historicism in the 80s, Multicultural criticism may be the dominant critical mode of the 1990s. An ideological criticism repeating (and inspired by) many of the moves of Marxist and feminist criticism, multicultural criticism sets out to “de-center” the literature of European (particularly British) and American colonialism and domination in an attempt to reopen for indigenous voice(s) the subjects, languages and traditions of colonized peoples”.⁵¹⁴

Now, let’s look at standard dictionaries used in the U.S. in the 20th and 21st century that demonstrate the change of meanings in this culture in the 21st century. Following the *Webster Dictionary* published in the year 1913 *criticism* is defined as follows:

1. *The rules and principles which regulate the practice of the critic; the art of judging with knowledge and propriety of the beauties and faults of a literary performance, or of a production in the fine arts; as, dramatic criticism.*

The elements of criticism depend on the two principles of Beauty and Truth, one of which is the final end or object of study in every one of its pursuits: Beauty, in letters and the arts; Truth, in history and sciences. Brande & C.

By criticism, as it was first instituted by Aristotle, was meant a standard of judging well. Dryden.

2. *The act of criticising; a critical judgment passed or expressed; a critical observation or detailed examination*

⁵¹² American Literary Criticism in the Nineteenth Century.Enotes. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.enotes.com/nineteenth-century-criticism/american-literary-criticism-nineteenth-century](http://www.enotes.com/nineteenth-century-criticism/american-literary-criticism-nineteenth-century)>

⁵¹³ See also chapter 2.3.6 “Der Begriff criticism für die Kritik in England und Amerika im 20. Jahrhundert”. In: Haase, Fee-Alexandra. *Kritik. Historische Begriffe der Sprache und Literatur einer Wissenschaft und Kunst von der Antike bis zum 20. Jahrhundert*. Fachpublikationen. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/](http://www.fachpublikationen.de/dokumente/01/1a/)>

⁵¹⁴ Wander, Philip. *The Ideological Turn in Modern Criticism*. Northeastern Illinois University. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.neiu.edu/~edepartm/dep/profs/scherm/html/multicult.htm](http://www.neiu.edu/~edepartm/dep/profs/scherm/html/multicult.htm)>

*and review; a critique; animadversion; censure.*⁵¹⁵

In *Roget's International Thesaurus* (1922) *criticism* is listed among the *Words Relating to the Sentient and Moral Powers*. The noun 'detraction' and the verb 'detract' have the synonyms "derogate, decry, depreciate, disparage, run down, cry down; back-cap [U. S.], belittle, pessimize, sneer at (contemn), criticize, pull to pieces, pick a hole in one's coat, asperse, cast aspersions, blow upon, bespatter, blacken, vilify, vilipend, avile, give a dog a bad name, brand, malign; backbite, libel, lampoon, traduce, slander, defame, calumniate, bear false witness against; speak ill of behind one's back."⁵¹⁶

According to *Wordsmyth* criticism is:

1. *the act of making judgments or criticizing.*
2. *the result of such an act.*
3. *the art of making skilled and detailed observations on literary, artistic, or scholarly works.*
4. *an unfavorable or negative judgment or evaluation.*⁵¹⁷

As defined by *Wordsmyth* a critic is:

1. *anyone who judges or evaluates.*
2. *a person whose work is to write evaluations of literary, artistic, or other cultural works.*
3. *one who tends to criticize and find faults.*⁵¹⁸

The *American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language* (2000) defines *criticism* as:

1. *The act of criticizing, especially adversely.*
2. *A critical comment or judgment.*

⁵¹⁵ Webster Dictionary (1913). University Chicago. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://machaut.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/WEBSTER.sh?WORD=criticism](http://machaut.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/WEBSTER.sh?WORD=criticism)>

⁵¹⁶ Roget's International Thesaurus (1922). Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.bartleby.com/110/934.html](http://www.bartleby.com/110/934.html)>

⁵¹⁷ 'Criticism'. Wordsmyth. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordsmyth.net/live/home.php?script=search&matchent=criticism&matchtype=exact](http://www.wordsmyth.net/live/home.php?script=search&matchent=criticism&matchtype=exact)>

⁵¹⁸ 'Critic'. Wordsmyth. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.wordsmyth.net/live/home.php?script=search&matchent=critic&matchtype=exact](http://www.wordsmyth.net/live/home.php?script=search&matchent=critic&matchtype=exact)>

3a. *The practice of analyzing, classifying, interpreting, or evaluating literary or other artistic works.*

b. *A critical article or essay; a critique.*

c. *The investigation of the origin and history of literary documents; textual criticism.*⁵¹⁹

The *American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language* (2000) defines a critic as:

1. *One who forms and expresses judgments of the merits, faults, value, or truth of a matter.*

2. *One who specializes especially professionally in the evaluation and appreciation of literary or artistic works:*

a film critic; a dance critic.

3. *One who tends to make harsh or carping judgments; a faultfinder.*⁵²⁰

Following *Roget's II: The New Thesaurus* (1995) criticism is defined as follows:

1. *A comment expressing fault: blame, censure, condemnation, denunciation, reprehension, reprobation.*

Informal : pan. Slang : knock.

2. *Evaluative and critical discourse: critique, notice, review.*⁵²¹

In the *American Heritage Dictionary* a critic has three meanings: One who forms and expresses judgments of the merits, faults, value, or truth of a matter. One who specializes especially professionally in the evaluation and appreciation of literary or artistic works: a film critic; a dance critic. One who tends to make harsh or carping judgments; a faultfinder.⁵²²

Following the *Columbia Guide to Standard American English* (1993) the words *criticize* and *criticism* retain their primary senses having to do with evenhanded evaluation and judging.

⁵¹⁹ The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition. Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007.
<[Http://www.bartleby.com/61/30/C0753000.html](http://www.bartleby.com/61/30/C0753000.html)>

⁵²⁰ The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition. Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007.
<[Http://www.bartleby.com/61/20/C0752000.html](http://www.bartleby.com/61/20/C0752000.html)>

⁵²¹ *Roget's II: The New Thesaurus*. Third Edition. Bartleby. May 20, 2007.
<[Http://www.bartleby.com/62/62/C0356200.html](http://www.bartleby.com/62/62/C0356200.html)>

⁵²² The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition. Published by the Houghton Mifflin Company. Bartleby. June 5, 2007.
<[Http://www.bartleby.com/61/20/C0752000.html](http://www.bartleby.com/61/20/C0752000.html)>

But far more prevalent are the pejorative senses of ‘judging unfavorably’ and of ‘finding fault.’⁵²³

In the North American edition of the *Encarta World English Dictionary* a critic is defined as follows:

1. *somebody judging something: somebody who judges or appraises somebody or something an eminent critic of postwar government*
2. *writer of reviews: somebody, especially a journalist, who writes or broadcasts opinions on the quality of things such as drama productions, art exhibitions, literary works, and society as a whole the newspaper's TV critic*
3. *fault-finder: somebody who habitually finds fault*⁵²⁴

In *Encarta World English Dictionary* criticism is defined as follows:

1. *act of criticizing: a spoken or written opinion or judgment of what is wrong or bad about somebody or something*
2. *disapproval: spoken or written opinions that point out one or more faults of somebody or something*
3. *assessment of creative work: considered judgment of or discussion about the qualities of something, especially a creative work*
4. *media*⁵²⁵

In opposition to the *Encarta World English Dictionary* in the *Collaborative International Dictionary of English* a critic is defined as follows:

⁵²³ Columbia Guide to Standard American English (1993). Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007.

<[Http://www.bartleby.com/68/68/1568.html](http://www.bartleby.com/68/68/1568.html)>

⁵²⁴ Encarta World English Dictionary [North American Edition]. The DICT Development Group. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict](http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict)>

⁵²⁵ Encarta World English Dictionary [North American Edition]. The DICT Development Group. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict](http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict)>

1. *One skilled in judging of the merits of literary or artistic works; a connoisseur; an adept; hence, one who*

examines literary or artistic works, etc., and passes judgment upon them; a reviewer.

2. *One who passes a rigorous or captious judgment; one who censures or finds fault; a harsh examiner or judge;*

a caviler; a carper.

3. *The art of criticism.*

4. *An act of criticism; a critique.*⁵²⁶

In *The Collaborative International Dictionary of English* criticism is:

1. *The rules and principles which regulate the practice of the critic; the art of judging with knowledge and*

propriety of the beauties and faults of a literary performance, or of a production in the fine arts; as,

dramatic criticism.

2. *The act of criticising; a critical judgment passed or expressed; a critical observation or detailed examination*

*and review; a critique; animadversion; censure.*⁵²⁷

The *Canadian Encyclopedia* stated that serious theatre criticism did not begin to emerge in cities such as Toronto and Halifax until the late 1820s because the infrequency of theatrical performances in colonial Canada did not warrant it.⁵²⁸ The *Canadian Encyclopedia* mentions in its entry *Literature in English: Theory and Criticism* Samuel Taylor Coleridge, a principal source of modern literary theory in English, who “made little direct impression in 19th-

⁵²⁶ Collaborative International Dictionary of English. The DICT Development Group. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict](http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict)>

⁵²⁷ Collaborative International Dictionary of English. The DICT Development Group. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict](http://www.dict.org/bin/Dict)>

⁵²⁸ ‘Criticism’. The Canadian Encyclopedia. Historica Foundation of Canada. May 20, 2007

<[Http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1](http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1)>

century Canada”.⁵²⁹ Following the *Canadian Encyclopedia* no French-language literary critic in Canada seems to have stature among writers equal to that of Bayle, Sainte-Beuve or Barthes in France. According to *Canadian Encyclopedia* the first substantial publication devoted to French Canadian literature was James Huston's *Répertoire national* (1848-50).⁵³⁰ The entry *Art Writing and Criticism* from *The Canadian Encyclopedia* mentions that “*art writing and criticism date for the most part from the 1950s. A distinction must be made between art criticism, which is a qualitative judgment of works of art, and the philosophy of art, which is concerned with interpreting*”.⁵³¹

The following text shows how criticism in the U.S. was a part of the separation from the European colonial powers and their culture. In *The American Crisis* Thomas Paine 1780 wrote upon the liberation of the U.S. from Great Britain and its independence:

These are the times that try men's souls. The summer soldier and the sunshine patriot will, in this crisis, shrink from the service of their country; but he that stands it now, deserves the love and thanks of man and woman. Tyranny, like hell, is not easily conquered; yet we have this consolation with us, that the harder the conflict, the more glorious the triumph. What we obtain too cheap, we esteem too lightly: it is dearness only that gives every thing its value. Heaven knows how to put a proper price upon its goods; and it would be strange indeed if so celestial an article as freedom not be highly rated. Britain, with an army to enforce her tyranny, has declared that she has a right (not only to tax but "to bind us in all cases whatsoever," and if being bound in that manner, is not slavery, then is there not such a thing as slavery upon earth. Even the expression is impious; for so unlimited a power can belong only to God.

Whether the independence of the continent was declared too soon, or delayed too long, I will not now enter into as an argument; my own simple opinion is, that had it been eight months earlier, it would have been much better. We did not make a proper use of last winter, neither could we, while we were in a dependent state. However, the fault, if it were one, was all our

⁵²⁹ ‘Criticism’. The Canadian Encyclopedia. Historica Foundation of Canada. May 20, 2007
<[Http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1](http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1)>

⁵³⁰ ‘Criticism’. The Canadian Encyclopedia. Historica Foundation of Canada. May 20, 2007
<[Http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1](http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1)>

⁵³¹ ‘Art writing and criticism’. The Canadian Encyclopedia. Historica Foundation of Canada. May 20, 2007
<[Http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1](http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/index.cfm?PgNm=TCESearch&Params=A1)>

own*⁵³²; we have none to blame but ourselves. But no great deal is lost yet. All that Howe has been doing for this month past, is rather a ravage than a conquest, which the spirit of the Jerseys, a year ago, would have quickly repulsed, and which time and a little resolution will soon recover.⁵³²

Asa Mahan (1799-1889) in *A Critical History of Philosophy* wrote about the conditions of the reformation of the sciences in the U.S. still relaying on European philosophy:

What is denominated the Modern Evolution in Philosophy begins with Sir Francis Bacon (1561-1636), who is regarded as the author of the inductive method in science. To comprehend the Evolution under consideration, we must attain to a clear and distinct understanding of the true idea of science, on the one hand, and of the method in science really developed by Bacon on the other. 'The sciences,' says Bacon, 'have hitherto been in a most sad condition. Philosophy, wasted in empty and fruitless logomachies, has failed during so many centuries to bring out a single work or experiment of actual benefit to human life. Logic hitherto has served more to the establishment of error than to the investigation of truth. Whence all this? Why this penury of the sciences? Simply because they have broken away from their root in nature and experience. The blame of this is chargeable to many sources; first, the old and rooted prejudice that the human mind loses somewhat of its dignity when it busies itself much and continuously with experiments and material things; next, superstition and blind religious zeal, which has been the most irreconcilable opposer to Natural Philosophy; again, the exclusive attention paid to morals and politics by the Romans, and since the Christian Era to theology by every acute mind; still farther, the great authority which certain philosophers have professed, and the great reverence given to antiquity; and, in fine, a want of courage and a despair of overcoming the many and great difficulties which lie in the way of the investigation of nature. All these causes have contributed to keep down the sciences. Hence they must now be renewed and regenerated and reformed in their most fundamental principles; there must be found a new basis of knowledge and new principles of science. This radical reformation of the sciences depends on two conditions; objectively upon the referring of science to experience and the Philosophy of nature, and subjectively upon the purifying the sense and the intellect from all abstract theories and traditional prejudices. Both

⁵³² Paine, Thomas. *The American Crisis*. Infomotions. Febr. 18, 2005.

<<http://www.infomotions.com/etexts/philosophy/1700-1799/paine-american-397.txt>>

*conditions furnish the correct method of natural science, which is nothing other than the method of induction. Upon a true induction depends all the soundness of the sciences.*⁵³³

Henry Seidel Canby was editor of *The Literary Review of The New York Evening Post* and a member of the *English Department of Yale University*. Seidel Canby wrote in *On Fiction Sentimental America*:

It is highly popular in France, although the excellent taste of French criticism keeps it in check. Italian popular literature exudes sentiment; and the sale of "squashy" fiction in England is said to be threatened only by an occasional importation of an American "best-seller." We have no bad eminence here. Sentimentalists with enlarged hearts are international in habitat, although, it must be admitted, especially popular in America. When a critic, after a course in American novels and magazines, declares that life, as it appears on the printed page here, is fundamentally sentimentalized, he goes much deeper than "mushiness" with his charge.

[...]

I am not touching in this picture merely to attack it. It has been abundantly attacked; what it needs is definition. For there is much in this bourgeois, good-humored American literature of ours which rings true, which is as honest an expression of our individuality as was the more austere product of antebellum New England. If American sentimentality does invite criticism, American sentiment deserves defense.

*If one reduces this imperfect sketch of existing conditions to terms of literary criticism, the result is interesting. There are two great schools of criticism: the judicial and the impressionistic. The judicial critic--a Boileau, a Matthew Arnold--bases his criticism upon fundamental principles. The impressionistic critic follows the now hackneyed advice of Anatole France, to let his soul adventure among masterpieces, and seeks the reaction for good or bad of a given work upon his own finely strung mind. The first group must be sure of the breadth, the soundness, and the just application of their principles. The second group must depend upon their own good taste.*⁵³⁴

⁵³³ Mahan, Asa. A Critical History of Philosophy. Febr. 18, 2005.

http://www.truthinheart.com/Asa_Mahan.html

⁵³⁴ Henry Seidel Canby. Definitions. The Project Gutenberg EBook. May 20, 2007.

<http://www.gutenberg.org/dirs/etext04/dfn10.txt>

In the English colonies of U.S. North America, the concept of a free press was born. In the U.S. the lack of monarchy is one reason for the strong tradition in democratic oratory. The use of criticism resulted in different and often opposite estimations of the Bible and methods to approach it. In *The Age Of Reason* (Part II) Thomas Paine wrote that “this book, the *Bible*, is even too ridiculous for criticism.”⁵³⁵ In *Fallacies of the Higher Criticism* the Cumberland Presbyterian Minister Franklin Johnson (1852-1925) wrote against critical methods such as *higher criticism* of biblical studies:

The errors of the higher criticism of which I shall write pertain to its very substance. Those (if a secondary character the limits of my space forbid me to consider. My discussion might be greatly expanded by additional masses of illustrative material, and hence I close it with a list of books which I recommend to persons who may wish to pursue the subject further.)

Definition of "the higher criticism." As an introduction to the fundamental fallacies of the higher criticism, let me state what the higher criticism is, and then what the higher critics tell us they have achieved. The name "the higher criticism" was coined by Eichhorn, who lived from 1752 to 1827. Zenos, after careful consideration, adopts the definition of the name given by its author: "The discovery and verification of the facts regarding the origin, form and value of literary productions upon the basis of their internal characters." The higher critics are not blind to some other sources of argument. They refer to history where they can gain any polemic advantage by doing so. The background of the entire picture which they bring to us is the assumption that the hypothesis of evolution is true. But after all their chief appeal is to the supposed evidence of the documents themselves. Other names for the movement have been sought. It has been called the "historic view," on the assumption that it represents the real history of the Hebrew people as it must have unfolded itself by the orderly processes of human evolution. "The Elements of the Higher Criticism." But, as the higher critics contradict the testimony of all the Hebrew historic documents which profess to be early, their theory might better, be called the "unhistoric view." The Higher Criticism has sometimes been called the "documentary hypothesis." But as all schools of criticism and all doctrines of inspiration are equally hospitable to the supposition that the biblical writers may have consulted documents, and may have quoted them, the Higher Criticism has no special right to this title. We must fall back, therefore, upon the name "the higher criticism" as the very best at our

⁵³⁵ Paine, Thomas. *Age Of Reason*. Part II. Footnote 18. The Secular Web. May 29, 2007.

<http://www.infidels.org/library/historical/thomas_paine/age_of_reason/part2.html>

disposal, and upon the definition of it as chiefly an inspection of literary productions in order to ascertain their dates, their authors, and their value, as they themselves, interpreted in the light of the hypothesis of evolution, may yield the evidence.

Johnson speaks about the ‘assured results’ of *higher critics* as a ‘destructive protest’ mainly from Germany and Great Britain:

I turn now to ask what the higher critics profess to have found out by this method of study. The "assured results" on which they congratulate themselves are stated variously. In this country and England they commonly assume a form less radical than that given them in Germany, though sufficiently startling and destructive to arouse vigorous protest and a vigorous demand for the evidences, which, as we shall see, have not been produced and cannot be produced. The less startling form of the "assured results" usually announced in England and America may be owing to the brighter light of Christianity in these countries. Yet it should be noticed that There are higher critics in this country and England who go beyond the principal German representatives of the school in their zeal for the dethronement of the Old Testament and the New Testament, in so far as these' holy books are presented to the world as the very Word of God, as a special revelation from heaven.⁵³⁶

In American colleges of the 18th century discourse was classified according to its use by clergymen, lawyers, or politicians. Robert Harris noticed in *A Handbook of Rhetorical Devices* about style:

While style is probably best learned through wide reading, comprehensive analysis and thorough practice, much can be discovered about effective writing through the study of some of the common and traditional devices of style and arrangement. By learning, practicing, altering, and perfecting them, and by testing their effects and nuances for yourself, these devices will help you to express yourself better and also teach you to see the interrelatedness of form and meaning, and the psychology of syntax, metaphor, and diction both in your own writing and in the works of others.⁵³⁷

⁵³⁶ Johnson, Franklin. Fallacies of the Higher Criticism. Nov. 17, 2005.

<http://www.xmission.com/~fidelis/volume1/chapter3/johnson.html>

⁵³⁷ Harris, Robert A. A Handbook of Rhetorical Devices. VirtualSalt. Nov. 15, 2005.

<http://www.virtualsalt.com/rhetoric.htm>

William Spalding writes in his contribution to the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* on rhetoric:

*Our general plan to the Systematic portion of Rhetoric now presents to us its Second Division, which treats of what the ancients called Disposition, or the Arrangement of the several Parts of Discourse. This department of the inquiry, a favourite one with the classical rhetorians, especially those of the later ages, has, in modern systems of the art, seldom received a place as a distinct branch, and has, indeed, been generally overlooked altogether; but the consideration of its suggests illustrations of the laws of eloquence, which claim for it some attention at least, although we shall not be tempted to dwell long upon it.*⁵³⁸

John Crowe Ransom's *New Criticism* (1941) named the U.S.-movement New Criticism. Criticism in the U.S. is part of the philosophical area and economy next to linguistic and philological studies in academia based upon European traditions. New Criticism since the 1920's was an approach to literature, which was developed by a group of U.S.-American critics. Most of them taught at southern universities during the years following the World War I. New Criticism emerged in the early 20th century in response to a combination of both political and cultural developments. New Critics expected to isolate the object of their work and the object of the activity of criticism is the text itself and not its historical context. The *American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language* (2000) defines *New Criticism* as follows:

*A method of literary evaluation and interpretation practiced chiefly in the mid-20th century that emphasizes close examination of a text with minimum regard for the biographical or historical circumstances in which it was produced.*⁵³⁹

In *Introduction to Literature* Michael Delahoyde stated regarding New Criticism:

New Criticism emphasizes explication, or "close reading," of "the work itself." It rejects old historicism's attention to biographical and sociological matters. Instead, the objective

⁵³⁸ Moir, George; Spalding, William. *Treasures on Poetry, Modern Romance, and Rhetoric*. With a New Introduction by John Vadimir Price. Roulledge 1995. P. 341.

⁵³⁹ The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition. Bartleby.com. May 20, 2007. <[Http://www.bartleby.com/61/88/N0078800.html](http://www.bartleby.com/61/88/N0078800.html)>

determination as to "how a piece works" can be found through close focus and analysis, rather than through extraneous and erudite special knowledge. It has long been the pervasive and standard approach to literature in college and high school curricula.⁵⁴⁰

In 1922 in *Rhetoric and Poetry in the Renaissance. A Study of Rhetorical Terms in English Renaissance Literary Criticism* Donald Lemen Clark from Columbia University wrote in the Preface:

*In this essay I undertake to trace the influence of classical rhetoric on the criticisms of poetry published in England between 1553 and 1641. This influence is most readily recognized in the use by English renaissance writers on literary criticism of the terminology of classical rhetoric. But the rhetorical terminology in most cases carried with it rhetorical thinking, traces of whose influence persist in criticism of poetry to the present day.*⁵⁴¹

Ransom's *The New Criticism* provided the name for the influential mid-20th-century school of criticism. In *The Future of Poetry* Ransom wrote:

*The arts generally have had to recognize Modernism-how should poetry escape? And yet what is Modernism? It is undefined. Henry James stopped before a certain piece of sculpture to apostrophize "beautiful modern spirit"; but he did not attempt a definition where a more incompetent man would surely have done it. In poetry the Imagists, in our time and place, made a valiant effort to formulate their program. Their modernist manifestoes were exciting, their practice was crude, as was becoming to pioneers, and instructive in more ways than they had intended.*⁵⁴²

In the U.S. especially since the 19th-century American writers produced theories and criticism. Joseph Campbell applied archetypal criticism in the U.S. According to Campbell criticism is the art of judging skillfully of the merits or beauties, defects or faults of a literary or scientific

⁵⁴⁰ Delahoyde, Michael. Introduction to Literature. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.wsu.edu/~delahoyd/psycho.crit.html](http://www.wsu.edu/~delahoyd/psycho.crit.html)>

⁵⁴¹ Clark, Donald Lemen. *Rhetoric and Poetry in the Renaissance. A Study of Rhetorical Terms in English Renaissance Literary Criticism*. The Project Gutenberg EBook. May 29, 2007.

<[Http://www.gutenberg.org/files/10140/10140-h/10140-h.htm](http://www.gutenberg.org/files/10140/10140-h/10140-h.htm)>

⁵⁴² Ransom, John Crowe. *The Future of Poetry*. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.english.uiuc.edu/maps/poets/m_r/ransom/future.htm](http://www.english.uiuc.edu/maps/poets/m_r/ransom/future.htm)>

performance, or of a production of art. Campbell described myths as a manifestation of the universal human need to explain reality. Campbell wrote *The Hero with a Thousand Faces*, where he compared the myths of various cultures and concluded that they were all the same monomyth. Campbell examined religion as a myth. In *The Masks of God* he claimed that all myths have the same message.⁵⁴³ The movement of New Criticism was a fusion of I.A. Richards and TS Eliot with the later modification of a group of Southern U.S.-critics including John Crow Ransom, Robert Penn Warren, Cleanth Brooks and WK Wimsatt. The theoretical differences among the critics commonly described as New Critics like I. A. Richards, William Empson, Frank Raymond Leavis, Kenneth Burke, John Crowe Ransom, Allen Tate, Yvor Winters, Cleanth Brooks, Richard Palmer Blackmur, William K. Wimsatt, Jr. and René Wellek. Louise Rosenblatt answered in an interview in March 1999 regarding her theory of literacy:

Q. What major trends and philosophies have contributed to your theory of literacy?

A. I've become known as, you might say, a representative of the application of the pragmatist philosophy to esthetics. While I was teaching at Barnard at Columbia University in the thirties, although I never studied with him, John Dewey was still a professor of philosophy there. I did meet him and I ultimately became one of the early members of an organization called The Conference on Methods in Philosophy and the Sciences that he and other philosophers organized. In that organization I came into contact with Dewey, Horace Kallen and a number of the other leading philosophers and people in the social sciences and the humanities.

*The meetings dealt with problems of methodology in all of these areas. The work of Charles Sanders Peirce as well as John Dewey and William James has been particularly important to my theory. Our Revolution: Essays in working class and international revolution, 1904-1917*⁵⁴⁴

A specific topic related to criticism of the U.S. is *Anti-Americanism* defined as follows: *Anti-Americanism as a political and cultural sentiment has grown steadily over the course of the*

⁵⁴³ Cf. Ellen, K. Archetypal Criticism and Joseph Campbell. May 24, 2006

<<http://www.fcaps.k12.va.us/gm/faculty/english/archcrit.htm>>

⁵⁴⁴ Rosenblatt, Louise. Interview. Distinguished Visiting Scholar. Department of Teaching and Learning, School of Education, University of Miami. March 14, 1999. Nov. 15, 2005.

<<http://www.education.miami.edu/ep/Rosenblatt/>>

*twentieth century. Although there are records of anti-American sentiment in political and literary writings in previous centuries, the United States has attracted more negative attention for its policies and culture in the twentieth century than any other time in its history.*⁵⁴⁵ Due to its application in universities under the title ‘critical thinking’ criticism is in the U.S. an applied method. In terms of practical life-skills criticism serves for the building of opinions and individual judgements. Another field of application is the critical examination of cultural products done by critics in media. Urbinati wrote in *Criticism of Intellectual Critics* that “yet American critical intellectuals do not appeal to human rights to make their case against the liberticidal politics of American government (and its grave violations of the Geneva Convention). Even Dworkin, in his scathing criticism of the Bush administration, prefers to appeal not to human rights, but to the Bill of Rights and to the Constitution, even when those who are subject to Bush’s measures are not American. The argument that the critics use is implicitly that the appeal to universalism is redundant in this case because in the fundamental documents of the U.S. there is, incorporated and asserted, the same philosophy of human rights. For this reason, the criticism of intellectual critics, as important as it is, remains limited and is never as strong as it could be were it formulated on the basis of a universalist perspective. The challenge that the defenders of rights should accept is to understand that in order to “protect” the laws and rights contained in the Bill of Rights, American politics should be judged according to universal criteria.”⁵⁴⁶

⁵⁴⁵ Anti-Americanism. E-notes. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://www.enotes.com/twentieth-century-criticism/anti-americanism](http://www.enotes.com/twentieth-century-criticism/anti-americanism)>

⁵⁴⁶ Urbinati, Nadia. *Criticism of Intellectual Critics*. In: *Logos. a Journal of Modern Society & Culture*. 1.4. Fall 2002. June 7, 2007.

<[Http://logosonline.home.igc.org/urbinati.pdf](http://logosonline.home.igc.org/urbinati.pdf)>

2.7. On Criticism in Australian and the Pacific Area

In the Pacific zone autochthon cultures transformed after the colonization into hybride cultures connecting both traditional and colonial elements of life. The region Pacific Asia called Polynesia is characterized by a variety of cultures, languages, and customs. Despite the strong Western influence the inhabitants of the islands lived with their Polynesian culture. In Eastern Oceania lies the continent Australia besides Indonesia, East Timor, Malaysia, and the Philippines. Many islands in the Pacific are not independent states, but belong as colonies to the U.S., France, or Great Britain. Australia is among the countries in Oceania the most developed one with urban centres. In other parts of Oceania most humans live in small villages on islands with relatively less modern technology and also less school teaching facilities or higher education. The *University of the South Pacific* provides tertiary education in the Pacific region and investigates into all aspects of Pacific life of the countries Cook Iceland, Fiji, Kiribati, Marshall Iceland, Nauru, Niue, Samoa, Solomon Iceland, Tokelau, Tonga, Tuvalu, and Vanuatu. Criticism is here a result from Western influence in education and has less impact on the traditional life and cultural concepts. White and Tengan stated that “in contrast to the relative absence of indigenous practitioners of anthropology in the Pacific, recent years have seen a virtual renaissance of fiction writing and video production by Pacific Islanders, creating new forms of cultural criticism akin to interdisciplinary cultural studies in other parts of the world. As anthropology reconceptualizes the objects of its research, devises new approaches to fieldwork, and otherwise engages in dialogue with a range of interlocutors, the discipline is being redefined with as yet indeterminate results.”⁵⁴⁷

For the area of the Pacific Rim David Dudge in *When Politicians Meddle* stated:

In truth, political leaders in the region have always been quick to blame the media for their reporting. With politicians becoming increasingly media obsessed, the slightest hint of criticism is met with harsh words and allegations of bias. Often the charges come from the government of the day and the opposition at the same time, squeezing the media between two

⁵⁴⁷ White, Geoffrey M.; Tengan, Ty Kawika. “Disappearing Worlds: Anthropology and Cultural Studies in Hawai’i and the Pacific”. In: *The Contemporary Pacific*. Volume 13. Number 2. Fall 2001. Pp. 381-416

*opposing sides, but also affirming the media's belief that they must be doing something right.*⁵⁴⁸

Singh wrote in *Media Ethics and Accountability. Six Oceania Microstates: Thegenesis of Media Accountability* about the state of criticism in public mass communication:

*While criticism of self-regulatory media councils have led to their improvement and development over the years, and are essential to keep them accountable and on their toes, it has to be tempered in the Pacific media context with the knowledge that autocratically-orientated governments are eager to turn such debates against the media to bring in controls.*⁵⁴⁹

Immigrants from all over the world settled in Australia and developed it to a modern nation. At first the culture of the Australian continent was strongly influenced by the colonial power England. With the developing of its own national identity also a defined national culture of Australia developed since the 18th century. Contemporary Australia is mixed by the influences of different groups of immigrants in all ranges with their lifestyles and also the oldest culture of the Aborigines. The development of an own Australian literature began in the middle of the 19th century. The poems and ballads of early authors like Henry Lawson ‚Banjo’ Paterson describe the life in Australia. The focus of Australian literature was always directed to the Australian inhabitants. The most known of the early poets of Australia are Michael Massey Robinson, George Barrington, and Frank the Poet. In poems of Ralph Waldo Emerson we find a decent irony and social criticism:

Compensation

Why should I keep holiday

When other men have none?

Why but because, when these are gay,

I sit and mourn alone?

⁵⁴⁸ Dudge, David. When Politicians Meddle. International Press Institute (IPI). Freemedia. May 29, 2007. <http://www.freemedia.at/cms/ipi/freedom_detail.html?ctxid=CH0056&docid=CMS1145972953574>

⁵⁴⁹ Singh, Shailendra. “Media Ethics and Accountability. Six Oceania Microstates: Thegenesis of Media Accountability.” In: Pacific Journal Review. May 29, 2007. <http://www.pjreview.info/issues/docs/11_2/pjr11205singhpp42-60.pdf>

*And why, when mirth unseals all tongues,
Should mine alone be dumb?
Ah! late I spoke to silent throngs,
And now their hour is come.*⁵⁵⁰

The continent has ethnical or differently defined groups resulting in a multi-cultural Australia. Australia's media are strongly monopolized compared to other countries in the world. The Australians know many own word creations called also 'strine' derived from British English with their own dictionaries. 'Strine' has its origins in an old Cockney accent brought to the country with the arrival of the first settlers and convicts from England. Australian intellectual life was influenced by the British culture and other Western cultures arriving within the colonization process. The *Department of Philosophy* at the *University of Melbourne* described the relation between philosophy and questions and answers of its *criticisms and distinctions* as a dialectical relation:

*A good philosophical answer is one that is backed up by well-ordered and clear arguments indeed an answer without supporting argument is worthless and sometimes barely intelligible. Moreover an answer must be informed must take account of the arguments advanced and of the criticisms and distinctions made by others who have thought deeply about the same questions. These others need not be philosophers; philosophical discussion is at its best when it is informed by the insights and anxieties of other disciplines as well as the resources of its own tradition.*⁵⁵¹

The *Centre of Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics* at the *University Melbourne* was established as a *Commonwealth Special Research Centre* in 2000. International and social topics after the Second World War influenced the literature of the country and the contributions were also internationally respected. The criticism in Australia looks with specific Australian perspective to national and international issues. Washington Irving wrote in *Wolfert's Roost and Miscellanies. Desultory Thoughts on Criticism*:

⁵⁵⁰ Emerson, Ralph Waldo. Poems. Project Gutenberg EBooks. May 1st, 2006.

<[Http://www.gutenberg.net/1/2/8/4/12843/](http://www.gutenberg.net/1/2/8/4/12843/)>

⁵⁵¹ Department of Philosophy. The University of Melbourne. May 18, 2007.

<[Http://www.philosophy.unimelb.edu.au/ug/whatisphilosophy.html](http://www.philosophy.unimelb.edu.au/ug/whatisphilosophy.html)>

For my part, I doubt whether either writer or reader is benefited by what is commonly called criticism. The former is rendered cautious and distrustful; he fears to give way to those kindling emotions, and brave sallies of thought, which bear him up to excellence; the latter is made fastidious and cynical; or rather, he surrenders his own independent taste and judgment, and learns to like and dislike at second hand.

The critic, too, who dictates thus oracularly to the world, is perhaps some dingy, ill-favored, ill-mannered varlet, who, were he to speak by word of mouth, would be disregarded, if not scoffed at; but such is the magic of types; such the mystic operation of anonymous writing; such the potential effect of the pronoun we, that his crude decisions, fulminated through the press, become circulated far and wide, control the opinions of the world, and give or destroy reputation.⁵⁵²

Media criticisms developed terms such as media conglomerate for representatives of the industry such as Rupert Murdoch, who owns numerous newspapers in several countries and the publishing firm HarperCollins. Contemporary literary opinion finds expression in the quarterlies *Meanjin of Melbourne* and *Southerly of Sydney*, and in the weekly journal *The Bulletin*. The article *Ye Olde Criticism's Greatest Hits* in the magazine *The Australian* (June 17, 2004) by Jan Swafford mentions that the artist must survive in the *Zeitgeist* of his/her time:

After their demise, artists are at the mercy of history. The ones who survive are the ones who are malleable, who can ride the shifting tides of ideology, ideals, theory, fashion, catastrophe and shibboleth that constitute the Zeitgeist. The survivors, however, don't always ride those tides unscathed. Two cases in point are Johann Sebastian Bach and Mozart. Bach was created by his time but outlived it; Mozart was in tune with his time, but his legacy took surprising turns in the next generations.⁵⁵³

Australian critics shared their objects with international critics referring to Australian works. The *Who's Who of Australian Writers* was published by D. W. Thorpe in association with the

⁵⁵² Irving, Washington. *Wolfert's Roost and Miscellanies. Desultory Thoughts on Criticism*. University Newcastle. June 5, 2007.

<<http://whitewolf.newcastle.edu.au/words/authors/I/IrvingWashington/prose/wolfertsroost/desultorythoughts.html>>

⁵⁵³ Anonymus. *Too Bizarre, Mozart*. Febr. 18, 2005.

<<http://www.guardian.co.uk/arts/fridayreview/story/0,12102,1230395,00.html>>

National Centre for Australian Studies in 1991 and *The Oxford Companion to Australian Literature* edited by William H. Wilde, Joy Wooton and Barry Andrews have kept record.⁵⁵⁴

The *Australian Association of Writing Programs (AAWP)* was established in 1996 with its first conference, a gathering of teachers and students of creative and professional writing at the *University of Technology* in Sydney. The *University of South Australia* has a department of Communication Rhetoric and Reasoning. In Australia at University of South Australia a School of communication, information and New Media exists. A school of Journalism and Communication is established at the University of Queensland.⁵⁵⁵ *Charles Sturt University* offers the course *Applied Criticism*. In this subject students follow a self-directed research program in which they ‘investigate the artistic, cultural and critical context’ of their ‘exhibition/performance/project’, or other work selected in consultation with their supervisor.⁵⁵⁶ The *University of South Australia* mentions for its Electronic newsgroup COMMA that the use of netiquette is necessary for the participating persons:

*Remember that all staff and students have access to these messages. Do not use COMMA to carry on private conversations, and please exercise the usual standards of 'netiquette' you would use with all e-mailing: that is, adopt a cool, calm, professional approach, with no personal attacks or comments, and nothing else you may be ashamed of in future for having posted.*⁵⁵⁷

⁵⁵⁴ Cf. as standard works for Australian criticism.

Ross, Robert L. *Australian Literary Criticism. 1945 – 1988. An Annotated Bibliography.* New York 1989, pp. 76ff.

Semmler, Clement. *Twentieth Century Australian Literary Criticism.* Melbourne 1967, pp. 45ff.

Johnston, Grahame. *Australian Literary Criticism.* Melbourne 1962, pp. 23ff.

Bird, Delys. *Authority and Influence. Australian Literary Criticism 1950 - 2000.* St. Lucia, Queensland 2001, pp. 106ff.

Bailey, Raymond Frederick. *Some Preoccupations of Australian Literary Criticism 1945 - 1983.* S.I. 1989, pp. 55ff.

⁵⁵⁵ Salazar, Philippe-Joseph. *Rhetoric de la Race. L’Afrique Australe au XVIIIe siècle.* In: *Rhetorica.* 1996 14 (2), pp. 151-165.

⁵⁵⁶ Handbook. Charles Sturt University. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.csu.edu.au/handbook/subjects/ART503.html](http://www.csu.edu.au/handbook/subjects/ART503.html)>

⁵⁵⁷ Online edited at: Guide to Study. Communication: Rhetoric and Reasoning University of South Australia. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.roma.unisa.edu.au/07118/guidest.htm](http://www.roma.unisa.edu.au/07118/guidest.htm)>

In Australia speech teachers formed their own professional organization, the *National Association for Academic Teachers of Public Speaking*, which is now the *Speech Communication Association*. In Australian universities the disciplines rhetoric and communication are in the faculties of arts. At the University of South Australia communication as rhetoric and reasoning is a combination of the classical rhetoric with its roots in Greece and Rome and literary and communication theory. Literacy, as the ability to read and write, has been much in the news recently in Australia. Simon Etherington in *Fair Dealings under Australian Copyright Law* stated that in Australia you are allowed to reproduce or otherwise use someone else's copyright work for free and without permission if your use amounts to a "fair dealing" for a particular purpose. The permitted purposes are:

- Research or study
- Criticism or review
- Report the news
- Legal professional advice

In the *Copyright Law Review Committee* of the Government of Australia definitions of research, study, criticism, and review.⁵⁵⁸ According to Etherington the terms 'criticism' and 'review' mean to make some analysis or judgment about the quality of the thing being criticised or reviewed:

Criticism may be strongly expressed and may also be made in a satirical or humorous way. [...] To be legal, your use of a copyright work for criticism must be to criticise the work you are using or another work – but not something else altogether. For instance, your criticism may be directed at the work you are using - like where you reproduce a poem or photograph for the purposes of commenting on and critiquing it. Your criticism may also be directed at other works. For example you may copy some lyrics of Run DMC to compare them critically with the work of Eminem. Also, your criticism or review may extend to the ideas or

⁵⁵⁸ Copyright Law Review Committee. Government of Australia. May 29, 2007.

<<http://www.ag.gov.au/www/clrHome.nsf/AllDocs/5EC397B374406C04CA256C4F0006F070?OpenDocument>>

*philosophies underlying the work(s) you are reviewing and need not be limited to the actual language or expression used.*⁵⁵⁹

The state is organized in the individual federal states that possess parliaments with large authority for legislation. John Burnheim, Professor of General Philosophy at the *University of Sydney* in his book *Is Democracy Possible?* (1985) invented the term 'demarchy' to describe a political system without the state or bureaucracies, and based instead on randomly selected groups of decision makers. In *Future Directions for Rhetoric - Invention and Ethos in Public Critique* Ned Curthoys stated about *public critics*:

At stake in the current crisis of the university is a loss of competency in public genres, as well as the critical flexibility and alertness, the skills of address which make for a 'readiness to comment' on issues of the day. Indyk laments the impending loss of an Australian tradition of public critics including James McCauley, A.D. Hope, and A.A. Phillips, literary critics and practitioners of reading who wrote from a 'broad base' of public and political involvement.

By 'publicity', I mean a broad, reflexive mode of communication or address seeking sociable dissemination and diverse citation in public conversations, as opposed to a single-minded truth-assertion or empirical correction.

*In the last few years in Australia, much of the 'theoretical' concern about foundationalism, positivism, and disciplinary rigidity in history, philosophy, and literary studies has articulated fears about the opacity, narrowness, and homogeneity of critical writing, its failure to impact on our cultural imagination.*⁵⁶⁰

Australian literature is in the 21st century a recognized academic subject in educational institutions. The scholarly journal *Australian Literary Studies* is an adjunct to such courses. In addition many popular periodicals carry reviews and articles on contemporary publications and literary developments. Australian philosophy exams critically traditional Western ideas and makes new accesses. 21st-century topics of criticism are multi-cultural living, local literature, and language in film and television and in the arts, ethnical cultures, and globalization.

⁵⁵⁹ Etherington, Simon. Fair Dealings Under Australian Copyright Law. Arts Law Centre of Australia. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://artslaw.com.au/LegalInformation/Copyright/03Fairdealing.asp](http://artslaw.com.au/LegalInformation/Copyright/03Fairdealing.asp)>

⁵⁶⁰ Curthoys, Ned. Future Directions for Rhetoric - Invention and Ethos in Public Critique. Latrobe University. June 5, 2007.

<[Http://www.lib.latrobe.edu.au/AHR/archive/Issue-April-2001/curthoys.html](http://www.lib.latrobe.edu.au/AHR/archive/Issue-April-2001/curthoys.html)>

